TABLE OF CONTENTS

Dedication iii
Preface v
Acknowledgments vii
Table of Cases xix

Chapter 1 A BRIEF HISTORY OF FORENSIC EVIDENCE 1

1. INTRODUCTION 1
Evidence Dynamics: Locard's Exchange Principle & Crime Reconstruction 2

1.1. Comments and Further Reading 10
Juror Expectations for Scientific Evidence in Criminal Cases: Perceptions and Reality about the "CSI Effect" Myth 11

1.2. Further Reading 24

Chapter 2 THE ROLE OF THE POLICE, PROSECUTORS, DEFENCE COUNSEL AND JUDGES 27

1. INTRODUCTION 27

2. THE ROLE OF THE POLICE 28
Editorial: The Police and the Public 28
2.1 Discussion 29
United States v. Wade 30
2.2 Questions 34
R. v. McArthur 34
2.3 Discussion 42
R. v. Hennessey 42
R. v. Singh 46

3. THE ROLE OF THE PROSECUTOR 52
R. v. Boucher 52
3.1 Discussion & Question 54
Berger v. United States 54
3.2 Question 59
R. v. Babos 59
R. v. Rose 63
R. v. Rosik 69
3.3 Comment 73

4. THE ROLE OF THE DEFENCE COUNSEL 74
The Law Society of Upper Canada 74
4.1 Comments & Further Reading 77
R. v. Butt 78
R. c. Delisle 79

R. v. Li 84
North Carolina v. Alford 92
4.2 Comment & Further Reading 95
R. v. Murray 96
4.3 Questions & Further Reading 110
R. v. Cottrell 110
4.4 Note 116

5. THE ROLE OF THE JUDGE 116
Ethical Principles for Judges 116
R. v. Baltovich 130
5.1 Comment & Question 141
R. v. Brown 141
5.2 Further Reading 157
R. v. Gushman 157
5.3 Comment 169
R. v. Pompeo 170
5.4 Comment 175
In re Complaint Concerning the Honorouble Alberto O. Miera 175
5.5 Comment 185

Chapter 3 DIRECT, CIRCUMSTANTIAL, REAL AND DEMONSTRATIVE EVIDENCE 187

1. INTRODUCTION 187

2. DIRECT EVIDENCE 188
Missouri v. Famber 188
2.1 Further Reading 190
R. v. Williams 190
2.2 Note 191
R. v. Mitchell 192
Missouri v. McClure 193
Oregon v. Baker 195
2.3 Comment & Question 197

3. CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE 197
R. v. O'Donnell 197
3.1 Comment & Question 204
People v. Yokum 204
R. v. Charemski 208
3.2 Question 213
R. v. Arcuri 213
3.3 Further Reading 219

4. REAL EVIDENCE 219
Riggie v. Grand Trunk Railway Company 219
Gutman v. Industrial Commission 221

4.1 Note 223

People v. Kinney 223
Western Cottonoil Company v. Adkisson 225
R. v. Mondor 226

4.2 Further Reading 227

5. DEMONSTRATIVE EVIDENCE 228
R. v. Bannister 228

5.1 Comment & Question 228
Smith v. Ohio Oil Company 229
R. v. Laverty 230

5.2 Comment 232
R. v. McDonald 232

5.3 Questions 241
R. v. Collins 241
The Law Society of Upper Canada Special Lectures 2003: The Law of Evidence: Roger G. Oatley,"Demonstrative Evidence: Uses and Abuses" 252

Chapter 4 DISCLOSURE, CONFIDENTIAL RECORDS AND PRIVILEGE 259

1. INTRODUCTION 259

2. DISCLOSURE 259
R. v. Stinchcombe 259
2.1 Comments & Further Reading 270
Ontario, Report of the Attorney General's Advisory Committee on Charge Screening, Disclosure and Resolution Discussions 271
Brady v. Maryland 283
2.2 Further Reading 284
R. Hutter 284
2.3 Discussion Questions & Further Reading 289
R. v. Cleghorn 290
2.4 Question 292
R. v. Witter 293
2.5 Note 299
Washington v. Huson 300
R. v. Sweeney 301
R. v. Worth 306
R. v. G.E.M. 309
2.6 Comment & Questions 311

3. CONFIDENTIAL RECORDS 311
R. v. O'Connor 311

3.1 Note & Further Reading 316
R. v. Carosella 316
3.2 Question & Further Reading 324
R. v. Mills 324
R. v. McNeil 340
3.3 Comment 351

4. PRIVILEGE 351
Solosky v. R. 351
4.1 Comment 353
Desôteaux c. Mierzwinski 353
R. v. Couture 358
R. v. Nguyen 363
4.2 Questions & Comment 375
R. v. Gruenke 375
4.3 Note 379
Tarasoff v. The Regents of the University of California 379
4.4 Note & Questions 383
Smith v. Jones 384
Named Person v. Vancouver Sun 393
4.5 Further Reading 406

Chapter 5 COURTS AND TRIBUNALS 407

1. INTRODUCTION 407
Supreme Court of Canada 408
Administrative Tribunals and the Courts: An Evolutionary Relationship 412
Pasiechnyk v. Saskatchewan (Workers' Compensation Board) 419
1.1 Comment & Further Reading 433
Pushpanathan v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship & Immigration) 433
1.2 Question 439
Ocean Port Hotel Ltd. v. British Columbia (General Manager, Liquor Control & Licensing Branch) 439
Committee for Justice & Liberty v. Canada (National Energy Board) 442
1.3 Comments & Further Reading 450

Chapter 6 OVERSIGHT LEGISLATION AND RULES USED BY GOVERNING BODIES 451

1. INTRODUCTION 451
Foxes, Henhouses, Unfathomable Mysteries, and the Sufferance of the People: A Review of Regulating Professions and Occupations 451
1.1 Comment & Question 461

What Does It Mean to Be a Self-governing Regulated Profession? ... 461
1.2 Note ... 470

2. THE MEDICAL PROFESSION ... 471
Im (Re) ... 471
2.1 Comment ... 474
Awad (Re) ... 474
2.2 Comment ... 479

3. THE NURSING PROFESSION ... 479
Discipline Committee of the College of Nurses of Ontario ... 479
3.1 Question ... 493
Discipline Committee of the College of Nurses of Ontario ... 493

4. THE ENGINEERING PROFESSION ... 504
Summary of Decision and Reasons ... 504
4.1 Question ... 508
Summary of Decision and Reasons ... 508
4.2 Comment & Further Reading ... 511

5. THE PROFESSION OF SOCIAL WORKING ... 511
Discipline Decision Summary ... 511
5.1 Comment & Question ... 514
Discipline Decision Summary ... 515
5.2 Comment ... 518

6. THE PROFESSION OF ACCOUNTING ... 518
Bull (Re) ... 518
6.1 Comment & Questions ... 525
Strohyj (Re) ... 525
6.2 Comment ... 532

Chapter 7 TRIAL DELAYS AND ISSUES PERTAINING TO MEMORY ... 533

1. INTRODUCTION ... 533
Bedeviled by Delay: Straight Talk About Memory Loss, Procedural Manipulation and the Myth of Swift Justice ... 534
1.1 Comment & Question ... 543
Barker v. Wingo ... 543
1.2 Comment & Further Reading ... 551
United States v. Lovasco ... 552
1.3 Comment & Further Reading ... 557
R. v. Askov ... 557
1.4 Note & Question ... 568
R. v. Morin ... 568
1.5 Comment & Questions ... 585

R. v. R.D.R. 585
1.6 Questions 590
R. v. Jordan 590
1.7 Comments and Further Reading 598
Chapter 8 CHALLENGING AND ADMITTING EXPERT TESTIMONY 599
1. INTRODUCTION 599
Frye v. United States 600
1.1 Comment & Further Reading 601
Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals Inc. 602
1.2 Comment 607
R. v. Mohan 608
1.3 Question 613
R. v. Fatima 613
1.4 Comment & Questions 615
R. v. Zwezdaryk 615
1.5 Note 627
R. v. Marquard 628
1.6 Comment 636
R. v. Giroux 636
1.7 Comments 645
Blank v. Canada (Department of Justice) 645
1.8 Comment 652
R. v. Medwid 652
1.9 Comment 655
R. v. Ghorvei 656
1.10 Comment & Question 660
R. v. Karaibrahimovic 660
1.11 Comment 664
Desbiens v. Mordini 664
1.12 Comment 667
White Burgess Langille Inman v. Abbott and Haliburton Co. 668
1.13 Comment 680
Chapter 9 ETHICALITY, JUNK SCIENCE AND THE MISCARRIAGE OF JUSTICE 681
1. INTRODUCTION 681
When "Experts" Speak, Should Judges Listen: Some Basic Science Lessons 681
1.1 Comments 689
Expert Witness Ethics 689
1.2 Comment & Further Reading 699
Ethicality and the Expert Witness: Remembering What Hangs in the Balance 699
1.3 Comment & Question 703

Ontario, *The Commission on Proceedings Involving Guy Paul Morin* 703
1.4 Comment & Question 717
R. v. Bianco 718
1.5 Comment 724
R. v. Paul 724
1.6 Comment 734
R. v. Lawrence 735
1.7 Note 738
Ontario, *Inquiry into Pediatric Forensic Pathology in Ontario* 738
1.8 Comment 752
R. v. Kumar 752
1.9 Comments & Questions 761
R. v. Olscamp 761
1.10 Further Reading 772
Banks v. State 772
1.11 Further Reading 776
Pierce v. Gilchrist 777
1.12 Note & Questions 785
R. v. Palombi 785
R. v. Truscott 789
1.13 Comment 814
Index 815