

# Table of Contents

## CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION

### I. OVERVIEW

- § 1:1 Generally
- § 1:2 Basic legal protections: Asylum, INA § 241(b)(3) withholding of removal, and Convention Against Torture
- § 1:3 History of U.S. asylum law

### II. SOURCES OF LAW

- § 1:4 Domestic law
- § 1:5 International law

### III. ASYLUM, WITHHOLDING OF REMOVAL, AND CONVENTION AGAINST TORTURE PROCEDURE

- § 1:6 Generally
- § 1:7 Credible fear and reasonable fear
- § 1:8 Asylum Office: “Affirmative” asylum
- § 1:9 Immigration Court: “Defensive” asylum, INA § 241(b)(3) withholding of removal, and protection under Convention Against Torture
- § 1:10 Administrative and judicial review
- § 1:11 Post-asylum: Family reunification and permanent residency

### IV. RELATED IMMIGRATION STATUSES AND RELIEF

- § 1:12 Introduction
- § 1:13 Temporary protected status (TPS)
- § 1:14 Violence Against Women Act (VAWA)
- § 1:15 U and T visas
- § 1:16 Special immigrant juvenile status (SIJS)
- § 1:17 Deferred action, deferred action for childhood arrivals, and deferred action for parental accountability
- § 1:18 Private bills

### V. CLIMATE MIGRATION AND REFUGEE LAW

- § 1:19 Overview
- § 1:20 Refugee law and climate change: Key concepts
- § 1:21 Applying refugee law
- § 1:22 Persecution
- § 1:23 Nexus
- § 1:24 Internal relocation
- § 1:25 “Other serious harm”

## CHAPTER 2. STANDARD OF PROOF

### I. INTRODUCTION

- § 2:1 Generally

## **II. DISTINGUISHING STANDARDS OF PROOF IN ASYLUM AND WITHHOLDING OF REMOVAL: EARLY U.S. SUPREME COURT DECISIONS**

§ 2:2 Generally

### **III. STANDARD OF PROOF FOR ASYLUM**

#### **A. WELL-FOUNDED FEAR OF PERSECUTION**

##### **1. Overview**

§ 2:3 Generally

§ 2:4 Requirement of individualized determination

##### **2. “Subjective” and “Objective” Elements**

§ 2:5 “Subjective” fear and “objective” risk

§ 2:6 Reconciling “subjective” fear and “objective” risk

##### **3. Refugees “Sur Place”**

§ 2:7 Generally

##### **4. Types of Proof**

§ 2:8 Past persecution

§ 2:9 Targeting: Threats and past harm

§ 2:10 Human rights conditions

§ 2:11 Treatment of closely-associated persons

§ 2:12 “Pattern or practice” (“similarly-situated” standard)

##### **5. Internal Relocation**

§ 2:13 Generally

§ 2:14 Burden of proof

§ 2:15 “Reasonableness” under all the circumstances

#### **B. PAST PERSECUTION**

##### **1. Overview**

§ 2:16 Past persecution: Independent basis

##### **2. Burden Shifting and Exercise of Discretion**

###### **a. Presumption of Future Persecution**

§ 2:17 Generally

###### **b. Rebuttal of Presumption**

###### **i. Fundamental Change in Circumstances**

§ 2:18 Fundamental change in circumstances generally

§ 2:19 Fundamental change in conditions of country of origin

§ 2:20 Fundamental change in personal circumstances—Gender and female genital mutilation

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 2:21 Forced sterilization
  - ii. Internal Relocation
- § 2:22 Generally
  - c. Discretionary Grant and “Past-Persecution-Only Asylum”
- § 2:23 Generally
- § 2:24 Determination of severity of past persecution
- § 2:25 Determination of existence of “other serious harm”

**IV. STANDARD OF PROOF IN INA § 241(b)(3)  
WITHHOLDING OF REMOVAL**

- § 2:26 Generally
- § 2:27 Withholding of removal based on past persecution
- § 2:28 Withholding of removal based on future threat to life or freedom

**CHAPTER 3. EVIDENCE**

**I. INTRODUCTION**

- § 3:1 Generally

**II. APPLICANT’S BURDEN OF PROOF**

**A. OVERVIEW**

- § 3:2 Generally
- § 3:3 Applicant’s testimony; benefit of the doubt principle

**B. CORROBORATION**

**1. Overview**

- § 3:4 Generally
- § 3:5 Corroboration of central, material facts that are reasonably available
- § 3:6 Judicial review: Scope of review and corroboration rules
- § 3:7 Notice and opportunity to respond

**2. Types of Corroborating Evidence**

**a. Overview**

- § 3:8 Generally
- § 3:9 Corroborative testimony of lay witnesses
- § 3:10 Expert witnesses and affidavits
- § 3:11 External documentary evidence

**b. Country Conditions and Human Rights  
Documentation**

- § 3:12 Generally
- § 3:13 Governmental and non-governmental sources

### **III. ADMINISTRATIVE NOTICE OF COUNTRY CONDITIONS**

- § 3:14 Board of Immigration Appeals practice
- § 3:15 Commonly acknowledged facts requirement
- § 3:16 Restrictions on adjudicative or outcome-determinative facts
- § 3:17 Applicant's right to individualized determination
- § 3:18 Rebuttal rights

### **IV. CREDIBILITY**

#### **A. OVERVIEW**

- § 3:19 Generally
- § 3:20 REAL ID Act codification of credibility standards

#### **B. CREDIBILITY FACTORS**

##### **1. Demeanor**

- § 3:21 Generally

##### **2. Specificity and Detail**

- § 3:22 Generally

##### **3. Consistency**

- § 3:23 Generally
- § 3:24 Internal consistency
- § 3:25 Nonmaterial inconsistencies
- § 3:26 External consistency

##### **4. Applicant's Opportunity to Explain**

- § 3:27 Generally

##### **5. Children and Credibility**

- § 3:28 Generally

## **CHAPTER 4. PERSECUTION**

### **I. PERSECUTION: DOMESTIC AND INTERNATIONAL LAW**

- § 4:1 International law and human rights standards
- § 4:2 History and context
- § 4:3 Human rights standards
- § 4:4 U.S. case law: General concepts and definitions
- § 4:5 Persecution versus "threat to life or freedom"
- § 4:6 Distinguishing persecution from prosecution
- § 4:7 Persecution versus punishment

### **II. ROLE OF STATE PROTECTION**

- § 4:8 State protection: Inability or unwillingness to protect
- § 4:9 State actors: Official and *de facto*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 4:10 Non-state actors
- § 4:11 Evidence of a failure of state protection

**III. FORMS OF PERSECUTORY HARM**

**A. OVERVIEW**

- § 4:12 Generally

**B. PHYSICAL VIOLENCE AND RELATED HARMS**

- § 4:13 Generally
- § 4:14 Detention
- § 4:15 Rape and sexual violence
- § 4:16 Domestic violence
- § 4:17 Female genital mutilation

**C. MENTAL, EMOTIONAL, AND PSYCHOLOGICAL HARM**

- § 4:18 Generally
- § 4:19 Threats
- § 4:20 Harm to family members
- § 4:21 Harm to children

**D. FORCED VIOLATIONS OF FUNDAMENTAL BELIEFS**

- § 4:22 Generally
- § 4:23 Forced renunciation or violation of religious beliefs
- § 4:24 Coercive family planning policies
- § 4:25 Feminist beliefs and forced marriage
- § 4:26 Conscription

**E. ECONOMIC HARM**

**1. Overview**

- § 4:27 Generally
- § 4:28 Evolution of standards

**2. Forms of Economic Harm**

- § 4:29 Generally
- § 4:30 Fines and other economic penalties
- § 4:31 Employment
- § 4:32 Housing and other means of living and support
- § 4:33 Education and health care

**3. Cumulative Economic Harm**

- § 4:34 Generally

**F. DISCRIMINATION**

- § 4:35 Generally

G. EXPULSION AND DENATIONALIZATION

§ 4:36 Generally

**CHAPTER 5. NEXUS AND GROUNDS OF PERSECUTION**

**I. NEXUS REQUIREMENT**

A. OVERVIEW

§ 5:1 Generally

B. INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS AND U.S. INTERPRETATION

1. Overview

§ 5:2 Generally

2. Early U.S. Interpretation of Nexus

§ 5:3 Early Board of Immigration Appeals decisions: Emphasis on motives

§ 5:4 Early Ninth Circuit presumptions

§ 5:5 U.S. Supreme Court in *Elias-Zacarias*: Rejection of *per se* rules, acceptance of circumstantial evidence

C. PROVING NEXUS

1. Overview

§ 5:6 Generally

§ 5:7 Evidence: Direct or circumstantial

§ 5:8 Mixed motives: *Matter of S-P*

§ 5:9 Objective criteria: No subjective animus

§ 5:10 Laws of general applicability and enforcement

2. REAL ID Act and Nexus: “At Least One Central Reason” Test

§ 5:11 Generally

§ 5:12 Nexus in the withholding of removal context

§ 5:13 Legislative history: Change from “motive” to “reason”

§ 5:14 Mixed reasons; requirement of “non-tangential” reason

§ 5:15 Motivational inquiry post-REAL ID

§ 5:16 The bifurcated nexus challenge in U.S. law

**II. GROUNDS OF PERSECUTION**

A. OVERVIEW

§ 5:17 Generally

TABLE OF CONTENTS

B. POLITICAL OPINION

1. Overview

§ 5:18 Meaning of political opinion

2. Express Political Opinion

- § 5:19 Organizational membership and affiliation
- § 5:20 Labor union membership and activities
- § 5:21 Mere membership in or association with a group
- § 5:22 Individual activism
- § 5:23 Refusal to join or support organization
- § 5:24 Whistleblowing
- § 5:25 Neutrality
- § 5:26 Third generation gangs
- § 5:27 Violation of the law, generally
- § 5:28 Violation of laws prohibiting departure
- § 5:29 Violation of military service laws
- § 5:30 Gender-related political opinion
- § 5:31 Opposition to, or violation of, coercive family planning laws

3. Imputed Political Opinion

a. Overview

§ 5:32 Generally

b. Imputation Based on Associations

- § 5:33 Family associations as a basis for imputed political opinion
- § 5:34 Nationality, race, religion, or ethnic group as a basis for imputed political opinion
- § 5:35 Village or region as a basis for imputed political opinion
- § 5:36 Social class as a basis for imputed political opinion
- § 5:37 Perceived group membership or association with group members as a basis for imputed political opinion
- § 5:38 Spiritual, philosophical, or charitable practices or group membership as basis for imputed political opinion
- § 5:39 Individual ties to government, actual and perceived, as a basis for imputed political opinion

c. Non-Associational Activism

§ 5:40 Generally

C. MEMBERSHIP IN A PARTICULAR SOCIAL GROUP

1. Basic Framework

§ 5:41 Generally

2. Social Distinction and Particularity

- § 5:42 Generally
- § 5:43 Evolution of PSG
- § 5:44 The requirements of particularity and social distinction

3. Types of Social Group Claims

a. Family and Clan

§ 5:45 Generally

b. Gender-Based Particular Social Groups

i. Overview

§ 5:46 Gender *Per Se*

ii. Female Genital Mutilation

§ 5:47 Generally

§ 5:48 Past female genital mutilation

§ 5:49 Fear of harm to applicant's children

iii. Spousal or Intimate Partner Violence

§ 5:50 Generally

iv. Forced Marriage

§ 5:51 Generally

v. Trafficking

§ 5:52 Generally

vi. Gender-Based Discrimination

§ 5:53 Generally

c. Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity

§ 5:54 Sexual orientation

§ 5:55 Gender identity

d. Third Generation Gangs

i. Overview

§ 5:56 Generally

ii. Former Gang Members

§ 5:57 Generally

iii. Non-Gang Members

§ 5:58 Generally

§ 5:59 Resistance to recruitment

§ 5:60 Extortion

§ 5:61 Witnesses or informants

§ 5:62 Gender-based

e. Children

§ 5:63 Generally

f. Former Status

§ 5:64 Generally

§ 5:65 Past targeting and victimization

TABLE OF CONTENTS

g. Social Status; Landownership

§ 5:66 Generally

h. Health Status and Disability

§ 5:67 Generally

§ 5:68 HIV/AIDS

D. RELIGION

1. Overview

§ 5:69 Generally

§ 5:70 Right to religious freedom in international law

§ 5:71 Defining religion

2. Right to Hold Religious Beliefs

§ 5:72 Generally

3. Right to Practice: Restrictions on the Exercise of Religious Freedom

§ 5:73 Generally

§ 5:74 State regulation of religion

§ 5:75 Religion-based conscientious objectors

4. Sincerity of Belief and Evidentiary Issues

§ 5:76 Generally

§ 5:77 Doctrinal religious knowledge

§ 5:78 Apostasy

§ 5:79 Perceived renunciation

5. Well-Founded Fear and Nexus Issues

§ 5:80 Generally

6. Relationship of Religion to Other Grounds

§ 5:81 Religion and political opinion

§ 5:82 Religion and gender

§ 5:83 Religion and race, nationality

§ 5:84 Interfaith marriages

E. RACE

§ 5:85 Generally

§ 5:86 Racial discrimination

§ 5:87 Standard of proof and nexus

§ 5:88 Relationship of race to other grounds

F. NATIONALITY

§ 5:89 Generally

§ 5:90 Relationship of nationality to other grounds

§ 5:91 Perceived nationality

## **CHAPTER 6. INELIGIBILITY FOR ASYLUM AND WITHHOLDING OF REMOVAL**

### **I. INTRODUCTION**

- § 6:1 International basis for exclusion from refugee status
- § 6:2 Bars, generally

### **II. BARS TO ASYLUM AND WITHHOLDING OF REMOVAL**

#### **A. PERSECUTION OF OTHERS**

- § 6:3 Generally
- § 6:4 Comparison between U.S. provisions and Refugee Convention
- § 6:5 Development of U.S. case law
- § 6:6 Persecution on account of a protected ground
- § 6:7 “Ordered, incited, assisted, or otherwise participated in” requirement

#### **B. SERIOUS NONPOLITICAL CRIMES**

- § 6:8 Generally
- § 6:9 “Serious reasons for believing” requirement
- § 6:10 “Nonpolitical” crime requirement
- § 6:11 Terrorism and “nonpolitical” crimes
- § 6:12 “Serious” crime requirement
- § 6:13 Balancing of criminal conduct and feared persecution

#### **C. PARTICULARLY SERIOUS CRIMES**

##### **1. Overview**

- § 6:14 Generally
  - § 6:15 Issues of proof, individualized review, and categorical bars
- ##### **2. The “Particularly Serious Crime” Bar to Asylum and Withholding of Removal**
- § 6:16 Background
  - § 6:17 Aggravated felonies: Particularly serious crimes *per se*
  - § 6:18 Other *per se* or presumptive particularly serious crimes
  - § 6:19 Crimes requiring individualized assessments
  - § 6:20 “Danger to the community” and balancing severity of persecution

#### **D. DANGER TO THE SECURITY OF THE UNITED STATES AND TERRORISM**

##### **1. Overview**

- § 6:21 Generally
- § 6:22 U.S. and international law

TABLE OF CONTENTS

2. “Danger to the Security of the United States”

§ 6:23 Generally

3. Terrorist Activities, Risks, and Associations

§ 6:24 Generally

§ 6:25 Key statutory definitions

§ 6:26 Operation of terrorism bars

§ 6:27 Material support of terrorism

§ 6:28 Waiver of terrorism-related bars

§ 6:29 Secret evidence

**III. BARS TO ASYLUM ONLY**

**A. OVERVIEW**

§ 6:30 Generally

**B. ONE-YEAR FILING DEADLINE**

1. Overview

§ 6:31 Generally

§ 6:32 Timeliness: Burden and standard of proof

§ 6:33 Determining time of filing and time of entry

2. Exceptions to One-Year Filing Deadline

§ 6:34 Generally

§ 6:35 Extraordinary circumstances

§ 6:36 Changed circumstances

§ 6:37 Reasonable period filing requirement

**C. FIRM RESETTLEMENT**

§ 6:38 Generally

§ 6:39 Regulatory transit bans

§ 6:40 Burden of proof and evidence

§ 6:41 Status in third country

§ 6:42 Ability to return and status

**D. DISCRETIONARY DENIALS OF ASYLUM**

§ 6:43 Generally

**E. SAFE THIRD-COUNTRY AGREEMENTS**

§ 6:44 Generally

§ 6:45 U.S. safe third-country provisions

**F. PREVIOUSLY-DENIED ASYLUM APPLICATIONS**

§ 6:46 Generally

**G. “FRIVOLOUS” ASYLUM APPLICATIONS**

§ 6:47 Generally

## **IV. JUDICIAL REVIEW OF ASYLUM AND WITHHOLDING BARS**

§ 6:48 Generally

## **CHAPTER 7. PROTECTION UNDER ARTICLE 3 OF THE CONVENTION AGAINST TORTURE**

### **I. OVERVIEW**

#### **A. CONVENTION AGAINST TORTURE AND THE ABSOLUTE NATURE OF THE TORTURE PROHIBITION**

§ 7:1 Generally

§ 7:2 U.S. obligations under the treaty; 1999 implementing regulations

#### **B. ARTICLE 3 OF THE CONVENTION AGAINST TORTURE: PROHIBITION AGAINST RETURN**

§ 7:3 Generally

§ 7:4 Contrast with asylum and withholding protections

### **II. SOURCES OF INTERNATIONAL LAW ON TORTURE**

#### **A. OVERVIEW**

§ 7:5 Generally

§ 7:6 European law

#### **B. EUROPEAN CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND FUNDAMENTAL FREEDOMS**

§ 7:7 Background to the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms

§ 7:8 Importance and weight of European jurisprudence

§ 7:9 A brief comparison between Article 3 of the European Convention and Article 3 of the Torture Convention

§ 7:10 Individualization of risk

#### **C. U.N. HUMAN RIGHTS COMMITTEE**

§ 7:11 Monitoring compliance under the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

#### **D. U.N. COMMITTEE AGAINST TORTURE**

§ 7:12 Committee functions

#### **E. U.N. SPECIAL RAPPORTEUR ON TORTURE**

§ 7:13 Appointment of the Special Rapporteur on Torture

TABLE OF CONTENTS

F. INTER-AMERICAN CONVENTION TO PREVENT  
AND PUNISH TORTURE, AND AMERICAN  
CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS

§ 7:14 Monitoring compliance under the American Convention

III. ARTICLE 3 CONVENTION AGAINST TORTURE  
PROTECTION: U.S. AND INTERNATIONAL LAW

A. OVERVIEW

§ 7:15 Scope of Article 3: Torture only

§ 7:16 Interpretation and agreed-upon catalog of torturous acts

§ 7:17 Flexible interpretation; standards for judicial review of facts

§ 7:18 Distinction between torture and other forms of inhuman or  
degrading treatment

B. ELEMENTS OF TORTURE

1. Overview

§ 7:19 Generally

2. Severe Physical or Mental Pain or Suffering

§ 7:20 Severe physical pain or suffering

§ 7:21 Detention and imprisonment

§ 7:22 Rape and other gender-based violence

§ 7:23 Severe mental pain or suffering

§ 7:24 Death penalty

3. Intentional Acts

§ 7:25 Generally

§ 7:26 Specific versus general intent

4. Proscribed Purpose

§ 7:27 Illicit purpose

5. Public Authority: Instigation, Consent, or  
Acquiescence

§ 7:28 Generally

§ 7:29 Scope of state authority

§ 7:30 Quasi-public officials

§ 7:31 Actions under color of law

§ 7:32 Domestic and gender violence: Issue of state complicity or  
acquiescence

§ 7:33 U.S. understanding of acquiescence

6. Exclusion of Lawful Sanctions

§ 7:34 Acts “arising only from, inherent in, or incidental to lawful  
sanctions”

C. STANDARD OF PROOF

1. Overview

§ 7:35 Generally

- § 7:36 Past torture as presumptive proof
  - 2. The “Substantial Grounds Test” Under the Torture Convention
- § 7:37 Generally
- § 7:38 U.S. understanding of “substantial grounds”: Probability test
- § 7:39 European Court of Human Rights interpretations of standard of proof
  - 3. Meeting the Standard of Proof
- § 7:40 Individual circumstances and treatment of “similarly situated” persons
- § 7:41 Consistent pattern of gross human rights violations
- § 7:42 Human rights evidence; changed country conditions
- § 7:43 Credibility and benefit of the doubt

**D. NON-DEROGABILITY: NO EXCLUSION FROM PROTECTION**

- § 7:44 Generally

**E. ALL MEANS OF RETURN**

- § 7:45 Generally

**APPENDIX**

Appendix A. Overview of Procedures for Asylum, Withholding of Removal, and Deferral of Removal

**Table of Laws and Rules**

**Table of Cases**

**Index**