

Table of Contents

Volume 1

PART I. THE SIGNIFICANCE OF CONSTITUTIONAL REMEDIES

CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION

§ 1:1 Generally

CHAPTER 2. HISTORICAL OVERVIEW

I. INTRODUCTION; CONSTITUTIONAL REMEDIES AT CONFEDERATION

§ 2:1 Introduction

§ 2:2 Constitutional Remedies at Confederation

II. INTERPLAY OF JUDICIAL AND LEGISLATIVE REMEDIES: THE MANITOBA LANGUAGE AND SCHOOLS CRISES

§ 2:3 Introduction

§ 2:4 Minority Language Rights

§ 2:5 Denominational School Rights

§ 2:5.50 Métis Land Rights

§ 2:6 Summary

III. CIVIL DISOBEDIENCE

§ 2:7 Generally

IV. THE DEVELOPMENT OF JUDICIAL REMEDIES

§ 2:8 Damages

§ 2:9 Injunctions

§ 2:10 Declarations

§ 2:11 Standing

§ 2:12 Prerogative Writs

V. REMEDIES IN THE CRIMINAL PROCESS

- § 2:13 Exclusion of Improperly Obtained Evidence
- § 2:14 Stays of Proceedings
- § 2:15 Habeas Corpus

VI. THE CANADIAN BILL OF RIGHTS

- § 2:16 Generally

VII. THE DEVELOPMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE REMEDIES

- § 2:17 Introduction
- § 2:18 Human Rights Commissions
- § 2:19 Social and Economic Rights

VIII. INTERNATIONAL LAW; THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE CANADIAN CHARTER OF RIGHTS AND FREEDOMS; CONCLUSION

- § 2:20 International Law
- § 2:21 The Development of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms
- § 2:22 Conclusion

CHAPTER 3. REMEDIAL PURPOSES, PRINCIPLES AND CONSTRAINTS

- § 3:1 Introduction
- § 3:2 Textual Approaches
- § 3:3 —Section 24(1) of the Charter
- § 3:4 —Section 24(2) of the Charter
- § 3:5 —Section 52(1) of the Constitution Act, 1982
- § 3:6 Positive and Negative Remedies
- § 3:7 The Nature of Remedial Discretion and the Principled Approach
- § 3:8 Principled and Purposive Approaches
- § 3:9 Meaningful Remedies that Compensate and Vindicate
- § 3:10 Effective Remedies that Ensure Compliance in the Future
- § 3:11 Respecting Institutional Roles
- § 3:12 Fairness to all the Parties

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 3:13 Countervailing Factors and Interests that Mitigate Remedies
- § 3:14 Retroactive and Prospective Relief
- § 3:15 The Roles of Proportionality as a Remedial Principle
- § 3:16 —Proportionality and the Choice of Less Drastic or Intrusive Remedies
- § 3:17 —Proportionality and the Justification of Public Interest Constraints on Remedies
- § 3:18 Conclusion

PART II. ACCESS TO CONSTITUTIONAL REMEDIES

CHAPTER 4. INTRODUCTION

- § 4:1 Generally

CHAPTER 5. STANDING AND TIMING

I. INTRODUCTION

- § 5:1 Generally

II. STANDING UNDER SECTION 52(1) OF THE CONSTITUTION ACT, 1982

- § 5:2 Introduction
- § 5:3 Discretionary Standing for Those Not Directly Affected by Impugned Laws or Activities
- § 5:4 —Serious Issue of Constitutionality
- § 5:5 —Genuine Interest in the Validity of the Legislation
- § 5:6 —A Reasonable and Effective Way to Bring the Issue to Court
- § 5:7 —Summary
- § 5:8 Standing as of Right for Those Directly Affected
- § 5:9 Standing of the Accused to Challenge Unconstitutional Laws

III. STANDING UNDER SECTION 24(1) OF THE CHARTER

- § 5:10 Generally

**IV. ESTABLISHING THE BASIS FOR CLAIMING
A CHARTER REMEDY**

- § 5:11 Introduction
- § 5:12 The Need for Facts to Support Violations and Remedies
- § 5:13 Burdens of Proof
- § 5:14 Standard of Appellate Review

**V. RIPENESS AND CLAIMS IN ANTICIPATION
OF A VIOLATION**

- § 5:15 Generally

**VI. MOOTNESS AND CLAIMS AFTER A DISPUTE
IS RESOLVED**

- § 5:16 Introduction
- § 5:17 Adversarial Presentation
- § 5:18 Judicial Economy
- § 5:19 Relations with Other Institutions
- § 5:20 Immunizing Actions from Review
- § 5:21 A Reasonable and Effective Way to Bring the Issue to Court

VII. CONCLUSION

- § 5:22 Generally

**CHAPTER 6. COURT OF COMPETENT
JURISDICTION**

I. INTRODUCTION

- § 6:1 Generally

**II. GENERAL DEFINITIONS OF A COURT OF
COMPETENT JURISDICTION**

- § 6:2 Jurisdiction under Section 24(1) of the Charter
- § 6:3 Jurisdiction under Section 52(1) of the Constitution Act, 1982

III. JURISDICTION IN THE CRIMINAL PROCESS

- § 6:4 Preliminary Inquiries

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 6:5 Superior Courts
- § 6:6 Trial Courts—Provincial and Other Statutory Courts
- § 6:7 —Superior Courts
- § 6:8 Appellate Courts
- § 6:9 Federal Court

IV. JURISDICTION IN THE CIVIL PROCESS

- § 6:10 Role of Provincial Superior Courts
- § 6:11 —In Relation to the Federal Court
- § 6:12 —In Relation to Administrative Agencies and Schemes

V. JURISDICTION IN THE ADMINISTRATIVE PROCESS

- § 6:13 Introduction
- § 6:14 Jurisdiction under Section 52(1) of the Constitution Act, 1982
- § 6:15 Jurisdiction under Section 24(1) of the Charter
- § 6:16 The Role of Provincial Superior Courts and the Federal Court

VI. CONCLUSION

- § 6:17 Generally

CHAPTER 7. INTERLOCUTORY REMEDIES

I. INTRODUCTION

- § 7:1 Generally

II. INTERLOCUTORY INJUNCTIONS

A. INTRODUCTION; STANDARD OF REVIEW

- § 7:2 Introduction
- § 7:3 Standard of Review

B. STRENGTH OF THE PLAINTIFF'S CASE

- § 7:4 Serious Question that is Not Frivolous or Vexatious
- § 7:5 Simple Questions of Law
- § 7:6 Final Determination of an Action

§ 7:7 No Presumption of Constitutionality

C. IRREPARABLE HARM

§ 7:8 Irreparable Harm to the Plaintiff

§ 7:9 Irreparable Harm to the Defendant

§ 7:10 Plaintiff's Undertaking to Pay Damages

D. BALANCE OF CONVENIENCE

§ 7:11 Maintenance of the Status Quo

§ 7:12 Consideration of the Public Interest

§ 7:13 Suspensions and Exemptions

§ 7:14 The Balance of Convenience and Proportionality

§ 7:15 Balance of Convenience and Injunctions that both
Threaten and Protect Constitutional Rights

III. INTERIM STAYS, DECLARATIONS AND COSTS

§ 7:16 Interim Stays of Proceedings Based on Legislation
Alleged to be Unconstitutional

§ 7:17 Interim Declarations

§ 7:18 Interim Costs

IV. REVIEW OF THE TRIAL JUDGE'S DECISIONS; CONCLUSION

§ 7:19 Review of the Trial Judge's Decision

§ 7:20 Conclusion

PART III. CONSTITUTIONAL REMEDIES

CHAPTER 8. INTRODUCTION

§ 8:1 Generally

CHAPTER 9. REMEDIES IN THE CRIMINAL PROCESS

I. INTRODUCTION; THE EVOLUTION AND PURPOSES OF REMEDIES IN THE CRIMINAL PROCESS

§ 9:1 Introduction

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 9:2 The Evolution and Purposes of Remedies in the Criminal Process

II. STAYS OF PROCEEDINGS

A. INTRODUCTION

§ 9:3 Generally

B. THE TEST FOR GRANTING A STAY OF PROCEEDINGS

1. Introduction

§ 9:4 Generally

2. The Alternative Grounds of Protecting Rights and Judicial Integrity

§ 9:5 The Differences and Relation Between the Alternative Grounds

§ 9:6 Stays Based on Judicial Integrity

§ 9:7 Stays Based on Fair Trial Grounds

§ 9:8 The Cumulative Effects of Harms to Rights and Judicial Integrity

3. The Need for the Abuse to be Perpetuated by the Subsequent Trial

§ 9:9 Generally

4. No Other Less Drastic But Adequate Alternative Remedies; Balancing the Affected Interests

§ 9:10 No Other Less Drastic but Adequate Alternative Remedies

§ 9:11 Balancing the Affected Interests

5. Procedural Matters

§ 9:12 Burdens and Standards of Proof

§ 9:13 Procedure and Timing of Stay Applications

§ 9:14 Appellate Deference to Trial Judges' Decisions

§ 9:15 Summary

C. STAYS AND ALTERNATIVE REMEDIES FOR VIOLATION OF DISCLOSURE RIGHTS

§ 9:16 Introduction

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 9:17 Cases where Stays of Proceedings have been
Granted and Upheld
- § 9:18 Cases where Stays of Proceedings have been
Reversed
- § 9:19 Alternative Remedies for Disclosure Violations
- § 9:20 —Disclosure Orders
- § 9:21 —Mistrials
- § 9:22 —Exclusion of Evidence Not Disclosed
- § 9:23 —Costs
- § 9:24 —New Trials
- § 9:25 —Summary

**D. VIOLATION OF RIGHTS TO LEGAL
ASSISTANCE**

- § 9:26 Stays of Proceedings
- § 9:27 Alternative Remedies to Stays of Proceedings

**E. VIOLATION OF RIGHTS RELATING TO
CONDITIONS OF CONFINEMENT;
VIOLATION OF THE RIGHT TO AN
INTERPRETER AND LANGUAGE RIGHTS**

- § 9:28 Violation of Rights Relating to Conditions of
Confinement
- § 9:29 Violation of the Right to an Interpreter and
Language Rights

F. VIOLATIONS OF THE CHARTER

- § 9:30 Violations of Section 11(d) of the Charter
- § 9:31 Violations of Section 11(b) of the Charter
- § 9:32 —Delayed Child Apprehension Proceedings
- § 9:33 Violations of Sections 8 and 9 of the Charter

G. SUMMARY

- § 9:34 Generally

**III. PREROGATIVE REMEDIES AND RELATED
PRE-TRIAL RELIEF**

- § 9:35 Introduction
- § 9:36 Non-Prerogative Pre-Trial Relief
- § 9:37 Prerogative Relief

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 9:38 —Prohibition
- § 9:39 —Mandamus
- § 9:40 —Certiorari

IV. RETURN OF EVIDENCE

- § 9:41 Introduction
- § 9:42 Court of Competent Jurisdiction
- § 9:43 Tests for Return of the Evidence

V. CHARTER VIOLATIONS AS A CRIMINAL DEFENCE

- § 9:44 Generally

VI. SENTENCE REDUCTIONS

- § 9:45 General Considerations
- § 9:46 The Connection Between the Charter Violation and the Circumstances of the Offence
- § 9:47 Sentence Reductions and Statutory Minimums
- § 9:48 Summary

VII. RELIEF RELATED TO CONDITIONS OF IMPRISONMENT

- § 9:49 Generally

VIII. HABEAS CORPUS AND RELATED RELIEF

- § 9:50 Section 10(c) of the Charter
- § 9:51 Expanded Grounds of Review
- § 9:52 Ancillary Remedies

IX. CONCLUSION

- § 9:53 Generally

CHAPTER 10. EXCLUSION OF UNCONSTITUTIONALLY OBTAINED EVIDENCE

I. INTRODUCTION

- § 10:1 Generally

**II. THE EVOLUTION AND PURPOSES OF
EXCLUSION OF EVIDENCE**

- § 10:2 Introduction
- § 10:3 Exclusion of Evidence to Correct a Violation
- § 10:4 Exclusion of Evidence to Regulate Police Conduct
- § 10:5 Balancing Tests for the Exclusion of Evidence

**III. AN OUTLINE OF SECTION 24(2)
JURISPRUDENCE**

A. R. V. COLLINS AND R. V. STILLMAN

- § 10:6 Introduction
- § 10:7 Exclusion to prevent unfair trials
- § 10:8 Exclusion to Prevent Judicial Condonation of
Unacceptable Conduct
- § 10:9 The Effects of Excluding Evidence
- § 10:10 Implications of the Collins Tests
- § 10:11 Criticisms of the Collins Tests

**B. ABOLITION OF THE FAIR TRIAL TEST AND
THE NEW TEST IN GRANT**

- § 10:12 Generally

**IV. THRESHOLD ISSUES IN THE EXCLUSION
OF EVIDENCE**

A. INTRODUCTION; STANDING

- § 10:13 Introduction
- § 10:14 Standing
- § 10:15 —Summary

B. PROCEDURE FOR EXCLUSIONARY CLAIMS

- § 10:16 At Trial
- § 10:17 On Appeal
- § 10:18 Standard of Appellate Review
- § 10:19 No Substantial Wrong or Miscarriage of Justice
- § 10:20 The Use that is Sought to be Made of the
Impugned Evidence

C. BURDEN OF PROOF

- § 10:21 Persuasive Burden

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 10:22 Evidential Burdens

D. EVIDENCE OBTAINED IN A MANNER THAT VIOLATES CHARTER RIGHTS

§ 10:23 The Need for a Temporal or Causal Connection
Between the Violation and the Evidence

§ 10:24 —Determining if the Connection Between the
Charter Violation and the Evidence Sought to be
Excluded is too Remote

E. CONCLUSION TO THRESHOLD ISSUES

§ 10:25 Generally

**V. THE THREE-PART GRANT TEST FOR
EXCLUSION OF EVIDENCE**

A. INTRODUCTION

§ 10:26 Generally

**B. THE SERIOUSNESS OF THE CHARTER
VIOLATION**

§ 10:27 Introduction

§ 10:28 The Purpose of the Serious Violation Test

§ 10:29 Compliance with the Charter during the
Investigation

§ 10:30 Good Faith Violations

§ 10:31 —Reliance on Statutes

§ 10:32 —Reliance on Judicial Decisions

§ 10:33 —Reliance on Warrants

§ 10:34 —Reliance on Practices and Policies

§ 10:35 —The Effect of Uncertainty in the Law

§ 10:36 —Summary

§ 10:37 Inadvertent and Minor Charter Violations

§ 10:38 Deliberate, Blatant and Flagrant Violations

§ 10:39 Availability of other Investigative Means and the
Discoverability of the Evidence

§ 10:40 Urgency and Necessity

**C. THE IMPACT OF THE BREACH ON THE
ACCUSED'S CHARTER-BASED INTERESTS**

§ 10:41 Introduction

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 10:42 Statements from the Accused
- § 10:43 Bodily Substances
- § 10:44 Physical Evidence
- § 10:45 Derivative Evidence

D. SOCIETY’S INTEREST IN AN ADJUDICATION ON THE MERITS

- § 10:46 Introduction
- § 10:47 Determining Disrepute
- § 10:48 The Seriousness of the Offence Charged
- § 10:49 The Importance and Reliability of the Evidence
Sought to be Excluded

VI. CONCLUSION

- § 10:50 Generally

CHAPTER 11. DAMAGES AND COSTS

I. INTRODUCTION; THE EVOLUTION AND PURPOSES OF MONEY AWARDS

- § 11:1 Introduction
- § 11:2 The Evolution and Purposes of Money Awards

II. PROCEDURAL BARRIERS TO CHARTER DAMAGE CLAIMS

- § 11:3 Court of Competent Jurisdiction
- § 11:4 —Provincial Criminal Courts
- § 11:5 —Superior Courts of Criminal Jurisdiction
- § 11:6 Class Proceedings
- § 11:7 Estoppel and Abuse of Process
- § 11:8 Statutes of Limitation
- § 11:9 Immunities from Civil Actions
- § 11:10 —Absolute Immunities
- § 11:11 —Qualified Immunities

III. ELEMENTS OF A CHARTER DAMAGE CLAIM

A. INTRODUCTION; THE APPROPRIATE DEFENDANT

- § 11:12 Introduction

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 11:13 The Appropriate Defendant

B. THE FUNCTIONAL NEED FOR DAMAGES

§ 11:14 Introduction

§ 11:15 Compensation for a Wide Range of Harm and Loss

§ 11:16 Vindication of the Charter Right

§ 11:17 Deterrence of Future Charter Violations

C. COUNTERVAILING FACTORS TO THE AWARD OF DAMAGES

§ 11:18 Introduction

§ 11:19 Alternative Remedies

§ 11:20 Effective Governance Concerns

D. APPROPRIATE AND JUST QUANTUMS OF DAMAGE AWARDS

§ 11:21 Introduction

§ 11:22 Rejection of Per Se Awards

§ 11:23 Compensatory Awards

§ 11:24 Vindication

§ 11:25 Deterrence

§ 11:26 Exemplary and Punitive Damages

IV. COSTS

§ 11:27 Introduction

§ 11:28 Advance Costs

§ 11:29 The Application of Costs Rule in Constitutional Litigation

§ 11:30 —Costs in Criminal Cases and Appeals

§ 11:31 —Costs Against an Unsuccessful Charter Applicant

§ 11:32 —Costs for an Unsuccessful Charter Applicant

§ 11:33 —Costs for a Successful Charter Applicant

§ 11:34 The Use of Costs as a Section 24(1) Remedy

V. CONCLUSION

§ 11:35 Generally

CHAPTER 12. DECLARATIONS

I. INTRODUCTION; THE EVOLUTION AND PURPOSES OF DECLARATORY RELIEF

- § 12:1 Introduction
- § 12:2 The Evolution and Purposes of Declaratory Relief

II. DECLARATIONS CONCERNING FUTURE VIOLATIONS; DECLARATIONS CONCERNING PAST VIOLATIONS

- § 12:3 Declarations Concerning Future Violations
- § 12:4 Declarations Concerning Past Violations

III. DECLARATIONS CONCERNING CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS

- § 12:5 Introduction
- § 12:6 Minority Language Cases
- § 12:7 Equality Cases
- § 12:8 Suspended Declarations
- § 12:9 Summary

IV. “DECLARATIONS PLUS”

- § 12:10 Introduction
- § 12:11 Declarations, Retention of Jurisdiction and Other Means to Resolve Disputes About the Declaration
- § 12:12 Declarations that are Directions
- § 12:13 Consultation and Negotiations About the Implementation of Declarations
- § 12:14 Declarations on Consent

V. WHEN DECLARATIONS MAY NOT BE APPROPRIATE AND JUST

- § 12:15 Introduction
- § 12:16 Custodial Institutions
- § 12:17 Governmental Resistance and Neglect

VI. CONCLUSION

- § 12:18 Generally

TABLE OF CONTENTS

**CHAPTER 13. INJUNCTIONS AND OTHER
MANDATORY REMEDIES**

I. INTRODUCTION

§ 13:1 Generally

**II. THE EVOLUTION AND PURPOSES OF
MANDATORY RELIEF**

§ 13:2 Introduction

§ 13:3 The Role of Equity

§ 13:4 Crown Immunity and the Preference for Declaratory
Relief

**III. COMPARATIVE EXPERIENCE WITH
INJUNCTIONS AS A CONSTITUTIONAL
REMEDY**

§ 13:5 The United States

§ 13:6 —Judicial Experience

§ 13:7 —Fiss’s Typology

§ 13:8 —Other Perspectives

§ 13:9 India

§ 13:10 South Africa

IV. THE USE OF INJUNCTIONS IN CANADA

**A. PREVENTIVE INJUNCTIONS; REPARATIVE
INJUNCTIONS**

§ 13:11 Preventive Injunctions

§ 13:12 Reparative Injunctions

§ 13:13 —Reference re: Language Rights under the
Manitoba Act, 1870

B. STRUCTURAL INJUNCTIONS

1. Introduction

§ 13:14 Generally

**2. Cases Where Structural Injunctions have
been Granted and Sustained on Appeal**

§ 13:15 *La Société des Acadiens v. Minority Language
School Board*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 13:16	<i>Marchand v. Simcoe (County) Board of Education</i>
§ 13:17	<i>Lavoie v. Nova Scotia</i>
§ 13:18	<i>Doucet-Boudreau v. Nova Scotia</i>
§ 13:19	Other Minority Language Rights Cases
§ 13:20	National Security and Criminal Cases
	3. Cases Where Structural Injunctions were Not Ordered or Overturned on Appeal
§ 13:21	<i>Little Sisters Book and Art Emporium v. Canada (Minister of Justice)</i>
§ 13:22	Khadr and other Cases Affecting Foreign Relations
§ 13:23	<i>Thibodeau v. Air Canada</i>
§ 13:23.50	Climate Change Litigation
§ 13:24	Other Cases

V. OTHER MANDATORY REMEDIES

§ 13:25	Introduction
§ 13:26	Mandamus—Voting Rights Cases
§ 13:27	—The Insite Decision
§ 13:28	Prohibition

VI. MANDATORY REMEDIES TO ENFORCE EQUALITY RIGHTS

A. INTRODUCTION; THE AMERICAN EXPERIENCE

§ 13:29	Introduction
§ 13:30	American Experience

B. CANADIAN EXPERIENCE UNDER HUMAN RIGHTS CODES

§ 13:31	Remedies Available Under Human Rights Codes
§ 13:32	The Approach to Remedies Under Human Rights Codes
§ 13:33	<i>Action Travail des Femmes v. C.N.R. Co.</i>

VII. CONCLUSION

§ 13:34	Generally
---------	-----------

TABLE OF CONTENTS

**CHAPTER 14. REMEDIES INVOLVING
LEGISLATION**

I. INTRODUCTION

§ 14:1 Generally

**II. THE EVOLUTION AND PURPOSES OF
REMEDIES FOR UNCONSTITUTIONAL
LEGISLATION**

§ 14:2 American Experience

§ 14:3 Canadian Experience—Enforcing the Division of
Powers

§ 14:4 —The Evolution of Section 52(1) Charter Remedies

III. UPHOLDING PERMISSIVE LEGISLATION

§ 14:5 Generally

**IV. READING DOWN POTENTIALLY
UNCONSTITUTIONAL LEGISLATION**

A. INTRODUCTION

§ 14:6 Generally

B. FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION CASES

§ 14:7 Osborne and Rocket

§ 14:8 Butler, Zundel and Sharpe

§ 14:9 Criminal Cases

§ 14:10 —Cases Where Reading In was Not Appropriate

§ 14:11 —Radical Reading In to Save s. 43 of the Criminal
Code

§ 14:12 Administrative Cases

§ 14:13 Summary

V. CONSTITUTIONAL EXEMPTIONS

A. INTRODUCTION; EARLY CASES; FERGUSON

§ 14:14 Introduction

§ 14:15 Early Cases

§ 14:16 Ferguson

**B. CONSTITUTIONAL EXEMPTIONS AFTER
FERGUSON**

- § 14:17 Section 24(1) Remedies
- § 14:18 Section 24(1) Exemptions During a Suspended
Declaration of Invalidity
- § 14:19 Reading Down as a Functional Alternative

VI. SEVERANCE

- § 14:20 Introduction
- § 14:21 Cases Where Severance is Not Appropriate
- § 14:22 Cases Where Severance is Appropriate
- § 14:23 Summary

**VII. EXTENSION BY READING IN OR
NULLIFICATION OF UNDERINCLUSIVE
LEGISLATION**

**A. INTRODUCTION; EXTENSION OF
LEGISLATION THROUGH INVALIDATION OR
READING IN**

- § 14:24 Introduction
- § 14:25 Extension of Legislation Through Invalidation or
Reading In

B. SCHACHTER V. CANADA

- § 14:26 Introduction
- § 14:27 Respect for the Role of the Legislature
- § 14:28 —Remedial Precision
- § 14:29 —Consistency with Legislative Objectives
- § 14:30 The Size of the Group to be Included
- § 14:31 Respect for the Purposes of the Charter—The
Protection of Vulnerable Minorities
- § 14:32 —The Role of Constitutional Rights and Hints
- § 14:33 Temporary Suspensions of Nullification or
Extension
- § 14:34 Summary

TABLE OF CONTENTS

C. CASES WHERE EXTENSION BY READING IN IS APPROPRIATE; CASES WHERE EXTENSION BY READING IN WAS NOT APPROPRIATE

§ 14:35 Cases Where Extension by Reading In is Appropriate

§ 14:36 Cases Where Extension by Reading In was Not Appropriate

D. SUMMARY

§ 14:37 Concluding Remarks

VIII. SUSPENDED DECLARATIONS OF INVALIDITY

§ 14:38 Introduction

§ 14:39 Reference re: Language Rights and Other Bilingualism Cases

§ 14:40 R. v. Swain and Other Early Cases

§ 14:41 Carter and Other Cases Involving Extensions of Suspended Declarations

§ 14:42 Schachter v. Canada

§ 14:43 Ontario (Attorney General) v. G.

§ 14:44 Timing, Length and Consequences of Suspended Declarations

§ 14:45 Cases Where Suspended Declarations of Invalidity are Appropriate—Exempting Successful Charter Applicants From the Period of Suspension

§ 14:46 —Cases Where Applicants Were Exempted: A Two-track Approach

§ 14:47 —Cases Where Applicants Were Not Exempted

§ 14:48 Cases Where Suspended Declarations of Invalidity are Not Appropriate

§ 14:49 Summary

IX. PROSPECTIVE AND RETROACTIVE RELIEF; CONCLUSION

§ 14:50 Prospective and Retroactive Relief

§ 14:51 Conclusion

CHAPTER 15. REMEDIES AND ABORIGINAL RIGHTS

I. INTRODUCTION; THE EVOLUTION AND PURPOSES OF REMEDIES FOR VIOLATIONS OF ABORIGINAL RIGHTS

- § 15:1 Introduction
- § 15:2 The Evolution and Purposes of Remedies for
Violations of Aboriginal Rights

II. INTERLOCUTORY REMEDIES TO PREVENT VIOLATIONS OF ABORIGINAL RIGHTS

A. INTRODUCTION; STRENGTH OF THE PLAINTIFF'S CASE

- § 15:3 Introduction
- § 15:4 Strength of the Plaintiff's Case

B. IRREPARABLE HARM TO THE PLAINTIFF AND DEFENDANT

- § 15:5 Irreparable Harm to the Plaintiff
- § 15:6 Irreparable Harm to the Defendant and
Undertakings to Pay Damages

C. NO PRESUMPTION OF CONSTITUTIONALITY OR PRESERVATION OF THE STATUS QUO

- § 15:7 Generally

D. THE BALANCE OF CONVENIENCE AND THE PUBLIC INTEREST

- § 15:8 Introduction
- § 15:9 No Monopoly on the Public Interest
- § 15:10 Determining the Balance of Convenience
- § 15:11 The Duty to Consult

E. INJUNCTIONS AGAINST ABORIGINAL PROTESTS; SUMMARY

- § 15:12 Injunctions Against Aboriginal Protests

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 15:13 Summary

**III. REMEDIES FOR BREACH OF
CONSTITUTIONAL DUTIES OF
CONSULTATION**

- § 15:14 Introduction
- § 15:15 Remedies for Breach of the Duty to Consult
- § 15:16 Suspending or Quashing of Government Decisions
to allow Development
- § 15:17 Interlocutory Injunctions and Similar Remedies to
Halt Proposed Developments that May Infringe
Aboriginal Rights
- § 15:18 Declarations
- § 15:19 “Declarations Plus”
- § 15:20 Damages and Costs
- § 15:21 Jurisdictional Issues and the Duty to Consult

**IV. REMEDIES FOR PRE-1982
EXTINGUISHMENT OR DIMINUTION OF
ABORIGINAL TITLE**

- § 15:22 Introduction
- § 15:23 Compensation for Expropriation
- § 15:24 No Legal Right to Compensation
- § 15:25 Remedies for Breach of Fiduciary Duty
- § 15:26 Criticisms of the Fiduciary Approach
- § 15:27 Declarations Concerning Government’s
Discharge of Obligations
- § 15:27.50 Pre-1982 Treaty Claims
- § 15:28 Summary

**V. REMEDIES FOR VIOLATIONS OF SECTION
35(1) OF THE CONSTITUTION ACT, 1982**

A. INTRODUCTION

- § 15:29 Generally

**B. REMEDIES IN LITIGATION TO SECURE
ABORIGINAL RIGHTS**

- § 15:30 Introduction
- § 15:31 Declarations
- § 15:32 “Declarations Plus” and Negotiation

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 15:33	Suspended Declarations of Invalidity and Transition Periods
§ 15:34	Other Section 52(1) Remedies: Reading Down and Constitutional Exemptions
§ 15:35	Injunctions and Other Equitable Remedies
§ 15:36	Compensation
§ 15:37	Summary
 C. REMEDIES IN PROSECUTIONS AGAINST ABORIGINAL RIGHTS	
§ 15:38	Generally

VI. CONCLUSION

§ 15:39	Concluding Remarks
---------	--------------------

Index