

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Dedication</i> . . . . .	iii
<i>Preface</i> . . . . .	v
<i>Acknowledgments</i> . . . . .	vii
<i>Table of Cases</i> . . . . .	xix
Chapter 1 A BRIEF HISTORY OF FORENSIC EVIDENCE . . . . . 1	
1. INTRODUCTION .....	1
Evidence Dynamics: Locard’s Exchange Principle & Crime Reconstruction .....	2
1.1. Comments and Further Reading .....	10
Juror Expectations for Scientific Evidence in Criminal Cases: Perceptions and Reality about the “CSI Effect” Myth.....	11
1.2. Further Reading .....	24
Chapter 2 THE ROLE OF THE POLICE, PROSECUTORS, DEFENCE COUNSEL AND JUDGES . . . . .	27
1. INTRODUCTION.....	27
2. THE ROLE OF THE POLICE.....	28
Editorial: The Police and the Public.....	28
2.1 Discussion.....	29
United States v. Wade .....	30
2.2 Questions .....	34
R. v. McArthur .....	34
2.3 Discussion.....	42
R. v. Hennessey .....	42
R. v. Singh .....	46
3. THE ROLE OF THE PROSECUTOR .....	52
R. v. Boucher .....	52
3.1 Discussion & Question .....	54
Berger v. United States .....	54
3.2 Question .....	59
R. v. Babos .....	59
R. v. Rose .....	63
R. v. Rosik .....	69
3.3 Comment .....	73
4. THE ROLE OF THE DEFENCE COUNSEL.....	74
The Law Society of Upper Canada.....	74
4.1 Comments & Further Reading .....	77
R. v. Butt .....	78
R. c. Delisle.....	79

xii      TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

R. v. Li.....	84
North Carolina v. Alford.....	92
4.2 Comment & Further Reading .....	95
R. v. Murray .....	96
4.3 Questions & Further Reading .....	110
R. v. Cottrell .....	110
4.4 Note .....	116
5. THE ROLE OF THE JUDGE.....	116
Ethical Principles for Judges .....	116
R. v. Baltovich .....	130
5.1 Comment & Question .....	141
R. v. Brown.....	141
5.2 Further Reading .....	157
R. v. Gushman .....	157
5.3 Comment .....	169
R. v. Pompeo .....	170
5.4 Comment .....	175
In re Complaint Concerning the Honorable Alberto O. Miera.....	175
5.5 Comment .....	185
Chapter 3 DIRECT, CIRCUMSTANTIAL, REAL AND DEMONSTRATIVE EVIDENCE.....	187
1. INTRODUCTION.....	187
2. DIRECT EVIDENCE.....	188
Missouri v. Famber .....	188
2.1 Further Reading .....	190
R. v. Williams.....	190
2.2 Note .....	191
R. v. Mitchell .....	192
Missouri v. McClure.....	193
Oregon v. Baker .....	195
2.3 Comment & Question .....	197
3. CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE.....	197
R. v. O'Donnell.....	197
3.1 Comment & Question .....	204
People v. Yokum .....	204
R. v. Charemski.....	208
3.2 Question .....	213
R. v. Arcuri .....	213
3.3 Further Reading .....	219
4. REAL EVIDENCE.....	219
Riggie v. Grand Trunk Railway Company.....	219
Gutman v. Industrial Commission .....	221
4.1 Note .....	223

---

TABLE OF CONTENTS      xiii

People v. Kinney .....	223
Western Cottonoil Company v. Adkisson .....	225
R. v. Mondor .....	226
4.2 Further Reading .....	227
5. DEMONSTRATIVE EVIDENCE .....	228
R. v. Bannister .....	228
5.1 Comment & Question .....	228
Smith v. Ohio Oil Company .....	229
R. v. Laverty .....	230
5.2 Comment.....	232
R. v. McDonald .....	232
5.3 Questions.....	241
R. v. Collins .....	241
The Law Society of Upper Canada Special Lectures 2003: The Law of Evidence: Roger G. Oatley, "Demonstrative Evidence: Uses and Abuses" .....	252
 Chapter 4 DISCLOSURE, CONFIDENTIAL RECORDS AND PRIVILEGE .. . . . .	259
1. INTRODUCTION.....	259
2. DISCLOSURE.....	259
R. v. Stinchcombe .....	259
2.1 Comments & Further Reading .....	270
Ontario, Report of the Attorney General's Advisory Committee on Charge Screening, Disclosure and Resolution Discussions .....	271
Brady v. Maryland .....	283
2.2 Further Reading .....	284
R. Hutter.....	284
2.3 Discussion Questions & Further Reading .....	289
R. v. Cleghorn.....	290
2.4 Question .....	292
R. v. Witter .....	293
2.5 Note .....	299
Washington v. Huson .....	300
R. v. Sweeney .....	301
R. v. Worth.....	306
R. v. G.E.M. .....	309
2.6 Comment & Questions .....	311
3. CONFIDENTIAL RECORDS.....	311
R. v. O'Connor .....	311

xiv TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

3.1 Note & Further Reading.....	316
R. v. Carosella.....	316
3.2 Question & Further Reading.....	324
R. v. Mills .....	324
R. v. McNeil .....	340
3.3 Comment.....	351
4. PRIVILEGE .....	351
Solosky v. R.....	351
4.1 Comment .....	353
Desôteaux c. Mierzynski .....	353
R. v. Couture .....	358
R. v. Nguyen.....	363
4.2 Questions & Comment .....	375
R. v. Gruenke.....	375
4.3 Note .....	379
Tarasoff v. The Regents of the University of California .....	379
4.4 Note & Questions .....	383
Smith v. Jones .....	384
Named Person v. Vancouver Sun.....	393
4.5 Further Reading .....	406
Chapter 5 COURTS AND TRIBUNALS .....	407
1. INTRODUCTION.....	407
Supreme Court of Canada .....	408
Administrative Tribunals and the Courts: An Evolutionary Relationship .....	412
Pasiechnyk v. Saskatchewan (Workers' Compensation Board).....	419
1.1 Comment & Further Reading .....	433
Pushpanathan v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship & Immigration) .....	433
1.2 Question .....	439
Ocean Port Hotel Ltd. v. British Columbia (General Manager, Liquor Control & Licensing Branch).....	439
Committee for Justice & Liberty v. Canada (National Energy Board) .....	442
1.3 Comments & Further Reading .....	450
Chapter 6 OVERSIGHT LEGISLATION AND RULES USED BY GOVERNING BODIES .....	451
1. INTRODUCTION.....	451
Foxes, Henhouses, Unfathomable Mysteries, and the Sufferance of the People: A Review of Regulating Professions and Occupations .....	451
1.1 Comment & Question .....	461

---

TABLE OF CONTENTS xv

What Does It Mean to Be a Self-governing Regulated Profession?.....	461
1.2 Note .....	470
2. THE MEDICAL PROFESSION.....	471
Im (Re).....	471
2.1 Comment .....	474
Awad (Re).....	474
2.2 Comment .....	479
3. THE NURSING PROFESSION.....	479
Discipline Committee of the College of Nurses of Ontario .....	479
3.1 Question .....	493
Discipline Committee of the College of Nurses of Ontario .....	493
4. THE ENGINEERING PROFESSION .....	504
Summary of Decision and Reasons.....	504
4.1 Question .....	508
Summary of Decision and Reasons.....	508
4.2 Comment & Further Reading .....	511
5. THE PROFESSION OF SOCIAL WORKING .....	511
Discipline Decision Summary .....	511
5.1 Comment & Question .....	514
Discipline Decision Summary .....	515
5.2 Comment .....	518
6. THE PROFESSION OF ACCOUNTING .....	518
Bull (Re).....	518
6.1 Comment & Questions .....	525
Strohyj (Re).....	525
6.2 Comment .....	532
Chapter 7 TRIAL DELAYS AND ISSUES PERTAINING TO MEMORY.....	533
1. INTRODUCTION.....	533
Bedeviled by Delay: Straight Talk About Memory Loss, Procedural Manipulation and the Myth of Swift Justice .....	534
1.1 Comment & Question .....	543
Barker v. Wingo .....	543
1.2 Comment & Further Reading .....	551
United States v. Lovasco .....	552
1.3 Comment & Further Reading .....	557
R. v. Askov .....	557
1.4 Note & Question.....	568
R. v. Morin .....	568
1.5 Comment & Questions .....	585

xvi TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

R. v. R.D.R.....	585
1.6 Questions .....	590
R. v. Jordan .....	590
1.7 Comments and Further Reading .....	598
Chapter 8 CHALLENGING AND ADMITTING EXPERT TESTIMONY .....	599
1. INTRODUCTION.....	599
Frye v. United States.....	600
1.1 Comment & Further Reading .....	601
Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals Inc. ....	602
1.2 Comment .....	607
R. v. Mohan.....	608
1.3 Question .....	613
R. v. Fatima.....	613
1.4 Comment & Questions .....	615
R. v. Zwezdaryk .....	615
1.5 Note .....	627
R. v. Marquard .....	628
1.6 Comment.....	636
R. v. Giroux .....	636
1.7 Comments.....	645
Blank v. Canada (Department of Justice).....	645
1.8 Comment .....	652
R. v. Medwid .....	652
1.9 Comment .....	655
R. v. Ghorvei .....	656
1.10 Comment & Question.....	660
R. v. Karaibrahimovic .....	660
1.11 Comment .....	664
Desbiens v. Mordini .....	664
1.12 Comment .....	667
White Burgess Langille Inman v. Abbott and Haliburton Co.....	668
1.13 Comment .....	680
Chapter 9 ETHICALITY, JUNK SCIENCE AND THE MISCARRIAGE OF JUSTICE .....	681
1. INTRODUCTION.....	681
When “Experts” Speak, Should Judges Listen: Some Basic Science Lessons.....	681
1.1 Comments.....	689
Expert Witness Ethics.....	689
1.2 Comment & Further Reading .....	699
Ethicality and the Expert Witness: Remembering What Hangs in the Balance .....	699
1.3 Comment & Question .....	703

---

TABLE OF CONTENTS xvii

Ontario, <i>The Commission on Proceedings Involving Guy Paul Morin</i> .....	703
1.4 Comment & Question .....	717
R. v. Bianco .....	718
1.5 Comment .....	724
R. v. Paul .....	724
1.6 Comment .....	734
R. v. Lawrence .....	735
1.7 Note .....	738
Ontario, <i>Inquiry into Pediatric Forensic Pathology in Ontario</i> .....	738
1.8 Comment .....	752
R. v. Kumar .....	752
1.9 Comments & Questions .....	761
R. v. Olscamp .....	761
1.10 Further Reading .....	772
Banks v. State .....	772
1.11 Further Reading .....	776
Pierce v. Gilchrist .....	777
1.12 Note & Questions .....	785
R. v. Palombi .....	785
R. v. Truscott .....	789
1.13 Comment .....	814
<i>Index</i> .....	815