

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgments</i> .....	iii
<i>Table of Cases</i> .....	xi

## CHAPTER 1: THE HUMAN RIGHTS SYSTEM IN ONTARIO

1. RECENT CHANGES TO THE ONTARIO HUMAN RIGHTS SYSTEM .....	1
2. THE ROLE OF THE TRIBUNAL.....	3
(a) Applications Before the Tribunal .....	7
(b) Mediations and Hearings Before the Tribunal.....	9
(i) Mediations .....	9
(ii) Tribunal Decisions.....	9
3. THE HUMAN RIGHTS LEGAL SUPPORT CENTRE .....	10
(a) Eligibility for Representation by the HRLSC.....	11
4. THE ROLE OF THE COMMISSION .....	13
(a) Commission as Applicant.....	16
(b) Commission as Intervenor in Tribunal Applications.....	17
(c) Commission as Intervenor in Court Cases .....	22
(d) References to the Commission .....	23

## CHAPTER 2: THE APPLICATION

1. PARTIES TO AN APPLICATION .....	25
2. PROCEDURE FOR FILING AN APPLICATION.....	26
3. TIMELINESS OF AN APPLICATION .....	27
(a) Discrete Incidents vs. Single Act with Continuing Effects.....	28
(b) Incidents of Similar Nature or Character .....	30
(c) Time Between Incidents.....	32
(d) Extending the Limitation Period.....	33
(i) Was the Delay Incurred in Good Faith?.....	33
(ii) Will the Respondent Suffer Substantial Prejudice?.....	36
4. REQUIREMENTS OF A COMPLETE APPLICATION .....	37
(a) Contact Information.....	37
(b) Authorized Representatives .....	38
(c) Naming the Respondent .....	40
(d) Substance of Application and Early Dismissal Where Application Outside of Jurisdiction.....	42
(e) Remedy Requested .....	45
(f) Mediation .....	45
(g) Other Proceedings.....	45
(h) Documents and Witnesses.....	46

**CHAPTER 3: THE RESPONSE**

1. CONSIDERATIONS IN PREPARING THE RESPONSE.....	47
(a) Timelines and Process for Filing of the Response.....	48
(b) Penalties for Failing to File a Response.....	49
(c) Naming Additional Respondents .....	49
(i) Allegation of Workplace Harassment.....	50
(ii) Two or More Employers Controlled the Applicant's Employment .....	51
(d) Affected Persons .....	52
(e) Statutory Defences.....	53
2. REQUESTING DISMISSAL OF AN APPLICATION WITHOUT A FULL RESPONSE.....	55
(a) Concurrent Civil Claim .....	56
(b) Execution of a Full and Final Release .....	58
(c) Federal Jurisdiction .....	60
3. REQUESTING DISMISSAL WITH A FULL RESPONSE.....	62
(a) The Evolution of Section 45.1 of the <i>Code</i> .....	62
(b) The Impact of <i>Penner</i> on Section 45.1 .....	66
(i) Disciplinary Hearings.....	67
(ii) WSIB Proceedings .....	68
(iii) Arbitration Proceedings.....	71
(iv) Employment Standards Adjudications.....	73
4. REQUESTING DEFERRAL OF AN APPLICATION .....	74

**CHAPTER 4: THE REPLY**

1. WHEN A REPLY IS APPROPRIATE.....	77
2. WHEN IS A REPLY NOT APPROPRIATE .....	78
3. TIMELINE FOR FILING THE REPLY .....	81

**CHAPTER 5: MEDIATION**

1. SCHEDULING OF MEDIATIONS AND ADJOURNMENT REQUESTS.....	83
2. THE MEDIATION PROCESS AT THE TRIBUNAL .....	86
3. TERMS OF SETTLEMENT .....	87
(a) Payment Terms.....	87
(b) Confidentiality .....	88
(c) No Admission of Liability.....	89
(d) Public Interest Remedies.....	90
(e) Release and Indemnity.....	90
(f) Execution of a Form 25 and/or a Form 9.....	90
(g) Independent Legal Advice/No Duress .....	92

4. ENFORCING TERMS OF SETTLEMENT .....	94
(a) Procedural Steps to Enforcement.....	94
(b) Determining Whether a Contravention Has Occurred .....	96
5. COMMON CONTRAVENTIONS OF SETTLEMENT .....	97
(a) Non-Payment of Settlement Funds.....	97
(b) Delay.....	98
(c) Non-Performance/Inadequate Performance.....	99
(d) Breach of Confidentiality.....	101
6. REMEDIES FOR A CONTRAVENTION OF THE SETTLEMENT	
AGREEMENT .....	105
(a) The Tribunal’s General Approach to Remedies.....	105
(i) Nature of the Breach.....	106
(ii) Fulfillment of the Terms of Settlement.....	107
(iii) Expectation of the Parties.....	107
(iv) Material Harm and Harm to Dignity, Feelings and	
Self-Respect.....	107
(b) Specific Performance .....	108
(c) Damages .....	109
(d) Interest .....	112
(e) Legal Fees.....	113

#### **CHAPTER 6: DOCUMENT DISCLOSURE IN TRIBUNAL PROCEEDINGS**

1. TIMELINES FOR DOCUMENT DISCLOSURE.....	115
(a) The Obligation to Disclose All “Arguably Relevant” Documents .....	115
(b) The Obligation to Disclose “Reliance” Documents.....	120
(c) Non-Compliance with the Tribunal’s Disclosure Requirements .....	121
2. SPECIFIC DOCUMENT PRODUCTION ISSUES.....	124
(a) Disclosure of Settlement Documentation .....	124
(b) Disclosure of Documents Produced in the Course of Civil	
Proceedings.....	127
(c) Disclosure of Investigation Reports.....	129
(d) Disclosure of Medical Records.....	131
(i) Medical Evidence as Proof of Disability .....	131
(ii) Medical Evidence used to Substantiate Remedial Claim .....	134
(iii) Medical Evidence in the Respondent’s Possession.....	134
(iv) WSIB Information in the Respondent’s Possession .....	138
(v) Limits Imposed on Document Production.....	140

#### **CHAPTER 7: WITNESS STATEMENTS**

1. CONTENT OF WITNESS STATEMENTS.....	145
2. TIMELINES AND PENALTIES FOR NON-COMPLIANCE.....	148

3. AFFIDAVIT EVIDENCE .....	150
-----------------------------	-----

#### **CHAPTER 8: REQUESTS FOR ORDERS DURING PROCEEDINGS**

1. PROCEDURE FOR REQUESTING AND RESPONDING TO RFOPs .....	153
2. REQUEST TO CONSOLIDATE OR HAVE APPLICATIONS HEARD TOGETHER .....	155
3. REQUEST TO ADD OR REMOVE A PARTY.....	159
4. REQUEST TO AMEND APPLICATION OR RESPONSE.....	168
(a) Nature of the Proposed Amendment.....	169
(b) Reasons for the Amendment .....	172
(c) Timing of the Request to Amend and Prejudice.....	173
5. REQUEST TO DEFER APPLICATION .....	175
6. REQUEST TO REACTIVATE DEFERRED APPLICATION.....	178
(a) Reason for the Delay .....	181
(b) Prejudice to the Opposing Party.....	184
7. REQUEST FOR PARTICULARS.....	185
8. REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS .....	190
9. OTHER RFOPs .....	191
(a) Separate Applications.....	191
(b) Bifurcation the Hearing.....	191
(c) Order to Transcribe.....	192
(d) Request for Names and Contact Information.....	192

#### **CHAPTER 9: SUMMARY HEARINGS**

1. SUMMARY HEARING PROCEDURE .....	193
2. SUBSTANTIVE CONSIDERATIONS AT THE SUMMARY HEARING STAGE.....	198
(a) Assuming the Allegations are True, Does the Application have no Reasonable Prospect of Success? .....	200
(b) Is There a Reasonable Prospect the Applicant will be able to Prove his or her Rights under the <i>Code</i> were Violated?.....	204

#### **CHAPTER 10: THE HEARING**

1. SCHEDULING OF HEARING DATES AND ADJOURNMENT REQUESTS .....	211
2. EXPEDITED HEARINGS.....	215
3. MEDIATION—ADJUDICATION AT THE OUTSET OF HEARING.....	218
4. PUBLICATION BANS AND CLOSED HEARINGS.....	220
5. THE HEARING PROCESS GENERALLY .....	223

6. EVIDENTIARY ISSUES BEFORE THE TRIBUNAL .....	223
(a) Summoning of Witnesses.....	223
(b) The Legal Burden of Proof Before the Tribunal.....	226
(c) Assessment of Credibility Before the Tribunal .....	227
(d) Similar Fact Evidence .....	229
(e) Hearsay Evidence.....	231
7. DISMISSAL OF AN APPLICATION IN THE COURSE OF HEARING .....	232
8. CONDUCT DURING THE HEARING PROCESS .....	235

### CHAPTER 11: REMEDIES

1. NON-MONETARY REMEDIES.....	238
(a) Reinstatement .....	238
(b) Apology.....	242
(c) Order to Hire.....	242
(d) Cease and Desist .....	243
(e) Other .....	244
2. GENERAL DAMAGES.....	245
3. SPECIAL DAMAGES .....	268
(a) Damages for Lost Income and Employment Benefits.....	268
(b) Damages for Lost Opportunity .....	273
(c) Other Special Damages .....	275
4. PUBLIC INTEREST REMEDIES .....	277
5. INTERIM REMEDIES.....	279
(a) The Application Appears to Have Merit .....	281
(b) The Balance of Harm or Convenience Favours an Interim Remedy ..	281
(c) It is Just and Appropriate to Award the Interim Remedy .....	282

### CHAPTER 12: REQUESTS FOR RECONSIDERATION

1. REQUESTS FOR RECONSIDERATION UNDER THE <i>CODE</i> .....	285
2. THE RECONSIDERATION PROCESS .....	287
3. FACTORS CONSIDERED IN A REQUEST FOR RECONSIDERATION ...	288
(a) New Facts and Evidence .....	289
(b) Failure to Notify Party .....	290
(c) Conflict with Established Jurisprudence .....	292
(a) Other Factors .....	293
4. RECONSIDERATION OF INTERIM VERSUS FINAL DECISIONS .....	295
5. INTERSECTION BETWEEN REQUESTS FOR RECONSIDERATION AND JUDICIAL REVIEW .....	297

**CHAPTER 13: JUDICIAL REVIEW OF TRIBUNAL DECISIONS**

1. JUDICIAL REVIEW UNDER THE <i>CODE</i> .....	301
2. THE APPROPRIATE STANDARD OF REVIEW.....	304
3. INTERSECTION BETWEEN REQUESTS FOR RECONSIDERATION AND JUDICIAL REVIEW.....	308
4. COST AWARDS ON JUDICIAL REVIEW.....	309
<i>Index</i> .....	313