

# Table of Contents

Preface.....	iii
Table of Cases.....	xix
<b>Chapter 1 Introduction</b>	
1.1 Scope of work.....	1
1.2 Dicey's idea of equality.....	2
1.3 History of Crown proceedings.....	4
(a) Origin of petition of right.....	4
(b) Equitable relief.....	6
(c) Contract and tort.....	6
(d) Royal fiat.....	8
(e) Statutory reform.....	8
(f) Judicial reform.....	10
1.4 Meaning of the Crown.....	11
(a) Executive branch of government.....	11
(b) Crown agency.....	13
(c) Divisibility.....	13
(d) Corporate character.....	16
1.5 Powers of the Crown.....	18
(a) Statutory powers.....	18
(b) Crown prerogative.....	19
(c) Judicial review of Crown powers.....	25
<b>Chapter 2 Remedies</b>	
2.1 Introduction.....	30
2.2 Damages.....	32
(a) Definition.....	32
(b) Crown liability.....	32
(c) Tortious liability.....	32
(d) Punitive damages.....	33
(e) Interest on damages.....	34
2.3 Declaration.....	37
(a) Definition.....	37
(b) Crown liability.....	37
(c) Crown proceedings statutes.....	38

(d)	Dyson procedure .....	38
(e)	Interlocutory declaration .....	39
(f)	Suspended declaration .....	42
(g)	Constitutional declaration.....	44
2.4	Injunction.....	45
(a)	Definition .....	45
(b)	Crown immunity .....	46
(c)	Crown servants.....	46
(d)	Lack of legal authority .....	48
(e)	Mandatory injunction .....	48
(f)	Interlocutory injunction.....	49
(g)	Constitutional injunction.....	50
(h)	Personal or official capacity .....	52
(i)	Justification for Crown immunity .....	54
2.5	Specific performance .....	56
(a)	Definition .....	56
(b)	Crown immunity .....	56
2.6	Mandamus.....	57
(a)	Definition .....	57
(b)	Crown immunity .....	57
(c)	Persona designata .....	57
(d)	Constitutional mandamus .....	58
(e)	Justification for Crown immunity .....	59
2.7	Prohibition and certiorari.....	60
(a)	Definition .....	60
(b)	Crown immunity .....	60
2.8	Habeas corpus.....	61
(a)	Definition .....	61
(b)	Crown liability.....	62
(c)	Constitutional guarantee.....	62
2.9	Application for judicial review .....	63
(a)	Definition .....	63
(b)	Crown immunity .....	63
2.10	Collateral attack.....	63
(a)	Definition of collateral attack.....	63
(b)	Collateral attack in inferior courts.....	65
(c)	Collateral attack in superior courts.....	65

(d) Collateral attack criminal proceedings .....	66
(e) Collateral attack in civil proceedings .....	67
2.11 Set-off .....	71
(a) Definition .....	71
(b) Crown immunity .....	71
(c) Statutory reform .....	72
2.12 Proceedings in rem.....	72
(a) Definition .....	72
(b) Crown immunity .....	73
2.13 Proceedings by the Crown .....	74

### **Chapter 3 Enforcement of Judgments**

3.1 Execution .....	75
(a) Definition of execution.....	75
(b) Crown immunity .....	75
(c) Duty to pay judgment debts.....	76
(d) Interest on judgment debts .....	78
(e) Legislative nullification.....	78
(f) Justification for Crown immunity .....	79
3.2 Garnishment.....	80
(a) Definition of garnishment .....	80
(b) Crown as judgment debtor .....	80
(c) Crown as garnishee .....	81
3.3 Contempt.....	82
(a) Definition of contempt .....	82
(b) Crown immunity .....	82
(c) Justification for Crown immunity .....	84

### **Chapter 4 Procedure**

4.1 General rule.....	87
4.2 Discovery.....	89
(a) Definition .....	89
(b) Crown immunity .....	90
(c) Statutory reform .....	90
(d) Designation of Crown representative .....	91
(e) Residual immunity .....	92
(f) Crown privilege.....	93
4.3 Costs .....	94

(a)	Definition .....	94
(b)	Crown immunity .....	94
(c)	Statutory reform .....	94
(d)	Advance costs.....	95
4.4	Interest .....	98
(a)	Prejudgment interest.....	98
(b)	Postjudgment interest.....	98
4.5	Limitation of actions.....	98
(a)	Definition .....	98
(b)	Crown immunity .....	98
(c)	Statutory reform of limitation law.....	99
(d)	Limitation periods in the provinces.....	100
(e)	Limitation periods in the federal jurisdiction.....	102
(f)	Constitutional claims.....	105
4.6	Notice requirements.....	107
(a)	Definition .....	107
(b)	Post-accident notice.....	108
(c)	Pre-accident notice .....	110
(d)	Constitutional notice .....	111

## **Chapter 5 Evidence**

5.1	Definition of public interest immunity.....	114
5.2	Comparison with other privileges.....	114
5.3	Procedure .....	116
(a)	General.....	116
(b)	Form of claim.....	116
(c)	Claim made before trial.....	117
(d)	Claim made during trial.....	118
(e)	Representation of Crown.....	119
5.4	Judicial review .....	120
(a)	History.....	120
(b)	Balancing of interests.....	122
(c)	Balancing in criminal cases.....	124
(d)	Inspection .....	125
(e)	Disclosure.....	125
(f)	Disclosure of Crown brief.....	126
(g)	Disclosure under Canada Evidence Act .....	128

5.5	Class claims .....	129
	(a) General rule.....	129
	(b) Candour in public service.....	129
5.6	Cabinet documents.....	130
	(a) Common law .....	130
	(b) Canada Evidence Act, s. 39.....	132
5.7	National security .....	136
5.8	Oral evidence .....	140
5.9	Real evidence.....	142
5.10	Informer privilege.....	142
	(a) Nature of informer privilege.....	142
	(b) Scope of informer privilege.....	146
	(c) Other confidential information .....	148
5.11	Confidentiality laws .....	148
5.12	Freedom of information laws.....	149

## **Chapter 6 Tort: General Principles**

6.1	History .....	152
	(a) Crown immunity .....	152
	(b) Early statutory reform .....	152
	(c) United Kingdom reform of 1947.....	154
	(d) Australia and New Zealand .....	156
	(e) Canada.....	156
6.2	Vicarious liability .....	159
	(a) Definition of vicarious liability .....	159
	(b) Direct liability compared.....	159
	(c) Crown servant .....	160
	(i) Liability for tort of Crown servant: General rule.....	160
	(ii) Definition of Crown servant .....	161
	(iii) Identification of Crown servant .....	162
	(iv) Independent contractor .....	163
	(v) Crown agent.....	166
	(d) Commission of tort by servant .....	167
	(i) Commission of tort by servant: General rule.....	167
	(ii) Statutory immunity clauses.....	167
	(iii) Enforcement of criminal law .....	168
	(iv) Judicial functions .....	169

(e)	Course of employment .....	171
(i)	Course of employment: General rule .....	171
(ii)	De facto authority .....	172
(iii)	Independent discretion .....	173
(f)	Policy favouring vicarious liability .....	175
6.3	Direct liability .....	176
(a)	Crown liability .....	176
(b)	Employers' duties .....	178
(c)	Occupiers' duties .....	179
(d)	Statutory duties .....	180
(e)	Other duties and reform of direct liability .....	182
6.4	Lack of legal authority .....	188
(a)	General rule .....	188
(b)	Compensation under statute .....	188
(c)	Compensation under prerogative .....	188
(d)	Significance of legal authority .....	189
(e)	Interpretation of statutory authority .....	190
6.5	Commission of a tort .....	194
(a)	Recognized heads of liability .....	194
(b)	Negligence .....	196
(c)	Misfeasance in a public office .....	197
(d)	Constitutional torts .....	201
6.6	Reform .....	206
(a)	Compensation based on invalidity .....	206
(b)	Compensation based on risk .....	213
(c)	Compensation based on entitlement .....	217
(d)	A public law of torts .....	218

## **Chapter 7 Tort: Negligence**

7.1	Definition of negligence .....	221
7.2	Duty of care .....	223
(a)	Definition of duty of care .....	223
(b)	The <i>Anns/Kamloops</i> test .....	224
(i)	Description of the <i>Anns/Kamloops</i> test .....	224
(ii)	The policy/operational distinction .....	225
(iii)	Criticism of the <i>Anns/Kamloops</i> test .....	228
(c)	The <i>Anns/Cooper</i> test .....	231

(i) Description of the <i>Anns/Cooper</i> test .....	231
(ii) Proximity .....	232
(iii) Residual policy considerations .....	244
7.3 Special categories of negligence .....	248
(a) Introduction to special categories of negligence .....	248
(b) Pure economic loss .....	249
(i) Evolution of liability for pure economic loss .....	249
(ii) Independent liability of statutory public authorities .....	251
(iii) Negligent misrepresentation .....	254
(c) Nonfeasance .....	256
(d) Peculiarly governmental activity .....	261
(i) Evolution of liability for peculiarly governmental activity .....	261
(ii) Military activity .....	264
7.4 Invalidity .....	267
7.5 Reform .....	273

## **Chapter 8 Tort: Liability of Servants**

8.1 Personal liability in general .....	275
8.2 State necessity .....	276
(a) General rule .....	276
(b) Act of state .....	277
8.3 Legal authority .....	278
8.4 Statutory immunity .....	279
8.5 Judicial immunity .....	283
(a) Common law protection .....	283
(b) Superior court judges .....	284
(c) Inferior court judges .....	286
(d) Statutory protection .....	289
8.6 Prosecutorial immunity .....	292
8.7 Immunity from defamation proceedings .....	298
(a) Judicial proceedings .....	298
(b) High executive communications .....	299
(c) Critique of immunity .....	301

## **Chapter 9 Contract**

9.1 Introduction .....	304
9.2 Private law of contract .....	304
9.3 Intention to create contractual relations .....	307

(a)	Government promises .....	307
(b)	Statutory provisions.....	308
(c)	Election promises .....	308
(d)	Policy promises .....	309
(e)	Tendering contracts .....	311
9.4	Power of Crown to make contracts .....	313
(a)	Power of a natural person.....	313
(b)	Statutory authority.....	315
(c)	Legislative appropriation.....	316
(d)	Constitutional limits .....	318
(e)	Statutory limits .....	320
9.5	Power of Crown servants to make contracts .....	322
(a)	General rules of agency.....	322
(b)	Statutory limits .....	323
9.6	Fettering legislative power.....	324
(a)	Direct fettering of legislative power.....	324
(b)	Indirect fettering of legislative power .....	325
(c)	The <i>Pacific National</i> case.....	326
(d)	Policy reasons for permitting indirect fettering .....	329
(e)	Conclusion on fettering legislative power .....	331
9.7	Liability of Crown servants .....	332
(a)	General rule of immunity .....	332
(b)	Warranty of authority .....	332
(c)	Agent's personal liability .....	333
9.8	Contracts with Crown servants .....	333
(a)	Application of general law of contract .....	333
(b)	Action for loss of services .....	339

## **Chapter 10 Restitution**

10.1	Definition of restitution.....	341
10.2	Crown liability for restitution .....	342
10.3	Benefit to Crown.....	343
10.4	Detriment to plaintiff .....	345
10.5	No juristic reason for enrichment.....	347
10.6	Recovery of unauthorized taxes .....	348
(a)	General right of recovery .....	348
(b)	Uncertainty before <i>Kingstreet</i> decision .....	349

(c) The <i>Kingstreet</i> decision.....	352
(d) The passing-on defence.....	354
(e) Limitation periods .....	354

## **Chapter 11 Taking**

11.1 Constitutional power to take property.....	357
11.2 Crown property .....	359
11.3 Compensation for taking.....	360
(a) No constitutional right to compensation.....	360
(b) Statutory right to compensation.....	362
11.4 Regulation of property .....	363
11.5 Constructive taking .....	364
11.6 Extinguishment of contractual rights .....	367

## **Chapter 12 Trust**

12.1 Definition of trust.....	369
12.2 Crown liability as trustee .....	369
12.3 Political trusts .....	370
12.4 Crown's duties as trustee .....	371
12.5 Crown as fiduciary.....	372
(a) Definition of fiduciary.....	372
(b) Crown liability as fiduciary.....	373
(c) No ordinary fiduciary .....	374
(d) Legislation modifying fiduciary duty.....	376
(e) Conclusion on Crown as fiduciary .....	379

## **Chapter 13 Estoppel**

13.1 Definition of estoppel .....	381
13.2 Crown bound by estoppel .....	382
13.3 Estoppel and statutory duties. ....	383
13.4 Estoppel and statutory powers .....	383
13.5 Res judicata.....	385

## **Chapter 14 Crown as Creditor**

14.1 Legal proceedings by Crown .....	387
14.2 Prerogative of priority.....	387
14.3 Competing Crown debts .....	388
14.4 Statutory abolition of Crown priority.....	389
14.5 Statutory reinforcement of Crown priority .....	391

## Chapter 15 Statutes

15.1	Subjection to common law.....	396
15.2	Subjection to statute law .....	396
15.3	Presumption of Crown immunity.....	397
	(a) Rule of construction .....	397
	(b) Rights peculiar to the Crown.....	400
	(c) Public good.....	400
	(d) Necessary implication .....	400
	(e) Modern version of presumption .....	401
15.4	Effect of Interpretation Acts .....	406
	(a) Codification of presumption.....	406
	(b) Reversal of presumption.....	409
15.5	Express words.....	410
15.6	Necessary implication.....	411
	(a) Exception to immunity .....	411
	(b) Purpose of statute .....	411
	(c) Other indications in statute.....	412
	(d) Displacement of prerogative .....	415
15.7	Benefit of statutes .....	417
	(a) Requirement of prejudice .....	417
	(b) No effect on Crown.....	418
	(c) Beneficial effect on Crown.....	418
	(d) Burden linked to benefit.....	420
15.8	Implied term of contract.....	424
15.9	Commercial activity.....	425
15.10	Incorporation by reference .....	427
	(a) Crown liability.....	427
	(b) Ambulatory or static.....	428
	(c) Interjurisdictional liability.....	429
15.11	Provincial Crown as defendant .....	429
	(a) Right-of-the-parties provision .....	429
	(b) Procedural rights .....	430
	(c) Substantive rights .....	430
	(d) Ambulatory effect .....	432
	(e) “As nearly as possible”.....	433
15.12	Federal Crown as defendant.....	435
	(a) Absence of rights-of-the-parties provision .....	435

(b) Proceedings in contract .....	435
(c) Proceedings in tort.....	435
15.13 Crown as plaintiff .....	437
15.14 Criminal liability .....	440
(a) Strict liability offences .....	440
(b) Mens rea offences.....	443
15.15 Crown agents and servants.....	445
(a) Requirement of prejudice .....	445
(b) Crown agents.....	445
(c) Crown servants.....	446
(d) Crown contractors .....	448
(e) Crown premises.....	449
15.16 Federal complications .....	450
(a) Scope of presumption.....	450
(b) Meaning of “the Crown” .....	452
(c) Crown bound by necessary implication .....	455
15.17 Reform .....	456
(a) Criticism of presumption.....	456
(b) Reversal of presumption.....	459

## **Chapter 16 Crown agents**

16.1 Agent of the Crown.....	461
16.2 Crown agent at common law .....	463
(a) Functions test .....	463
(b) Control test.....	465
16.3 Crown agent by statute.....	468
(a) General rule.....	468
(b) Ultra vires activity .....	470
16.4 Liability of Crown agent.....	472
(a) Introduction .....	472
(b) Liability to be sued.....	472
(c) Liability under substantive law .....	474
(d) Tort.....	475
(e) Contract.....	478
(f) Crown immunities .....	479
16.5 Conclusion .....	481

## **Chapter 17 Federal Questions**

17.1 Federalism.....	483
17.2 State immunity in international law .....	484
17.3 Jurisdiction of courts.....	485
(a) Crown immunity .....	485
(b) Suits against Crown in right of provinces .....	485
(c) Suits against Crown in right of Canada.....	488
(d) Suits by Crown.....	493
(e) Suits between governments.....	494
17.4 Choice of law .....	496
(a) Which law applies? .....	496
(b) Liability of Crown in right of Canada .....	497
(c) Crown in right of Canada as plaintiff.....	498
17.5 Federal common law.....	498
(a) Federal common law in the United States .....	498
(b) Federal common law in Canada .....	499
<b>Chapter 18 Conclusion</b>	
.....	501
Selected Bibliography .....	507
Index.....	517