

# Table of Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i> .....	xiii
<b>Chapter 1 INTRODUCTION</b> .....	1
1. Prefatory Remarks .....	1
2. An Attempt to Commit an Offence is an Offence in its Own Right ...	3
3. Definitional Elements .....	3
4. Introductory Comments on the General Attempt Provision in the Canadian <i>Criminal Code</i> .....	4
5. Importance and Difficulty .....	7
<b>Chapter 2 HISTORICAL ASPECTS</b> .....	9
1. Introduction .....	9
2. Roman Law .....	10
3. Scandinavia .....	10
4. Continental Europe .....	10
5. The Common Law — and Scotland .....	11
6. Conclusion .....	12
<b>Chapter 3 WHY PUNISH ATTEMPT?</b> .....	15
1. Introduction .....	15
2. Objective and Subjective — The Two Major Approaches .....	20
(a) Objective — Social Danger, Functional .....	21
(b) Subjective — Personal Intent, Conceptual .....	24

3.	The Conventional Criteria of Punishment as Applied to Attempts ....	28
	(a) Deterrence .....	29
	(b) Retribution .....	32
	(c) Rehabilitation .....	34
	(d) Law Enforcement and Intervention .....	36
	(e) Harm .....	39
	(f) Policy .....	42
4.	Conclusion .....	43
<b>Chapter 4 THE MENTAL REQUIREMENT — <i>MENS REA</i></b> .....		45
1.	Introduction .....	45
	(a) Terminology .....	45
	(b) <i>Mens Rea Per Se</i> is not Criminal .....	47
	(c) An Exception to the “ <i>Mens Rea Per Se</i> is not Criminal” Principle: Treason .....	55
2.	The <i>Mens Rea</i> of Attempt: Only a “Direct” Intent will Suffice .....	57
3.	An Exception for the <i>Mens Rea</i> of Attempt .....	62
4.	Recklessness as the <i>Mens Rea</i> for Attempt .....	79
	(a) No Substantial Doubt .....	81
	(b) A “Virtual Certainty” .....	83
	(c) Trends toward Objective <i>Mens Rea</i> in Canada .....	86
5.	Intent as to Consequences; Recklessness as to Circumstances? .....	99
6.	Negligence as <i>Mens Rea</i> for Attempt? .....	102
7.	Strict Liability? .....	107
8.	Conditional Intent .....	111
9.	Transferred Intent .....	117
10.	Conclusion .....	119
<b>Chapter 5 THE FACTUAL REQUIREMENT — <i>ACTUS REUS</i></b> .....		121
1.	Introduction .....	121
	(a) Prefatory Remarks .....	121
	(b) Functions of the Judge and Jury vis-à-vis the <i>Actus Reus</i> .....	131
	(c) “It Depends on the Particular Facts” .....	137
	(d) Attempt Committed by Omission .....	139
2.	Proximity Test .....	142
3.	First Stage Theories .....	155
4.	Commencement of the Execution Test .....	161
5.	Final Stage Theories .....	165
	(a) Last Act Test .....	165
	(b) Penultimate Act Test .....	170
	(c) Possibility of Intervention Theory .....	172
	(d) Probability of Desistance Theory .....	172

6.	Dangerousness Test .....	176
7.	Equivocality Test .....	184
8.	Substantial Step Test .....	196
9.	Control Approach and Indispensable Element Approach .....	208
10.	Causation Theory .....	210
11.	“Culpability Otherwise Required for the Commission of the Crime Attempted” Test .....	211
12.	The “Common Sense” Test .....	212
13.	“Discretion of the Courts” Test .....	213
14.	“Likely to End in Consummation” Test .....	214
15.	Commitment Test .....	215
16.	Abnormal Step (Probability of Desistance) Theory .....	216
17.	The “Commission of Another Crime Constitutes by itself an Attempt” Theory .....	216
18.	Professor Stuart: A Subjective Test, being Alternatively the Proximity Test or Probability of Desistance Theory .....	217
19.	Indeterminate Tests .....	218
20.	Guidelines .....	218
21.	Conclusion .....	220
 <b>Chapter 6 IMPOSSIBILITY .....</b>		<b>223</b>
1.	Introduction .....	223
	(a) Preface .....	223
	(b) Impossibility or Statutory Interpretation? .....	224
	(c) The Legal Impossibility and Factual Impossibility Distinction .....	229
2.	Categories of Impossibility .....	232
	(a) Non-existence of Something in the External World .....	232
	(i) The Empty Pocket .....	232
	(ii) The Vacuous Womb .....	238
	(iii) The Absent Ambush Victim .....	242
	(iv) The Trying Tree Stump .....	245
	(v) The Ubiquitous Umbrella .....	247
	(vi) The Non-Existent Narcotics .....	249
	(b) Lack of an Essential Quality .....	250
	(i) The Poisoning Posers .....	250
	(ii) The Bungled Bullet .....	252
	(iii) Attempted Fraud and False Pretences, Extortion, and Corruption .....	256
	(iv) Lady Eldon’s Lace .....	259
	(v) Magical Mysteries .....	261
	(c) Personal Incapacity .....	263
	(i) Age .....	263

x THE LAW OF CRIMINAL ATTEMPT

(ii)	Incapable Rapist .....	268
(d)	The Receiver, the Launderer, the Fence — Three Bags Full ...	269
3.	Are there any Offences which cannot be Attempted? .....	286
(a)	Attempt Contemplated in Substantive Offences .....	287
(b)	Attempting Omission Crimes .....	289
(c)	Substantive Offences of Recklessness and other Lesser <i>Mens Rea</i> .....	290
(d)	Attempts to Extort, Purger, Riot, and Libel .....	291
(e)	Attempting Attempt, Conspiracy, and Other Inchoate Offences .....	292
4.	Conspiracy to do the Impossible .....	298
5.	Three Possible Solutions to Impossibility .....	301
(a)	Reasonable Person .....	301
(b)	The English Law Commission, the <i>Criminal Attempts Act 1981</i> , the House of Lords, and the Supreme Court of Canada .....	303
(c)	The American Model Penal Code .....	304
6.	Conclusion .....	307
<b>Chapter 7 ABANDONMENT OF THE ATTEMPT .....</b>		<b>311</b>
1.	Introduction .....	311
2.	Anglo-Canadian Position .....	312
3.	Australia .....	317
4.	South Africa .....	319
5.	United States .....	320
6.	Considerations for and against the Defence of Abandonment .....	323
(a)	For the Defence .....	323
(b)	Against the Defence .....	326
7.	Conclusion .....	328
<b>Chapter 8 SUCCESSFUL ATTEMPTS AND MERGER .....</b>		<b>331</b>
<b>Chapter 9 EVIDENTIAL AND PROCEDURAL CONSIDERATIONS .....</b>		<b>347</b>
1.	Introduction .....	347
2.	Drafting the Information and Indictment .....	347
3.	Accomplices and Attempt .....	351
(a)	Aiding and Abetting; Accomplices (Section 21) .....	351
(b)	Counselling (Section 22) .....	354
(c)	Accessory After the Fact (Section 23) .....	355
4.	Provocation .....	357

5.	Self Defence .....	362
6.	Attempting Indictable Offences .....	362
7.	Attempting Summary Offences .....	363
8.	Attempting Hybrid Offences .....	365
9.	Similar Fact Evidence .....	365
10.	Verdict .....	366
11.	Attempted Offences by Corporations .....	367
 <b>Chapter 10 SENTENCING .....</b>		<b>371</b>
 <b>Chapter 11 GENERAL ATTEMPT PROVISIONS .....</b>		<b>377</b>
 <b>Chapter 12 SPECIFIC ATTEMPT PROVISIONS .....</b>		<b>383</b>
1.	Specific Attempt in Federal Legislation .....	383
2.	Specific Attempt, or “Preliminary” Offences, as an Answer to the Inadequacies of General Attempt Provisions? .....	386
 <b>Chapter 13 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR LEGISLATIVE REFORM .....</b>		<b>391</b>
1.	Introduction .....	391
2.	The Mental Requirement — <i>Mens Rea</i> .....	392
3.	The Factual Requirement — <i>Actus Reus</i> .....	394
4.	Impossibility .....	396
5.	Abandonment of the Attempt .....	397
6.	Successful Attempts and Merger .....	398
7.	Evidential and Procedural Considerations .....	399
8.	Sentencing .....	400
9.	Conclusion .....	400
 <i>Index</i> .....		<b>401</b>