

# Index

## ABANDONMENT

abandonment going to elements of offence, 50-51, 328-329  
defence of abandonment  
arguments against, 326-328  
arguments for, 323-325  
availability  
Australia, 317-319  
Canada and England, 312-317  
civil law jurisdictions, 325  
conclusion, 328-329  
general, 311-312  
South Africa, 319-320  
United States, 320-323  
Model Penal Code, 321-322  
factor in sentencing, 327-328, 397-398

ABORTION *see also* PROCURING  
MISCARRIAGE, 268, 355-357

## ACCOMPLICES

accomplice to attempt, 351-357  
attempt to aid and abet, 351-353  
counselling, 354-355

## ACTUS REUS

as evidence of intent, 54-55, 90, 392  
functions of judge and jury  
English versus Canadian position, 131-137  
perverse verdicts, 135-137  
questions of fact and law, 6-7, 135-137  
interaction with intent, 131  
preparation versus attempt  
general, 5-6, 53, 95, 121-131  
indeterminate tests, 218  
need for workable rule, 126, 220-222  
objective and subjective standards, 128, 217-218  
reliance on facts of case, 126, 137-139  
specific tests  
abnormal step, 216  
causation, 210-211  
commitment, 215  
common sense, 212-213

- conduct otherwise criminal, 216-217
- consummation, likelihood of, 214-215
- control, 208-210
- culpability otherwise required, 211-212
- dangerousness, 176-184
- discretion of court, 213-214
- equivocality, 184-196
- final stage theories
  - last act, 165-170
  - penultimate act, 170-172
  - possibility of intervention, 172
  - probability of desistance, 172-176
- first stage theories
  - commencement of execution, 161-164
  - general, 155-161
- guidelines, 205-206, 215, 218-220, 394
- indispensable element, 208-210
- proximity, 142-155, 198, 208, 217-218, 221-222
- reform proposal, 394-396
- substantial step, 196-208, 219, 221
- AIDING AND ABETTING**
  - aiding and abetting attempt, 351-357
  - impossibility of attempted aiding and abetting, 354-355
- ARSON**, 130, 165, 185, 313, 338-339
- ASSAULT**, 268, 287-289
- ATTEMPT BY OMISSION**, 139-142, 289-290
- ATTEMPTED MURDER** *see* MURDER ATTEMPT
- BREAKING AND ENTERING**, 72-73, 233, 292, 313
- BRIBERY AND CORRUPTION**, 256-258
- CHARGING OFFENCES** *see* INFORMATION AND INDICTMENT
- CIVIL LAW**
  - abandonment as defence, 325
  - general attempt provisions, 10-12, 379-380
- COMPARATIVE LAW**, 10-12, 138-142, 155, 161-164, 325, 379-381
- CONDUCT** *see* ACTUS REUS
- CONSPIRACY**
  - attempted conspiracy, 292-298
  - conspiracy to do impossible, 298-301
- CORPORATIONS**, 367-369, 399-400
- COUNSELLING AND PROCURING**, 354-355
- CRIME PREVENTION**
  - and individual freedom, 43, 307-310
  - as function of law of attempt, 15-19, 36-38
  - as rational for “preparatory” offences, 20-28, 36
- DANGEROUSNESS**, 10, 22-26, 43-44, 176-184, 262-281
- DEFENCES** *see* ABANDONMENT; IMPOSSIBILITY; PROVOCATION
- DEFINITION OF ATTEMPT**
  - Criminal Code
    - general, 2-3, 377-378
    - inadequacy of definition, 3-7, 124, 309-310, 392
  - development, 11-12, 378
  - English position, 190-191
  - semantic confusion between legal and practical meanings, 23, 43, 47, 92-97, 121-124, 149-150, 273, 280

- ELEMENTS OF OFFENCE *see*  
ACTUS REUS; MENS REA
- EXTORTION, 256-258, 291-292
- FRAUD, 170-171, 208-210, 256-258,  
294-295, 297, 332, 335
- GENERAL STATUTORY  
PROVISIONS  
comparative law  
  general, 10-12, 379-381  
  influence of French Penal Code, 10,  
  161, 379-380  
  influence of U.S. Model Penal  
  Code, 380-381  
Criminal Code *see also* REFORM  
PROPOSALS  
  incompleteness of definition, 5-6  
  proposals for abolition, 309-310
- HISTORICAL ASPECTS OF LAW,  
9-13
- HYBRID OR OPTIONABLE  
OFFENCES *see* INFORMATION  
AND INDICTMENT;  
SENTENCING
- IMPAIRED DRIVING, 290, 338
- IMPOSSIBILITY  
ambiguity in Criminal Code, 309-310  
categories of impossibility  
  lack of essential quality  
    bungled bullet, 252-256  
    false pretences, 256-258  
    fraud where victim not deceived,  
    256-258  
  ineffective means, 22, 261-263,  
    277-278  
  inoperative weapon, 229, 252-256  
  Lady Eldon's lace, 259-261  
  offence not known to law,  
    278-280  
  poisoning with harmless  
  substance, 250-252  
  non-existence of something in  
  external world  
    absent ambush victim, 127,  
    242-245  
    empty pocket, 232-238  
    non-existent narcotic, 249-250  
    trying tree stump, 245-247  
    ubiquitous umbrella, 85-86,  
    247-249  
    vacuous womb, 238-242  
  personal incapacity  
    age, 263-268, 269  
    impotency, 268-269  
  charging offence, 348-351  
  conspiracy to do impossible, 298-301  
  English solution, 303-304  
  factual versus legal, 229-232, 278-280  
  legislative solutions, 223-224  
  objective approach, 301-302  
  offences impossible to attempt,  
    286-298  
  principle of legality, 224-227, 229n,  
    260, 270  
  punishment for attempting  
    impossible, 22  
  receiving stolen goods  
    general, 269-270, 278-279  
    principle in *Haughton v. Smith*  
    criticism, 278-281  
    distinguished in Canada, 284-286  
    general, 275-278  
    overruled in England, 283,  
    303-304  
    specific applications, 280-283  
  reform proposals, 307-310, 396-397  
  statutory interpretation, 224-229  
  subjective approach, 303-307  
  U.S. Model Penal Code, 304-307,  
    310
- INCITEMENT, 293, 297
- INFORMATION AND  
INDICTMENT,

- charging offence
  - accomplices, 353
  - corporations and partnerships, 367-369
  - general, 348-351
  - hybrid offences, 365
  - indictable offences, 362-363
  - summary offences, 363-364
- drafting indictment carefully, 115-116, 228, 233, 236, 348-351
- form, 347-351
- INDICTABLE OFFENCES *see* INFORMATION AND INDICTMENT
- INTENT *see* MENS REA
- JUDGE AND JURY, 6-7, 86-87, 131-137, 337
- LAW REFORM *see* REFORM PROPOSALS
- MAGIC *see* WITCHCRAFT
- MANSLAUGHTER
  - attempted, 357-362, 399
- MENS REA
  - complexity and ambiguity of law, 45-47, 86, 119-120
  - conditional intent, 111-116, 350
  - definition by reference to substantive offence
    - distinction between consequences and circumstances, 99-102
    - general, 79-83
    - intent alone not criminal, 9, 24-25, 47-55, 129-130
  - negligence insufficient, 5, 59-62, 102-106
  - objective and subjective approaches, 55
  - proof, 53-54
  - recklessness
    - attempted murder, 62-79
    - concept of “qualified intent”, 85-86
    - foresight of consequences, 83-85
    - indirect intention, 86
    - intention to effect consequences, 99-102
    - present state of law, 79-80, 87-88
    - rationale, 87-97
    - semantic fallacy in exclusion, 92-94
  - reform proposals, 392-394
  - specific intent
    - attempted murder, 65, 72-79
    - general, 57-62
    - policy arguments, 97-99
  - strict liability, 5, 79, 107-111
  - terminology, 45-47
  - transferred intent, 117-119
- MERGER
  - common law doctrine, 331-333
  - prosecution for attempt or full-offence, 328, 344-345, 351
  - reform proposal, 398-399
  - status of doctrine
    - Canada, 334-341
    - England, 331-332, 334
    - United States, 332, 341-344
- MODEL PENAL CODE *see* U.S. MODEL PENAL CODE
- MURDER ATTEMPT
  - defences
    - impossibility, 242-247, 250-256
    - provocation, 357-362
    - self-defence, 362
  - definition, 73-74, 352-353, 383, 386-387
  - mens rea, 57-63, 65-79, 80-83, 95, 99
  - reduction to attempted manslaughter, 357-362
  - similar fact evidence, 365-366
- OMISSION AS ATTEMPT, 139-140, 289-290

- OPTIONAL OR HYBRID  
OFFENCES *see* INFORMATION  
AND INDICTMENT;  
SENTENCING
- PERJURY, 291-292
- POISONING, 169, 250-252
- POSSESSION OF NARCOTICS,  
101, 145n, 200-201, 249-250, 282
- PREPARATION VERSUS  
ATTEMPT *see* ACTUS REUS
- “PREPARATORY” OFFENCES,  
377, 386-389
- PROCURING MISCARRIAGE,  
225-227, 238-242
- PROVOCATION  
as defence to attempted murder,  
357-362  
reform proposals, 399
- PUBLIC POLICY, 7-8, 19, 225, 246,  
309
- PUNISHMENT *see also*  
SENTENCING  
necessity and purpose, 43-44  
principles applied to attempt  
deterrence  
    general deterrence, 39-32, 391  
    special deterrence, 29-32  
law enforcement, 138, 152, 281  
protection of society, 29, 37, 42  
public policy, 42  
rehabilitation, 34-36  
retribution, 32-34  
risk of harm, 39-41  
rationale for punishing attempt,  
15-19, 40, 49, 308-309  
theory  
    general, 15-19  
    objective approach  
    dangerous as criterion, 21-22  
    emphasis on welfare of society,  
    327-328  
    necessity for harm, 23-24  
subjective approach  
    emphasis on personal intent, 24  
    English Criminal Attempts Act, 26  
    Roman law, 10-27  
    societal versus individual rights, 2,  
    12, 15, 27, 44, 308-309  
theoretical difficulties, 26-27,  
127-128  
U.S. Model Penal Code, 25-26
- RECEIVING STOLEN GOODS *see*  
IMPOSSIBILITY
- RECKLESSNESS *see* MENS REA
- REFORM PROPOSALS  
abandonment defence, 397-398  
actus reus, 394-396  
evidential and procedural matters,  
399-400  
impossibility defence, 396-397  
mens rea, 396-397  
merger doctrine, 398-399  
necessity for reform, 116, 391-392  
sentencing, 375-376
- RELATIONAL NATURE OF  
ATTEMPT, 3
- ROBBERY, 38, 201-202
- ROMAN LAW, 10, 27
- SENTENCING *see also*  
PUNISHMENT  
abandonment as mitigating factor,  
326-327  
“half measure” rules, 375-376, 400  
range of dispositions, 344-345,  
371-374, 400  
reference materials, 371-373

- SEXUAL OFFENCES, 41, 108,  
186-187, 193, 263-269, 288-289,  
314, 332-333, 366
- SIMILAR FACT EVIDENCE, 54,  
365-366
- SPECIFIC ATTEMPT OFFENCES,  
383-385
- SPECIFIC INTENT *see* MENS REA
- STATEMENTS OF ACCUSED,  
53-54, 184-185
- SUBSTANTIVE NATURE OF  
ATTEMPT, 3, 12
- SUCCESSFUL ATTEMPTS *see*  
MERGER
- SUMMARY OFFENCES *see*  
INFORMATION AND  
INDICTMENT
- TESTS FOR ATTEMPT *see* ACTUS  
REUS
- THEFT, 37, 99, 111-116, 209,  
229-238, 240, 247-249, 278,  
281-282, 316-317, 349-351, 365
- TREASON  
impossibility of attempt, 387  
intent as substance of offence, 55-56
- U.S. MODEL PENAL CODE  
defence of abandonment, 321-322  
general attempt provision, 380-381  
impossibility, approach to, 304-307,  
310  
punishment for attempt, 25  
“substantial step” test, 196-198, 201,  
379-381, 394-395  
subjective viewpoint, 26
- WITCHCRAFT, 261-263