

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface . . . . .	iii
Table of Cases . . . . .	xiii

## *Aboriginal Rights*

1.1	Introduction . . . . .	2
1.2	Reconciliation . . . . .	5
1.3	Section 35 . . . . .	8
1.4	History . . . . .	8
	1.4.1 Subsection 35(1) . . . . .	10
	1.4.2 Subsection 35(2) — Aboriginal Peoples of Canada . . . . .	13
	1.4.3 Subsection 35(3) — Modern Treaty Rights and Land Claims Agreements . . . . .	13
1.5	Aboriginal Rights . . . . .	14
	1.5.1 Definition . . . . .	14
	1.5.2 Establishing an Aboriginal Right — The <i>Van der Peet</i> Test . . . . .	14
	1.5.3 Proof and Evidentiary Issues . . . . .	18
	1.5.4 Extinguishment . . . . .	25
	1.5.5 Infringement . . . . .	26
	1.5.5.1 Unreasonable Lmitation . . . . .	27
	1.5.5.2 Undue Hardship . . . . .	29
	1.5.5.3 Preferred Means . . . . .	30
	1.5.6 Justification of Infringement . . . . .	31
	1.5.6.1 Compelling and Substantial Objective . . . . .	31
	1.5.6.2 Honour of the Crown . . . . .	33
	1.5.7 Injunctive Relief . . . . .	38
1.6	Section 25, Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms . . . . .	39
1.7	Individual and Collective Rights . . . . .	43
1.8	Self Government . . . . .	45
	1.8.1.1 <i>R. v. Pamajewon</i> . . . . .	46
	1.8.1.2 <i>Campbell v. B.C.</i> . . . . .	47
	1.8.1.3 <i>Mitchell v. Canada (Min. of National Revenue)</i> . . . . .	48
	1.8.2 Implementing Self-Government . . . . .	49
	1.8.2.1 Dogrib Treaty 11 Council . . . . .	50
	1.8.2.2 Mohawks of Kanesatake . . . . .	50
	1.8.2.3 <i>Sechelt Indian Band Self-Government Act</i> . . . . .	51

1.8.2.4	<i>Cree-Naskapi (of Quebec) Act</i> . . . . .	52
1.8.2.5	Yukon Territory . . . . .	54
1.8.2.6	<i>Westbank First Nation Self-Government Act</i> . . . . .	54
1.8.2.7	Deline Final Self-Government Agreement . . . . .	55
1.8.2.8	<i>First Nations Jurisdiction over Education in British Columbia Act</i> . . . . .	56
1.8.3	<i>Indian Act</i> . . . . .	56
1.8.3.1	Legal Status of Indian Band Councils . . . . .	57
1.9	International Law . . . . .	59
1.9.1	United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples . . . . .	59

### ***Aboriginal Title***

2.1	Introduction . . . . .	65
2.2	Historical Aspects of Aboriginal Title . . . . .	66
2.2.1	Royal Proclamation of 1763 . . . . .	66
2.2.2	Early United States Case Law . . . . .	67
2.2.3	Pre- <i>Delgamuukw</i> Canadian Case Law . . . . .	70
2.3	Aboriginal Title . . . . .	72
2.3.1	<i>Delgamuukw</i> (1997), <i>Marshall/Bernard</i> (2005) and <i>Tsilhqot'in</i> (2014) . . . . .	72
2.3.2	Nature and Scope of Aboriginal Title . . . . .	74
2.3.2.1	General Features . . . . .	74
2.3.2.2	The Content of Aboriginal Title — Exclusive, but Limited Use . . . . .	75
2.3.3	Establishing Aboriginal Title . . . . .	78
2.3.3.1	Pre-Sovereignty, Continuous, and Exclusive Occupation . . . . .	78
2.3.3.2	Negotiated Solutions . . . . .	84
2.3.4	Justifying Infringements of Aboriginal Title . . . . .	85
2.3.5	Extinguishing Aboriginal Title . . . . .	88
2.3.6	Conclusion . . . . .	89
2.4	Fee Simple Title and Aboriginal Title . . . . .	91
2.5	Remedies . . . . .	95
2.5.1	Crown Land Remedies . . . . .	97
2.5.2	Fee Simple Land Remedies . . . . .	103

### ***Treaty Rights — Historic***

3.1	Introduction . . . . .	109
3.2	Treaties Generally . . . . .	110
	3.2.1.1 Definition of a Treaty . . . . .	110
	3.2.1.2 Interpretation . . . . .	112
	3.2.1.3 Evidence . . . . .	117
	3.2.1.4 Geographic Limitations on Treaty Rights . . . . .	119
	3.2.1.5 Visible, Incompatible Use . . . . .	121
	3.2.1.6 Treaty Beneficiaries . . . . .	122
3.2.2	Treaty Rights . . . . .	124
	3.2.2.1 Section 88, Indian Act — Application of Provincial Laws . . . . .	124
	3.2.2.2 <i>Grassy Narrows First Nation v. Ontario (Sub. Nom.- Keewatin v. Minister of Natural Resources)</i> . . . . .	126
	3.2.2.3 Extinguishment . . . . .	129
	3.2.2.4 Infringement . . . . .	130
	3.2.2.5 Justification of Infringement . . . . .	133
	3.2.2.6 Crown's Duty to Consult and Treaty Rights . . . . .	134
	3.2.2.7 Good Faith Negotiations . . . . .	134
	3.2.2.8 Interlocutory Injunctions . . . . .	136
3.2.3	Treaty Rights Claims . . . . .	136
	3.2.3.1 Specific Land Claims . . . . .	136
	3.2.3.2 Treaty Land Entitlement . . . . .	138
3.2.4	Judicial Decisions Regarding Treaty Rights . . . . .	141
	3.2.4.1 Pre-1982 Treaty Rights Decisions . . . . .	141
	3.2.4.2 Post-1982 Treaty Rights Decisions . . . . .	143
3.2.5	Particular Treaties . . . . .	149
	3.2.5.1 Maritime Peace and Friendship Treaties . . . . .	149
	3.2.5.2 Pre-Confederation Treaties . . . . .	150
	3.2.5.3 Post-Confederation Treaties . . . . .	156

### ***Modern Treaties and Land Claims Agreements***

4.1	Introduction . . . . .	165
4.2	Canada's Comprehensive Land Claims Policy . . . . .	166
4.3	British Columbia Treaty Commission Process . . . . .	167
4.4	Interpreting Modern Treaties . . . . .	170
	4.4.1 Government's Desire for Certainty . . . . .	179
4.5	Specific Claim Agreements and Modern Treaties or Comprehensive Land Claim Agreements . . . . .	182
	4.5.1 James Bay and Northern Quebec Agreement (1975) . . . . .	182
	4.5.2 Northeastern Quebec Agreement (1978) . . . . .	183
	4.5.3 Inuvialuit Final Agreement (1984) . . . . .	184

4.5.4	Gwich'in Final Agreement (1992) . . . . .	184
4.5.5	Sahtu Dene and Métis Land Claim Agreement (1993) . . . . .	185
4.5.6	Tlicho Agreement (2003) . . . . .	185
4.5.7	Nunavut Land Claims Agreement (1993) . . . . .	186
4.5.8	Council for Yukon Indians Umbrella Final Agreement (1993) . . . . .	190
4.5.9	Nisga'a Final Agreement (1999) . . . . .	192
4.5.10	Labrador Inuit Land Claims Agreement (2003) . . . . .	195
4.5.11	Nunavik Inuit Land Claims Agreement (2008) . . . . .	197
4.5.12	Tsawwassen First Nation Final Agreement (2009) . . . . .	198
4.5.13	Maa-nulth First Nations Final Agreement (2011) . . . . .	199
4.5.14	Eeyou Marine Region Land Claims Agreement (2010) . . . . .	199
4.5.15	Yale First Nation Final Agreement (2013) . . . . .	199
4.5.16	Tla'amin (Sliammon) Final Agreement (2014) . . . . .	200
4.5.17	Other Claims . . . . .	200

### ***Federal Authority***

5.1	Introduction . . . . .	202
5.2	Subsection 91(24), <i>Constitution Act, 1867</i> . . . . .	202
5.3	“Indians” and “Aboriginal Peoples” . . . . .	203
5.4	“Lands Reserved for the Indians” . . . . .	205
5.5	Inuit . . . . .	206
5.6	Section 35 of the <i>Constitution Act, 1982</i> and its Effect on Federal Legislative Authority . . . . .	207
5.7	<i>Indian Act</i> . . . . .	209
	5.7.1 General . . . . .	209
	5.7.2 The <i>Indian Act</i> and Reserve Lands . . . . .	210
	5.7.3 Discrimination under the <i>Indian Act</i> . . . . .	212
5.8	Other Federal Legislation . . . . .	221
	5.8.1 <i>First Nations Land Management Act</i> . . . . .	222
	5.8.2 <i>First Nations Commercial and Industrial Development Act</i> . . . . .	224
	5.8.3 <i>First Nations Financial Transparency Act</i> . . . . .	224
	5.8.4 <i>First Nations Fiscal Management Act</i> . . . . .	224
	5.8.5 <i>First Nations Goods and Services Tax Act</i> . . . . .	225
	5.8.6 <i>First Nations Oil and Gas Money Management Act</i> . . . . .	225
	5.8.7 <i>Family Homes on Reserves and Matrimonial Interests or Rights Act</i> . . . . .	256
5.9	Anti-Corruption Initiatives . . . . .	226
5.10	Fiduciary Relationship and fiduciary duties . . . . .	228
	5.10.1 Introduction . . . . .	228
	5.10.2 Early Case Law . . . . .	230

5.10.2.1 <i>Guerin v. The Queen</i> (1984) . . . . .	230
5.10.2.2 <i>Quebec (A.G.) v. Canada (National Energy Board)</i> (1994) . . . . .	230
5.10.3 Other Fiduciary-Related Case Law . . . . .	232
5.10.4 Current Law . . . . .	235
5.10.4.1 <i>Wewaykum Indian Band v. Canada</i> (2002) . . . . .	235
5.10.4.2 <i>Manitoba Métis Federation v. Canada</i> (AG) (2013) . . . . .	239

### ***Indian Reserve Land And Related Tax Matters***

6.1 Introduction . . . . .	243
6.2 Creation of Reserves . . . . .	245
6.2.1 Application of Laws on Reserves . . . . .	250
6.3 Indian Band Interests in Reserves . . . . .	251
6.3.1 Crown Duties in Relation to Reserves . . . . .	253
6.4 Surface and Subsurface Rights . . . . .	255
6.4.1 Mining . . . . .	256
6.4.2 Timber . . . . .	258
6.4.3 Oil and Gas . . . . .	259
6.5 Water Rights . . . . .	262
6.6 Granting Interests in, and Disposition of, Reserve Lands . . . . .	264
6.6.1 Expropriation . . . . .	264
6.6.2 <i>Osoyoos Indian Band v. Oliver (Town)</i> (2001) . . . . .	266
6.6.3 Permits or Leases . . . . .	268
6.6.4 Surrenders and Designations . . . . .	269
6.6.5 Individual Possession . . . . .	272
6.7 Security on Reserves . . . . .	272
6.8 Taxation and Indian Reserve Land . . . . .	275
6.8.1 Indian Tax Exemption — Section 87, <i>Indian Act</i> . . . . .	275
6.8.2 <i>Williams v. R.</i> (1992) — Connecting Factors Test . . . . .	277
6.8.3 Application of <i>Williams</i> . . . . .	278
6.8.4 Paramount Location Test . . . . .	281
6.8.5 GST and Other Federal Taxes . . . . .	284
6.9 Indian Band Taxation Authority . . . . .	285
6.10 Subsection 90(1), <i>Indian Act</i> . . . . .	288
6.11 Provincial Taxes . . . . .	291
6.12 Treaties and Land Claims Agreements . . . . .	294

### ***Provincial And Territorial Authority***

7.1	Introduction . . . . .	299
7.2	Provincial Authority . . . . .	300
	7.2.1 Indian Reserves are not Federal Enclaves . . . . .	300
	7.2.2 Valid Provincial Legislation . . . . .	301
	7.2.3 Laws of General Application — No “Singling Out” . . . . .	303
	7.2.4 “ <i>ex proprio vigore</i> ” — “Indianness” . . . . .	306
7.3	Section 88, <i>Indian Act</i> . . . . .	309
	7.3.1 Paramouncy . . . . .	310
	7.3.2 Treaties . . . . .	311
7.4	Application of Provincial Laws to Treaty Rights . . . . .	312
7.5	Application of Provincial Laws to Aboriginal Rights . . . . .	314
7.6	Extinguishment . . . . .	317
7.7	Natural Resources Transfer Agreements (1930) . . . . .	321
7.8	Provincial Adjudicative Bodies . . . . .	323
7.9	Municipalities . . . . .	325
7.10	Territorial Authority . . . . .	326

### ***Crown’s Duty to Consult Aboriginal Peoples***

8.1	Introduction . . . . .	330
	8.1.1 <i>Haida Nation v. B.C.</i> (2004) . . . . .	331
	8.1.2 <i>Taku River Tlingit v. B.C. (Project Assessment Director)</i> (2004) . . . . .	332
	8.1.3 <i>Mikisew Cree First Nation v. Canada</i> (2005) . . . . .	334
	8.1.4 <i>Rio Tinto Alcan Inc. v. Carrier Sekani Tribal Council</i> (2010) . . . . .	335
	8.1.5 <i>Beckman v. Little Salmon/Carmacks First Nation</i> (2010) . . . . .	336
	8.1.6 <i>Behn v. Moulton Contracting Ltd.</i> (2013) . . . . .	338
	8.1.7 Sources of Consultation . . . . .	338
8.2	Honour of the Crown . . . . .	340
	8.2.1 Introduction . . . . .	340
	8.2.2 Historical Use in Canada . . . . .	341
	8.2.3 Modern Development . . . . .	343
	8.2.4 Engaging the Honour of the Crown — <i>Manitoba Métis Federation Inc. v. Canada (A.G.)</i> (2013) . . . . .	354
8.3	Crown’s Duty to Consult Aboriginal Peoples . . . . .	356
	8.3.1 Development of Consultation in <i>Sparrow</i> and <i>Delgamuukw</i> . . . . .	356
	8.3.2 Duty Rests with the Crown . . . . .	357
	8.3.3 What is the “Crown” for the Purposes of the Duty? . . . . .	359

8.3.3.1	Regulatory Boards and Tribunals . . . . .	359
8.3.3.2	Municipal Governments . . . . .	362
8.3.4	Triggering the Duty . . . . .	367
8.3.5	Causal Connection and Potential Adverse Effects . . . . .	371
8.3.6	Content, Scope and Spectrum of the Duty . . . . .	375
8.3.7	To Whom is the Duty Owed? . . . . .	380
8.3.7.1	Métis . . . . .	383
8.3.8	Duty of Procedural Fairness . . . . .	385
8.3.9	Legal Standard of Review for Consultation — Consultation as a <i>Procedural Right</i> . . . . .	386
8.3.10	Obligations of Aboriginal Peoples Regarding Consultation . . . . .	391
8.3.11	Accommodation . . . . .	394
8.3.12	Remedies . . . . .	401
8.3.12.1	Injunctive Relief . . . . .	402
8.3.12.2	Damages . . . . .	406
8.3.12.3	Declaratory Relief . . . . .	407
8.4	Industry and Third Parties . . . . .	408
8.4.1	Delegation of Consultation to Third Parties . . . . .	408
8.4.2	The Duty to Consult with Respect to Private Property . . . . .	410
8.5	Reconciliation . . . . .	411
8.5.1	Balancing of Aboriginal and Non-Aboriginal Interests . . . . .	413

### ***Métis Rights***

9.1	Who is Métis? . . . . .	419
9.1.1	Métis for Purposes of Section 35 . . . . .	421
9.1.2	<i>R. v. Powley</i> (2003) . . . . .	423
9.1.3	Subsection 91(24), <i>Constitution Act, 1867</i> . . . . .	427
9.2	Métis Rights . . . . .	429
9.2.1	Métis Aboriginal Rights . . . . .	429
9.3	Aboriginal Title and the Métis . . . . .	434
9.3.1	Historic Occupation . . . . .	435
9.3.2	Continuous Occupation . . . . .	435
9.3.3	Exclusive Occupation . . . . .	436
9.4	Métis Land Claims Based on Legislative Instruments . . . . .	437
9.4.1	<i>Manitoba Act</i> and <i>Dominion Lands Act</i> . . . . .	437
9.4.2	<i>Manitoba Métis Federation Inc. v. Canada (A.G.)</i> — Lower Court Decisions . . . . .	439
9.4.3	<i>Manitoba Métis Federation Inc. v. Canada (A.G.)</i> — Supreme Court of Canada (2013) . . . . .	441
9.4.4	Métis Land Claims Outside Manitoba . . . . .	444
9.5	The Crown's Duty to Consult Métis Peoples . . . . .	445

9.6	Federal Developments . . . . .	445
9.7	Provincial and Territorial Developments . . . . .	446
9.7.1	British Columbia . . . . .	446
9.7.2	Alberta . . . . .	447
9.7.3	Saskatchewan . . . . .	450
9.7.4	Manitoba . . . . .	454
9.7.5	Ontario . . . . .	454
9.7.6	Quebec and the Maritimes . . . . .	456
9.7.7	Northwest Territories and the Yukon Territory . . . . .	457
	Maps	
	Modern Treaties and Self-Government Agreements . . . . .	460
	Historical Treaties of Canada . . . . .	461
	Index . . . . .	463
	About the Author . . . . .	482