

SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Contributors	iii
Detailed Table of Cases.....	xv
Table of Cases	xxvii

1. Introduction: Food Law and Policy in Canada
Angela Lee, Heather McLeod-Kilmurray & Nathalie Chalifour 1

PART I — FOUNDATIONS OF FOOD LAW AND POLICY IN CANADA

2. Canada's National Food Policy: The Political Basis for
Coordination and Integration
Peter Andr e, Mary Coulas & Patricia Ballamingie 13
3. Transforming Buffalo: Plains Cree Constitutionalism and Food
Sovereignty
Darcy Lindberg..... 37
4. It's Complicated: Food and Federalism in Canada
Donald E. Buckingham 55
5. Cities in a Time of Uncertainty: Food and Canadian Municipal Law
Jamie Baxter & Jessica Rose..... 73
6. Food Systems and Sustainability
Heather McLeod-Kilmurray & Nathalie Chalifour 93
7. Protecting Farmland in Canada: Provincial Legislative Frameworks
*David J. Connell, Chris Bryant, Wayne Caldwell, Greg Cameron &
Tom Johnston*.....113
8. Foodlands Protection in Canada: Indigenous and Colonial
Foodscapes in Law
Deborah Curran.....151
9. Food Safety
Kiri A. Latuskie & Jacob J. Shelley.....175
10. Food Safety in Canada: Regulatory Approaches to Public Health
Sarah Berger Richardson201
11. Finding Concordance between Nutrition Law Reform and
Epidemiological Estimates of Public Health Impact
Bill Jeffery221
12. A Recipe for Effective Front-of-Pack Nutrition Labelling: Lessons
From Canada, Codex, and the World Health Organization
Bill Jeffery237
13. Food Advertising and Marketing to Children
Jacob J. Shelley & Melanie L. McPhail263

14. The Consumers' Rights to Information about Animal Welfare:
The Canadian Framework for Labelling of Food Products of
Animal Origin
Marie-Claude Desjardins & Sabrina Tremblay-Huet.....287
15. Cultivating Healthier, More Sustainable Food Choices through
Taxation
Nathalie Chalifour & Josiane Rioux Collin305
16. Social Justice and the Food System
Nadia C.S. Lambek325
17. Food Justice in Canada: Local Governance as a Vehicle for a
National Food Policy / La justice alimentaire au Canada :
la gouvernance locale comme vecteur d'une politique
alimentaire nationale
Jessica Dufresne351

**PART II — CRITICAL PERSPECTIVES ON FOOD LAW
AND POLICY IN CANADA**

18. Eat This! Gender Inequality, Culture, and the Politics of Food
Dr. Bita Amani.....409
19. The Fox Regulating the Henhouse: How the Law Fails Animals
Farmed for Food
Anna Pippus431
20. Regulation of Genetically Novel Crops and Food in Canada:
It's About PNTs, Not GMOs
Dr. Stan Benda.....453
21. The New Frontiers of Flesh Food: Regulating Genetically
Engineered Animals and *In Vitro* Meat
Angela Lee475
22. Access and Valorization of Aboriginal Seeds in Canada:
Opportunities and Limits of Existing Legal Frameworks
to Frame Collaborations between Aboriginal Peoples and
Researchers / Accès et valorisation des semences autochtones
au Canada Opportunités et limites des cadres juridiques
existants pour l'encadrement des collaborations entre
autochtones et chercheurs
Thomas Burelli499
- Index565

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Contributors	iii
Summary Table of Contents.....	xiii
Detailed Table of Contents	xv
Table of Cases	xxvii
Chapter 1 — Introduction: Food Law and Policy in Canada	1
1. Why We Need This Book	1
2. How This Book Came About.....	3
3. Overview	3
4. Conclusion	10
PART I — FOUNDATIONS OF FOOD LAW AND POLICY IN CANADA	
Chapter 2 — Canada’s National Food Policy: The Political Basis for Coordination and Integration	13
1. Introduction	13
2. Two Previous Attempts	16
3. The National Food Policy Conversation in 2017	18
4. Shared Priorities Among National Food Policy Stakeholders	23
(a) Achieve Food Security for All.....	23
(b) Strengthen Economic Opportunities for Canadian Food Producers and Processors	26
(c) Improve Diet-related Health Outcomes	28
(d) Improve Environmental Sustainability Across the Food System	29
(e) Ensure Food Safety.....	30
(f) Increase Transparency of Information	30
5. Recommendations	31
(a) Develop a Pan-Canadian Food Strategy.....	31
(b) Set Clear Targets and Accountability	32
(c) Scale Up and Out Tried-and-True Initiatives.....	33
(d) Ensure Ongoing Cross-stakeholder Dialogue/Problem-solving.....	33
(e) Facilitate Cross-departmental Coordination	34
6. Now! The Timing is Right	34
7. Conclusion	35
Chapter 3 — Transforming Buffalo: Plains Cree Constitutionalism and Food Sovereignty.....	37
1. Shaping-Shifting Buffalo	38
2. Plains Cree Constitutionalism.....	40
3. Experiences of Food Insecurity by Plains Cree Peoples.....	41

4.	Enclosures.....	43
	(a) Prairie Enclosures.....	43
	(b) Indigenous Enclosures.....	44
5.	From Treatment to Treaty	47
6.	Food Treaties in Plains Cree Narratives	48
	(a) Land Creation Stories and Principles of Wahkotowin Obligations.....	49
	(b) Windigo and Pahkokos Stories and Principles Against Overconsumption	49
	(c) Further Wahkotowin Stories	50
7.	Treaty Narratives and Constitutional Principles	50
8.	Turning Towards Plains Cree Constitutionalism.....	52
9.	Concluding Thoughts	53
	Chapter 4 — It’s Complicated: Food and Federalism in Canada	55
1.	Introduction.....	55
2.	Food—What Are We Regulating Exactly?.....	56
3.	Where is Food and Federalism in Our Constitution?.....	57
	(a) The Shared Agriculture Power—Section 95	58
	(i) “Laws in relation to Agriculture” Not for Laws Generally Relating to Food.....	58
	(ii) A Very Thin Slice for Specific Food Laws.....	59
	(b) Federal Powers—Section 91	60
	(i) The Criminal Law Power	60
	(ii) The Trade and Commerce Power	61
	(iii) Intellectual Property Powers as Applied to Food.....	63
	(iv) Federal Spending Power	64
	(v) Federal Powers of Very Limited Support for Food Legislation	64
	(c) Provincial Powers—Section 92	65
	(i) The Property and Civil Rights Power.....	65
	(ii) Other Provincial Powers.....	65
4.	Why Not Examine “Food and Federalism” in its 21st Century Constitutional Context?.....	66
	(a) Food Safety	66
	(b) Food Fraud Prevention.....	68
	(c) Food Product Information and Labelling.....	69
	(d) Food and Private Law Rights	70
5.	Where Do We Go from Here?.....	70
	(a) Recognizing Our Constitutional Limitations.....	71
	(b) Pushing Out from Our Constitutional Limitations.....	71
	(i) Through More Federal/Provincial/Territorial Cooperation	71
	(ii) Through “Smarter” Regulation	71
	(iii) Through Strategic Federal Leadership.....	72

Chapter 5 — Cities in a Time of Uncertainty: Food and Canadian Municipal Law	73
1. Introduction	73
2. The Scope of Municipal Food Governance	75
(a) Municipal Initiatives	77
(i) Self-Governance	77
(ii) Control and Compliance	78
(iii) Provision	79
(iv) Enabling	80
3. Uncertainty in Municipal Food Law	82
(a) Municipal Jurisdiction	82
(b) Subsidiarity	86
4. Municipal “Entrepreneurship”	87
(a) History	88
(b) Political Institutions	89
(c) Local Policy Activism	90
5. Conclusion	91
Chapter 6 — Food Systems and Sustainability	93
1. Introduction	93
2. Sustainable Food Systems	94
(a) Understanding Sustainability Through the Three-Part Lens of the Food System	94
(i) Food Sources	94
(ii) Transportation and Distribution of Food	95
(iii) Consumption of Food	96
(b) The Cross Cutting and Integrated Nature of Sustainable Food Systems	97
(c) Law as Obstacle and Enabler of Sustainable Food in Canada	100
(i) Food Production	100
(ii) Processing, Packaging and Transport	107
(iii) Consumption	109
3. Conclusion	111
Chapter 7 — Protecting Farmland in Canada: Provincial Legislative Frameworks	113
1. Introduction	113
2. The State of Farmland Protection in Canada	115
3. Strongest Provincial Legislative Frameworks	118
(a) Québec	118
(b) British Columbia	123
(c) Ontario	126
4. Moderate Provincial Legislative Frameworks	129
(a) Manitoba	129
(b) New Brunswick	132

(c)	Saskatchewan.....	134
(d)	Nova Scotia.....	136
(e)	Newfoundland and Labrador.....	139
5.	Weakest Provincial Legislative Frameworks.....	142
(a)	Alberta.....	142
(b)	Prince Edward Island.....	145
6.	Looking Ahead: Issues and Opportunities.....	148
Chapter 8 — Foodlands Protection in Canada: Indigenous and Colonial Foodscapes in Law.....		151
1.	Introduction.....	151
2.	Indigenous Foodscapes Law.....	154
(a)	Indigenous Foodscape Laws.....	155
(b)	Aboriginal Rights and Title.....	156
(c)	Recognition of Indigenous Foodscapes.....	159
3.	Provincial Agricultural Land Protection Law and Foodscapes.....	161
(a)	Provincial Zoning Designation.....	162
(b)	Limitations on Decision-Making.....	163
(c)	Additional Factors in Decision-Making that Protect Agricultural Capability.....	165
4.	Municipal Law and Foodlands Protection.....	166
(a)	Consistency with Provincial Regimes.....	167
(b)	Zoning and Other Municipal Regulation.....	167
(c)	Farm Practices Protection and Right to Farm.....	168
(d)	Unconventional Foodlands and Foodlands Trusts.....	170
5.	Conclusion.....	173
Chapter 9 — Food Safety.....		175
1.	Introduction.....	175
2.	Safe Food.....	177
(a)	Meaning of Safe Food.....	177
(b)	History of Food Safety in Canada.....	178
(c)	Actors Involved with Food Safety.....	179
3.	Governance of Food Safety.....	183
(a)	Regulatory Context.....	184
(i)	Jurisdiction.....	184
(ii)	International Norms and Principles of Food Safety.....	185
(b)	The Legislative Framework.....	186
(i)	Federal Statutes and Agencies.....	186
(ii)	Ontario's Framework.....	188
(iii)	Risk Assessment and Risk Management.....	190
(c)	Effectiveness of the Canadian Food Safety Framework.....	192
4.	Civil Litigation and Food Safety.....	193
(a)	Defective Products.....	194
(b)	Heightened Standard of Care.....	197
5.	Conclusion.....	198

Chapter 10 — Food Safety in Canada: Regulatory Approaches to Public Health	201
1. Introduction	201
2. Tracing 150 Years of Food Safety Regulations in Canada	204
(a) Early Food Safety Regulations in Canada	204
(b) Renewed Interest in Food Safety Regulations From the 1990s to Present	206
3. Vertical and Horizontal Food Safety Management	208
(a) Key Actors	209
(i) Parliament	209
(ii) Provinces	210
(iii) Municipal Institutions	211
(iv) Industry	211
(b) Key Federal Legislation	212
(i) Health and Safety Standards: <i>Food and Drugs Act</i> , R.S.C. 1985, c. F-27	212
(ii) Food Safety Enforcement and Inspection: <i>Safe Food for Canadians Act</i> , S.C. 2012, c. 24	213
(iii) Food Imports: <i>Canadian Food Inspection Agency Act</i> , S.C. 1997, c. 6	214
4. Global Food Governance, International Trade and Canadian Food Safety Regulation	214
(a) Policy Coordination of Global Food Markets	214
(b) Science Versus Culture in Global Food Safety Governance ...	215
(c) Growing Role of Private Retailers in Global Food Governance	216
5. Emerging Issues in Food Safety Regulation	217
(a) Labelling and Food Fraud	218
(b) Artisanal and Small-scale Production	219
6. Conclusion	220
Chapter 11 — Finding Concordance Between Nutrition Law Reform and Epidemiological Estimates of Public Health Impact	221
1. Nutrition Labelling	229
Chapter 12 — A Recipe for Effective Front-of-Pack Nutrition Labelling: Lessons From Canada, Codex, and the World Health Organization	237
1. Develop a Nutrition Algorithm to Effectively Distil the Health Impact of the Amounts of All Ingredients and Nutrients in Each Food	240
2. Establishing Robust Conflict of Interest Safeguards	244
3. Facilitating and Drawing Inspiration from Effective, Diverse International Precedents	249
Chapter 13 — Food Advertising and Marketing to Children	263
1. Introduction	263
2. A History of Food Marketing Restrictions	264

3.	The International Experience.....	266
	(a) The United Kingdom.....	267
	(b) The United States.....	267
	(c) Australia.....	270
4.	The Constitution and M2K.....	271
	(a) Division of Powers.....	271
	(b) The <i>Charter</i> and M2K.....	275
5.	Approaches to Restricting Food and Beverage Advertising and Marketing in Canada.....	278
	(a) Self-Regulation.....	278
	(b) Regulation of Commercial Advertising to Children.....	280
	(c) Regulation of Food and Beverage Advertising and Marketing.....	281
6.	Challenges with Restricting Food and Beverage Advertising.....	282
	(a) Scope.....	282
	(b) Implementation.....	284
	(c) Values.....	285
7.	Conclusion.....	286
Chapter 14 — The Consumers’ Right to Information About Animal Welfare: The Canadian Framework for Labelling of Food Products of Animal Origin.....		287
1.	Introduction.....	287
2.	Consumers’ Right to Non-false and Non-misleading Representations.....	289
	(a) Provincial and Federal Legal Frameworks: Quebec and Canada.....	290
	(b) Specific Issues Related to Animal Welfare Claims.....	294
3.	Consumers’ Right to Disclosure of Information.....	296
	(a) Voluntary Disclosure.....	297
	(b) Disclosure of Important Facts.....	298
	(c) The Potential of the <i>Act Respecting Reserved Designations and Added-Value Claims</i>	299
	(d) A Comparative Analysis: The Case of the European Union.....	300
4.	Conclusion.....	302
Chapter 15 — Cultivating Healthier, More Sustainable Food Choices Through Taxation.....		305
1.	Introduction.....	305
2.	The Use of Taxation to Influence Consumer Choices.....	306
3.	Use of Taxation to Promote Healthier, More Sustainable Food Choices.....	309
	(a) Encouraging a Transition to More Sustainable Farming Practices.....	310

(b)	Encouraging More Sustainable and Healthier Food Choices	311
4.	Using Taxation to Influence Consumer Food Choices in Canada ...	314
5.	Case Study: Sugar-Sweetened Beverages	318
(a)	The Rationale for a Sugar Tax.....	318
(b)	Experience with Taxes on Sugar-Sweetened Beverages (SSBs)	319
(c)	A Sugar Tax in Canada?	322
6.	The Way Forward for Canada	323
Chapter 16	— Social Justice and the Food System.....	325
1.	Introduction	325
2.	Injustices in Our Food System: The Example of Food Insecurity ...	327
3.	The Role of Law in Creating Injustices in Our Food Systems: The Case of Agricultural Workers	332
4.	Two Possible Alternatives: The Right to Food and Food Sovereignty	339
(a)	The Right to Food	339
(b)	Food Sovereignty	344
5.	Canada's Vibrant Food Movements	347
6.	Conclusion	349
Chapter 17	— Food Justice in Canada: Local Governance as a Vehicle for a National Food Policy.....	351
1.	Introduction	351
2.	The Multiple Dimensions of the Fight Against Food Insecurity ...	353
(a)	The UN Approach: The Fundamental Right to Food	354
(b)	Food Security: More an End Than a Means	356
(c)	Food Sovereignty and Food Justice: Emerging and Complementary Paradigms.....	358
3.	Policy Gaps in Response to Food Insecurity in Canada	364
(a)	The Proliferation of Citizens' Food Initiatives to Make Up for the Absence of a National Food Policy	365
(b)	Successful Examples of Food Justice Projects From Our Neighbour to the South.....	370
4.	Conclusion	373
La justice alimentaire au Canada : la gouvernance locale comme vecteur d'une politique alimentaire nationale		377
1.	Introduction	377
2.	Les différentes facettes de la lutte contre l'insécurité alimentaire	380
(a)	L'approche onusienne : le droit fondamental à l'alimentation	380
(b)	La sécurité alimentaire : une finalité générale, davantage qu'un moyen	383
(c)	Souveraineté et justice alimentaires : des paradigmes émergents et complémentaires.....	385

3. Les lacunes politiques en réponse à l'insécurité alimentaire au Canada392
 - (a) Le foisonnement d'initiatives alimentaires citoyennes pour palier à l'absence de politique alimentaire.....393
 - (b) Les exemples fructueux de justice alimentaire chez nos voisins du sud399
4. Conclusion402

PART II — CRITICAL PERSPECTIVES ON FOOD LAW AND POLICY IN CANADA

Chapter 18 — Eat This! Gender Inequality, Culture, and the Politics of

- Food**409
1. Introduction: On Gender and Race in Food Production.....409
 2. *Managing Food: Milk and Marketing Madness*411
 - (a) Milk and Markets in Reproductive Labour.....412
 - (b) Feeding Global Markets in Mental Health and Non-Communicable Disease.....414
 3. Situating Gender and Culture Within a Corporate Food Economy.....416
 - (a) Intersectional and Intellectual Properties of (Commodity) Production417
 - (b) Women, Precautionary Consumption, and Power.....423
 - (c) Shifting Food Culture and Consumer Habits424
 4. Food Politics, Food Security426
 - (a) Outsourcing Governance and Reinforcing Food Care426
 - (b) Gender-Based Analysis of Food Policies for Canada427
 5. Situating the Self in Community: Concluding with an Invitation to Commit428

Chapter 19 — The Fox Regulating the Henhouse: How the Law Fails

- Animals Farmed for Food**431
1. Introduction.....431
 2. Overview of the Laws.....433
 3. Necessary and Unnecessary Suffering: When is it Illegal to Harm Animals?434
 4. Animal Agriculture Industry Codes of Practice437
 5. Why Aren't Cruelty Laws Being Enforced to Protect Farmed Animals?439
 6. Our Inconsistent Attitudes Lead to Inconsistent Law Enforcement.....443
 7. Federal Transport Regulations445
 8. Case Study: Maple Lodge Farms.....446
 9. The Regulation of Killing449
 10. Conclusion451

Chapter 20 — Regulation of Genetically Novel Crops and Food in Canada: It's About PNTs, Not GMOs	453
1. Introduction	453
2. Food Histories	454
3. Plant Breeding.....	455
(a) Sexual	456
(b) Asexual	456
(c) Hybrid	456
(d) Mutagenesis	457
(e) Interspecies Crossing	457
(f) Embryo Rescue	458
(g) Protoplast Fusion.....	458
(h) Chromosome Doubling	458
(i) Somaclonal Variation.....	459
(j) Recombinant DNA (rDNA).....	459
(k) CRISPR(CAS9)	460
4. The GMO Imbroglia.....	461
(a) The GMO Debate.....	461
(b) Two Schools of Interpretation.....	463
(c) Regulatory Approach with Novel Technologies Premised on Scientific Rationality	465
5. Plants with Novel Traits (PNTs)	467
(a) History.....	467
(b) PNTs: In the Field	469
(c) PNTs: On the Fork	471
(d) PNTs: Labels	473
6. Summary	474
Chapter 21 — The New Frontiers of Flesh Food: Regulating Genetically Engineered Animals and <i>In Vitro</i> Meat	475
1. Introduction	475
2. Regulating Novel Foods in Canada.....	477
3. GE Animals	480
(a) Overview	480
(b) Beyond Scientists, Safety, and Short-Termism	483
4. <i>In Vitro</i> Meat.....	489
(a) Overview	489
(b) Rethinking Risk	492
5. Conclusion	497
Chapter 22 — Access and Valorization of Aboriginal Seeds in Canada: Opportunities and Limits of Existing Legal Frameworks to Frame Collaborations Between Aboriginal Peoples and Researchers	499
1. Introduction	499
2. Emergence of International Rights in Favour of Aboriginal Genetic Resource Holders	503

(a)	Particularly Broad Recognition of Rights of Control in the <i>United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples</i>	503
(b)	Recognition of Rights Respecting the Circulation of Resources Physically Held by Aboriginal Communities	504
(i)	The Framing of Access to Genetic Resources in the Convention on Biological Diversity and the Nagoya Protocol	504
(ii)	A Specific Treaty for Plant Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture.....	506
(c)	An Absence of Rights Regarding the Circulation of Resources Not Physically Held by Indigenous Communities	507
(d)	The Valuation of Genetic Resources and the Sharing of Their Resulting Benefits	508
(i)	The Protection of Plant Resources Through Patents.....	508
(ii)	The Protection of New Plant Varieties	509
(iii)	Benefit Sharing Stemming from the Harnessing of Genetic Resources	511
3.	Silences and Gaps in Canadian Law for the Protection of Aboriginal Seeds	511
(a)	Canada's Prevarication on Implementing the <i>United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples</i>	512
(b)	In the Absence of the Implementation of the <i>CBD</i> and the Nagoya Protocol in Canada	513
(c)	The Valuation of Living Plants in Canadian Law: Plant Variety Rights and Patents.....	515
(d)	The Canadian Genebank and Aboriginal Interests.....	516
4.	Underestimated and Unrecognized Legal Gaps in Canadian Frameworks	519
(a)	Opportunities Offered by the Canadian Legal System.....	519
(i)	The Right to Access Canadian Collections	519
(ii)	The Option to Challenge Patent Applications and Plant Varieties.....	520
(b)	Claiming Ancestral Rights.....	522
(c)	The Development of New Frameworks for Collaboration	525
(i)	Collaboration Between the Indian Agricultural Program of Ontario (IAPO) and Agriculture Canada	526
(ii)	The Three Sisters Project.....	526
5.	Conclusion	527

Accès et valorisation des semences autochtones au Canada opportunités et limites des cadres juridiques existants pour l'encadrement des collaborations entre autochtones et chercheurs.....	531
1. Introduction.....	531
2. L'émergence de droits en faveur des détenteurs autochtones de ressources génétiques au niveau international	535
(a) La reconnaissance de droits de contrôle particulièrement étendus dans la <i>Déclaration des Nations Unies sur les droits des peuples autochtones</i>	535
(b) La reconnaissance de droits quant à la circulation des ressources détenues physiquement par les communautés autochtones.....	536
(i) L'encadrement de l'accès aux ressources génétiques dans la CDB et le protocole de Nagoya	536
(ii) Un traité spécifique pour les ressources phytogénétiques pour l'alimentation et l'agriculture.....	538
(c) Une absence de droits quant à la circulation des ressources non détenues physiquement par les communautés autochtones.....	539
(d) La valorisation des ressources génétiques et le partage des avantages en découlant.....	541
(i) La protection des ressources végétales par le biais des brevets	541
(ii) La protection des obtentions végétales.....	542
(iii) Le partage des avantages découlant de l'exploitation des ressources génétiques.....	544
3. Les silences et les lacunes du droit canadien pour la protection des semences autochtones.....	545
(a) Les tergiversations du Canada quant à la mise en œuvre de la <i>Déclaration des Nations Unies sur les droits des peuples autochtones</i>	545
(b) L'absence de mise en œuvre de la CDB et du protocole de Nagoya au Canada.....	546
(c) La valorisation du vivant végétal en droit canadien : les obtentions végétales et les brevets.....	549
(d) La banque de gènes canadienne et les intérêts autochtones ...	550
4. Les interstices juridiques sous-estimés et méconnus des cadres canadiens	553
(a) Les opportunités offertes par le système juridique canadien ..	553
(i) Le droit d'accéder aux collections canadiennes	553
(ii) La possibilité de contester les demandes de brevets et de variétés végétales	554
(b) La revendication de droits ancestraux.....	556
(c) Le développement de nouveaux cadres de collaboration	559

(i) La collaboration entre le Indian Agricultural Program of Ontario (IAPO) et Agriculture Canada	561
(ii) Le projet des Trois Soeurs.....	561
5. Conclusion.....	562
Index	565