

Table of Contents

	PAGE
<i>Dedication</i>	iii
<i>Preface</i>	v
<i>Quotations</i>	vii
<i>Contributors</i>	ix
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxiii
Chapter 1 Introduction to Issues in Civilian Oversight of Policing in Canada	1
<i>Ian Scott</i>	
Chapter 2 Oversight Overview	11
<i>Ian Scott</i>	
Introduction	11
Federal Government	13
British Columbia	14
Office of the Police Complaint Commissioner	15
Independent Investigations Office	17
Alberta	18
Law Enforcement Review Board	19
Alberta Serious Incident Response Team	20
Saskatchewan	21
Public Complaints Commission	21
No Independent Investigative Agency	23
Manitoba	24
The Law Enforcement Review Agency	24
Independent Investigations Unit	25
Ontario	26
Office of the Independent Review Director	27
Special Investigations Unit (SIU)	29
Quebec	29
Police Ethics Commissioner	30
Police Ethics Committee	31
Independent Investigative Agency for Quebec	32
New Brunswick	33
New Brunswick Police Commission	33
No Independent Investigative Agency	34

Nova Scotia	34
Office of the Police Complaints Commissioner	34
Serious Incident Response Team (SIRT)	35
Prince Edward Island	35
Office of the Police Commissioner	36
No Independent Investigative Agency	36
Newfoundland and Labrador	36
Newfoundland Constabulary Public Complaints Commission	37
No Independent Investigative Agency	37
Conclusion	37
Chapter 3 Civilian Review of Police Conduct in the Federal System	41
<i>Lisa-Marie Inman</i>	
Overview	41
The Commission for Public Complaints Against the RCMP	42
Recommendations Regarding Changes to the Legislative Framework	45
Innovations	48
The Civilian Review and Complaints Commission	49
Other Means of Examination of RCMP Member Conduct	51
The Criminal Process	51
The Disciplinary Process	52
Efficacy of the Public Complaints System	53
Participatory Public Right	53
Accessible Evidentiary Threshold	54
Ability to Address Systemic Issues	55
Conclusion	56
Chapter 4 The Military Police Complaints Commission	59
<i>Peter Tinsley</i>	
Introduction and Overview	59
Origins and Evolution	60
The Somalia Commission	61
The Dickson Reports	62
The Lamer Report	64
Bills C-7, C-45 and C-41	65
The Second Five Year Review	66
Bill C-15	67
Summary of Evolution	68

TABLE OF CONTENTS

xv

The Military Police Complaints Oversight Process	69
Conduct Complaints	70
Interference Complaints	72
Interim to Final Reports	73
Continuing Issues in Military Police Oversight	75
Legislated Interference	75
Agency or Adversary of Government	76
Conclusion	80
Chapter 5 The Bureau des Enquêtes Indépendantes du Québec:	
A Long Time Coming	81
<i>André Fiset</i>	
The Seeds of Reform	81
The Villanueva Affair	81
The Ombudsperson’s Report	82
The Current System in the Province of Quebec	83
The Charest Government’s Bill 46	84
The Reform Proposed by Minister Dutil	84
The Ombudsperson’s Criticism	85
The Marois Government’s Bill 12	85
The Reform Proposed by Minister Bergeron	85
The Regulatory Proposals	87
Chapter 6 Development of Civilian Oversight in Ontario	89
<i>Ian Scott</i>	
Introduction	89
Beginnings of Oversight	90
Toronto Public Complaints Project, 1981	93
Beginnings of the Special Investigations Unit	94
Entrenchment of Provincial Oversight, 1990	95
The 1990s – Lead-up to the Abolition of the Public Complaints Commissioner	97
Review of the Special Investigations Unit’s Mandate Through the 1990s	99
2000 to 2010 – Civilian Oversight of Police Complaints Redux . . .	103
SIU – 2000 to 2011 – More Studies	106
Conclusion	109

**Chapter 7 Civilian Oversight and the 2010 G20 Summit
in Toronto** 111
Nathalie Des Rosiers and Graeme Norton

Introduction 111
 The Policing of the G20. 113
 G20 Accountability Responses. 121
 The Federal Standing Committee on Public Safety and
 National Security: Hearings and Report 122
 The Public Works Protection Act 123
 Investigations of Serious Injuries Caused by Police: The
 Special Investigations Unit 125
 Public Complaints Bodies: The OIPRD and RCMP-CPC 128
 Civilian Oversight 130
 The Accountability Gaps 132
 Conclusion. 134

**Chapter 8 Other Legal Mechanisms of Accountability for
Police Use of Force** 137
Ian Scott

Introduction 137
 Criminal Law Addressing Police Use of Force. 138
 Statutory Provisions Creating Liability 138
 Common Law Overlay 138
 Protections Conferred by Criminal Code Section 25 140
 “Fleeing Felon” Rule 142
 Defence of Person 143
 Common Law Overlay 145
 Ambit 145
 Propensity for Violence 147
 Law Enforcement Immunity?. 147
 Investigation and Laying of Charges 149
 Staying of Charges 150
 Provincial Mechanisms of Accountability. 151
 Civil Actions 151
 Intentional Tort Lawsuits 151
 Charter 153
 Declaratory Relief. 154
 Inquests 155
 Public Inquiries 157
 Interrelationship Between Criminal Law and Provincial
 Mechanisms of Accountability. 159
 Conclusion. 161

Chapter 9 Independence in Civilian-Led Investigations of the Police 163

Kevin Kunetski and Kelsi Barkway

Introduction 163

Review of the Literature 164

Independence 165

Public Confidence in the Police 165

Transparency 166

The Goals of Civilian Oversight and Investigation 167

Methodology 167

Results of Research 169

Theme #1 – The head of a civilian-led oversight agency should never have worked as a police officer 169

Theme #2 – The head of a civilian-led oversight agency should be employed for a non-renewable fixed term of five to seven years 169

Theme #3 – The head of a civilian-led oversight agency should report to an all-party committee of the Legislature or to Parliament, or should otherwise be structured to have real and perceived operational independence from any bureaucratic department of the government 170

Theme #4 – Civilian-led oversight agencies require adequate budgets to ensure they will be capable of fulfilling their mandates 172

Theme #5 – Civilian-led oversight agencies, wherever possible, should avoid using seconded or serving police officer resources 173

Theme #6 – The public should have the ability to report incidents directly to a civilian-led oversight agency 177

Theme #7 – Civilian-led oversight agencies should have the ability to self-initiate investigations 178

Theme #8 – Civilian-led oversight agencies, operating within their mandate, should have the sole authority to determine which incidents they will or will not investigate, without influence from any person or entity 178

Theme #9 – Civilian-led oversight agencies should embrace transparency 179

Theme #10 – Civilian-led oversight agencies require strong legislation to ensure their independence from the police and the government 180

Conclusion 181

Appendix “A” – Civilian-led Oversight Agency Respondents 182

Appendix “B” – Research Themes, Recommendations, and Best Practices	184
Chapter 10 The Impact of McNeil on Civilian Oversight of the Police: A Case Study of Ontario’s Special Investigations Unit	185
<i>Joseph Martino</i>	
Introduction	185
McNeil: An Overview	186
The Ambit of O’Connor	187
Privacy and Criminal Investigation Files	187
Whether the Crown is Indivisible in the Context of Disclosure under Stinchcombe	187
Crown and Police Disclosure Obligations vis-à-vis Third Party Police Disciplinary Records and Criminal Investigation Files	188
The O’Connor Regime for Production of Third Party Records	188
Stinchcombe Remodelled	192
Crown Counsel’s Duty to Inquire	192
Police Service’s Duty to Disclose	193
The SIU and the Importance of Confidentiality	195
The Impact of McNeil	197
The SIU as “Third Party”?	197
Are SIU Records “Likely Relevant”?	199
Second Stage of O’Connor Revisited	207
A Question of Privilege?	208
Scope of McNeil Duty to Disclose	213
Application to the SIU	219
Conclusion	221
Chapter 11 Litigation as a Vehicle for Police Oversight Reform: A Family Business	225
<i>Julian N. Falconer and Meaghan Daniel</i>	
Introduction	225
Odhavji Estate v. Woodhouse	227
Hill v. Hamilton-Wentworth Regional Police Services Board	231
Wellington v. Ontario	233
Abouhassan v. Van Buskirk	237
Penner v. Niagara Regional Police Services Board	238
Schaeffer v. Wood	244

The Obvious Thus Far Unstated: Police Misconduct's Disproportionate Effects	250
Conclusion.	253
Chapter 12 Off-Duty Misconduct and Quebec Police Officers	255
<i>André Fiset</i>	
Introduction	255
The Disciplinary System	256
Actions Specifically Involving an Off-Duty Police Officer	257
Wearing Uniform During a Union Demonstration	257
Drinking Alcoholic Beverages Immoderately	258
Fraternizing with Persons with a Criminal Reputation.	258
Conduct Which May Constitute a Criminal Offence	259
Affecting the Image of the Police Organization	260
A Cited Police Officer's Procedural Guarantees	261
The Right to Be Informed of the Filing of a Complaint.	262
The Right to Remain Silent Versus the Obligation to File a Report.	263
The Right to a Full and Complete Defence and Communication of the Evidence	264
The Possibility of Contesting the Police Organization's Disciplinary Measure.	264
The Code of Ethics of Quebec Police Officers	265
General Regime.	266
Exceptionally, the Commissioner May Rule on an Ethics Complaint Against an Off-Duty Police Officer	267
Enforcement of the New Provisions of the Police Act	268
Dismissal of a Police Officer Found Guilty of a Criminal Offence.	268
The Duty to Inform.	271
Conclusion.	272
Chapter 13 The Road to Independent Police Officers' Notes in SIU Incidents	273
<i>Ian Scott</i>	
Introduction	273
Prelude to the Schaeffer Incident	274
The Shooting Death of Levi Schaeffer	276
The Investigation	277
The Importance of the Independence of Notes.	278
The Press Release and Reaction.	281

Notice of Application Filed 284
 The LeSage Process 286
 The Application 287
 Notice of Appeal Filed 288
 LeSage Process Revisited 289
 More Motions to Quash 289
 The Appeal Ruling 290
 Leave to Appeal to the Supreme Court of Canada Granted 292
 The Appeal to the Supreme Court of Canada 293
 The Decision 295
 Conclusion 296

Chapter 14 Models of Civilian Police Review: The Objectives and Mechanisms of Legal and Political Regulation of the Police 301

Kent Roach

Introduction 301
 The Objectives of Civilian Oversight 307
 The Balance between Review for Propriety and Efficacy 308
 The Balance between Democratic Oversight by Elected
 Officials and Legal Oversight by Independent Bodies 309
 Where Oversight May Not Be Appropriate: The Limited
 and Legitimate Scope of Police Independence 311
 The Balance between Independent Review and
 Self-Regulation 312
 Maintaining Public Confidence: Engaging with a
 Knowledgeable, Diverse and Cynical Public 316
 The Balance between Resolution of Complaints and
 Systemic Reviews or Audits 318
 The Balance between Mediation and Adjudication of
 Complaints 319
 Paramilitary or Professional Discipline? 320
 Sanctions or Rewards? 320
 Fragmented/Fail Safe Review or Focused Review? 321
 Mechanisms of Civil Oversight 322
 Police Commissions or Services Boards 322
 Ministerial Responsibility 323
 Police Complaints Bodies 324
 Regulatory Offences and the Disciplinary Process 329
 Criminal Investigations and Prosecutions and the Special
 Investigations Model 330
 Civil Lawsuits 334

TABLE OF CONTENTS

xxi

Indirect Review of Police Conduct in Criminal Cases	336
Public Inquiries and Other Systemic Reviews	337
Conclusion	338
<i>Index</i>	341