

Table of Contents

	PAGE
<i>Dedication</i>	iii
<i>Preface</i>	v
<i>Quotations</i>	vii
<i>Contributors</i>	ix
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxiii
 Chapter 1 Introduction to Issues in Civilian Oversight of Policing in Canada	1
<i>Ian Scott</i>	
 Chapter 2 Oversight Overview	11
<i>Ian Scott</i>	
Introduction	11
Federal Government	13
British Columbia	14
Office of the Police Complaint Commissioner	15
Independent Investigations Office	17
Alberta	18
Law Enforcement Review Board	19
Alberta Serious Incident Response Team	20
Saskatchewan	21
Public Complaints Commission	21
No Independent Investigative Agency	23
Manitoba	24
The Law Enforcement Review Agency	24
Independent Investigations Unit	25
Ontario	26
Office of the Independent Review Director	27
Special Investigations Unit (SIU)	29
Quebec	29
Police Ethics Commissioner	30
Police Ethics Committee	31
Independent Investigative Agency for Quebec	32
New Brunswick	33
New Brunswick Police Commission	33
No Independent Investigative Agency	34

Nova Scotia	34
Office of the Police Complaints Commissioner	34
Serious Incident Response Team (SIRT)	35
Prince Edward Island	35
Office of the Police Commissioner	36
No Independent Investigative Agency	36
Newfoundland and Labrador	36
Newfoundland Constabulary Public Complaints Commission	37
No Independent Investigative Agency	37
Conclusion	37
 Chapter 3 Civilian Review of Police Conduct in the Federal System	 41
<i>Lisa-Marie Inman</i>	
Overview	41
The Commission for Public Complaints Against the RCMP	42
Recommendations Regarding Changes to the Legislative Framework	45
Innovations	48
The Civilian Review and Complaints Commission	49
Other Means of Examination of RCMP Member Conduct	51
The Criminal Process	51
The Disciplinary Process	52
Efficacy of the Public Complaints System	53
Participatory Public Right	53
Accessible Evidentiary Threshold	54
Ability to Address Systemic Issues	55
Conclusion	56
 Chapter 4 The Military Police Complaints Commission	 59
<i>Peter Tinsley</i>	
Introduction and Overview	59
Origins and Evolution	60
The Somalia Commission	61
The Dickson Reports	62
The Lamer Report	64
Bills C-7, C-45 and C-41	65
The Second Five Year Review	66
Bill C-15	67
Summary of Evolution	68

TABLE OF CONTENTS

xv

The Military Police Complaints Oversight Process	69
Conduct Complaints	70
Interference Complaints	72
Interim to Final Reports	73
Continuing Issues in Military Police Oversight	75
Legislated Interference	75
Agency or Adversary of Government	76
Conclusion	80
Chapter 5 The Bureau des Enquêtes Indépendantes du Québec:	
A Long Time Coming	81
<i>André Fiset</i>	
The Seeds of Reform	81
The Villanueva Affair	81
The Ombudsperson’s Report	82
The Current System in the Province of Quebec	83
The Charest Government’s Bill 46	84
The Reform Proposed by Minister Dutil	84
The Ombudsperson’s Criticism	85
The Marois Government’s Bill 12	85
The Reform Proposed by Minister Bergeron	85
The Regulatory Proposals	87
Chapter 6 Development of Civilian Oversight in Ontario	
<i>Ian Scott</i>	
Introduction	89
Beginnings of Oversight	90
Toronto Public Complaints Project, 1981	93
Beginnings of the Special Investigations Unit	94
Entrenchment of Provincial Oversight, 1990	95
The 1990s – Lead-up to the Abolition of the Public Complaints Commissioner	97
Review of the Special Investigations Unit’s Mandate Through the 1990s	99
2000 to 2010 – Civilian Oversight of Police Complaints Redux . . .	103
SIU – 2000 to 2011 – More Studies	106
Conclusion	109

Chapter 7 Civilian Oversight and the 2010 G20 Summit in Toronto	111
<i>Nathalie Des Rosiers and Graeme Norton</i>	
Introduction	111
The Policing of the G20	113
G20 Accountability Responses	121
The Federal Standing Committee on Public Safety and National Security: Hearings and Report	122
The Public Works Protection Act	123
Investigations of Serious Injuries Caused by Police: The Special Investigations Unit	125
Public Complaints Bodies: The OIPRD and RCMP-CPC	128
Civilian Oversight	130
The Accountability Gaps	132
Conclusion	134
 Chapter 8 Other Legal Mechanisms of Accountability for Police Use of Force	137
<i>Ian Scott</i>	
Introduction	137
Criminal Law Addressing Police Use of Force	138
Statutory Provisions Creating Liability	138
Common Law Overlay	138
Protections Conferred by Criminal Code Section 25	140
“Fleeing Felon” Rule	142
Defence of Person	143
Common Law Overlay	145
Ambit	145
Propensity for Violence	147
Law Enforcement Immunity?	147
Investigation and Laying of Charges	149
Staying of Charges	150
Provincial Mechanisms of Accountability	151
Civil Actions	151
Intentional Tort Lawsuits	151
Charter	153
Declaratory Relief	154
Inquests	155
Public Inquiries	157
Interrelationship Between Criminal Law and Provincial Mechanisms of Accountability	159
Conclusion	161

Chapter 9 Independence in Civilian-Led Investigations of the Police	163
<i>Kevin Kunetski and Kelsi Barkway</i>	
Introduction	163
Review of the Literature	164
Independence	165
Public Confidence in the Police	165
Transparency	166
The Goals of Civilian Oversight and Investigation	167
Methodology	167
Results of Research	169
Theme #1 – The head of a civilian-led oversight agency should never have worked as a police officer	169
Theme #2 – The head of a civilian-led oversight agency should be employed for a non-renewable fixed term of five to seven years	169
Theme #3 – The head of a civilian-led oversight agency should report to an all-party committee of the Legislature or to Parliament, or should otherwise be structured to have real and perceived operational independence from any bureaucratic department of the government	170
Theme #4 – Civilian-led oversight agencies require adequate budgets to ensure they will be capable of fulfilling their mandates	172
Theme #5 – Civilian-led oversight agencies, wherever possible, should avoid using seconded or serving police officer resources	173
Theme #6 – The public should have the ability to report incidents directly to a civilian-led oversight agency	177
Theme #7 – Civilian-led oversight agencies should have the ability to self-initiate investigations	178
Theme #8 – Civilian-led oversight agencies, operating within their mandate, should have the sole authority to determine which incidents they will or will not investigate, without influence from any person or entity	178
Theme #9 – Civilian-led oversight agencies should embrace transparency	179
Theme #10 – Civilian-led oversight agencies require strong legislation to ensure their independence from the police and the government	180
Conclusion	181
Appendix “A” – Civilian-led Oversight Agency Respondents	182

Appendix “B” – Research Themes, Recommendations, and Best Practices.	184
Chapter 10 The Impact of McNeil on Civilian Oversight of the Police: A Case Study of Ontario’s Special Investigations Unit	185
<i>Joseph Martino</i>	
Introduction	185
McNeil: An Overview	186
The Ambit of O’Connor	187
Privacy and Criminal Investigation Files	187
Whether the Crown is Indivisible in the Context of Disclosure under Stinchcombe.	187
Crown and Police Disclosure Obligations vis-à-vis Third Party Police Disciplinary Records and Criminal Investigation Files	188
The O’Connor Regime for Production of Third Party Records	188
Stinchcombe Remodelled.	192
Crown Counsel’s Duty to Inquire	192
Police Service’s Duty to Disclose	193
The SIU and the Importance of Confidentiality.	195
The Impact of McNeil	197
The SIU as “Third Party”?	197
Are SIU Records “Likely Relevant”?	199
Second Stage of O’Connor Revisited	207
A Question of Privilege?	208
Scope of McNeil Duty to Disclose.	213
Application to the SIU	219
Conclusion.	221
Chapter 11 Litigation as a Vehicle for Police Oversight Reform: A Family Business	225
<i>Julian N. Falconer and Meaghan Daniel</i>	
Introduction	225
Odhavji Estate v. Woodhouse	227
Hill v. Hamilton-Wentworth Regional Police Services Board	231
Wellington v. Ontario	233
Abouhassan v. Van Buskirk.	237
Penner v. Niagara Regional Police Services Board	238
Schaeffer v. Wood	244

The Obvious Thus Far Unstated: Police Misconduct's Disproportionate Effects	250
Conclusion.	253
Chapter 12 Off-Duty Misconduct and Quebec Police Officers	255
<i>André Fiset</i>	
Introduction	255
The Disciplinary System	256
Actions Specifically Involving an Off-Duty Police Officer	257
Wearing Uniform During a Union Demonstration	257
Drinking Alcoholic Beverages Immoderately	258
Fraternizing with Persons with a Criminal Reputation.	258
Conduct Which May Constitute a Criminal Offence	259
Affecting the Image of the Police Organization	260
A Cited Police Officer's Procedural Guarantees	261
The Right to Be Informed of the Filing of a Complaint.	262
The Right to Remain Silent Versus the Obligation to File a Report.	263
The Right to a Full and Complete Defence and Communication of the Evidence	264
The Possibility of Contesting the Police Organization's Disciplinary Measure.	264
The Code of Ethics of Quebec Police Officers	265
General Regime.	266
Exceptionally, the Commissioner May Rule on an Ethics Complaint Against an Off-Duty Police Officer	267
Enforcement of the New Provisions of the Police Act	268
Dismissal of a Police Officer Found Guilty of a Criminal Offence.	268
The Duty to Inform.	271
Conclusion.	272
Chapter 13 The Road to Independent Police Officers' Notes in SIU Incidents	273
<i>Ian Scott</i>	
Introduction	273
Prelude to the Schaeffer Incident	274
The Shooting Death of Levi Schaeffer	276
The Investigation.	277
The Importance of the Independence of Notes.	278
The Press Release and Reaction.	281

Notice of Application Filed	284
The LeSage Process	286
The Application.	287
Notice of Appeal Filed	288
LeSage Process Revisited	289
More Motions to Quash	289
The Appeal Ruling	290
Leave to Appeal to the Supreme Court of Canada Granted.	292
The Appeal to the Supreme Court of Canada	293
The Decision	295
Conclusion.	296

Chapter 14 Models of Civilian Police Review: The Objectives and Mechanisms of Legal and Political Regulation of the Police.	301
<i>Kent Roach</i>	
Introduction	301
The Objectives of Civilian Oversight	307
The Balance between Review for Propriety and Efficacy	308
The Balance between Democratic Oversight by Elected Officials and Legal Oversight by Independent Bodies	309
Where Oversight May Not Be Appropriate: The Limited and Legitimate Scope of Police Independence	311
The Balance between Independent Review and Self-Regulation	312
Maintaining Public Confidence: Engaging with a Knowledgeable, Diverse and Cynical Public	316
The Balance between Resolution of Complaints and Systemic Reviews or Audits.	318
The Balance between Mediation and Adjudication of Complaints	319
Paramilitary or Professional Discipline?.	320
Sanctions or Rewards?.	320
Fragmented/Fail Safe Review or Focused Review?	321
Mechanisms of Civil Oversight.	322
Police Commissions or Services Boards	322
Ministerial Responsibility	323
Police Complaints Bodies.	324
Regulatory Offences and the Disciplinary Process	329
Criminal Investigations and Prosecutions and the Special Investigations Model	330
Civil Lawsuits	334

TABLE OF CONTENTS

xxi

Indirect Review of Police Conduct in Criminal Cases	336
Public Inquiries and Other Systemic Reviews	337
Conclusion	338
<i>Index</i>	341