Table of Contents

CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION

I. OVERVIEW

- § 1:1 Generally
- § 1:2 Basic legal protections: Asylum, INA § 241(b)(3) withholding of removal, and Convention Against Torture
- § 1:3 History of U.S. asylum law

II. SOURCES OF LAW

- § 1:4 Domestic law
- § 1:5 International law

III. ASYLUM, WITHHOLDING OF REMOVAL, AND CONVENTION AGAINST TORTURE PROCEDURE

- § 1:6 Generally
- § 1:7 Credible fear and reasonable fear
- § 1:8 Asylum Office: "Affirmative" asylum
- § 1:9 Immigration Court: "Defensive" asylum, INA § 241(b)(3) withholding of removal, and protection under Convention Against Torture
- § 1:10 Administrative and judicial review
- § 1:11 Post-asylum: Family reunification and permanent residency

IV. RELATED IMMIGRATION STATUSES AND RELIEF

- § 1:12 Introduction
- § 1:13 Temporary protected status (TPS)
- § 1:14 Violence Against Women Act (VAWA)
- § 1:15 U and T visas
- § 1:16 Special immigrant juvenile status (SIJS)
- § 1:17 Deferred action, deferred action for childhood arrivals, and deferred action for parental accountability
- § 1:18 Private bills

V. CLIMATE MIGRATION AND REFUGEE LAW

- § 1:19 Overview
- § 1:20 Refugee law and climate change: Key concepts
- § 1:21 Applying refugee law
- § 1:22 Persecution
- § 1:23 Nexus
- § 1:24 Internal relocation
- § 1:25 "Other serious harm"

CHAPTER 2. STANDARD OF PROOF

I. INTRODUCTION

§ 2:1 Generally

II. DISTINGUISHING STANDARDS OF PROOF IN ASYLUM AND WITHHOLDING OF REMOVAL: EARLY U.S. SUPREME COURT DECISIONS

§ 2:2 Generally

II. STANDARD OF PROOF FOR ASYLUM

A. WELL-FOUNDED FEAR OF PERSECUTION

-	\sim	
	()ve	rview

- § 2:3 Generally
- § 2:4 Requirement of individualized determination
 - 2. "Subjective" and "Objective" Elements
- § 2:5 "Subjective" fear and "objective" risk
- § 2:6 Reconciling "subjective" fear and "objective" risk
 - 3. Refugees "Sur Place"
- § 2:7 Generally

4. Types of Proof

- § 2:8 Past persecution
- § 2:9 Targeting: Threats and past harm
- § 2:10 Human rights conditions
- § 2:11 Treatment of closely-associated persons
- § 2:12 "Pattern or practice" ("similarly-situated" standard)

5. Internal Relocation

- § 2:13 Generally
- § 2:14 Burden of proof
- § 2:15 "Reasonableness" under all the circumstances

B. PAST PERSECUTION

1. Overview

- § 2:16 Past persecution: Independent basis
 - 2. Burden Shifting and Exercise of Discretion
 - a. Presumption of Future Persecution
- § 2:17 Generally
 - b. Rebuttal of Presumption
 - i. Fundamental Change in Circumstances
- § 2:18 Fundamental change in circumstances generally
- § 2:19 Fundamental change in conditions of country of origin
- § 2:20 Fundamental change in personal circumstances—Gender and female genital mutilation

§ 2:21 Forced sterilization
ii. Internal Relocation
§ 2:22 Generally
c. Discretionary Grant and "Past-Persecution Only Asylum"
§ 2:23 Generally
§ 2:24 Determination of severity of past persecution§ 2:25 Determination of existence of "other serious harm"
IV. STANDARD OF PROOF IN INA § 241(b)(3) WITHHOLDING OF REMOVAL
§ 2:26 Generally
 § 2:27 Withholding of removal based on past persecution § 2:28 Withholding of removal based on future threat to life or freedom
CHAPTER 3. EVIDENCE
I. INTRODUCTION
§ 3:1 Generally
II. APPLICANT'S BURDEN OF PROOF
A. OVERVIEW
§ 3:2 Generally § 3:3 Applicant's testimony; benefit of the doubt principle
B. CORROBORATION
1. Overview
§ 3:4 Generally § 3:5 Corroboration of central, material facts that are reasonably available
§ 3:6 Judicial review: Scope of review and corroboration rules § 3:7 Notice and opportunity to respond
2. Types of Corroborating Evidence
a. Overview
§ 3:8 Generally
§ 3:9 Corroborative testimony of lay witnesses § 3:10 Expert witnesses and affidavits
§ 3:11 External documentary evidence
b. Country Conditions and Human Rights Documentation
§ 3:12 Generally
§ 3:13 Governmental and non-governmental sources

III. ADMINISTRATIVE NOTICE OF COUNTRY CONDITIONS

- § 3:14 Board of Immigration Appeals practice
- § 3:15 Commonly acknowledged facts requirement
- § 3:16 Restrictions on adjudicative or outcome-determinative facts
- § 3:17 Applicant's right to individualized determination
- § 3:18 Rebuttal rights

IV. CREDIBILITY

A. OVERVIEW

- § 3:19 Generally
- § 3:20 REAL ID Act codification of credibility standards

B. CREDIBILITY FACTORS

- 1. Demeanor
- § 3:21 Generally
 - 2. Specificity and Detail
- § 3:22 Generally
 - 3. Consistency
- § 3:23 Generally
- § 3:24 Internal consistency
- § 3:25 Nonmaterial inconsistencies
- § 3:26 External consistency
 - 4. Applicant's Opportunity to Explain
- § 3:27 Generally
 - 5. Children and Credibility
- § 3:28 Generally

CHAPTER 4. PERSECUTION

I. PERSECUTION: DOMESTIC AND INTERNATIONAL LAW

- § 4:1 International law and human rights standards
- § 4:2 History and context
- § 4:3 Human rights standards
- § 4:4 U.S. case law: General concepts and definitions
- § 4:5 Persecution versus "threat to life or freedom"
- § 4:6 Distinguishing persecution from prosecution
- § 4:7 Persecution versus punishment

II. ROLE OF STATE PROTECTION

- § 4:8 State protection: Inability or unwillingness to protect
- § 4:9 State actors: Official and de facto

- § 4:10 Non-state actors
- § 4:11 Evidence of a failure of state protection

III. FORMS OF PERSECUTORY HARM

A. OVERVIEW

§ 4:12 Generally

B. PHYSICAL VIOLENCE AND RELATED HARMS

- § 4:13 Generally
- § 4:14 Detention
- § 4:15 Rape and sexual violence
- § 4:16 Domestic violence
- § 4:17 Female genital mutilation

C. MENTAL, EMOTIONAL, AND PSYCHOLOGICAL HARM

- § 4:18 Generally
- § 4:19 Threats
- § 4:20 Harm to family members
- § 4:21 Harm to children

D. FORCED VIOLATIONS OF FUNDAMENTAL BELIEFS

- § 4:22 Generally
- § 4:23 Forced renunciation or violation of religious beliefs
- § 4:24 Coercive family planning policies
- § 4:25 Feminist beliefs and forced marriage
- § 4:26 Conscription

E. ECONOMIC HARM

1. Overview

- § 4:27 Generally
- § 4:28 Evolution of standards

2. Forms of Economic Harm

- § 4:29 Generally
- § 4:30 Fines and other economic penalties
- § 4:31 Employment
- § 4:32 Housing and other means of living and support
- § 4:33 Education and health care

3. Cumulative Economic Harm

§ 4:34 Generally

F. DISCRIMINATION

§ 4:35 Generally

G. EXPULSION AND DENATIONALIZATION

§ 4:36 Generally

CHAPTER 5. NEXUS AND GROUNDS OF PERSECUTION

I. NEXUS REQUIREMENT

- A. OVERVIEW
- § 5:1 Generally
 - B. INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS AND U.S. INTERPRETATION
 - 1. Overview
- § 5:2 Generally
 - 2. Early U.S. Interpretation of Nexus
- § 5:3 Early Board of Immigration Appeals decisions: Emphasis on motives
- § 5:4 Early Ninth Circuit presumptions
- § 5:5 U.S. Supreme Court in *Elias-Zacarias*: Rejection of *per se* rules, acceptance of circumstantial evidence

C. PROVING NEXUS

1. Overview

- § 5:6 Generally
- § 5:7 Evidence: Direct or circumstantial
- § 5:8 Mixed motives: Matter of S-P-
- § 5:9 Objective criteria: No subjective animus
- § 5:10 Laws of general applicability and enforcement
 - 2. REAL ID Act and Nexus: "At Least One Central Reason" Test
- § 5:11 Generally
- § 5:12 Nexus in the withholding of removal context
- § 5:13 Legislative history: Change from "motive" to "reason"
- § 5:14 Mixed reasons; requirement of "non-tangential" reason
- § 5:15 Motivational inquiry post-REAL ID
- § 5:16 The bifurcated nexus challenge in U.S. law

II. GROUNDS OF PERSECUTION

- A. OVERVIEW
- § 5:17 Generally

B. POLITICAL OPINION

1. Overview

O	F 10	7 /r ·		1	
ð.	5:18	Meaning	ot no	litical	oninion
×	0.10	Meaning	OT DO	mutai	ODITION

2. Express Political Opinion

- § 5:19 Organizational membership and affiliation
- § 5:20 Labor union membership and activities
- § 5:21 Mere membership in or association with a group
- § 5:22 Individual activism
- § 5:23 Refusal to join or support organization
- § 5:24 Whistleblowing
- § 5:25 Neutrality
- § 5:26 Third generation gangs
- § 5:27 Violation of the law, generally
- § 5:28 Violation of laws prohibiting departure
- § 5:29 Violation of military service laws
- § 5:30 Gender-related political opinion
- § 5:31 Opposition to, or violation of, coercive family planning laws

3. Imputed Political Opinion

a. Overview

§ 5:32 Generally

b. Imputation Based on Associations

- § 5:33 Family associations as a basis for imputed political opinion
- § 5:34 Nationality, race, religion, or ethnic group as a basis for imputed political opinion
- § 5:35 Village or region as a basis for imputed political opinion
- § 5:36 Social class as a basis for imputed political opinion
- § 5:37 Perceived group membership or association with group members as a basis for imputed political opinion
- § 5:38 Spiritual, philosophical, or charitable practices or group membership as basis for imputed political opinion
- § 5:39 Individual ties to government, actual and perceived, as a basis for imputed political opinion

c. Non-Associational Activism

§ 5:40 Generally

C. MEMBERSHIP IN A PARTICULAR SOCIAL GROUP

1. Basic Framework

- § 5:41 Generally
 - Social Distinction and Particularity
- § 5:42 Generally
- § 5:43 Evolution of PSG
- § 5:44 The requirements of particularity and social distinction

	3. Types of Social Group Claims				
	a. Family and Clan				
§ 5:45	Generally				
0	b. Gender-Based Particular Social Groups				
	i. Overview				
8 5 40					
§ 5:46	Gender Per Se				
	ii. Female Genital Mutilation				
-	Generally				
	Past female genital mutilation				
§ 5:49	5:49 Fear of harm to applicant's children				
	iii. Spousal or Intimate Partner Violence				
§ 5:50	Generally				
	iv. Forced Marriage				
§ 5:51	Generally				
	v. Trafficking				
§ 5:52	Generally				
8 0.02	•				
	vi. Gender-Based Discrimination				
§ 5:53	Generally				
	c. Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity				
0	Sexual orientation				
§ 5:55	Gender identity				
	d. Third Generation Gangs				
	i. Overview				
§ 5:56	Generally				
	ii. Former Gang Members				
8 5.57	Generally				
3 0.0 .	iii. Non-Gang Members				
8 5.50	_				
§ 5:58	Generally Pacieton on to magnify and				
0	Resistance to recruitment Extortion				
-	Witnesses or informants				
	Gender-based				
§ 5.02	e. Children				
\$ 5.60					
§ 5:63	Generally Formular Status				
_	f. Former Status				
§ 5:64	Generally				
§ 5:65	Past targeting and victimization				

	g. Social Status; Landownership		
§ 5:66	Generally		
	h. Health Status and Disability		
§ 5:67	Generally		
§ 5:68	HIV/AIDS		
D.	RELIGION		
	1. Overview		
§ 5:69	Generally		
§ 5:70	Right to religious freedom in international law		
§ 5:71	Defining religion		
	2. Right to Hold Religious Beliefs		
§ 5:72	Generally		
	3. Right to Practice: Restrictions on the Exercise of Religious Freedom		
§ 5:73	Generally		
§ 5:74	State regulation of religion		
§ 5:75	Religion-based conscientious objectors		
	4. Sincerity of Belief and Evidentiary Issues		
§ 5:76	Generally		
§ 5:77	Doctrinal religious knowledge		
§ 5:78	Apostasy		
§ 5:79	Perceived renunciation		
	5. Well-Founded Fear and Nexus Issues		
§ 5:80	Generally		
	6. Relationship of Religion to Other Grounds		
§ 5:81	Religion and political opinion		
§ 5:82	Religion and gender		
	Religion and race, nationality		
§ 5:84	Interfaith marriages		
E.	RACE		
§ 5:85	Generally		
§ 5:86	Racial discrimination		
§ 5:87	Standard of proof and nexus		
§ 5:88	Relationship of race to other grounds		
F.	NATIONALITY		
§ 5:89	Generally		
§ 5:90	Relationship of nationality to other grounds		
§ 5:91	Perceived nationality		

CHAPTER 6. INELIGIBILITY FOR ASYLUM AND WITHHOLDING OF REMOVAL

I. INTRODUCTION

- § 6:1 International basis for exclusion from refugee status
- § 6:2 Bars, generally

II. BARS TO ASYLUM AND WITHHOLDING OF REMOVAL

A. PERSECUTION OF OTHERS

- § 6:3 Generally
- § 6:4 Comparison between U.S. provisions and Refugee Convention
- § 6:5 Development of U.S. case law
- § 6:6 Persecution on account of a protected ground
- § 6:7 "Ordered, incited, assisted, or otherwise participated in" requirement

B. SERIOUS NONPOLITICAL CRIMES

- § 6:8 Generally
- § 6:9 "Serious reasons for believing" requirement
- § 6:10 "Nonpolitical" crime requirement
- § 6:11 Terrorism and "nonpolitical" crimes
- § 6:12 "Serious" crime requirement
- § 6:13 Balancing of criminal conduct and feared persecution

C. PARTICULARLY SERIOUS CRIMES

1. Overview

- § 6:14 Generally
- § 6:15 Issues of proof, individualized review, and categorical bars

2. The "Particularly Serious Crime" Bar to Asylum and Withholding of Removal

- § 6:16 Background
- § 6:17 Aggravated felonies: Particularly serious crimes per se
- § 6:18 Other *per se* or presumptive particularly serious crimes
- § 6:19 Crimes requiring individualized assessments
- § 6:20 "Danger to the community" and balancing severity of persecution

D. DANGER TO THE SECURITY OF THE UNITED STATES AND TERRORISM

1. Overview

- § 6:21 Generally
- § 6:22 U.S. and international law

Table of	F CONTENTS			
	2. "Danger to the Security of the United States	3"		
§ 6:23	Generally			
	3. Terrorist Activities, Risks, and Associations			
§ 6:24	Generally			
§ 6:25	Key statutory definitions			
§ 6:26	Operation of terrorism bars			
§ 6:27	Material support of terrorism			
§ 6:28				
§ 6:29	Secret evidence			
III. E	BARS TO ASYLUM ONLY			
A.	OVERVIEW			
§ 6:30	Generally			
В.	ONE-YEAR FILING DEADLINE			
	1. Overview			
§ 6:31	Generally			
§ 6:32	Timeliness: Burden and standard of proof			
§ 6:33				
	2. Exceptions to One-Year Filing Deadline			
§ 6:34	Generally			
§ 6:35	Extraordinary circumstances			
§ 6:36	Changed circumstances			
§ 6:37	Reasonable period filing requirement			
C.	FIRM RESETTLEMENT			
§ 6:38	Generally			
§ 6:39	Regulatory transit bans			
§ 6:40	Burden of proof and evidence			
§ 6:41	Status in third country			
§ 6:42	Ability to return and status			
D.	. DISCRETIONARY DENIALS OF ASYLUM			
§ 6:43	Generally			
E.	SAFE THIRD-COUNTRY AGREEMENTS			

- § 6:44 Generally
- § 6:45 U.S. safe third-country provisions

F. PREVIOUSLY-DENIED ASYLUM APPLICATIONS

§ 6:46 Generally

G. "FRIVOLOUS" ASYLUM APPLICATIONS

§ 6:47 Generally

IV. JUDICIAL REVIEW OF ASYLUM AND WITHHOLDING BARS

§ 6:48 Generally

CHAPTER 7. PROTECTION UNDER ARTICLE 3 OF THE CONVENTION AGAINST TORTURE

I. OVERVIEW

- A. CONVENTION AGAINST TORTURE AND THE ABSOLUTE NATURE OF THE TORTURE PROHIBITION
- § 7:1 Generally
- § 7:2 U.S. obligations under the treaty; 1999 implementing regulations
 - B. ARTICLE 3 OF THE CONVENTION AGAINST TORTURE: PROHIBITION AGAINST RETURN
- § 7:3 Generally
- § 7:4 Contrast with asylum and withholding protections

II. SOURCES OF INTERNATIONAL LAW ON TORTURE

A. OVERVIEW

- § 7:5 Generally
- § 7:6 European law
 - B. EUROPEAN CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND FUNDAMENTAL FREEDOMS
- § 7:7 Background to the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
- § 7:8 Importance and weight of European jurisprudence
- § 7:9 A brief comparison between Article 3 of the European Convention and Article 3 of the Torture Convention
- § 7:10 Individualization of risk

C. U.N. HUMAN RIGHTS COMMITTEE

- § 7:11 Monitoring compliance under the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
 - D. U.N. COMMITTEE AGAINST TORTURE
- § 7:12 Committee functions
 - E. U.N. SPECIAL RAPPORTEUR ON TORTURE
- § 7:13 Appointment of the Special Rapporteur on Torture

F. INTER-AMERICAN CONVENTION TO PREVENT AND PUNISH TORTURE, AND AMERICAN CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS

§ 7:14 Monitoring compliance under the American Convention

III. ARTICLE 3 CONVENTION AGAINST TORTURE PROTECTION: U.S. AND INTERNATIONAL LAW

A. OVERVIEW

- § 7:15 Scope of Article 3: Torture only
- § 7:16 Interpretation and agreed-upon catalog of torturous acts
- § 7:17 Flexible interpretation; standards for judicial review of facts
- § 7:18 Distinction between torture and other forms of inhuman or degrading treatment

B. ELEMENTS OF TORTURE

1. Overview

- § 7:19 Generally
 - 2. Severe Physical or Mental Pain or Suffering
- § 7:20 Severe physical pain or suffering
- § 7:21 Detention and imprisonment
- § 7:22 Rape and other gender-based violence
- § 7:23 Severe mental pain or suffering
- § 7:24 Death penalty

3. Intentional Acts

- § 7:25 Generally
- § 7:26 Specific versus general intent

4. Proscribed Purpose

- § 7:27 Illicit purpose
 - 5. Public Authority: Instigation, Consent, or Acquiescence
- § 7:28 Generally
- § 7:29 Scope of state authority
- § 7:30 Quasi-public officials
- § 7:31 Actions under color of law
- § 7:32 Domestic and gender violence: Issue of state complicity or acquiescence
- § 7:33 U.S. understanding of acquiescence
 - 6. Exclusion of Lawful Sanctions
- § 7:34 Acts "arising only from, inherent in, or incidental to lawful sanctions"

C. STANDARD OF PROOF

- 1. Overview
- § 7:35 Generally

- § 7:36 Past torture as presumptive proof
 - 2. The "Substantial Grounds Test" Under the Torture Convention
- § 7:37 Generally
- § 7:38 U.S. understanding of "substantial grounds": Probability test.
- § 7:39 European Court of Human Rights interpretations of standard of proof
 - 3. Meeting the Standard of Proof
- § 7:40 Individual circumstances and treatment of "similarly situated" persons
- § 7:41 Consistent pattern of gross human rights violations
- § 7:42 Human rights evidence; changed country conditions
- § 7:43 Credibility and benefit of the doubt
 - D. NON-DEROGABILITY: NO EXCLUSION FROM PROTECTION
- § 7:44 Generally
 - E. ALL MEANS OF RETURN
- § 7:45 Generally

APPENDIX

Appendix A. Overview of Procedures for Asylum, Withholding of Removal, and Deferral of Removal

Table of Laws and Rules

Table of Cases

Index