

# Table of Contents

## CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION

- § 1:1 Dangers of eyewitness identification
- § 1:2 Types of identification procedures
- § 1:3 Suggestive identification
- § 1:4 Indicia of “danger”
- § 1:5 Nature of crimes affected

## CHAPTER 2. *UNITED STATES V. WADE* AND ITS PROGENY: RIGHT TO COUNSEL

### I. IN GENERAL

- § 2:1 *United States v. Wade*
- § 2:2 Waiver of counsel

### II. PREINDICTMENT LINEUPS

- § 2:3 *Kirby v. Illinois*
- § 2:4 Lower court interpretations

### III. POST-WADE

- § 2:5 Prompt-on-the-scene showups
- § 2:6 Accidental or “unarranged” showups
- § 2:7 “Arranged” showups

### IV. ROLE OF COUNSEL AT THE LINEUP

- § 2:8 “Arranged” showups—Generally
- § 2:9 Presence of counsel at post-lineup interview
- § 2:10 Substitute counsel

### V. RIGHT TO COUNSEL AT PHOTO IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURES

- § 2:11 *United States v. Ash*
- § 2:12 State court interpretations

## CHAPTER 3. THE DUE PROCESS TEST FOR EYEWITNESS IDENTIFICATION

### I. INTRODUCTION

- § 3:1 Due process generally

§ 3:2 Applicability of the due process test

## II. THE EVOLUTION OF THE DUE PROCESS TEST

§ 3:3 Generally

§ 3:4 *Neil v. Biggers*

§ 3:5 *Manson v. Brathwaite*

§ 3:6 *Perry v. New Hampshire*

## III. DUE PROCESS SHOWUPS

§ 3:7 Generally

§ 3:8 Hospital room showups

§ 3:9 Prompt-on-the-scene or in-field showups

§ 3:10 Accidental showups

§ 3:11 Station house showups

§ 3:12 Showups during judicial proceedings

## IV. DUE PROCESS LINEUPS

§ 3:13 Generally

§ 3:14 Pre-lineup suggestion

§ 3:15 Composition of the lineup

§ 3:16 Prior acquaintance with participants

§ 3:17 Distinctive clothing

§ 3:18 Multiple suspects or witnesses

§ 3:19 Defendant's conduct

§ 3:20 Post-lineup suggestion

# CHAPTER 4. EXCLUSIONARY SANCTIONS IN IDENTIFICATION CASES

## I. VIOLATION OF RIGHT TO COUNSEL

§ 4:1 Exclusion of in-court identification; the independent source rule

§ 4:2 Exclusion of pretrial confrontation evidence; the *Gilbert* per se rule

## II. VIOLATION OF DUE PROCESS

§ 4:3 Generally

§ 4:4 Pre-*Biggers* cases

§ 4:5 *Biggers*—Reliability test applied to pretrial confrontations

§ 4:6 *Brathwaite*—Rejection of per se rule

§ 4:7 Lower court interpretations

## III. HEARSAY AND BOLSTERING ISSUES

§ 4:8 Bolstering by the eyewitness

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 4:9 Third-party bolstering
- § 4:10 The Confrontation Clause
- § 4:11 Photo identification

## **CHAPTER 5. PHOTO AND VOICE IDENTIFICATION**

### **I. PHOTO IDENTIFICATION**

#### **A. USE OF PHOTO IDENTIFICATION**

- § 5:1 Generally
- § 5:2 Investigation stage
- § 5:3 Custody stage
- § 5:4 Defendant stage

#### **B. DUE PROCESS TEST FOR PHOTO IDENTIFICATION**

##### **1. In General**

- § 5:5 Development of due process test

##### **2. Application of Due Process Test to Police-Controlled Photo Identifications**

- § 5:6 Generally
- § 5:7 Composition of the photo spread
- § 5:8 Repetition of suspect's photograph
- § 5:9 Suggestive markings on the photo
- § 5:10 Group viewing or discussion of photos
- § 5:11 Comments or suggestions by law enforcement officers
- § 5:12 Photo showups
- § 5:13 Surveillance photos

##### **3. Application of Due Process Test to Photo Identification Not Controlled by Police**

- § 5:14 Generally
- § 5:15 Photos shown by private citizens
- § 5:16 Newspaper or television photos of suspect

#### **C. OTHER PHOTO IDENTIFICATION ISSUES**

- § 5:17 Retention of the photo display

### **II. VOICE IDENTIFICATION**

- § 5:18 Generally
- § 5:19 Voiceprints or spectrographs
- § 5:20 Self-incrimination

§ 5:21 Due process analysis

## **CHAPTER 6. FACTORS OF INDEPENDENT SOURCE OR RELIABILITY**

- § 6:1 The melding of independent source and reliability
- § 6:2 External factors
- § 6:3 Opportunity to observe
- § 6:4 —Adequate view
- § 6:5 —Limited view
- § 6:6 Prior knowledge of identity
- § 6:7 Accuracy of description
- § 6:8 Witness's degree of attention
- § 6:9 —High level of attention
- § 6:10 —Lack of attention or emotional state
- § 6:11 Witness's prior identification or misidentification
- § 6:12 Witness's level of certainty
- § 6:13 Time elapsed between crime and identification

## **CHAPTER 7. TAINTED IDENTIFICATION**

- § 7:1 Unlawful arrest
- § 7:2 Unconstitutional search or confession
- § 7:3 Unlawful detention

## **CHAPTER 8. COMPULSORY APPEARANCE FOR IDENTIFICATION**

- § 8:1 Self-incrimination
- § 8:2 Suspect in custody
- § 8:3 Equal protection issues
- § 8:4 Persons at large—Judicial orders
- § 8:5 Grand jury powers
- § 8:6 Statutory authorization
- § 8:7 Sanctions for refusal
- § 8:8 Defendant's request for a lineup
- § 8:9 —Prior to trial
- § 8:10 —In court

## **CHAPTER 9. PROCEDURAL ISSUES**

### **I. PRETRIAL SUPPRESSION MOTION**

- § 9:1 Generally
- § 9:2 Pretrial suppression motion
- § 9:3 Right to a hearing on suppression motion
- § 9:4 Prosecution's duty to disclose prior inconsistency or exculpatory evidence

TABLE OF CONTENTS

**II. TRIAL ISSUES**

**A. IN GENERAL**

- § 9:5 Burden of proof
- § 9:6 Use of photographic evidence at trial
- § 9:7 Jury issues

**B. THE IDENTIFICATION WITNESS**

- § 9:8 Generally
- § 9:9 No prior out-of-court identification procedure
- § 9:10 “One witness” rule
- § 9:11 Inability to identify defendant at trial
- § 9:12 Recollection refreshed by hypnosis
- § 9:13 Recorded recollections and prior inconsistent statements
- § 9:14 Eyewitness unavailable at trial

**C. ADMISSIBILITY OF EXPERT TESTIMONY**

- § 9:15 Generally
- § 9:16 Surveillance photos
- § 9:17 Reliability
- § 9:18 Voice identification

**D. JURY INSTRUCTIONS**

- § 9:19 On dangers of eyewitness identification
- § 9:20 On fallibility of interracial identification
- § 9:21 Sample jury instruction on accuracy of eyewitness identifications
- § 9:22 Sample jury instruction from *State v. Cabagbag*
- § 9:23 Provisional jury instruction from Massachusetts Supreme Court

Appendix     Sample Jury Instructions—United States District Court, E.D. of California

**III. POST TRIAL ISSUES**

- § 9:24 Standards for appellate review
- § 9:25 Ineffective assistance of counsel
- § 9:26 Harmless error

**IV. CIVIL LIABILITY FOR MISTAKEN IDENTIFICATION**

- § 9:27 Tort liability
- § 9:28 42 U.S.C.A. § 1983

## **CHAPTER 10. STANDARDS OF FAIRNESS**

### **I. INTRODUCTION**

- § 10:1 Generally
- § 10:2 Law enforcement regulations

### **II. STANDARDS FOR A FAIR LINEUP**

- § 10:3 Pre-lineup
- § 10:4 —Photo identification
- § 10:5 —“Blank” lineups
- § 10:6 Lineup
- § 10:7 Post-lineup

### **III. ADDITIONAL FAIRNESS STANDARDS**

- § 10:8 Standards for photo identification
- § 10:9 State guidelines for eyewitness identification procedures

## **CHAPTER 11. CROSS-EXAMINATION OF THE EYEWITNESS AT TRIAL**

### **I. PREPARING THE CROSS-EXAMINATION**

#### **A. IN GENERAL**

- § 11:1 Generally
- § 11:2 What is your defense?

#### **B. AMMUNITION**

- § 11:3 Generally
- § 11:4 Police reports
- § 11:5 Other prior statements by the witness
- § 11:6 Traditional credibility attacks specifically consistent with your theory of the case
- § 11:7 Traditional credibility attacks not apparently consistent with your theory
- § 11:8 High-card evidence
- § 11:9 The effect of the incident

### **II. CROSS-EXAMINATION CHECKLIST**

- § 11:10 Introduction
- § 11:11 Your theory
- § 11:12 The incident as a handmade cartoon
- § 11:13 Tracking the *Wade*, *Biggers*, and *Brathwaite* factors

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 11:14	Identification is not in a vacuum
§ 11:15	Who is the witness identifying anyway?

**Table of Laws and Rules**

**Table of Cases**

**Index**