

# Table of Contents

## CHAPTER 1. PRELIMINARY CONSIDERATIONS

### I. CONSIDERATIONS PERTINENT TO CASE ACCEPTANCE

|        |  |
|--------|--|
| § 1:1  | Initial client meeting   |
| § 1:2  | —Preliminary phone contact   |
| § 1:3  | — —Speak to potential client personally                            |
| § 1:4  | — —Initial conflict check  |
| § 1:5  | — — —Content of the Rules of Professional Conduct                  |
| § 1:6  | — — —Enforcement by Appellate Divisions                            |
| § 1:7  | — — —Punishment for Rules violations                               |
| § 1:8  | — —Determine client’s objectives                                   |
| § 1:9  | — —Preliminary advice for urgent matters                           |
| § 1:10 | — — —Statute of limitations or other applicable<br>constraints     |
| § 1:11 | — —Schedule appointment  |
| § 1:12 | — — —Setting the meeting date                                      |
| § 1:13 | — — —Client should be encouraged to bring relevant<br>documents    |
| § 1:14 | — — —Confirm by letter   |
| § 1:15 | — — —Advise of consultation fees                                   |
| § 1:16 | —Preparation for initial meeting                                   |
| § 1:17 | — —Preliminary research  |
| § 1:18 | — —“Statement of Client’s Rights”                                  |
| § 1:19 | —Conducting first meeting  |
| § 1:20 | — —Developing rapport with client                                  |
| § 1:21 | — — —Attorney-client privilege                                     |
| § 1:22 | — — — —Necessity of attorney-client relationship                   |
| § 1:23 | — — — —“Confidential information,” defined                         |
| § 1:24 | — — — —Waiver exception  |
| § 1:25 | — —Ascertaining relevant facts                                     |
| § 1:26 | — — —Client narrative  |
| § 1:27 | — — —Questions and answers   |
| § 1:28 | — — —Combination of approaches                                     |
| § 1:29 | — —Structuring client interview                                    |
| § 1:30 | — — —Begin with event(s) which led client to seek<br>legal counsel |
| § 1:31 | — — —Proceed chronologically                                       |
| § 1:32 | — — —Question client   |

LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 1:33 — — — Evaluate case
- § 1:34 Ethical restrictions in accepting representation
- § 1:35 — Competence required
- § 1:36 — — “Competence,” defined
- § 1:37 — — — Duty to act diligently
- § 1:38 — — Options when competence is lacking
- § 1:39 — — — Associating or consulting with other attorneys
- § 1:40 — — Discipline of attorneys for lack of competence
- § 1:41 — — Supervision of other attorneys and employees
- § 1:42 — — Aiding the unauthorized practice of law prohibited
- § 1:43 — — — Exceptions to licensing requirement
- § 1:44 — — — Disclosure of unadmitted status
- § 1:45 — Client’s motives and case merits
- § 1:46 — Client motives and merits of case—Applicable standards
- § 1:47 — — — Improper purpose
- § 1:48 — — — Meritless claims
- § 1:49 — — Sanctions for “frivolous” conduct
- § 1:50 — — — “Frivolous” conduct, defined
- § 1:51 — — — — Certification of documents
- § 1:52 — — — Penalties imposed
- § 1:53 — — — Hearing required
- § 1:54 — — — Discretionary allowances
- § 1:55 — Conflicts of interest
- § 1:56 — — Implications of “of counsel” designation
- § 1:57 — — Adverse party currently a client
- § 1:58 — — Adverse party a former client
- § 1:59 — — — Standard for disqualification
- § 1:60 — — Multiple clients
- § 1:61 — — — Evaluating circumstances
- § 1:62 — — — Limitations on multiple client representation
- § 1:63 — — — Client consent to multiple representation
- § 1:64 — — Conflicts arising from representation of organizations
- § 1:65 — — Lawyer’s conflicting interests
- § 1:66 — — Withdrawal as counsel when lawyer becomes a witness
- § 1:67 — — — Compare: when attorney is litigant
- § 1:68 — — — Compare: when attorney is corporate officer
- § 1:69 Fees and costs
- § 1:70 — Typical fee configurations
- § 1:71 — — Hourly fees
- § 1:72 — — Flat fees
- § 1:73 — — Contingency fees

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|         |   |
|---------|---|
| § 1:74  | — — Retainer fees   |
| § 1:75  | — — — Non-refundable retainers  |
| § 1:76  | — — — Retainer fees may need to be deposited in attorney’s “client trust account” |
| § 1:77  | — — — “Fees on fees” provisions   |
| § 1:78  | — — Combined fee agreements   |
| § 1:79  | — — Alternative fees  |
| § 1:80  | — Limits on fees charged  |
| § 1:81  | — — Ethical limits  |
| § 1:82  | — — — Relevant factors in determining excessive fees                              |
| § 1:83  | — — — “Illegal” fees  |
| § 1:84  | — — Third-party payments  |
| § 1:85  | — — Division of fees among lawyers  |
| § 1:86  | — — — Client consent required after full disclosure                               |
| § 1:87  | — — — — When fee sharing is not allowed   |
| § 1:88  | — — — Division of fees with non-lawyers   |
| § 1:89  | — Costs arrangements  |
| § 1:90  | — — Typical expenses  |
| § 1:91  | — — Attorney’s liability for costs to third parties                               |
| § 1:92  | — Fee agreement   |
| § 1:93  | — — General requirements  |
| § 1:94  | — — Specific provisions   |
| § 1:95  | — — Terminating representation  |
| § 1:96  | — — — Consensual withdrawal   |
| § 1:97  | — — — Non-consensual withdrawal   |
| § 1:98  | — — — Fee recovery upon termination of representation                             |
| § 1:99  | — — Provisions to secure fees   |
| § 1:100 | — — — Retainer fees   |
| § 1:101 | — — — Retaining liens   |
| § 1:102 | — — — Charging liens  |
| § 1:103 | — — — Non-exclusive nature of remedy  |
| § 1:104 | Interest on unpaid fees   |
| § 1:105 | — Client billings and fee payments  |
| § 1:106 | — — Issuance of invoices and/or billing statements                                |
| § 1:107 | — — Suspension of services for unpaid bills                                       |
| § 1:108 | — — Attorney’s billing records may not be subject to disclosure                   |
| § 1:109 | — — Fee agreement may be subject to discovery                                     |
| § 1:110 | — — Recovery of fees premised upon “account stated”                               |
| § 1:111 | Fee-Dispute Resolution  |

## II. UPON ACCEPTANCE OF CASE

|         |  |
|---------|--|
| § 1:112 | Ethical restraints on case disposition |
|---------|--|

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 1:113 — Communications with opposing parties
- § 1:114 — — Communications with adverse party's employees
- § 1:115 — — Advice to opposing parties
- § 1:116 — — Communications between clients distinguished
- § 1:117 — — Improper statements to adversaries
- § 1:118 — — — Counsel should comport with "Standards of Civility"
- § 1:119 — — Standard for the treatment of persons involved in legal proceedings
- § 1:120 — — Statements concerning judges and other adjudicatory officers
- § 1:121 — — Duty to report misconduct
- § 1:122 — — — "Misconduct," defined
- § 1:123 — "Frivolous" litigation practices
- § 1:124 — Improper delay tactics
- § 1:125 Counseling as to alternatives
- § 1:126 — Initial advice
- § 1:127 — — No outcome guarantees
- § 1:128 — — Timetables and deadlines
- § 1:129 — — Confirm requests in writing
- § 1:130 — Division of authority between attorney and client
- § 1:131 — Tactical considerations
- § 1:132 — — Landlord's rent acceptance may prejudice case
- § 1:133 — — — Pre-termination rent acceptance may constitute waiver
- § 1:134 — — — Post-termination rent acceptance may reinstate tenancy
- § 1:135 — — Renewal-lease offers may reinstate tenancy
- § 1:136 — Specific landlord-tenant considerations
- § 1:137 — — If the problem involves initial rent and security
- § 1:138 — — — Record-keeping in connection with rent-regulated tenancies
- § 1:139 — — — Tenant response to excessive rent payment
- § 1:140 — — — Precautionary measures to circumvent security-deposit disputes
- § 1:141 — — If an eviction is sought
- § 1:142 Initial negotiations
- § 1:143 — Negotiating techniques and strategies
- § 1:144 — — Attorney's authority to settle
- § 1:145 — — Duty to communicate all settlement offers to client
- § 1:146 — Ensuring a tenant's compliance with the lease's terms
- § 1:147 — — Investigate the proposed tenant's personal, professional, and financial references

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|         |   |
|---------|---|
| § 1:148 | — —Secure personal guarantees   |
| § 1:149 | Maintaining open lines of communication   |
| § 1:150 | —Client must keep counsel updated   |
| § 1:151 | — —Client’s responsibilities should be outlined and addressed                   |
| § 1:152 | —Attorney’s duty to communicate with client                                     |
| § 1:153 | Attorney liability exposure   |
| § 1:154 | —Legal malpractice  |
| § 1:155 | — —Damage standard  |
| § 1:156 | —Potential liability under federal Fair Debt Collection Practices Act (“FDCPA”) |
| § 1:157 | — —Determining whether attorney is “debt collector” under FDCPA                 |
| § 1:158 | — — —Exception for legal remedies   |
| § 1:159 | — — —Application of FDCPA to landlord-tenant matters                            |
| § 1:160 | — —Protects “consumers” only  |
| § 1:161 | — —“Debts” covered by FDCPA   |
| § 1:162 | — — —Rental arrears fall within FDCPA’s definition of “debt”                    |
| § 1:163 | — — —Dishonored checks  |
| § 1:164 | — — —Business debts excluded from FDCPA’s ambit                                 |
| § 1:165 | — —Amount of potential damages  |
| § 1:166 | Complying with the FDCPA  |
| § 1:167 | —Content of communications  |
| § 1:168 | — —Thirty day dispute-validation period   |
| § 1:169 | — —Defining “initial communication”   |
| § 1:170 | — —Standard for determining whether communication violates FDCPA                |
| § 1:171 | —Timing of communications   |
| § 1:172 | —Place of communications  |
| § 1:173 | —Governing statute of limitations   |
| § 1:174 | —Potential liability under New York Consumer Protection Act                     |
| § 1:175 | —Liability for acts of agents retained by attorney, such as process servers     |

## III. FORMS

|         |  |
|---------|--|
| § 1:176 | Form 1-1: Landlord-tenant client interview checklist |
| § 1:177 | Form 1-2: Sample hourly rate attorney fee agreement  |
| § 1:178 | Form 1-3: Sample consumer collection letter          |

APPENDIX 1-1. Statement of Client’s Rights and Responsibilities

APPENDIX 1-2. Civil Court Directives, Costs and Sanctions,

Civil Court of the City of New York (8/  
21/89 and 3/12/96)

- APPENDIX 1-3. Standards of Civility
- APPENDIX 1-4. Statement of Client's Responsibilities
- APPENDIX 1-5. Civil Court Directive, Entry of Judgment  
Account Stated
- APPENDIX 1-6. Civil Court of the City of New York

## CHAPTER 2. CREATING THE TENANCY

### I. NATURE OF TENANCY

- § 2:1 Defining the relationship
- § 2:2 —“Landlord,” defined
- § 2:3 — —“Lessors” as landlords
- § 2:4 — —“Landlord” not limited to fee-title holder
- § 2:5 — — —“Landlord” as party entitled to rent and  
possession
- § 2:6 — — — —Receiver as landlord
- § 2:7 — — — —Assignee as landlord
- § 2:8 — — — —Net lessee as landlord
- § 2:9 — — — —Mortgagee as landlord
- § 2:10 — — — —Purchaser as landlord
- § 2:11 — — — —Purchaser generally bound by  
predecessor's conduct
- § 2:12 — — — —Licensor as landlord
- § 2:13 — — — —Employer as landlord
- § 2:14 — — — —Sublessor as landlord
- § 2:15 — — — —Proprietary lessor as landlord
- § 2:16 — — —“Landlord” under rent control, defined
- § 2:17 — — —“Landlord” under rent stabilization, defined
- § 2:18 — — — —Provider of utility services excepted from  
definition
- § 2:19 —“Tenant,” defined
- § 2:20 — —“Lessee” is tenant
- § 2:21 — — —“Illusory tenant,” defined
- § 2:22 — — —“Occupant,” defined
- § 2:23 — —“Tenant” includes rooming-house or hotel resident
- § 2:24 — —Rent-controlled tenant, defined
- § 2:25 — —Rent-stabilized tenant, defined
- § 2:26 — —HUD tenant, defined
- § 2:27 — — —“Section 8” tenant
- § 2:28 —Tenant's possession is exclusive
- § 2:29 — —Tenant's right to “quiet enjoyment”

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|        |  |
|--------|--|
| § 2:30 | — — — Compare: warranty of habitability  |
| § 2:31 | — — Exception to “exclusive possession” for inspection and repairs               |
| § 2:32 | — — Reversion to landlord at termination of tenancy                              |
| § 2:33 | — Other essential elements for creating a tenancy                                |
| § 2:34 | — — Term or duration of tenancy  |
| § 2:35 | — — — Periodic tenancy presumed if no term stated                                |
| § 2:36 | — — — Compare: month-to-month tenancy  |
| § 2:37 | — — — New York City limits tenancy of uncertain duration                         |
| § 2:38 | — — — Perpetual leases disfavored  |
| § 2:39 | — — — Regulated tenancies may restrict term                                      |
| § 2:40 | — — — Example: one or two-year rent-stabilized lease                             |
| § 2:41 | — — — Compare: “statutory” tenant under rent control                             |
| § 2:42 | — — — “Statutory” tenancy held to be contractual                                 |
| § 2:43 | — — Amount of rent charged   |
| § 2:44 | — — — Rent gouging illegal   |
| § 2:45 | Dual components: contract and conveyance   |
| § 2:46 | — Landlord-tenant relationship created by contract                               |
| § 2:47 | — — Distinction between “lease” and “leasehold”                                  |
| § 2:48 | — — — Compare: “management contract”   |
| § 2:49 | — — Example of implied contract  |
| § 2:50 | — — Exception to rule of creation of tenancy by contract                         |
| § 2:51 | — Lease conveys interest in property   |
| § 2:52 | — — Delivery of lease is required  |
| § 2:53 | — — Effect of net lease on “ownership”   |
| § 2:54 | — — — Net lessee acts as “owner”   |
| § 2:55 | — Lease defines parties’ rights  |
| § 2:56 | — Residential lease is contract for shelter and services                         |
| § 2:57 | — — Implied warranty of habitability   |
| § 2:58 | — — — No “luxury” standard   |
| § 2:59 | — — — Warranty of habitability inapplicable to commercial premises               |
| § 2:60 | — Tenancies subject to laws of contract and real property                        |
| § 2:61 | — — Compare: landlord’s duty to mitigate under commercial and residential leases |
| § 2:62 | Notice of tenancy to third parties   |
| § 2:63 | — Actual notice  |
| § 2:64 | — Constructive notice: possession  |
| § 2:65 | — Constructive notice: recordation   |
| § 2:66 | — — Lease for more than three years may be recorded                              |

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 2:67 — — Unrecorded lease for term greater than three years may be void as against subsequent purchasers
- § 2:68 — — — Exception: actual notice
- § 2:69 — — Effect of recording
- § 2:70 — — — Example: tenant relegated to action for money damages for owner's breach of recorded lease
- § 2:71 — — Recording memoranda of leases
- § 2:72 — — Recording modification of leases
- § 2:73 — — Compare: registration of rent-regulated rents
- § 2:74 — Effect of mortgages
- § 2:75 — — Lease subject to all prior recorded liens
- § 2:76 — — Recorded lease superior to subsequent mortgage
- § 2:77 — — Lease subject to foreclosure
- § 2:78 — — — Lease with subordination clause can be extinguished in mortgage foreclosure
- § 2:79 — — — Conflict between mortgages
- § 2:80 — Effect of sale of property
- § 2:81 — Effect of *lis pendens* or "notice of pendency"
- § 2:82 — — *Lis pendens* may not be utilized within context of summary proceedings
- § 2:83 — — Filing procedures
- § 2:84 — — Content of notice
- § 2:85 — — Duration
- § 2:86 — — — Cancellation of the notice of pendency
- § 2:87 — Effect of foreclosure generally; rent-regulated units
- § 2:88 Rights and obligations during the tenancy
- § 2:89 — Examples: duty to repair
- § 2:90 — — Residential landlord's duty nondelegable
- § 2:91 — — Repairs or alterations by residential tenant
- § 2:92 — — Commercial landlord generally not obligated for repairs
- § 2:93 — Example: liability for real-estate taxes
- § 2:94 — Covenant of good faith and fair dealing

## II. TYPES OF TENANCIES

- § 2:95 Unique characteristics
- § 2:96 "Life estate" and "life occupancy" distinguished
- § 2:97 — "Life occupant," defined
- § 2:98 — "Life estate," defined
- § 2:99 — Creation of life estate
- § 2:100 — — Oral creation of life estate may be unenforceable
- § 2:101 — — Oral creation of life estate is generally unenforceable—Perpetual leases distinguished
- § 2:102 — Landlord entitled to reversion upon death of life tenant



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 2:103 —Landlord’s rights limited against holder of “life estate”
- § 2:104 — —Example: life tenant can exclude fee owner from showing property to prospective purchasers
- § 2:105 Estate or tenancy for years
- § 2:106 —Term must be certain
- § 2:107 — —One-month tenancy “for years” distinguished from “month-to-month” tenancy
- § 2:108 —Tenancy expires at stated termination date, not upon tenant’s death
- § 2:109 — —Exception: rent-controlled tenancy may convert to periodic tenancy after specified term
- § 2:110 Tenancies-at-will
- § 2:111 —No tenancy-at-will when tenant granted exclusive right to terminate
- § 2:112 Periodic tenancies
- § 2:113 —Month-to-month tenancies
- § 2:114 —“Presumptive” periodic tenancies
- § 2:115 Tenancies-at-sufferance
- § 2:116 —Example: subtenant as tenant-at-sufferance
- § 2:117 —Other legal effect: inapplicability of “automatic stay”

## III. SPECIAL CLASSES OF TENANTS

- § 2:118 Statutory protections, generally
- § 2:119 Rent-controlled tenants
- § 2:120 —Accommodations subject to rent control
- § 2:121 —No written renewal lease required
- § 2:122 —Regulation of rights and obligations
- § 2:123 — —Is a rent-controlled tenancy contractual or statutory?
- § 2:124 Rent-stabilized tenants
- § 2:125 —Accommodations subject to rent stabilization outside New York City
- § 2:126 —Accommodations subject to rent stabilization within New York City
- § 2:127 —Written lease required
- § 2:128 — —Effect of landlord’s failure to renew lease
- § 2:129 —Regulation of rights and obligations
- § 2:130 — —Rent-stabilized tenancies ruled “contractual” despite regulation
- § 2:131 Cooperative or condominium occupants
- § 2:132 —Cooperative shareholder as “tenant”
- § 2:133 —Condominium owner is not a “tenant”

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 2:134 — —Summary nonpayment proceedings are  
unavailable to condominium boards seeking common  
charges
- § 2:135 — —Condominium owner can not claim breach of  
warranty of habitability
- § 2:136 — —Condominium association may hold  
responsibility for repairs
- § 2:137 — —New York City pet law as applied to  
condominiums: conflicting opinion
- § 2:138 —Rights of non-purchasing rent-regulated tenants in  
conversion process
- § 2:139 — —Eviction plan
- § 2:140 — —Non-eviction plan
- § 2:141 — — —Units held by non-purchasing tenants under  
non-eviction plan subject to succession rules
- § 2:142 — —Sponsor-held units: post-conversion tenancy  
entitlements
- § 2:143 —Reversion of all units to rent regulation upon a  
cooperative's foreclosure
- § 2:144 Subtenants and assignees
- § 2:145 —Subtenant is not overlandlord's tenant
- § 2:146 — —Landlord may not "unreasonably" withhold  
consent to residential sublet
- § 2:147 — — —"Reasonableness" examined
- § 2:148 — —Acceptance of subtenant's rent by landlord may  
create tenancy
- § 2:149 — — —Compare: entitlement to "use and occupancy"
- § 2:150 —Assignee becomes landlord's tenant
- § 2:151 — —Landlord's posture on assignments
- § 2:152 —Assignment pro tanto
- § 2:153 Manufactured-home park tenancies
- § 2:154 —Landlord must offer lease and give notice of rent  
increases
- § 2:155 —Other rights and obligations
- § 2:156 — —Security deposits
- § 2:157 — —Access
- § 2:158 — —Warranty of habitability
- § 2:159 —Landlord must register services and park rules  
with DHCR
- § 2:160 Hotel tenancies
- § 2:161 —Regulation of hotel rents
- § 2:162 — —Required hotel services
- § 2:163 Residential loft tenancies
- § 2:164 Rooming houses
- § 2:165 Senior citizens

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 2:166 —Statutory protections and benefits
- § 2:167 — —SCRIE
- § 2:168 — —Rent-control eviction restrictions
- § 2:169 — —Rent-stabilization restriction on eviction of tenants in nursing homes
- § 2:170 — —Cooperative/condominium conversions
- § 2:171 — —Termination of lease to relocate to family member's residence, adult-care facility, or senior or subsidized housing
- § 2:172 Military personnel

## IV. FORMS

- § 2:173 Form 2-1: Memorandum of lease
- § 2:174 Form 2-2: Notice to senior citizens: residential lease termination

APPENDIX 2-1. NYC Finance: SCRIE Income Increase Fact Sheet

## CHAPTER 3. OTHER OCCUPANCY RELATIONSHIPS

### I. RELATIONSHIPS SIMILAR TO TENANCIES

- § 3:1 Occupancies similar to tenancies
- § 3:2 Occupancy relationships terminable through summary proceedings or “self-help”
- § 3:3 —Summary proceedings when no landlord-tenant relationship exists
- § 3:4 — —Eviction of occupant who has wrongfully ousted party entitled to lawful possession
- § 3:5 —“Self-help”
- § 3:6 —“Self-help”—Example: occupant in apartment for only two weeks
- § 3:7 — —Justification for self-help eviction
- § 3:8 — —Self-help eviction must be effected “peaceably”
- § 3:9 — —Distinction: self-help prohibited when tenant engages in unlawful activity
- § 3:10 — — —Compare “illegal use” statute
- § 3:11 Illegal-eviction law protects some occupants
- § 3:12 —Compare prior law
- § 3:13 —“Unlawful” removal, defined
- § 3:14 —Ousted occupant must have had peaceable possession
- § 3:15 — —“Peaceable possession,” defined

- § 3:16 — — —Example: illegal-eviction law protects  
licensee-subtenant
- § 3:17 — — —Example: illegal-eviction protection for school  
operator whose license expired
- § 3:18 — — —Example: no illegal-eviction protection for  
proposed subtenant
- § 3:19 —New York City’s “Unlawful Evictions Law”

## II. AGREEMENT BETWEEN LICENSOR AND LICENSEE

- § 3:20 “License,” defined
- § 3:21 License distinguished from lease
- § 3:22 —License conveys non-exclusive privilege to occupy  
premises
- § 3:23 —License generally cancelable at will
- § 3:24 — —Exception: “irrevocable” license
- § 3:25 —Rule of construction: license or lease?
- § 3:26 —“Illusory” tenancy
- § 3:27 —“License” may limit perfection of security interests  
for commercial landlord
- § 3:28 Termination of license
- § 3:29 —Summary proceeding
- § 3:30 —Self-help eviction
- § 3:31 — —Example: newsstand-operator ousted
- § 3:32 Types of licensees
- § 3:33 —Family members
- § 3:34 — —Spouses
- § 3:35 — —Stepchildren
- § 3:36 — —Domestic partners; non-traditional “family”  
members
- § 3:37 —Roommates
- § 3:38 — —Roommate distinguished from tenant
- § 3:39 — — —Roommate distinguished from subtenant
- § 3:40 — — —Roommate distinguished from guest
- § 3:41 — —Legal restriction on roommates
- § 3:42 — — —Notice requirements
- § 3:43 — — —Tenant must maintain primary residence
- § 3:44 — — —Overcrowding prohibitions
- § 3:45 — —Legal restriction of roommates—Overcrowding  
prohibitions—Same-sex partners
- § 3:46 — —Effect of termination of tenancy on roommate
- § 3:47 — — —Possibility of tenancy by consent
- § 3:48 — —Landlord’s collection of a rent increase for  
roommates

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 3:49 — — — Permissible under rent control
- § 3:50 — — — Not permissible under rent stabilization
- § 3:51 — — — — Exception: roommate added as co-tenant on renewal lease
- § 3:52 — — Amount of rent tenant can charge roommate or subtenant

### **III. AGREEMENT BETWEEN PROPRIETOR AND GUEST OR LODGER**

- § 3:53 Generally
- § 3:54 Lodger distinguished from tenant
- § 3:55 — Lodger relationship is personal contract
- § 3:56 — — Extended occupancy may confer tenancy status
- § 3:57 — Proprietor may evict lodger by self-help
- § 3:58 — Lodger may be evicted by summary proceeding
- § 3:59 — Rule of construction: lodger or tenant?
- § 3:60 — — Example: transient hotel guest deemed lodger
- § 3:61 — — Example: motel occupants placed by social services not “transient”
- § 3:62 Transient hotel-occupants, defined
- § 3:63 — Definition of “transient” hotel-New York City
- § 3:64 — — Mixed-use hotels
- § 3:65 — Rent-regulation of hotel rents

### **IV. AGREEMENT BETWEEN EMPLOYER AND EMPLOYEE**

- § 3:66 Generally
- § 3:67 No landlord-tenant relationship when occupancy made contingent on employment relationship
- § 3:68 — Prior tenancy not destroyed by subsequent employment
- § 3:69 — — Exception: tenancy exchanged for employment-occupancy
- § 3:70 — Occupancy independent of employment duties deemed tenancy
- § 3:71 — Subsequent tenancy can be created
- § 3:72 — Effect of successive employment relationships
- § 3:73 — Occupancy granted as compensation
- § 3:74 — — Effect of additional compensation
- § 3:75 Effect of termination of employment agreement
- § 3:76 — When landlord is not the direct employer: conflicting opinions
- § 3:77 — Landlord may be required to demonstrate “good cause” to evict

- § 3:78 —Independent right to possession
- § 3:79 Effect of rent-regulation laws
- § 3:80 —Superintendent not tenant under rent control
- § 3:81 —Succession rights when employee was tenant

## **V. SQUATTERS AND INTRUDERS**

- § 3:82 Generally
- § 3:83 “Squatter,” defined
- § 3:84 —“Intruder” distinguished
- § 3:85 —Notice requirement to commence proceedings
- § 3:86 No landlord-tenant relationship exists
- § 3:87 —Example: squatters enter premises without consent
- § 3:88 — —Compare: original or subsequent permission to occupy premises
- § 3:89 — —Effect of subsequent withdrawal of consent
- § 3:90 —Squatters hold no property rights
- § 3:91 Eviction of squatters
- § 3:92 —Summary proceedings
- § 3:93 — —Compare: sublessee/roommate not squatters
- § 3:94 —Self-help can be used against squatter
- § 3:95 Squatter or licensee?
- § 3:96 —Summary proceeding on alternate grounds: conflicting opinion
- § 3:97 — —Squatter/licensee combined proceeding improper: minority view
- § 3:98 — —Squatter/licensee combined proceeding proper: majority view

## **VI. ADULT-HOME RESIDENTS**

- § 3:99 Generally
- § 3:100 No landlord-tenant relationship under statute
- § 3:101 —Compare: tenancy-at-will

## **CHAPTER 4. RENTAL AGREEMENTS**

### **I. INTRODUCTORY CONSIDERATION; RELATIVE-BARGAINING POSITIONS**

- § 4:1 Generally

### **II. FORM OF AGREEMENT**

- § 4:2 Express or implied agreement
- § 4:3 “Lease,” defined

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 4:4 Oral or written agreement (Statute of Frauds)
- § 4:5 —Sufficiency of writing
- § 4:6 — —Type size
- § 4:7 —Calculating statute’s one-year period
- § 4:8 —Indefinite term leases
- § 4:9 Liability absent a lease
- § 4:10 “Agreements to lease” distinguished
- § 4:11 Delivery requirement
- § 4:12 Lease or license
- § 4:13 Pros and cons of written (fixed-term) lease
- § 4:14 —Reduces enforcement problems
- § 4:15 —Fixed lease-term
- § 4:16 — —Landlord’s perspective
- § 4:17 — —Tenant’s perspective

### **III. FUNDAMENTAL LEASE TERMS AND CONSIDERATIONS**

- § 4:18 Essential terms
- § 4:19 —Exclusive possession and control
- § 4:20 —Identity
- § 4:21 —Description
- § 4:22 —Amount of rent
- § 4:23 —Specified term
- § 4:24 — —Exception: New York City
- § 4:25 — —Exception: manufactured homes
- § 4:26 Form leases
- § 4:27 Special rules for certain types of housing
- § 4:28 Fraud or mistake
- § 4:29 Unilateral mistake
- § 4:30 Landlord disclosures

### **IV. STANDARD PROVISIONS IN WRITTEN RENTAL AGREEMENTS**

- § 4:31 Parties to contract
- § 4:32 —Natural persons
- § 4:33 —Entities
- § 4:34 — —Corporations
- § 4:35 — —Not-for-profit corporations
- § 4:36 — —Religious corporations
- § 4:37 — —Partnerships
- § 4:38 — —Municipalities
- § 4:39 — —Agents
- § 4:40 — —Real-estate brokers; license required

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 4:41 — —Liability for breach of lease
- § 4:42 — —Real-estate brokers; license required—Exception:  
tenant associations and not-for-profit corporations
- § 4:43 — — —Statute of Frauds
- § 4:44 Ascertainable identities
- § 4:45 —Agents
- § 4:46 —Guarantors
- § 4:47 Description of premises, demised
- § 4:48 —Definite and certain description required
- § 4:49 —Ambiguous description
- § 4:50 Adjoining space
- § 4:51 Special commercial-lease considerations
- § 4:52 —Prelease of space under construction; final  
description not available
- § 4:53 —Plot map of premises under construction
- § 4:54 Rental term
- § 4:55 —Exception: when agreement is of “indefinite”  
duration in New York City
- § 4:56 —Commencement and expiration dates
- § 4:57 — —Problems with commencement date: tenancies  
beginning upon completion of construction or  
improvements
- § 4:58 — — —Potential for litigation when commencement  
date is unclear
- § 4:59 — —Problems with ending date: options and pre-  
emptive renewal rights
- § 4:60 — — —Automatic renewal
- § 4:61 — —Rule Against Perpetuities
- § 4:62 — — —Non-vested rights
- § 4:63 — — —Options to purchase
- § 4:64 — — — —Compare: rights of first refusal
- § 4:65 —Statutory limits on duration of certain leases
- § 4:66 — —County property
- § 4:67 — —School-district property
- § 4:68 — —Religious corporations
- § 4:69 Rent
- § 4:70 —How, when, where, and to whom rent is paid
- § 4:71 — —Receipts
- § 4:72 —Due date
- § 4:73 —Percentage rents
- § 4:74 — —Exclusive right to conduct business
- § 4:75 —Forms of consideration
- § 4:76 Late charges
- § 4:77 —Excessive late charges are unenforceable
- § 4:78 —Late charges in rent-regulated jurisdictions



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|         |  |
|---------|--|
| § 4:79  | —Late charges in manufactured-home parks                   |
| § 4:80  | Security deposit   |
| § 4:81  | —Deposit pending landlord's approval of lease              |
| § 4:82  | Other charges  |
| § 4:83  | —Utilities   |
| § 4:84  | — —Identify party liable                                   |
| § 4:85  | — —Manufactured-home parks                                 |
| § 4:86  | — —Shared meters   |
| § 4:87  | — — —Elimination of shared meter                           |
| § 4:88  | — — — —Exception: "legal impediment or extraordinary cost" |
| § 4:89  | — — — —Exception: leases in effect on October 24, 1991     |
| § 4:90  | — — —Utility obligations                                   |
| § 4:91  | — — —Future charges  |
| § 4:92  | —Parking   |
| § 4:93  | — —Delineate parking privileges                            |
| § 4:94  | — —Payment terms   |
| § 4:95  | — — —Rent regulation                                       |
| § 4:96  | —Additional occupants                                      |
| § 4:97  | — —Limitations   |
| § 4:98  | — —Children  |
| § 4:99  | —Special commercial-lease considerations                   |
| § 4:100 | — —Operational and common-area maintenance expenses        |
| § 4:101 | — — —Base year escalation approach                         |
| § 4:102 | — — —Proportionate charges                                 |
| § 4:103 | — — —Tenant's audit rights                                 |
| § 4:104 | — —Cost of living increases                                |
| § 4:105 | — —Taxes   |
| § 4:106 | —ADA compliance burdens and charges                        |
| § 4:107 | — —Mandatory renovation                                    |
| § 4:108 | — — —Scope of alterations                                  |
| § 4:109 | — —No new barriers to handicapped access                   |
| § 4:110 | — —Enforcement   |
| § 4:111 | — —Other lease-related considerations                      |
| § 4:112 | Authorized occupants                                       |
| § 4:113 | —Rent regulation   |
| § 4:114 | —Sublessees/assignees                                      |
| § 4:115 | — —Residential subleases and assignments                   |
| § 4:116 | — — —Assignments   |
| § 4:117 | — — —Sublets   |
| § 4:118 | — — — —Exceptions: public housing and co-ops               |
| § 4:119 | — — — —Retroactivity                                       |
| § 4:120 | — — — —Notice to landlord required                         |

# LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 4:121 — — — —Timing of landlord’s consent
- § 4:122 — — — —Landlord or tenant’s failure to comply with  
N.Y. Real Prop. Law § 226-b
- § 4:123 — —Commercial leases
- § 4:124 — — — —No implied restrictions, generally
- § 4:125 — — — —Exception: implied limitation on  
assignment
- § 4:126 — — — —May be subject to express conditions
- § 4:127 — — — —Enforcement limited by waiver/estoppel
- § 4:128 — — — —Acceptance of rent may waive breach
- § 4:129 — — — —Distinguish: acceptance of rent under  
protest may not waive breach
- § 4:130 — — — —Distinguish: restriction requiring consent  
in the future is not extinguished by consenting to  
one sublease
- § 4:131 — — — —Compare: consent to assignment can  
eliminate non-assignment provision
- § 4:132 — — — —Lease provisions creating exception to waiver
- § 4:133 — —Reasonableness of withholding consent
- § 4:134 — — — —Landlord’s burden of proof
- § 4:135 — —“Reasonableness” examined
- § 4:136 — — — —Proposed transferee’s financial stability or  
lack thereof
- § 4:137 — — — —Nature of proposed occupancy
- § 4:138 — — — —Existence of waiting list
- § 4:139 — — — —Tenant’s failure to request consent under N.Y.  
Real Prop. Law § 226-b
- § 4:140 — — — —Misrepresentations in information provided
- § 4:141 — — — —Extending prohibitions to “licenses”
- § 4:142 — —Compare: manufactured homes
- § 4:143 — —Assignment and sublease distinguished
- § 4:144 — —Effect of valid transfer of tenant’s interest
- § 4:145 — — — —Assignment
- § 4:146 — — — —Contractual release of original tenant
- § 4:147 — — — —Privity of estate between landlord and  
assignee
- § 4:148 — — — —Absent a release, privity of contract  
between landlord and assignor/former tenant  
continues
- § 4:149 — — — —Privity of contract if assignee assumes  
liability
- § 4:150 — — — —Subleases
- § 4:151 — — — —Subtenant’s rights
- § 4:152 — — — —Tenant/sublessor remains bound by master  
lease

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|         |   |
|---------|---|
| § 4:153 | — — — — Subtenant also bound by master lease's terms                      |
| § 4:154 | — — Statute of Frauds   |
| § 4:155 | — Occupancy restrictions may constitute unlawful discrimination           |
| § 4:156 | — — Racial restrictions are prohibited                                    |
| § 4:157 | — — — Religious-use exception   |
| § 4:158 | — — Children  |
| § 4:159 | — — — Exception: permitting discrimination against children               |
| § 4:160 | — — Immediate family members and roommates                                |
| § 4:161 | Condition of premises   |
| § 4:162 | — Warranty of habitability  |
| § 4:163 | — Covenant of quiet enjoyment   |
| § 4:164 | — Inspections   |
| § 4:165 | — — Defects and deterioration   |
| § 4:166 | — — ADA surveys   |
| § 4:167 | — — Building/safety violations  |
| § 4:168 | Maintenance and repair obligations in residential context                 |
| § 4:169 | Maintenance and repair obligations in commercial context                  |
| § 4:170 | Use of premises   |
| § 4:171 | — Residential-use clauses   |
| § 4:172 | — Commercial-use clauses  |
| § 4:173 | — — Landlord's perspective: exclusive use protections                     |
| § 4:174 | — — Tenant's perspective: exclusive use protections                       |
| § 4:175 | — Illegal use renders lease void  |
| § 4:176 | — — Landlord liability  |
| § 4:177 | — — Waiver  |
| § 4:178 | Compliance with all laws  |
| § 4:179 | — Scope of tenant's assumed obligation                                    |
| § 4:180 | — — Parties' intent   |
| § 4:181 | Termination for tenant's breach of covenant                               |
| § 4:182 | — Default must be substantial   |
| § 4:183 | — — Breach of warranty of habitability is a defense to nonpayment of rent |
| § 4:184 | — Termination for chronic violations in commercial context                |
| § 4:185 | Rules and regulations   |
| § 4:186 | — Examples of lease rules   |
| § 4:187 | — Amendments and notice   |
| § 4:188 | — — Impact of rent regulation   |
| § 4:189 | — Manufactured-home leases  |
| § 4:190 | — — Reasonableness limitation   |

LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 4:191 Pets
- § 4:192 —Pet restrictions
- § 4:193 —Protections for elderly tenants in federal housing
- § 4:194 —Waiver of pet restrictions
- § 4:195 — —Example: New York City
- § 4:196 — — —Exception: New York City Housing Authority
- § 4:197 —Emotional-support animals
- § 4:198 Access
- § 4:199 Failure or refusal to permit access may constitute  
substantial breach of lease
- § 4:200 —Manufactured-home park tenancies
- § 4:201 Insurance
- § 4:202 —Mutual indemnification and insurance provisions
- § 4:203 —Insurance for liability to third parties
- § 4:204 —Terrorism coverage in commercial context
- § 4:205 —Landlord not obligated to compel insurance  
coverage
- § 4:206 —No exculpation for landlord's negligence
- § 4:207 Damage or destruction
- § 4:208 —Lease provisions concerning damage or destruction
- § 4:209 Property taxes
- § 4:210 —Treatment as “additional rent”
- § 4:211 — —Courts will not permit “windfall” to landlords
- § 4:212 —Effect of tenant improvements
- § 4:213 —Compare: landlord improvements
- § 4:214 —Tax liability when either party is a tax-exempt  
entity
- § 4:215 — —Private lease of municipal property
- § 4:216 — —Nonprofit organizations
- § 4:217 — —Tax exemptions: New York City
- § 4:218 —Tax-certiorari proceedings
- § 4:219 —Compare: manufactured home park tenants
- § 4:220 Notice provisions
- § 4:221 —Notice to terminate monthly tenancies
- § 4:222 —Notice to rent-regulated tenants
- § 4:223 —Notice to manufactured-home park tenants
- § 4:224 —When notice is deemed given
- § 4:225 Guaranty clauses, generally
- § 4:226 —Landlord-guaranty provisions
- § 4:227 —Recourse against guarantors
- § 4:228 — —Uninformed guarantor may be liable
- § 4:229 — —Jurisdiction over “foreign” guarantors
- § 4:230 — —Personal liability of guarantor
- § 4:231 — —Joinder of guarantor as a party to summary  
proceeding

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|         |  |
|---------|--|
| § 4:232 | —Guarantor’s rights  |
| § 4:233 | —Limitation on guarantor liability: subsequent change in nature of guarantee |
| § 4:234 | — —Renewal leases  |
| § 4:235 | — —Compare: guarantor is not released by assignment                          |
| § 4:236 | — —Extension of time for payment discharges guarantor                        |
| § 4:237 | —Limitation on guarantor liability; “good guy” clause                        |
| § 4:238 | Bankruptcy provisions  |
| § 4:239 | Waiver of counterclaims  |
| § 4:240 | —Exception for “inextricably related” claims                                 |
| § 4:241 | Waiver of jury trial   |
| § 4:242 | Attorney’s fees  |
| § 4:243 | —“Prevailing party” fee awards under RPL § 234                               |
| § 4:244 | — —Retroactive application to residential leases                             |
| § 4:245 | — —Entitlement to fees cannot be waived                                      |
| § 4:246 | — —“Change in law” is defense  |
| § 4:247 | — —Contingent fees   |
| § 4:248 | — —Landlord’s recovery   |
| § 4:249 | — —Identifying the “prevailing party”  |
| § 4:250 | —Any dispute arising out of lease obligations                                |
| § 4:251 | — —Valid lease required  |
| § 4:252 | — —Reciprocal nature of recovery   |
| § 4:253 | — —Attorneys’ fee claim should be asserted within same action or proceeding  |
| § 4:254 | —Fee recovery by successful <i>pro se</i> or legal services litigants        |
| § 4:255 | —“Reasonable” amount   |
| § 4:256 | — —Fees on fees  |
| § 4:257 | —Statutory fee awards  |
| § 4:258 | — —Discrimination against children   |
| § 4:259 | — —Fees in federal civil-rights litigation                                   |
| § 4:260 | — —Damages for “retaliatory” action  |
| § 4:261 | —Rent-regulated tenants may recover costs                                    |
| § 4:262 | Interest on money judgments  |
| § 4:263 | Waiver of breach   |
| § 4:264 | Closing formalities  |
| § 4:265 | —Validity and severability   |
| § 4:266 | —Entire agreement; modification prohibited                                   |
| § 4:267 | — —Fraud excepted  |
| § 4:268 | Arbitration provisions   |
| § 4:269 | —Limitations on arbitrable disputes  |
| § 4:270 | Signatures   |

- § 4:271 Presumption that agreement is understood and accepted once signed
- § 4:272 Signatures—New York State as tenant
- § 4:273 Disability rent increase exemption: New York City
- § 4:274 —Eligible apartment
- § 4:275 —Applicant named on the lease or rent order
- § 4:276 —State or federal disability related financial assistance
- § 4:277 —Income eligibility requirements
- § 4:278 —Amount of household's aggregate disposable income

## V. LIMITATIONS ON VALIDITY OF TERMS

- § 4:279 Generally
- § 4:280 Nonwaivable, nonmodifiable rights
- § 4:281 —Attorney's fees
- § 4:282 —Automatic tenancy renewal protection
- § 4:283 —Exculpatory clauses
- § 4:284 —Jury trial in personal injury or property-damage action
- § 4:285 —Occupancy
- § 4:286 —Retaliatory-eviction defense
- § 4:287 —Satellite dishes
- § 4:288 —Security-deposit refund
- § 4:289 —Shared meters
- § 4:290 —Sublets/assignments
- § 4:291 —Tenants' associations
- § 4:292 —Warranty of habitability
- § 4:293 Distinguish: commercial tenancies
- § 4:294 Nonwaivable rights in connection with other types of residential tenancies

## VI. OPTIONS

- § 4:295 Renewal provisions
- § 4:296 —Automatic renewal of tenancy
- § 4:297 —Renewal provisions must be definite and certain
- § 4:298 — —Rental amount
- § 4:299 — — —Rental amount tied to specified formula or guideline
- § 4:300 — — — —“Fair market value”
- § 4:301 — — —Rental amount deferrable to arbitration
- § 4:302 — — —Other details of renewed tenancy
- § 4:303 — — —Time and manner for exercise of option
- § 4:304 —Who may exercise?
- § 4:305 —Exercising options to renew

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 4:306 — —Covenants as conditions precedent
- § 4:307 — —Formalities: strict compliance ordinarily required
- § 4:308 — —“Sweetheart” leases, federal law
- § 4:309 — —“Sweetheart” leases, state law
- § 4:310 — —Formalities: strict compliance ordinarily required—Conditional exercise of renewal is ineffective
- § 4:311 — — —Compare: inconsequential discrepancies
- § 4:312 — — —Timeliness of notice of exercise
- § 4:313 — — —Equitable considerations
- § 4:314 — — —Acceptance of rent after option period
- § 4:315 —Compare: “right of first refusal” to renew
- § 4:316 Options to purchase
- § 4:317 —Certainty of terms essential
- § 4:318 —Legal effect of purchase option
- § 4:319 —Exercising option to purchase; strict adherence
- § 4:320 — —Exception: equity may intervene to avoid forfeiture
- § 4:321 — —Compliance with lease requirements
- § 4:322 — — —Waiver of breach preserves option
- § 4:323 —Specific performance if landlord refuses to perform
- § 4:324 Compare: “right of first refusal to purchase”
- § 4:325 —Distinguished from option to purchase
- § 4:326 —Result if landlord refuses to perform
- § 4:327 —Landlord cannot defeat tenant’s right to purchase

## VII. RECORDATION

- § 4:328 Generally
- § 4:329 Memoranda of leases
- § 4:330 Modifications
- § 4:331 Effect of recordation: constructive notice of leasehold interest
- § 4:332 —Tenant in possession as constructive notice

## VIII. ENFORCING AGREEMENTS

- § 4:333 Problems of contract interpretation
- § 4:334 —“Four-corners” rule
- § 4:335 —Ordinary and plain meaning
- § 4:336 —Reasonable meaning
- § 4:337 —Interpretation so as to give all parts of contract effect
- § 4:338 —Extrinsic evidence (parol evidence rule)
- § 4:339 Waiver and estoppel limitations

- § 4:340 —“Waiver” and “estoppel” distinguished
- § 4:341 — —Elements of an estoppel
- § 4:342 —Waiver of eviction grounds by accepting rent with knowledge of tenant’s breach
- § 4:343 — —Rent acceptance from unauthorized assignee
- § 4:344 — —Rent acceptance when tenant notified of default
- § 4:345 —Compare: written agreement specifying no waiver
- § 4:346 —Compare: when waiver would violate public policy
- § 4:347 —Compare: whether landlord’s conduct can “create” regulated tenancy
- § 4:348 —Compare: when renewal lease issues in accordance with requirements of regulatory scheme during course of on-going litigation
- § 4:349 —Compare: when renewal lease issues before or after “Golub” notice

## **IX. FORMS**

- § 4:350 Form 4-1: Standard form of apartment lease subject to rent stabilization
- § 4:351 Form 4-2: Disclosure of information on lead-based paint hazards
- § 4:352 Form 4-3: Window guard rider
- § 4:353 Form 4-4: Standard form of store lease
- § 4:354 Form 4-5: Standard form of office lease
- § 4:355 Form 4-6: Standard form of loft lease
- § 4:356 Form 4-7: Rent stabilization lease rider
- § 4:357 Form 4-8: Escalation clause riders
- § 4:358 Form 4-9: “Good Guy” Guaranty
- § 4:359 Form 4-10: Notice disclosing tenants’ rights to reasonable accommodations for persons with disabilities
- § 4:360 Form 4-11 Good cause eviction law notice

## **CHAPTER 5. HOUSING DISCRIMINATION**

### **I. OVERVIEW**

- § 5:1 Housing discrimination prohibited by federal and New York law
- § 5:2 Illegal “discriminatory practices,” defined
- § 5:3 Application of discrimination laws to commercial tenancies

### **II. STATUTORY PROTECTIONS AGAINST HOUSING DISCRIMINATION**

- § 5:4 No specific protection against housing discrimination under common law



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|        |   |
|--------|---|
| § 5:5  | Constitutional protections  |
| § 5:6  | —United States Constitution   |
| § 5:7  | — —No constitutional guarantee of shelter/housing   |
| § 5:8  | — —Equal protection guaranteed  |
| § 5:9  | — — —Discriminatory impact and intent required to prove equal protection violation                |
| § 5:10 | — — — —Compare: Fair Housing Act  |
| § 5:11 | — — —Government action versus private action  |
| § 5:12 | — — — —Grounds for upholding state action   |
| § 5:13 | — —Promotion of “general welfare” can include protection from discrimination                      |
| § 5:14 | — —Government “taking” of private property  |
| § 5:15 | — — —No “taking” when landlord’s reversionary interest and economic return not adversely impacted |
| § 5:16 | — —Other constitutional provisions may relate to housing discrimination                           |
| § 5:17 | —New York State Constitution  |
| § 5:18 | — —Equal protection   |
| § 5:19 | — —Promotion of general welfare   |
| § 5:20 | — — —No obligation to zone or build low-income housing to promote general welfare                 |
| § 5:21 | — —Government “taking” of private property  |
| § 5:22 | Federal statutes  |
| § 5:23 | —Fair Housing Act (Title VIII of the Civil Rights Act of 1968)                                    |
| § 5:24 | — —FHA administered by HUD  |
| § 5:25 | — —Discrimination against specific “protected classes” prohibited                                 |
| § 5:26 | — — —Economic groups are not protected classes  |
| § 5:27 | — — —Housing construction not compelled   |
| § 5:28 | — — —“Discriminatory housing practices” prohibited  |
| § 5:29 | — — —Refusing to rent or sell to members of protected classes                                     |
| § 5:30 | — — —Misrepresenting the availability of housing  |
| § 5:31 | — — —Discriminatory advertising   |
| § 5:32 | — — —Failing to provide tenant with services or rights provided to others                         |
| § 5:33 | — — —Failing to make housing accessible to disabled persons                                       |
| § 5:34 | — — —Discriminatory financing policies  |
| § 5:35 | — — —Racial steering  |
| § 5:36 | — — —Exclusionary zoning  |
| § 5:37 | — —The <i>prima facie</i> case  |
| § 5:38 | — —FHA does not require a showing of discriminatory intent  |

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 5:39 — — — Establishing discriminatory intent
- § 5:40 — — — — Consent is no defense
- § 5:41 — — — Discriminatory effect
- § 5:42 — — — — “Good faith” is no defense
- § 5:43 — — — — Legitimate justification may provide  
defense
- § 5:44 — — Vicarious liability in FHA cases
- § 5:45 — — FHA exemptions
- § 5:46 — — — Religious organizations
- § 5:47 — — — Private clubs
- § 5:48 — — — Occupancy limits
- § 5:49 — — — Housing for older persons can discriminate  
against children
- § 5:50 — — — Persons with drug convictions
- § 5:51 — — — Small buildings/owners
- § 5:52 — Civil Rights Act of 1866
- § 5:53 — — No protection based on religion
- § 5:54 — — Contract rights
- § 5:55 — — Property rights
- § 5:56 — — Discriminatory zoning measures prohibited
- § 5:57 — Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964
- § 5:58 — Rehabilitation Act of 1973
- § 5:59 — — Compare: Americans with Disabilities Act
- § 5:60 — Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990
- § 5:61 — — ADA prohibits discrimination in “public  
accommodations”
- § 5:62 — — — Residential apartments are not “public  
accommodations”
- § 5:63 — — — Dormitories are public accommodations
- § 5:64 — — — Homeless shelters and halfway houses may  
qualify as public accommodations
- § 5:65 — — — Inns, hotels, and motels are public  
accommodations
- § 5:66 — — — Some rooming houses are exempt from “public  
accommodation” categorization
- § 5:67 — Violence Against Women Act
- § 5:68 — — Protections for victims
- § 5:69 — — Verification of a victim’s status
- § 5:70 New York State statutes
- § 5:71 — New York State Human Rights Law
- § 5:72 — — Discrimination against certain protected classes  
prohibited
- § 5:73 — — — Compare: federal law
- § 5:74 — — — Compare: New York City law
- § 5:75 — — “Unlawful discriminatory practices,” defined

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|         |   |
|---------|---|
| § 5:76  | — — —Refusing to rent or sell to members of protected classes   |
| § 5:77  | — — —Misrepresenting availability of housing  |
| § 5:78  | — — —Discriminatory advertising   |
| § 5:79  | — — —Discriminatory record-keeping  |
| § 5:80  | — — —Failing to provide tenant with services or rights provided to others                             |
| § 5:81  | — — —Failing to make housing accessible to disabled persons   |
| § 5:82  | — — —Exclusionary zoning  |
| § 5:83  | — — —Blockbusting   |
| § 5:84  | — — —Retaliation  |
| § 5:85  | — — —Discrimination in financing  |
| § 5:86  | — — —Exception: some age discrimination permitted   |
| § 5:87  | — — Exemptions from ban on housing discrimination   |
| § 5:88  | — — —Limits on ban against age discrimination   |
| § 5:89  | — — —Exemption for religious organizations  |
| § 5:90  | — — —Discounts to disabled persons permitted  |
| § 5:91  | — — Discrimination in sale or rental of commercial space also prohibited                              |
| § 5:92  | — —Nursing-home discrimination against the blind prohibited   |
| § 5:93  | — — State Division of Human Rights administers law  |
| § 5:94  | — — —Concurrent jurisdiction  |
| § 5:95  | —New York State Civil Rights Law  |
| § 5:96  | — —Discriminatory opposition to transfer of cooperative ownership prohibited                          |
| § 5:97  | — —Disabled persons may keep assistance dogs  |
| § 5:98  | — —Discrimination in public housing prohibited  |
| § 5:99  | —Property-related prohibitions: Gen. Oblig. Law § 5-331   |
| § 5:100 | —Discrimination against children prohibited: Real Prop. Law § 237-a                                   |
| § 5:101 | — —Penalties and remedies   |
| § 5:102 | — —Prevailing party entitled to attorneys' fees   |
| § 5:103 | — —Exemptions   |
| § 5:104 | —Child-bearing restrictions prohibited: Real Prop. Law § 237  |
| § 5:105 | New York City statutes  |
| § 5:106 | —New York City Human Rights Law   |
| § 5:107 | — —Commission on Human Rights administers New York City Human Rights Law                              |
| § 5:108 | — —New York City bans housing discrimination against more protected classes than federal or state law |

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 5:109 — — — Compare: federal law
- § 5:110 — — — Compare: New York State law
- § 5:111 — — — Discriminatory housing practices prohibited
- § 5:112 — — — Refusing to rent or sell to members of  
protected classes
- § 5:113 — — — Failing to provide buyer or tenant with  
services or rights provided to others
- § 5:114 — — — Discriminatory advertising
- § 5:115 — — — Discriminatory record-keeping
- § 5:116 — — — Blockbusting
- § 5:117 — — — Discriminatory-lending practices
- § 5:118 — — — Retaliation
- § 5:119 — — — Exemptions from housing-discrimination ban
- § 5:120 — — — Private-home rentals
- § 5:121 — — — Minors as applicants
- § 5:122 — — — Senior-citizen housing
- § 5:123 — — — Religious organizations
- § 5:124 — — — Application to commercial property
- § 5:125 Other local housing-discrimination laws

### III. PROTECTED CATEGORIES UNDER FEDERAL AND STATE LAW

- § 5:126 Introductory considerations
- § 5:127 Race
  - § 5:128 — *Prima facie* racial-discrimination claim
  - § 5:129 — *Prima facie* case of housing discrimination
- § 5:130 — DHCR enforces integration in Mitchell-Lama  
housing
  - § 5:131 — — Racially discriminatory advertising
- § 5:132 — Pressure to sell only to particular racial group may  
not amount to racial steering
- § 5:133 — Concentrating homeless shelters in minority  
communities not discriminatory when there is no  
discriminatory effect
- § 5:134 Religion
  - § 5:135 — Example: religious harassment by neighbor did not  
constitute housing discrimination
  - § 5:136 — Example: installation of electric locks not deemed  
housing discrimination against orthodox Jewish  
tenants
  - § 5:137 — Example: public-housing authority cannot use  
religious preference as basis for tenant location
- § 5:138 National origin/ancestry
  - § 5:139 — Example: *prima facie* case

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|         |   |
|---------|---|
| § 5:140 | —Example: market plan did not discriminate against Hispanics  |
| § 5:141 | —No discriminatory conduct found when applicant failed to comport with apartment-interview procedures |
| § 5:142 | Gender  |
| § 5:143 | —Discrimination on the basis of gender identity or expression   |
| § 5:144 | —Compare: sexual orientation  |
| § 5:145 | —Sexual harassment constitutes gender discrimination  |
| § 5:146 | — —“Sexual harassment” in housing situations, defined   |
| § 5:147 | —“Same-sex” harassment  |
| § 5:148 | —Compare: same-sex composition of family unit   |
| § 5:149 | Family/marital status   |
| § 5:150 | —FHA bars “familial status” discrimination against individuals with children                          |
| § 5:151 | — —Compare: similar definitions under New York laws   |
| § 5:152 | — —FHA includes “single person” in “family” definition  |
| § 5:153 | —New York laws prohibit discrimination based on marital status  |
| § 5:154 | — —Examples of laws prohibiting discrimination based on marital status                                |
| § 5:155 | — —Compare: New York State bars discrimination based on sexual orientation                            |
| § 5:156 | —Exception: senior-housing exemptions   |
| § 5:157 | —Statewide rent-regulations permit tenant succession by nontraditional “family members”               |
| § 5:158 | — —“Family member,” defined   |
| § 5:159 | — —Criteria for nontraditional family member designation  |
| § 5:160 | —Exclusionary zoning and family composition   |
| § 5:161 | Age   |
| § 5:162 | —Exception: senior-housing exemptions   |
| § 5:163 | — —“Senior housing,” defined  |
| § 5:164 | —Additional protections against eviction of elderly   |
| § 5:165 | — —Restrictions on landlord’s recovery of rent-regulated apartments occupied by senior citizens       |
| § 5:166 | — —Rent-stabilization restriction on eviction of tenants temporarily residing in nursing homes        |
| § 5:167 | — — —Compare: senior citizens relocating to adult-care facilities can terminate residential leases    |
| § 5:168 | —Religious exemption from fair-housing rules does not permit unwarranted age discrimination           |

- § 5:169 Disability
- § 5:170 —Compare: definitions of “disability” or “handicap”
- § 5:171 — —Under federal law
- § 5:172 — — —Exceptions to FHA coverage
- § 5:173 — —Under state law
- § 5:174 — —Under New York City law
- § 5:175 — — —Limitation on definition of disability for alcohol/drug addiction
- § 5:176 —Reasonable accommodation for disabled required
- § 5:177 —Reasonable accommodation claims
- § 5:178 —Reasonable accommodation for disabled required—  
Example: reasonable accommodation of tenant-employee with AIDS
- § 5:179 — —Example: reasonable accommodation and handicapped parking
- § 5:180 — —No-pet clauses and reasonable accommodation
- § 5:181 —Construction standards for new housing accommodations
- § 5:182 —Disability discrimination and maximum occupancy limits
- § 5:183 —People with AIDS protected against discriminatory practices
- § 5:184 —Application of fair-housing laws to claims of disability discrimination

#### **IV. ADDITIONAL PROTECTED CATEGORIES UNDER NEW YORK CITY LAW**

- § 5:185 Sexual orientation
- § 5:186 Partnership status
- § 5:187 Lawful occupation
- § 5:188 Lawful source of income
- § 5:189 Immigration or citizenship status

#### **V. PROTECTIONS AGAINST EXCLUSIONARY ZONING**

- § 5:190 Exclusionary zoning is unlawful
- § 5:191 Balance required within municipality as a whole
- § 5:192 Test for determining validity of zoning ordinance

#### **VI. REMEDIES FOR HOUSING DISCRIMINATION**

- § 5:193 Under federal law
- § 5:194 —Aggrieved party may file administrative complaint
- § 5:195 —Aggrieved party may commence civil action

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|         |  |
|---------|--|
| § 5:196 | —Statute of limitations  |
| § 5:197 | — —Under FHA   |
| § 5:198 | — — —Compare: no statute of limitations applied to<br>Attorney General’s injunctive-relief claim             |
| § 5:199 | — — —Vicarious liability in FHA cases  |
| § 5:200 | — —Under Civil Rights Act of 1866  |
| § 5:201 | —Standing to sue   |
| § 5:202 | — —Plaintiff must allege “injury in fact”  |
| § 5:203 | — — —Municipality can sue brokers for racial<br>steering   |
| § 5:204 | — — —Tenant-counseling organization may sue when<br>resources expended to stem discriminatory practices      |
| § 5:205 | — — —Developers affected by zoning ordinance can<br>sue  |
| § 5:206 | — — —Hotel association lacked standing to sue on<br>behalf of disabled residents                             |
| § 5:207 | — — —Nonminority plaintiffs lack standing when no<br>loss of associational benefits demonstrated             |
| § 5:208 | — —Who can be sued   |
| § 5:209 | — — —Exception: no individual right of action<br>against HUD   |
| § 5:210 | — —Attorney General has standing to sue  |
| § 5:211 | —Available relief  |
| § 5:212 | — —Injunctive relief: likelihood of success and<br>balancing of hardships required                           |
| § 5:213 | — —Punitive damages available  |
| § 5:214 | — — —Criteria for imposing punitive damages  |
| § 5:215 | — —Prevailing plaintiff may be awarded attorneys’<br>fees and costs  |
| § 5:216 | — — —Exception: no fees recoverable in<br>administrative proceedings brought by private<br>parties           |
| § 5:217 | — —Penalties   |
| § 5:218 | Under New York State law   |
| § 5:219 | —Aggrieved party may file administrative complaint   |
| § 5:220 | —Aggrieved party may commence civil action   |
| § 5:221 | —Statute of limitations  |
| § 5:222 | —Standing to sue   |
| § 5:223 | — —Example: white prospective tenant with African-<br>American roommate can sue for racial<br>discrimination |
| § 5:224 | — —Commercial plaintiffs have standing to sue  |
| § 5:225 | — —Cooperative apartment seller could sue based on<br>alleged discrimination against prospective buyer       |
| § 5:226 | —Available relief  |
| § 5:227 | — —Punitive damages limited to \$10,000 per plaintiff  |

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 5:228 — —Example: \$30,000 in punitive damages awarded
- § 5:229 — —Example: preliminary injunction granted to prospective purchaser of commercial space based on disability discrimination
- § 5:230 Under New York City law
- § 5:231 —Aggrieved party may file administrative complaint
- § 5:232 —Aggrieved party may commence civil action
- § 5:233 —Statute of limitations
- § 5:234 —Standing to sue
- § 5:235 —Available relief
- § 5:236 — —Injunctive relief
- § 5:237 — — —Stay of eviction proceedings
- § 5:238 — —Civil penalties
- § 5:239 — —Criminal penalties

## VII. FORMS

- § 5:240 Form 5-1: Legal apartment application
- § 5:241 Form 5-2: Federal complaint for declaratory judgment, injunctive relief and damages
- § 5:242 Form 5-3: State division of human rights complaint
- § 5:243 Form 5-4: New York City Human Rights Commission Complaint
- § 5:244 Form 5-5: U.S. Department of House and Urban Development, Certification of Domestic Violence, Dating Violence, or Stalking

## CHAPTER 6. AMOUNT OF RENT

### I. AGREEMENT TO PAY RENT

- § 6:1 Payment of rent
- § 6:2 Place of payment
- § 6:3 Application of payments
- § 6:4 —Partial rent tenders may be rejected
- § 6:5 Time for payment
- § 6:6 —Parties may agree to advance rent payment
- § 6:7 —Effect of Saturday, Sunday, or holiday due date
- § 6:8 Acceleration of payment
- § 6:9 Enforceability of acceleration agreement based on rent
- § 6:10 —Acceleration based on some other breach of lease may not be valid
- § 6:11 —Effect of lease termination on rent acceleration
- § 6:12 Mode and medium of rent
- § 6:13 —Percentage rents
- § 6:14 —Rent payment by electronic-funds transfer



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 6:15 Modification or waiver as to time, place, or method of payment
- § 6:16 Receipt for payment of rent
- § 6:17 —No penalty for failure to provide rent receipt

## II. AMOUNT OF RENT UNDER RENT CONTROL

- § 6:18 “Maximum rent” system
- § 6:19 —Maximum rents set by DHCR for previously unregistered units
- § 6:20 Additional rent adjustments under rent control

## III. AMOUNT OF RENT UNDER RENT STABILIZATION

- § 6:21 Legal regulated rent
- § 6:22 Additional rent adjustments under rent stabilization
- § 6:23 Lease must reflect legal rent
- § 6:24 New landlord must obtain rent history

## CHAPTER 7. SECURITY DEPOSITS

### I. NEW YORK GENERAL OBLIGATIONS LAW

- § 7:1 Generally
- § 7:2 “Security deposit,” defined
- § 7:3 —Security deposit is not rent
- § 7:4 —Security deposit is a “substantial obligation of the tenancy”
- § 7:5 — —Landlord’s application of security deposit to rent arrears may not cure default
- § 7:6 Security deposit, formerly treated as debt, is now held in trust
- § 7:7 Landlord’s claim to security deposit given priority over other creditors
- § 7:8 Commingling of funds prohibited
- § 7:9 —Deposit of security funds into interest-bearing account not always required
- § 7:10 —Commingling constitutes conversion and may entitle tenant to immediate refund of security deposit
- § 7:11 —Commingling may be corrected
- § 7:12 —Tenant’s breach of lease does not relieve landlord of its duty to maintain segregated security deposit account
- § 7:13 —Example: landlord must return commingled security deposit even when tenant has allegedly repudiated lease

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 7:14 —Landlord may use security deposit to offset damages
- § 7:15 — —Any excess must be returned to tenant
- § 7:16 Transfer of security deposits upon conveyance of real property
- § 7:17 —New owner generally assumes liability when security deposits are transferred
- § 7:18 —Failure to transfer is a misdemeanor
- § 7:19 —Express conveyance of security deposits required
- § 7:20 Refund of security deposit upon termination of tenancy
- § 7:21 —Refund of security when stipulation of settlement is silent
- § 7:22 —Effect of constructive eviction
- § 7:23 —Effect of breach of warranty of habitability
- § 7:24 Landlord entitled to offsets against security deposits
- § 7:25 —Residential tenant's right to inspection
- § 7:26 —Residential tenant's right to repair damage
- § 7:27 —Security deposit can serve as offset only to extent of damages
- § 7:28 — —Accord and satisfaction
- § 7:29 —Timing of security deposit refund
- § 7:30 —Tenant may not offset rent arrears against security deposit
- § 7:31 — —Interest owed on security monies no defense to rent nonpayment
- § 7:32 — —Accrued interest on security deposit need not be applied to supplemental security owed by tenant
- § 7:33 — —An exception exists when lease and statutory requirements are violated
- § 7:34 —Exceptions to landlord's right to withhold
- § 7:35 "Prepaid rent" must also be held in trust
- § 7:36 —Example: prepaid rent must be transferred to receiver

## II. ADDITIONAL RULES FOR RESIDENTIAL SECURITY DEPOSITS

- § 7:37 Generally
- § 7:38 Security deposit must be held in an interest-bearing account in a New York state bank
- § 7:39 —Exception: fewer than six dwelling units
- § 7:40 —Written notice to tenant required
- § 7:41 — —Effect of violation of notice provisions
- § 7:42 —Landlord entitled to administrative fee
- § 7:43 —Annual interest payments
- § 7:44 —Attorney General has standing to sue

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 7:45 Liability of new landlord for security deposits of non-rent-stabilized tenants: N.Y. Gen. Oblig. Law § 7-108
- § 7:46 —Liability not absolute; “actual knowledge” of security deposit required
- § 7:47 — —“Actual knowledge,” defined
- § 7:48 —New landlord must notify tenant when there is no record of security deposit
- § 7:49 — —Purchaser can demand escrow account from seller
- § 7:50 Additional restrictions on security deposits of rent-controlled tenants
- § 7:51 —Maximum amount of security deposit
- § 7:52 —Deposit in interest-bearing New York State bank account required; one-percent administrative fee permitted
- § 7:53 —Liability of new landlord for security deposits of rent-controlled tenants
- § 7:54 —Civil remedy to recover security deposits: N.Y. Gen. Oblig. Law § 7-105
- § 7:55 —Collection of excess security deposit constitutes rent overcharge
- § 7:56 Additional restrictions on security deposits of rent-stabilized tenants
- § 7:57 —Amount of security deposit generally limited to one month’s rent
- § 7:58 — —Exception: larger deposit on base date
- § 7:59 — —Exception: no security deposit upon lease renewal when none collected initially
- § 7:60 —Tenant’s options regarding disbursement of interest
- § 7:61 —Administrative fee
- § 7:62 —Deposit in a New York State bank
- § 7:63 —Liability for security deposit upon conveyance of property
- § 7:64 — —Receiver’s liability is limited
- § 7:65 — —Waiver of benefit void
- § 7:66 — —Effective date
- § 7:67 —“Rent Stabilization Lease Rider” must state security deposit rules
- § 7:68 —DHCR can decide excess security deposit claim
- § 7:69 Security deposit protection for manufactured-home park tenants
- § 7:70 Provision of security deposit for tenants receiving public assistance

## III. COMPARE: “DEPOSIT” PENDING APPROVAL OF TENANT

- § 7:71 Withdrawal of offer prior to landlord’s acceptance

## **CHAPTER 8. DELIVERY AND SURRENDER OF POSSESSION**

### **I. LANDLORD'S OBLIGATION TO TENDER POSSESSION**

- § 8:1 Implied duty to deliver possession
- § 8:2 —Provision for delayed possession
- § 8:3 Delivery of possession
- § 8:4 —Condition of commercial premises
- § 8:5 —Condition of residential premises
- § 8:6 —Exclusive possessory rights during tenancy term
- § 8:7 — —Permissible occupants in residential premises
- § 8:8 — — —Leases entered into by one tenant
- § 8:9 — — —Leases entered into by two or more tenants
- § 8:10 Tenant's failure to take physical possession
- § 8:11 —Exception for statutory tenants
- § 8:12 — —Rent-controlled tenants
- § 8:13 — —Rent-stabilized tenants

### **II. TENANT'S REMEDIES FOR LANDLORD'S FAILURE TO TENDER POSSESSION AND DEPRIVATIONS OF POSSESSION**

- § 8:14 Statutory remedies
- § 8:15 —Rescission
- § 8:16 —Recovery of consideration
- § 8:17 —Damages
- § 8:18 Actions to compel delivery of possession
- § 8:19 —Ejectment
- § 8:20 —Availability of specific performance, injunctive, and  
declaratory relief
- § 8:21 — —Specific performance
- § 8:22 — —Injunctive and declaratory relief
- § 8:23 Damages
- § 8:24 —Lost profits for tenants never in possession
- § 8:25 —Contract damages

### **III. DEPRIVATIONS OF POSSESSION**

- § 8:26 Breach of warranty of habitability
- § 8:27 —General considerations
- § 8:28 — —Warranty of habitability applies to residential  
premises only
- § 8:29 — —Applicable standards

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 8:30 — Remedies and damages
- § 8:31 — — Rent abatements
- § 8:32 — — Compensatory damages
- § 8:33 — — Punitive damages
- § 8:34 — — Attorney's fees
- § 8:35 Constructive eviction
- § 8:36 — Abandonment required
- § 8:37 — Partial constructive eviction
- § 8:38 Illegal lockouts
- § 8:39 — Liability for treble damages
- § 8:40 — "Self-help" generally prohibited
- § 8:41 — Compare: use of "self-help" to evict non-tenants

## IV. TENANT'S OBLIGATION TO SURRENDER POSSESSION TO LANDLORD

- § 8:42 Termination of lease
- § 8:43 — Duty to remove all occupants
- § 8:44 — Renewals and extensions, generally
- § 8:45 — Tenants holding over after expiration of their term
- § 8:46 — — Landlord's right to terminate month-to-month tenancies
- § 8:47 — Liability for use and occupancy
- § 8:48 — — Use and occupancy distinguished from rent
- § 8:49 — — Computation of use and occupancy
- § 8:50 Authority to surrender possession
- § 8:51 Surrender of possession prior to lease expiration
- § 8:52 — Surrender upon destruction of leased premises
- § 8:53 — Surrender upon tenant's entering military service
- § 8:54 — Surrender upon tenant's entering adult care facility, senior or subsidized housing, or to relocate to family member's residence
- § 8:55 Landlord's duty to mitigate damages upon surrender
- § 8:56 — Commercial premises
- § 8:57 — Residential premises
- § 8:58 Tenant's liability for double rent
- § 8:59 Termination based upon tenant's violation of lease terms or statute
- § 8:60 — Termination of rent-regulated tenancies
- § 8:61 — Time periods for termination or surrender of possession pursuant to lease
- § 8:62 Tenant's death
- § 8:63 — Compare: rent-controlled tenancies
- § 8:64 — Procedure for recovery of possession upon tenant's death

§ 8:65 — —Compare: joinder of tenant's estate in holdover proceedings

§ 8:66 — —Compare: joinder of tenant's estate when lease has expired

APPENDIX 8:1. Civil Court Directives, Ejectment Actions in Civil Court, Civil Court of the City of New York (10/02/96)

## **CHAPTER 9. WARRANTY OF HABITABILITY**

### **I. OVERVIEW**

§ 9:1 Introduction

§ 9:2 Common-law antecedents

§ 9:3 Legislative history

§ 9:4 Judicial construction

§ 9:5 Modification and waiver void

§ 9:6 —Exculpatory lease clauses

§ 9:7 —Stipulations

### **II. TENANTS PROTECTED BY WARRANTY**

§ 9:8 Residential tenants and lessees protected by warranty

§ 9:9 —Cooperative shareholders

§ 9:10 —Government-subsidized housing

§ 9:11 —Loft tenants

§ 9:12 —Manufactured-home park tenants

§ 9:13 —Section 8 tenants

§ 9:14 —Subtenants

§ 9:15 Tenants' licensees not covered

§ 9:16 Holdover tenants not covered

§ 9:17 Tenants out-of-possession not covered

§ 9:18 —Non-residents have other remedies

§ 9:19 Condominium-unit owners not covered

§ 9:20 —Condominium-unit owners have other remedies

§ 9:21 Commercial tenants not covered

§ 9:22 —Commercial tenants have other remedies

### **III. LANDLORDS SUBJECT TO WARRANTY**

§ 9:23 Applicability of warranty

§ 9:24 —Bankruptcy trustees

§ 9:25 —Cooperative-apartment corporations

§ 9:26 —Loft-building owners

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 9:27 —Manufactured-home park owners and operators
- § 9:28 —Municipal or government lessors
- § 9:29 — —Notice of claim against government and municipal landlords
- § 9:30 —Receivers
- § 9:31 —7-A administrators
- § 9:32 Condominium associations and board of managers not covered
- § 9:33 —Other claims available

## IV. CONDITIONS CONSTITUTING A BREACH

- § 9:34 Generally
- § 9:35 —Air conditioning
- § 9:36 —Asbestos
- § 9:37 —Carbon-monoxide detectors
- § 9:38 —Certificate of occupancy
- § 9:39 —Common areas
- § 9:40 — —Snow removal
- § 9:41 —Doorknobs
- § 9:42 —Elevator service
- § 9:43 —Fire-detection equipment
- § 9:44 —Floor tiles
- § 9:45 —Garbage
- § 9:46 —Hall carpets
- § 9:47 —Heat and hot water
- § 9:48 —Illumination
- § 9:49 —Infestation
- § 9:50 — —Bed bugs
- § 9:51 —Kitchen cabinets
- § 9:52 —Lead-based paint
- § 9:53 —Leaks and water damage
- § 9:54 —Light and ventilation
- § 9:55 —Maintenance and construction
- § 9:56 —Mold
- § 9:57 —Noise disturbances
- § 9:58 — —Construction activities
- § 9:59 — —Mechanical equipment/commercial tenant
- § 9:60 — —Neighboring tenants
- § 9:61 — —Pets
- § 9:62 —Offensive fumes and odors
- § 9:63 —Package-room service
- § 9:64 —Painting
- § 9:65 —Plumbing
- § 9:66 —Radiator covers

- § 9:67 —Security
- § 9:68 — —Apartment-door lock
- § 9:69 — —Building lock and buzzers
- § 9:70 — —Drug-dealing neighbors
- § 9:71 — —Thefts and burglaries
- § 9:72 —Sewage leaks and spills
- § 9:73 —Smoke detectors
- § 9:74 —Soap dishes
- § 9:75 —Terraces
- § 9:76 —Water service
- § 9:77 —Window blinds
- § 9:78 —Window guards

## **V. MITIGATING FACTORS**

- § 9:79 Tenant's misconduct
- § 9:80 Strike or labor dispute
- § 9:81 Prior agency determinations

## **VI. PROCEDURE AND EVIDENCE**

- § 9:82 Statute of limitations
- § 9:83 Jurisdiction
- § 9:84 —Supreme Court
- § 9:85 —County Court
- § 9:86 —New York City Civil Court
- § 9:87 —District and City Courts
- § 9:88 —Justice Court
- § 9:89 —New York City Loft Board
- § 9:90 —State Division of Housing and Community Renewal  
("DHCR")
- § 9:91 Defensive or offensive application
- § 9:92 —Compare: amount of counterclaim capped by  
amount of rent sought in nonpayment proceeding
- § 9:93 —Counterclaims: effect of waiver clauses
- § 9:94 —Compare: holdover tenants
- § 9:95 Jury-waiver clauses: effect
- § 9:96 Pleading requirements
- § 9:97 —Notice to landlord
- § 9:98 Evidence
- § 9:99 —Code violations
- § 9:100 —Government records
- § 9:101 —Public records: judicial notice

## **VII. REMEDIES**

- § 9:102 Generally



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|         |  |
|---------|--|
| § 9:103 | Damages: how measured                          |
| § 9:104 | Damages: expert testimony not required         |
| § 9:105 | Injunctive relief                              |
| § 9:106 | Money damages                                  |
| § 9:107 | —“Rent abatement,” defined                     |
| § 9:108 | —“Repair and deduct”                           |
| § 9:109 | —Compare: damages for personal property        |
| § 9:110 | —Damages for personal injury                   |
| § 9:111 | — —Counterclaim severance: summary proceedings |
| § 9:112 | Punitive damages                               |
| § 9:113 | Nominal damages                                |
| § 9:114 | Attorneys’ fees                                |
| § 9:115 | Interest                                       |
| § 9:116 | Costs  |

## CHAPTER 10. RIGHTS AND OBLIGATIONS OF THE TENANCY

### I. HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE AND OVERVIEW

|         |  |
|---------|--|
| § 10:1  | Background   |
| § 10:2  | —Nature of parties’ agreement must be ascertained                                  |
| § 10:3  | Covenants governing lease  |
| § 10:4  | —“Express” covenants   |
| § 10:5  | —“Implied” covenants   |
| § 10:6  | — —Impact of statutory obligations   |
| § 10:7  | “Independent” and “dependent” covenants distinguished                              |
| § 10:8  | —“Dependent” covenants: performance is condition precedent to recovery             |
| § 10:9  | —“Independent” covenants: performance required despite breach                      |
| § 10:10 | Mutual covenants   |
| § 10:11 | —Implied covenant of good faith and fair dealing                                   |
| § 10:12 | —Unconscionable lease clauses are void   |
| § 10:13 | —Unconscionability requires finding of “procedural” and “substantive” overreaching |
| § 10:14 | — —Procedural unconscionability  |
| § 10:15 | — —Substantive unconscionability   |
| § 10:16 | — — —“Fiscal imprudence” is no defense   |
| § 10:17 | — — —Liquidated damages  |
| § 10:18 | — — —Lease clauses purporting to waive certain statutory rights are unconscionable |
| § 10:19 | — — — —Right to have security deposit held in trust                                |
| § 10:20 | — — — —Warranty of habitability  |

- § 10:21 — — — —Right to sublease or assign an apartment
- § 10:22 — — — —Exculpatory clauses
- § 10:23 — — — —Prohibitions against bankruptcy filing  
invalid
- § 10:24 — — — —Waiver of rent regulations invalid

## II. A LANDLORD'S OBLIGATIONS AND TENANT'S REMEDIES

- § 10:25 Landlord's duty to deliver full possession
- § 10:26 —Nature and scope of duty
- § 10:27 — —Duty to deliver possession extends to assignee of  
tenant
- § 10:28 —Establishing breach
- § 10:29 —Remedies available for landlord's failure to deliver  
possession
- § 10:30 — —Right of rescission
- § 10:31 — —"Loss of the bargain"
- § 10:32 — —Recovery of lost profits
- § 10:33 — —Summary proceeding to acquire possession from  
holdover tenant
- § 10:34 — —Summary proceeding to dispossess a squatter
- § 10:35 — —"Self-help" to remove squatter
- § 10:36 — —Equitable relief may not be available
- § 10:37 —Tenant's waiver of breach
- § 10:38 Implied covenant of quiet enjoyment
- § 10:39 —Scope of duty
- § 10:40 —Establishing breach
- § 10:41 — —"Actual eviction," defined
- § 10:42 — —"Constructive eviction," defined
- § 10:43 — — —Conduct giving rise to breach on grounds of  
constructive eviction
- § 10:44 — — — —Violation of restrictive-use lease covenants
- § 10:45 — — — —Violations of health and safety codes and  
administrative regulations
- § 10:46 — —Wrongful act by landlord is necessary element of  
any breach claim
- § 10:47 —Tenant's remedies
- § 10:48 — —Remedies against landlord
- § 10:49 — — —Suspension of rental obligation
- § 10:50 — — —Consequential damages
- § 10:51 — — —Punitive damages
- § 10:52 — — —Action for "private nuisance"
- § 10:53 — — —Action for injunctive relief
- § 10:54 — —Remedies against third-parties

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|         |   |
|---------|---|
| § 10:55 | —Tenant must comply with all lease conditions   |
| § 10:56 | Landlord's duties regarding condition of premises   |
| § 10:57 | —Commercial leases  |
| § 10:58 | — —Duty to maintain premises over which landlord retains control  |
| § 10:59 | — —Establishing breach  |
| § 10:60 | — —Remedies for breach  |
| § 10:61 | — — —No suspension of rent, absent abandonment  |
| § 10:62 | — — —Surrender of possession  |
| § 10:63 | — — — —Waiver enforceable   |
| § 10:64 | — — — —Equitable relief not available   |
| § 10:65 | —Residential tenancies: warranty of habitability  |
| § 10:66 | — —Distinct and independent nature of protection  |
| § 10:67 | — — —Government landlords held to same standard   |
| § 10:68 | — —Protections extended to co-ops, but not to condominiums  |
| § 10:69 | — —Establishing a statutory violation   |
| § 10:70 | — — —Premises must be fit for human habitation and serve their intended residential function                                      |
| § 10:71 | — — —Premises must be free of patent or latent defects  |
| § 10:72 | — — — —Violations of health and safety codes  |
| § 10:73 | — —Residential tenants' remedies  |
| § 10:74 | — — —Right to withhold rent and/or to seek set-off  |
| § 10:75 | — — —Punitive damages   |
| § 10:76 | — — —Equitable relief   |
| § 10:77 | — — — —Preliminary injunctive relief may be available to tenant threatened with eviction  |
| § 10:78 | — — — —Special proceedings may be maintained  |
| § 10:79 | — — —Surrender of tenancy   |
| § 10:80 | — —Property-damage recovery under the statute, generally  |
| § 10:81 | — —Tenant's waiver of breach  |
| § 10:82 | Landlord's covenant to maintain and repair premises during tenancy term   |
| § 10:83 | —Commercial leases  |
| § 10:84 | — —Establishing breach  |
| § 10:85 | — —Commercial tenant's remedies in tort   |
| § 10:86 | —Residential leases   |
| § 10:87 | — —Statutory duty of multiple-dwelling owners to perform repairs  |
| § 10:88 | — —Loft tenants may invoke statutory protections of Multiple Dwelling Law   |
| § 10:89 | — —New York City tenants in premises formerly used for manufacturing and warehouse purposes are further protected from harassment |

- § 10:90 — — — “Harassment,” defined
- § 10:91 — — — Establishing breach
- § 10:92 — — — Residential landlord has nondelegable duty to  
comply with statutes and regulations
- § 10:93 — — — — Application of duties to government  
landlords
- § 10:94 — — — Monetary damages for residential tenants
- § 10:95 — — — “Economic infeasibility” defense, generally
- § 10:96 — — — Evidence required to establish defense
- § 10:97 — — — Pertinence of landlord’s “clean hands”
- § 10:98 — — — In the residential context
- § 10:99 — — — The “marine rule,” generally

### III. THE TENANT’S OBLIGATION AND THE LANDLORD’S REMEDIES

- § 10:100 Tenant’s obligation to use and occupy
- § 10:101 — — — Percentage leases
- § 10:102 — — — Rent regulations govern occupancy requirements
- § 10:103 Remedies of landlord for abandonment or early  
termination of tenancy
- § 10:104 — — — General rule upon tenant’s abandonment
- § 10:105 — — — No duty to mitigate damages in commercial  
context
- § 10:106 — — — Duty to mitigate damages in the residential  
context
- § 10:107 — — — Conflict as to duty to mitigate damages in the  
residential context—“Mitigation of injury,” defined
- § 10:108 Duty to pay rent
- § 10:109 — — — “Use and occupancy” distinguished
- § 10:110 — — — Nature and scope of duty to pay rent
- § 10:111 — — — Duty to pay rent is relieved in very few  
circumstances
- § 10:112 — — — Duration of obligation to pay rent
- § 10:113 — — — When landlord accepts lease repudiation, rent  
obligation terminates
- § 10:114 — — — Due date of rent
- § 10:115 — — — Remedies for breach
- § 10:116 — — — Nonpayment proceeding to recoup unpaid rent
- § 10:117 — — — Terminating tenancy upon failure to cure and  
commencing holdover proceeding
- § 10:118 — — — — *Yellowstones* discouraged for nonpayment of  
rent
- § 10:119 — — — Compare: availability of post-judgment cure  
in residential context in New York City

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 10:120 | — — —Enforceability of conditional limitation for nonpayment of rent                              |
| § 10:121 | — — — —Enforceable in commercial context  |
| § 10:122 | — — — —Unenforceable in both residential and commercial contexts                                  |
| § 10:123 | — —Landlord’s remedies when tenant holds over   |
| § 10:124 | — —Bankruptcy of tenant   |
| § 10:125 | Duty to use premises for legal purposes   |
| § 10:126 | —Nature and scope of duty   |
| § 10:127 | —Landlord’s remedies  |
| § 10:128 | —No waiver by landlord  |
| § 10:129 | Duty not to commit or permit waste  |
| § 10:130 | —Establishing waste   |
| § 10:131 | — —Elements of waste claim  |
| § 10:132 | — —Tenant’s failure to make proper repairs  |
| § 10:133 | — —No liability when alterations are permitted or are consistent with the intended use            |
| § 10:134 | — — —Life tenant’s compliance with certain statutory requirements precludes liability for waste   |
| § 10:135 | — —Failure to pay property taxes, mortgage payments, insurance, and utilities may amount to waste |
| § 10:136 | — —No liability for waste when landlord explicitly or implicitly consents to alteration           |
| § 10:137 | —Parties with standing  |
| § 10:138 | — —Availability of monetary damages   |
| § 10:139 | Duty of tenant to make repairs in absence of express covenant or statutory duty                   |
| § 10:140 | —Remedies for tenant’s breach of the duty to repair   |
| § 10:141 | — —Plenary action for money damages   |

## IV. OTHER RIGHTS AND DUTIES OF PARTIES

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 10:142 | Assignment and subletting  |
| § 10:143 | —Assignments and subleases distinguished   |
| § 10:144 | —Tenant’s right to assign or sublet  |
| § 10:145 | — —Commercial leases   |
| § 10:146 | — —Residential-tenant’s rights   |
| § 10:147 | — — —Subletting requirements for tenants in buildings with four or more residential units                                  |
| § 10:148 | — — — —“Reasonableness” of landlord’s information request examined   |
| § 10:149 | — — —Effect of emergency rent-laws   |
| § 10:150 | — — — —“Sweetheart” provisions permitting unlimited assignments or subleases of regulated units are void and unenforceable |

- § 10:151 — — — Certain residential tenancies are not  
afforded statutory right to sublet
- § 10:152 — Liability of bankrupt tenant upon assignment
- § 10:153 Rights of parties regarding “fixtures”
- § 10:154 — “Trade fixtures,” defined
- § 10:155 — Tenant’s right to remove “trade fixtures”
- § 10:156 — Compensation for trade fixtures
- § 10:157 Impact of condemnation by “eminent domain”
- § 10:158 — “Eminent domain,” defined
- § 10:159 — Procedures followed
- § 10:160 — Effect on tenant’s obligation to pay rent
- § 10:161 — Tenant’s right to receive compensation when  
premises condemned

## CHAPTER 11. RENT REGULATION

### I. OVERVIEW

- § 11:1 Rent control and rent stabilization
- § 11:2 — Rent control
- § 11:3 — Rent stabilization
- § 11:4 Purpose
- § 11:5 Constitutionality
- § 11:6 Jurisdiction and venue
- § 11:7 — New York State Homes and Community Renewal  
 (“NYSHCR”) formerly New York State Division of  
Housing and Community Renewal (“DHCR”)
- § 11:8 — New York State Division of Housing and  
Community Renewal (“DHCR”)—Administrative  
determinations by DHCR
- § 11:9 — — — Two levels of administrative review
- § 11:10 — — — PARs to be decided within 90 days
- § 11:11 — — — Expedited proceedings
- § 11:12 — — Judicial review
- § 11:13 — — — DHCR rulings are upheld if reasonable
- § 11:14 — — — Judicial review of PAR “deemed denied”
- § 11:15 — Courts retain exclusive jurisdiction over certain  
rent-regulation issues
- § 11:16 — — Primary residence
- § 11:17 — — — Exception: DHCR determines primary-  
residence disputes for rent-controlled units outside  
New York City
- § 11:18 — — Rent overcharge of rent-controlled tenants
- § 11:19 — Concurrent jurisdiction
- § 11:20 — — Rent-overcharge issues

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 11:21 — — —Conflicting opinion on procedure
- § 11:22 — — —Attorney General has standing to sue for practices that violate rent-regulation laws
- § 11:23 — — —“Primary jurisdiction” doctrine no bar to Attorney General action

## II. GOVERNING STATUTES AND REGULATIONS

- § 11:24 Enabling legislation
- § 11:25 —Emergency Housing Rent Control Law
- § 11:26 —Local Emergency Housing Rent Control Act
- § 11:27 —Vacancy Decontrol Law
- § 11:28 —Emergency Tenant Protection Act of 1974
- § 11:29 —Omnibus Housing Act of 1983
- § 11:30 —Rent Regulation Reform Act of 1993
- § 11:31 —Rent Regulation Reform Act of 1997
- § 11:32 —Rent Act of 2011, Rent Act of 2015, and the Housing Stability and Tenant Protection Act of 2019
- § 11:33 Rent-control statutes
- § 11:34 —Emergency Housing Rent Control Law
- § 11:35 —New York City Rent and Rehabilitation Law
- § 11:36 Rent-stabilization statutes
- § 11:37 —Emergency Tenant Protection Act of 1974
- § 11:38 —New York City Rent Stabilization Law
- § 11:39 Regulations
- § 11:40 —State Rent and Eviction Regulations
- § 11:41 —New York City Rent and Eviction Regulations
- § 11:42 —Emergency Tenant Protection Regulations
- § 11:43 —Rent Stabilization Code
- § 11:44 — —History of prior code
- § 11:45 Related statutes
- § 11:46 —Urstadt Law
- § 11:47 —N.Y. Real Property Tax Laws § 421-a, § 421-g, and § 485-x
- § 11:48 —New York City Administrative Code § 11-244
- § 11:49 —New York City Loft Law
- § 11:50 Are rent-regulated tenancies statutory or contractual

## III. COVERAGE

- § 11:51 Extent of rent regulation statewide
- § 11:52 —1947 to 1969: rent control only
- § 11:53 —1969: rent stabilization introduced in New York City
- § 11:54 —1971: vacancy decontrol
- § 11:55 —1974: rent stabilization reinstated statewide

# LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 11:56 Rent-control coverage
- § 11:57 —No “ignorance” exception
- § 11:58 —Buildings with three or more units covered
- § 11:59 — —“Housing accommodations,” defined
- § 11:60 — —Other units may be subject to coverage
- § 11:61 — —No rent-control coverage for ancillary non-residential space
- § 11:62 —Municipalities subject to rent control
- § 11:63 —Statutory exemptions from rent-control coverage
- § 11:64 — —Furnished rooms
- § 11:65 — —Government-operated and subsidized housing
- § 11:66 — —Hotel accommodations
- § 11:67 — —Motor courts and tourist homes
- § 11:68 — —Municipalities exempt from rent control
- § 11:69 — —Not-for-profit institutions
- § 11:70 — —Other exemptions
- § 11:71 Rent-stabilization coverage
- § 11:72 —“Housing accommodations,” defined
- § 11:73 — —Units covered outside New York City
- § 11:74 — —Units covered within New York City
- § 11:75 — — —“Class A multiple dwelling,” defined
- § 11:76 — — — —Example: rooming house qualified as Class A multiple dwelling
- § 11:77 — — — —Garden-apartment complexes
- § 11:78 — — — —“Class B multiple dwelling,” defined
- § 11:79 — — —Application to hotels
- § 11:80 — —Units covered under tax-benefit programs
- § 11:81 — — —“421-a” new construction program
- § 11:82 — — —“423” redevelopment program
- § 11:83 —“Housing accommodations,” defined—Units covered under tax-benefit programs—“J-51” Tax exemption and abatement program
- § 11:84 —“Housing accommodations,” defined—Units covered under tax-benefit programs—State-assisted units
- § 11:85 —Zoning may exempt units from rent-stabilization coverage
- § 11:86 —Statutory exemptions from rent-stabilization coverage
- § 11:87 — —Rent-controlled units
- § 11:88 — —Government-operated and subsidized housing
- § 11:89 — —Less than six units
- § 11:90 — — —Combining apartments does not trigger exemption
- § 11:91 — — —“Horizontal multiple-dwellings” not exempt



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 11:92  | — — New construction or substantial rehabilitation after December 31, 1973                    |
| § 11:93  | — — — Substantial-rehabilitation criteria   |
| § 11:94  | — — — — No increase in number of units required   |
| § 11:95  | — — — — Tenants in occupancy or those constructively evicted remain rent-stabilized           |
| § 11:96  | — — Units owned or operated by charitable or educational institutions                         |
| § 11:97  | — — — Limited exemption for unaffiliated tenants  |
| § 11:98  | — — — — “Exclusive” or primary not-for-profit operation of building required                  |
| § 11:99  | — — Hotel rooms   |
| § 11:100 | — — “Motor courts, tourist homes,” defined  |
| § 11:101 | — — Furnished rooms   |
| § 11:102 | — — Non-primary residence   |
| § 11:103 | — — — Advance non-primary residence agreement void  |
| § 11:104 | — — Occupancy as incident of employment   |
| § 11:105 | — — Nonresidential use  |
| § 11:106 | — — Cooperative and condominium units   |
| § 11:107 | Deregulation of rent-controlled and rent-stabilized units                                     |
| § 11:108 | — Vacancy decontrol   |
| § 11:109 | — “Luxury” deregulation of vacant housing-accommodations                                      |
| § 11:110 | — — Under rent control  |
| § 11:111 | — “Luxury” deregulation of vacant housing-accommodations—Under rent stabilization             |
| § 11:112 | — — Notice to new tenants of high rent deregulation under rent stabilization and rent control |
| § 11:113 | — “Luxury” deregulation of occupied housing-accommodations                                    |
| § 11:114 | — — Under rent control  |
| § 11:115 | — — Under rent stabilization  |
| § 11:116 | — “Luxury” deregulation when tenant occupies multiple apartments                              |
| § 11:117 | — Exclusions from household income  |
| § 11:118 | — — No allowances for income “anomalies”  |
| § 11:119 | — Procedure   |
| § 11:120 | — — Income certification  |
| § 11:121 | — — — Methods of service  |
| § 11:122 | — — — Required information  |
| § 11:123 | — — — Service of income-certification form  |
| § 11:124 | — — Luxury deregulation petition  |
| § 11:125 | — — Grounds for petition  |

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 11:126 — —DHCR notice to tenant of petition and opportunity to answer
- § 11:127 — —Income verification
- § 11:128 — — —Amended returns may not defeat “luxury” deregulation
- § 11:129 — —Governing time limitations
- § 11:130 — —Appeal
- § 11:131 — —Effective date of deregulation determination
- § 11:132 — —Effect of tenant’s failure to timely respond to DHCR’s deregulation notice
- § 11:133 —Right of first refusal
- § 11:134 Deregulation of rent-stabilized units—Effect of retroactive rent adjustment on \$2,774.76 rent threshold
- § 11:135 Deregulation of rent-controlled and rent-stabilized units—Exemptions
- § 11:136 — —Units under tax benefit programs
- § 11:137 — — —Unit otherwise subject to rent stabilization not exempt
- § 11:138 —Loft Law units exempt from luxury destabilization
- § 11:139 —Exemptions—Compare: nonpurchasing co-op tenant subject to luxury deregulation
- § 11:140 —Deregulation of cooperative and condominium units converted after June 30, 1974
- § 11:141 Reversion of deregulated property to rent stabilization
- § 11:142 Reregulation of multiple dwellings purchased from New York City

## IV. REGISTRATION OF RENTS AND SERVICES

- § 11:143 Rent-controlled units
- § 11:144 —Initial registration of housing accommodations
- § 11:145 — —Additional 1984 registration requirement within New York City
- § 11:146 — — —1984 registration does not establish legal maximum rents
- § 11:147 — —Effect of failure to register
- § 11:148 — —Registration fees
- § 11:149 —Biannual maximum rent adjustments in New York City
- § 11:150 — —History
- § 11:151 — —Maximum rents include essential services
- § 11:152 — —“MBR,” defined
- § 11:153 — —“MCR,” defined
- § 11:154 — —Example: calculating MBR and MCR

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 11:155 | — — Procedure   |
| § 11:156 | — — — Violation certification   |
| § 11:157 | — — — Operation and maintenance and essential-<br>services certification                    |
| § 11:158 | — — — MBR Order of Eligibility  |
| § 11:159 | — — — Challenging an MBR order  |
| § 11:160 | — — — MBR filing fees   |
| § 11:161 | — Adjustment of maximum rents outside New York<br>City                                      |
| § 11:162 | — Compare: no DHCR order required for rent-<br>guideline increases under rent stabilization |
| § 11:163 | — Request for MCR calculation   |
| § 11:164 | — Report of vacancy decontrol   |
| § 11:165 | Rent-stabilized units   |
| § 11:166 | — Rent-registration system effective April 1, 1984  |
| § 11:167 | — Initial registration  |
| § 11:168 | — — Initial legal registered rent registration  |
| § 11:169 | — — Initial registration of required services and<br>other data                             |
| § 11:170 | — Annual registration-update  |
| § 11:171 | — — Annual registration and “legal regulated rent”  |
| § 11:172 | — Serving and filing registration forms   |
| § 11:173 | — — Proof of filing   |
| § 11:174 | — — — Initial registration form   |
| § 11:175 | — — — Annual registration form  |
| § 11:176 | — Registered rents and services not subject to FOIL   |
| § 11:177 | — Tenant objection to initial registration  |
| § 11:178 | — Registration fees   |
| § 11:179 | — Penalties for failure to file registration statements                                     |
| § 11:180 | — — Prospective elimination of penalties by late<br>filing                                  |
| § 11:181 | — — Effect of failure to register or late registration<br>on MCI applications               |
| § 11:182 | — Initial rent registration required after luxury<br>decontrol                              |

## V. ADJUSTMENTS TO REGULATED RENTS

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 11:183 | Regulated rent adjustments prescribed by applicable<br>statutes                     |
| § 11:184 | Annual adjustment to MCRs in New York City  |
| § 11:185 | Fair-market rent appeal of initial rent-stabilized<br>rent: service of form RR-1(i) |
| § 11:186 | — Some units not subject to fair-market rent appeal                                 |
| § 11:187 | Fair-market rent appeal of initial rent-stabilized                                  |

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- rent; service of form RR-1(i)—Proof of service of RR-1(i) form
- § 11:188 — —Service of RR-1(i) not required in certain situations
- § 11:189 —Appeal may be dismissed if untimely
- § 11:190 —Formula for determining fair-market rent
- § 11:191 — —MBR/MCR adjusted by special guidelines
- § 11:192 — —Qualifying comparable rents
- § 11:193 — —“Unique” features may warrant additional valuation
- § 11:194 —DHCR may hold hearings on FMRA issues
- § 11:195 —Refund of excess rent
- § 11:196 — —If properly joined, a current owner may be liable for FMRA reward
- § 11:197 —Rent-overcharge remedies do not apply to FMRA
- § 11:198 —Rent-overcharge penalties do not apply to FMRA—No treble damages
- § 11:199 — —No rent freeze for failure to serve RR-1(i) in FMRA
- § 11:200 — —No attorney’s fees
- § 11:201 —Conversion of rent overcharge complaint to FMRA
- § 11:202 Rent increases for vacancy or renewal of rent-stabilized lease
- § 11:203 —Vacancy “bonus”
- § 11:204 —Additional rent-increases set by local RGBs
- § 11:205 —Vacancy increase
- § 11:206 —Renewal increase
- § 11:207 — —Low-rent adjustment
- § 11:208 —Fuel-cost adjustments
- § 11:209 —Summary of recent New York City rent-guideline increases
- § 11:210 —Effect of early vacatur on calculation of next tenant’s rent
- § 11:211 —Effect of “preferential rent”
- § 11:212 — —Preferential rent may bind landlord to lower rent
- § 11:213 — —Documented preferential rent need not result in permanent lower rent
- § 11:214 —Notification to rent-stabilized tenants of prior legal regulated rents
- § 11:215 Fuel-cost adjustments for New York City rent-controlled units
- § 11:216 —Fuel-cost adjustment not added to base rent
- § 11:217 —Maintaining services was a prerequisite to fuel-cost adjustment
- § 11:218 —Procedure

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 11:219 | Fuel-cost adjustments were cumulative  |
| § 11:220 | Fuel-cost adjustments for New York City rent-controlled units—Computation of fuel-cost adjustment                          |
| § 11:221 | Fuel-cost adjustments for New York city rent-controlled units—Tenant appeal  |
| § 11:222 | Fuel-cost adjustments for New York City rent-controlled units—Effect of rent reductions on fuel-cost adjustments           |
| § 11:223 | Labor cost rent adjustment for New York City rent-controlled units   |
| § 11:224 | Rent increase for individual apartment improvements (“IAIs”)   |
| § 11:225 | —Under rent control  |
| § 11:226 | — —Tenant consent and prior DHCR notification required for IAIs  |
| § 11:227 | — — —SCRIE tenant not exempt from IAIs   |
| § 11:228 | — —Other requirements and considerations   |
| § 11:229 | — —Rate of increase  |
| § 11:230 | — —Special provisions for rent increase based on painting  |
| § 11:231 | —Under rent stabilization  |
| § 11:232 | — —Tenant consent required unless improvement made during apartment vacancy  |
| § 11:233 | — — —Lease signature alone does not constitute tenant consent to IAI rent increase   |
| § 11:234 | — — —“Order date” versus “delivery date”   |
| § 11:235 | — —Prior DHCR approval not currently required in New York City   |
| § 11:236 | — —Rate of increase  |
| § 11:237 | — —Qualifying improvements   |
| § 11:238 | — — —Ordinary maintenance and repairs do not qualify as IAIs   |
| § 11:239 | — — —Demolition costs  |
| § 11:240 | — — —IAIs may not be paid for with insurance proceeds  |
| § 11:241 | — —Confirmation of costs and payments  |
| § 11:242 | — —Confirmation of costs and payments during prior nonpayment proceeding   |
| § 11:243 | — —Confirmation of costs and payments—No rent increase for superintendent labor if paid for as part of normal compensation |
| § 11:244 | — — —Examples: qualifying IAIs   |
| § 11:245 | — —IAI data should be included in annual rent registration   |
| § 11:246 | —Washing machines, dryers, and dishwashers   |

# LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 11:247 —Window guards
- § 11:248 —Air conditioners
- § 11:249 — —Electrical inclusion buildings
- § 11:250 — —Electrical exclusion buildings
- § 11:251 — —Acceptable operating levels
- § 11:252 Surcharges for sub-metered electricity or other utility service
- § 11:253 —Compare: rent reduction based on electrical conversion
- § 11:254 —Creation of new rent-stabilized apartment results in “first rent”
- § 11:255 — —“High-rent” deregulation of first rent
- § 11:256 Major capital improvement (“MCI”) rent increases
- § 11:257 —“Major capital improvement,” defined
- § 11:258 —Eligibility requirements for MCI rent increase
- § 11:259 — —Application should be filed within two years of work’s completion
- § 11:260 — —Notice to new tenants required in vacancy lease
- § 11:261 — —Renewal-lease clause permitting MCI increase required
- § 11:262 — —Source of funds used to pay for MCI affects eligibility
- § 11:263 — — —Cooperative/condominium reserve funds
- § 11:264 — — —Government grants, low interest loans, and subsidies
- § 11:265 — —All hazardous violations must be corrected
- § 11:266 — —Effect of reduced services on MCI rent increase eligibility
- § 11:267 — — —MCI increase collectible if granted prior to rent reduction order
- § 11:268 — — —Rent reduction order bars further rent increases until rent restored
- § 11:269 — —Effect of failure to register or late registration on MCI applications
- § 11:270 —Work which constitutes MCIs
- § 11:271 — —Useful life schedule for major capital improvements
- § 11:272 — — —Examples: estimated useful life
- § 11:273 — —Asbestos removal
- § 11:274 — —Mailbox relocation required in New York City only
- § 11:275 — —Roofing
- § 11:276 — — —Waterproofing
- § 11:277 — —Building-wide installation of “low-flush” toilets
- § 11:278 — —Windows

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 11:279 | — — —Replacement windows after prior increase for storm windows  |
| § 11:280 | — — —Replacement of hallway or lot line windows not required   |
| § 11:281 | — — —Age of prior windows  |
| § 11:282 | — — —Defects in small percentage of windows may delay MCI rent increase  |
| § 11:283 | —Additional rent-increase for work related to MCI  |
| § 11:284 | —Procedure   |
| § 11:285 | — —Prior opinion   |
| § 11:286 | — —Expedited MCI   |
| § 11:287 | — —Confirmation of costs/payments  |
| § 11:288 | — — —DHCR may seek supplemental documentation  |
| § 11:289 | — —Third-party certification of MCI  |
| § 11:290 | —Calculating the MCI rent increase   |
| § 11:291 | Major capital improvement (“MCI”) rent increases—<br>Calculating the MCI rent increase—Two percent cap on annual rent increase for rent stabilized New York City tenants |
| § 11:292 | Major capital improvement (“MCI”) rent increases—<br>Calculating the MCI rent increase—Fifteen percent cap for other rent-regulated tenants                              |
| § 11:293 | — —Vacating tenant should pay retroactive MCI  |
| § 11:294 | — —MCI rent increase is permanent  |
| § 11:295 | — —Room count  |
| § 11:296 | — —Effective date of MCI rent increase   |
| § 11:297 | — —Example: MCI rent increase calculation  |
| § 11:298 | —Effect of SCRIE   |
| § 11:299 | Rent increase for building-wide service improvements   |
| § 11:300 | Landlord hardship  |
| § 11:301 | —Comparative-hardship formula  |
| § 11:302 | —Alternative-hardship formula  |
| § 11:303 | —Limitations on hardship rent increases  |
| § 11:304 | — —Six percent annual cap  |
| § 11:305 | — —Cap on rate of equity return  |
| § 11:306 | — —Thirty-six-month limitation   |
| § 11:307 | —Additional eligibility criteria   |
| § 11:308 | — —Maintenance of services   |
| § 11:309 | — —Resolution of pending tax certiorari proceedings or objections  |
| § 11:310 | — —Ownership by same or related entity for thirty-six months required  |
| § 11:311 | — —5% equity in property   |

- § 11:312 — —Immediately hazardous violations should be corrected
- § 11:313 — —Option to cancel lease
- § 11:314 421-a rent-increases
- § 11:315 —421-a rent-increases not included in base rent since 1982

## VI. PROHIBITIONS

- § 11:316 In general
- § 11:317 “Evasion” of rent regulation prohibited
- § 11:318 “Waiver” of benefit void
- § 11:319 No broker’s fee permitted when broker is landlord’s agent or employee
- § 11:320 No “conditional” rentals
- § 11:321 Failure to renew rent-stabilized lease
- § 11:322 —Rent-stabilized lease-renewal requirements
- § 11:323 — —One- or two-year term at tenant’s option
- § 11:324 — —Same terms and conditions upon lease renewal
- § 11:325 — — —Exception to “same terms and conditions” requirement
- § 11:326 — — — —Example: lawful rent-increase notice clause
- § 11:327 — — — —Example: luxury-deregulation rider
- § 11:328 — — — —Addition of spouse to New York City renewal lease
- § 11:329 — — — —Compare: domestic partners
- § 11:330 — — —“Window period” for renewal-lease offer and acceptance
- § 11:331 — — —Effect of delayed renewal
- § 11:332 — —Form of offer
- § 11:333 — —Landlord should deliver fully executed renewal-lease copy to tenant
- § 11:334 — —Lease-renewal procedure when rent guidelines unknown
- § 11:335 — — —Example: rent guidelines issued after lease-renewal offer
- § 11:336 —Landlord’s failure to renew, or properly renew, rent-stabilized lease is grounds for tenant’s DHCR complaint
- § 11:337 — —Failure to provide rent-stabilization rider also grounds for complaint
- § 11:338 — — —“Deemed” lease when tenant’s renewal complaint denied
- § 11:339 — —Eviction may be delayed while lease-renewal complaint pending



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 11:340 | — —Grounds for refusal to renew lease  |
| § 11:341 | —Illusory tenancy  |
| § 11:342 | —Effect of luxury deregulation application on lease renewal  |
| § 11:343 | —Tenant’s failure to renew lease   |
| § 11:344 | Rent overcharge  |
| § 11:345 | —Compare: fair-market rent appeals   |
| § 11:346 | —Procedure   |
| § 11:347 | — —Under rent control  |
| § 11:348 | — —Under rent stabilization  |
| § 11:349 | —Statute of limitations  |
| § 11:350 | — —Six-year statute of limitations under rent control  |
| § 11:351 | — —Six-year statute of limitations under rent-stabilization exception  |
| § 11:352 | — —Six-year statute of limitations under rent-stabilization exception: rent-overcharge result of fraud                                       |
| § 11:353 | — — —Effect of failure to register rents on statute of limitations for rent overcharge liability   |
| § 11:354 | — —Six-year statute of limitations under rent stabilization—Statute of limitations for rent overcharge complaints filed before April 1, 1984 |
| § 11:355 | —Production of rent-history records  |
| § 11:356 | —Rent determined by “default formula” when rent-history incomplete   |
| § 11:357 | —Remedies for rent overcharge  |
| § 11:358 | — —Treble damages applied to “willful” rent overcharge   |
| § 11:359 | — — —“Willful” overcharge, defined   |
| § 11:360 | — — —Treble damages also applied to negligent rent overcharge  |
| § 11:361 | — — — —Exception: New York City rent-stabilized units  |
| § 11:362 | — —Treble damages applied to “willful” rent overcharge—Six-year limit on treble damages  |
| § 11:363 | — —Treble damages applied to “willful” rent overcharge—No treble damages for technical error   |
| § 11:364 | — — —No treble damages when refund offered in response to complaint  |
| § 11:365 | — — —No treble damages for failure to register rent  |
| § 11:366 | — —Interest on overcharge refund   |
| § 11:367 | — — —Interest rate   |
| § 11:368 | — —Attorney’s fees and costs   |
| § 11:369 | — — —DHCR standard to determine discretionary attorney’s fees award  |

# LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 11:370 — — —Attorney’s fees recovery against DHCR
- § 11:371 — —Compare: rent freeze for failure to register rent
- § 11:372 —Recovery of rent overcharge
- § 11:373 — —Offset method
- § 11:374 — —Judgment method
- § 11:375 — —Effect of reduction of overcharge award
- § 11:376 — —Disposition of overcharge awards when tenant vacates and leaves no forwarding address
- § 11:377 — —Effect of change in building ownership
- § 11:378 — —Effect of judicial sale of building
- § 11:379 — — —“In rem” building
- § 11:380 — — —Receiver treated as judicial-sale purchaser
- § 11:381 Reduction of “essential” or “required” services
- § 11:382 —“Essential services,” defined by rent control
- § 11:383 —“Required” or “essential” services, defined by rent stabilization
- § 11:384 — —Ancillary services
- § 11:385 —Replacement of defective equipment or appliances
- § 11:386 —DHCR complaint procedure
- § 11:387 — —Third person certification of condition creates rebuttable presumption
- § 11:388 —Grounds for rent reduction
- § 11:389 — —Tenant complaint should request rent reduction
- § 11:390 — — —Exception
- § 11:391 — —Calculation of rent reduction
- § 11:392 — — —Under rent control
- § 11:393 — — —Under rent stabilization
- § 11:394 — — —Effective date of rent reduction
- § 11:395 — — —Offset for court-ordered rent abatement
- § 11:396 — —No further rent increase until rent restored
- § 11:397 — — —Effect of rent reduction order on MBR increases
- § 11:398 — —No rent reduction if tenant refuses access
- § 11:399 — —No rent reduction for *de minimis* conditions
- § 11:400 — —No rent reduction for noise complaints between neighbors
- § 11:401 — —No rent reduction when delay invalidates inspection
- § 11:402 — —Restoration of reduced rents
- § 11:403 —Special rules for heat and hot-water complaints
- § 11:404 — —Heat and hot-water complaint procedures
- § 11:405 — —Deprivation of “essential services” is not *de minimis*
- § 11:406 Harassment
- § 11:407 —Penalties

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 11:408 —Under New York City local law
- § 11:409 Security-deposit restrictions

## VII. TRANSFER OF TENANCY RIGHTS

- § 11:410 Succession rights to rent-regulated tenancies by “family members”
- § 11:411 —DHCR and courts have concurrent jurisdiction
- § 11:412 —Applicability of succession regulations to cooperatives and condominiums
- § 11:413 — —Rent-stabilized tenant’s family member in noneviction cooperative
- § 11:414 — —Family members of senior citizens or disabled tenants who remain in occupancy under eviction plan exemptions
- § 11:415 —Residency-term requirements for succession
- § 11:416 — —“Senior citizen,” defined
- § 11:417 — —“Disabled person,” defined
- § 11:418 — —Minimum residency requirements not deemed interrupted by family member’s temporary relocation
- § 11:419 — —Primary-residence requirement
- § 11:420 —“Family member,” defined
- § 11:421 — —Nephews, nieces, aunts, and uncles no longer defined among qualifying successor tenants
- § 11:422 —Criteria for establishing committed family-type relationship with tenant
- § 11:423 —Notice to landlord of family members with possible succession rights
- § 11:424 — —Effect of failure to notify landlord of additional occupants
- § 11:425 —Succession rights may be applied retroactively
- § 11:426 —Roommates and other occupants have no succession rights
- § 11:427 —Joinder of tenant’s estate in succession-rights case
- § 11:428 —Vacancy increases permitted for second succession
- § 11:429 Assignment of tenancy
- § 11:430 —Under rent control
- § 11:431 —Under rent stabilization
- § 11:432 Subleasing
- § 11:433 —Under rent control
- § 11:434 — —Rent increases during sublet term
- § 11:435 — — —Rent increase for unauthorized sublet
- § 11:436 —Under rent stabilization
- § 11:437 — —Furniture surcharge
- § 11:438 — —Two-year limit on sublease

- § 11:439 — —Landlord may collect “sublet surcharge” during sublet term
- § 11:440 — —Special rules for not-for-profit hospitals
- § 11:441 Profiteering

## VIII. GROUNDS FOR EVICTION

- § 11:442 Generally
- § 11:443 “Certificate of eviction” requirement
- § 11:444 Preliminary notices
- § 11:445 Eviction based on tenant’s wrongful acts
- § 11:446 —Refusal to permit access to landlord
- § 11:447 —Tenant’s failure or refusal to renew lease
- § 11:448 — —Under rent control
- § 11:449 — —Under rent stabilization
- § 11:450 —Nonprimary residence
- § 11:451 — —Proof considered in primary-residence cases
- § 11:452 — —Totality of circumstances determines “primary residence”
- § 11:453 — —Special rules for hospital tenants
- § 11:454 — —No legal grounds for nonprimary residence suit against tenant’s estate
- § 11:455 —Rent-controlled tenant not using unit for own dwelling
- § 11:456 Recovery of rent-regulated units based on landlord’s needs
- § 11:457 —Recovery of unit for owner occupancy
- § 11:458 — —Certificate of eviction is a prerequisite under rent control and rent-stabilization outside New York City
- § 11:459 — —Landlord may recover unit for self and/or immediate family member
- § 11:460 — — —Recovery by “natural persons” only
- § 11:461 — — —Partnerships and corporate entities are excluded
- § 11:462 — — —Limits on number of owners or units
- § 11:463 — — —“Immediate family,” defined
- § 11:464 — — —Effect of payment of rent by landlord’s immediate-family member
- § 11:465 — —Landlord must now show an “immediate and compelling necessity”
- § 11:466 — —Landlord should evince a “good faith” intent to occupy unit—Penalties for failure to take occupancy
- § 11:467 — —Landlord should show immediate and compelling necessity to recover any rent-controlled and rent-stabilized units outside New York City

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 11:468 | — — —Exception: small rent-controlled buildings outside New York City  |
| § 11:469 | — —Exemptions from owner occupancy recovery for elderly, disabled, and long-term tenants   |
| § 11:470 | — — —Under rent control  |
| § 11:471 | — — — —“Impairment,” defined   |
| § 11:472 | Recovery of rent-regulated units based on landlord’s needs—Recovery of unit for owner-occupancy—Exemptions from owner occupancy recovery for elderly, disabled, and long-term tenants—Successor tenant may not qualify for 15-year exemption from owner occupancy recovery |
| § 11:473 | Recovery of rent-regulated units based on landlord’s needs—Recovery of unit for owner occupancy—Exemptions from owner occupancy recovery for elderly, disabled, and long-term tenants—Under ETPA   |
| § 11:474 | — — —Under RSL   |
| § 11:475 | — — — —Timing of relocation offer  |
| § 11:476 | —Recovery by not-for-profit institution  |
| § 11:477 | — —Under rent control  |
| § 11:478 | — —Under rent stabilization  |
| § 11:479 | — — —Recovery restrictions   |
| § 11:480 | — — —No express ETPA provision   |
| § 11:481 | —Demolition  |
| § 11:482 | — —Under rent control  |
| § 11:483 | — — —Demolition prerequisites are waived in New York City when there are three or fewer occupied units   |
| § 11:484 | — — —Landlord’s duty to relocate tenant  |
| § 11:485 | — — —Exception: no relocation required   |
| § 11:486 | — — —Tenant’s “ability to pay” for the offered accommodation   |
| § 11:487 | — — —Exception to “tenant’s ability to pay rent” requirement   |
| § 11:488 | — —Under rent stabilization  |
| § 11:489 | — — —Documenting “good faith” intent with the DHCR   |
| § 11:490 | — — —Application procedure   |
| § 11:491 | — — —Tenant relocation and stipends  |
| § 11:492 | — — — —“Suitable housing accommodations,” defined  |
| § 11:493 | —Withdrawal of unit from rental market   |
| § 11:494 | — —Under rent control  |
| § 11:495 | — — —Tenant relocation and stipends  |
| § 11:496 | — —Under rent stabilization  |

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 11:497 — — —Additional requirements within New York City
- § 11:498 —Subdivision, alteration, or remodeling of underutilized rent-controlled unit
- § 11:499 — —Prerequisites may be waived when three or fewer occupied units

### **IX. DHCR PUBLICATIONS**

- § 11:500 Availability of publications
- § 11:501 DHCR Operational Bulletins
- § 11:502 DHCR Policy Statements
- § 11:503 DHCR Opinion Letters
- § 11:504 DHCR Advisory Opinions
- § 11:505 DHCR Fact Sheets
- § 11:506 —New York City Fact Sheets
- § 11:507 Regional, Borough, and District rent office locations
- § 11:508 —DHCR forms

- APPENDIX 11-1. Vacancy Allowance For Lease In Tenant's Brother's Name
- APPENDIX 11-2. Interpreting DHCR's Docket Numbers
- APPENDIX 11-3. Rent Guidelines Board Apartment Orders #1 through #56 (1969 to 2025)
- APPENDIX 11-4. 2009 Apartment & Loft Order #41
- APPENDIX 11-5. 2010 Apartment & Loft Order #42
- APPENDIX 11-6. 2011 Apartment & Loft Order #43
- APPENDIX 11-7. 2012 Apartment & Loft Order #44
- APPENDIX 11-8. 2013 Apartment & Loft Order #45
- APPENDIX 11-9. 2014 Apartment & Loft Order #46
- APPENDIX 11-10. 2015 Apartment & Loft Order #47
- APPENDIX 11-11. 2016 Apartment & Loft Order #48
- APPENDIX 11-12. 2017 Apartment & Loft Order #49
- APPENDIX 11-13. 2018 Apartment & Loft Order #50
- APPENDIX 11-14. 2019 Apartment & Loft Order #51
- APPENDIX 11-15. 2020 Apartment & Loft Order #52
- APPENDIX 11-16. 2020 Apartment & Loft Order #53
- APPENDIX 11-17. 2022 Apartment & Loft Order #54
- APPENDIX 11-18. 2023 Apartment & Loft Order #55
- APPENDIX 11-19. 2024 Apartment & Loft Order #56
- APPENDIX 11-20. Demolition Stipend Chart

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|                 |   |
|-----------------|---|
| APPENDIX 11-21. | DHCR Operation Bulletin 2014-1  |
| APPENDIX 11-22. | DHCR Operation Bulletin 2016-1  |
| APPENDIX 11-23. | DHCR Operational Bulletin 2016-2:<br>Procedures for Requests for Records<br>Access, Freedom of Information Law<br>(FOIL) Requests and Subpoenas                             |
| APPENDIX 11-24. | DHCR Operational Bulletin 2017-1: Major<br>Capital Improvements—Confirmation of<br>Costs/Payments   |
| APPENDIX 11-25. | DHCR Operational Bulletin 2018-1: The<br>Effect of Defective Work on the<br>Disposition of an Owner’s Application<br>for a Major Capital Improvement (MCI)<br>Rent Increase |
| APPENDIX 11-26. | Operational Bulletin 2021-1: Major Capital<br>Improvement Reasonable Cost Schedule  |
| APPENDIX 11-27. | DHCR Good Cause Eviction Law Notice   |

## CHAPTER 12. PREMISES LIABILITY

### I. NEGLIGENCE LIABILITY

§ 12:1 Generally

### II. ORDINARY NEGLIGENCE

|         |   |
|---------|---|
| § 12:2  | Defined   |
| § 12:3  | —Duty must exist for liability to attach  |
| § 12:4  | —Ordinary care  |
| § 12:5  | — —Status distinctions are not determinative of duty<br>owed                        |
| § 12:6  | — — —Compare: party’s status may affect<br>foreseeability                           |
| § 12:7  | — —No duty owed to general public   |
| § 12:8  | —Landlord’s duty of care  |
| § 12:9  | — —Basis of landlord’s duty   |
| § 12:10 | — —Ownership, occupancy, and control determine<br>liability                         |
| § 12:11 | —Specific considerations and duties relative to the<br>landlord-tenant relationship |
| § 12:12 | — —No duty to warn of obvious conditions  |
| § 12:13 | — — —Exception: when foreseeable injuries may<br>result                             |
| § 12:14 | — —No duty to remedy natural, open conditions                                       |
| § 12:15 | — —No duty to warn of conditions over which<br>landlord lacks control               |

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 12:16 — —Landlord’s duty to inspect and repair
- § 12:17 — — —Duty to inspect based on statute or contract
- § 12:18 — — — —Statutory duty to inspect for design or structural defect
- § 12:19 — — — —Contractual right to reenter and make repairs may create liability for design or structural defects
- § 12:20 — —Landlord’s duty based on acts of third parties
- § 12:21 — —Landlord’s duty to provide security against crime
- § 12:22 — — —Basis of landlord’s liability, generally
- § 12:23 — — —“Foreseeable risk of harm” must exist
- § 12:24 — — — —Known criminal activity may establish foreseeable risk of harm
- § 12:25 — — — —Past identical incidents not necessary
- § 12:26 — — — —Establishing landlord as “cause” of criminal activity
- § 12:27 — — — —Failure to provide outer-doors locks
- § 12:28 — — — —Proof of perpetrator’s means of access to building
- § 12:29 — — — —“Special relationship” may impose duty on landlord for injuries by intruders
- § 12:30 — — — —Public entities’ liability for criminal acts
- § 12:31 — —Liability for tenant’s misconduct
- § 12:32 — — —Grounds for eviction
- § 12:33 — — — —Isolated instances of misconduct may be insufficient
- § 12:34 — — —Lessor’s liability for tenant’s misconduct
- § 12:35 — — — —Landlord may evict tenant engaging in criminal conduct
- § 12:36 — —Duty to repair sidewalk when directed by New York City
- § 12:37 — — —“Special Use”
- § 12:38 —Landlord’s assumption of duty of care
- § 12:39 —Breach of duty of care
- § 12:40 —Foreseeability
- § 12:41 — —“Notice”
- § 12:42 — — —Actual notice
- § 12:43 — — —Constructive notice
- § 12:44 — — —“Foreseeability,” defined
- § 12:45 — — —Invitees or licensees
- § 12:46 — — —Trespassers
- § 12:47 — —Duty to prevent foreseeable acts is nondelegable
- § 12:48 — — —Examples: injuries foreseeable
- § 12:49 — — —Examples: injuries not foreseeable
- § 12:50 —Causation, generally



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 12:51 — — “Proximate cause,” defined
- § 12:52 — — Establishing proximate cause
- § 12:53 — — — Examples: proximate cause found

### III. LIABILITY BASED ON STATUTE OR REGULATION

- § 12:54 Statutory liability
- § 12:55 — Compliance requirements
- § 12:56 — Multiple Dwelling Law (“MDL”)
- § 12:57 — — “Reasonably safe condition,” defined
- § 12:58 — — Nondelegable nature of duty
- § 12:59 — — Notice required
- § 12:60 — — “Owner,” defined
- § 12:61 — — Examples: MDL requirements
- § 12:62 — — — Interior lighting
- § 12:63 — — — Exterior lighting
- § 12:64 — — — Door locks
- § 12:65 — — — Intercom systems
- § 12:66 — — — Smoke detectors
- § 12:67 — — — Sidewalk maintenance
- § 12:68 — — Common-law duty survives regardless of compliance with MDL
- § 12:69 — Warranty of habitability: N.Y. Real Prop. Law § 235-b, generally
- § 12:70 — — Property-damage recovery under N.Y. Real Prop. Law § 235-b, generally
- § 12:71 — — Common-law indemnification
- § 12:72 Lead-poisoning hazards
- § 12:73 — Federal law
- § 12:74 — — Drinking water
- § 12:75 — — “Lead-based paint”
- § 12:76 — Disclosures relating to lead-based paint
- § 12:77 — — “Target housing,” defined
- § 12:78 — — “Lead Warning Statement”
- § 12:79 — — — Content of the “Lead Warning Statement”
- § 12:80 — — Violation of disclosure statute
- § 12:81 — Scope of federal law
- § 12:82 — — State law
- § 12:83 — — — “Conditions conducive to lead poisoning,” defined
- § 12:84 — — — “Lead paint,” defined
- § 12:85 — — — “Lead pipes,” defined
- § 12:86 — — — Penalties for failing to abate “conditions conducive to lead poisoning”

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 12:87 —New York City Childhood Lead Poisoning Prevention Act of 2003
- § 12:88 — —“Lead-based paint,” defined
- § 12:89 — —“Lead-based paint hazard,” defined
- § 12:90 — —Owner’s duty to correct
- § 12:91 — —Waiver of statutory benefit is void
- § 12:92 Asbestos
- § 12:93 — —“Asbestos containing material,” defined
- § 12:94 — —“Friable,” defined
- § 12:95 —Federal law
- § 12:96 —State law
- § 12:97 —City Law: Local Law 76
- § 12:98 — —Standard lease provisions may be unenforceable
- § 12:99 —Penalties
- § 12:100 Snow removal required by statute
- § 12:101 —Snow-removal requirements: New York City
- § 12:102 —Counties must remove snow from public roads
- § 12:103 —Snow removal on property abutting state highway

### IV. STRICT LIABILITY

- § 12:104 Generally
- § 12:105 —Leakage of petroleum products
- § 12:106 — —Example: leakage from underground gasoline-storage tanks
- § 12:107 —Fire-related protections
- § 12:108 — —Fire-safety notices: New York City
- § 12:109 —Labor Law §§ 240, 241
- § 12:110 — —Exception: single and two-family homes
- § 12:111 — — —Exception inapplicable to investor/landlords
- § 12:112 —Window guards: New York City
- § 12:113 — —Child must be resident of apartment unit
- § 12:114 — —Annual notice must be given to tenants; tenant cooperation is required
- § 12:115 — —Penalties for violation: New York State

### V. CONTRACTUAL LIABILITY

- § 12:116 Liability based on lease or contract, generally
- § 12:117 —Landlord agrees to make repairs or maintain premises
- § 12:118 —Right of reentry may not impose liability to repair or maintain
- § 12:119 —Lack of privity does not foreclose liability
- § 12:120 —Exculpatory agreements and clauses, generally

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 12:121 Exception: exculpatory clauses are enforceable in “arm’s-length” transactions
- § 12:122 Liability based on lease or contract, generally—  
General Obligations Law (“GOL”) precludes waiver of liability
- § 12:123 — —Rule applies only to leases
- § 12:124 — — —Liability limitations must be clear and unambiguous
- § 12:125 — —Exculpatory clauses construed narrowly
- § 12:126 — — —Ambiguities construed against drafter

## VI. ENVIRONMENTAL LIABILITY

- § 12:127 Liability for environmental hazards
- § 12:128 —Federal legislation
- § 12:129 — —Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act of 1980 (“CERCLA”)
- § 12:130 — — —Applicability of CERCLA
- § 12:131 — — —Strict liability under CERCLA
- § 12:132 — — — —Owner and tenant jointly liable
- § 12:133 — — — —Former owners may retain liability
- § 12:134 — — —Penalties
- § 12:135 — —Solid Waste Disposal Act
- § 12:136 — — —“Hazardous substances,” defined
- § 12:137 — — —Strict liability
- § 12:138 — — — —Subsequent owners may be liable
- § 12:139 — —Air Pollution Prevention and Control Act (“Clean Air Act”)
- § 12:140 — — —“Hazardous air pollutants”
- § 12:141 — — —Strict liability under Clean Air Act
- § 12:142 — —Water Pollution Control Act (“Clean Water Act”)
- § 12:143 — — —“Discharge of pollutant,” defined
- § 12:144 — — —Liability under Clean Water Act, generally
- § 12:145 — — — —Strict liability
- § 12:146 — — — —Penalties
- § 12:147 —State legislation
- § 12:148 — —Navigation Law § 181
- § 12:149 — — —Strict liability
- § 12:150 — — —Retroactive application
- § 12:151 — — —Parties liable
- § 12:152 — — — —Example: tenant liable
- § 12:153 — — — —Example: oil broker may be liable
- § 12:154 — — — —Example: owner of delivery truck liable
- § 12:155 — —Environmental Conservation Law

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 12:156 — — —Issues regulated
- § 12:157 — — —Penalties for violation of statute
- § 12:158 —Legislation affecting cities and specific regions
- § 12:159 —Theories of private recovery for environmental contamination
- § 12:160 — —Nuisance
- § 12:161 — —Trespass
- § 12:162 — — —Distinction between nuisance and trespass
- § 12:163 — — —Nuisance and trespass actions maintainable by occupant
- § 12:164 — — —Parties liable for trespass and nuisance
- § 12:165 — — —Three-year statute of limitations
- § 12:166 — —Waste
- § 12:167 — —Negligence *per se*
- § 12:168 — —“Fraudulent concealment”
- § 12:169 — — —Duty to disclose environmental hazards
- § 12:170 — — —Dangerousness of condition is question of fact
- § 12:171 — — —Chain of title irrelevant
- § 12:172 — — —Statute of limitations for recovery from prior owner for environmental contamination
- § 12:173 — — —“*Caveat Emptor*”

## VII. TERMINATING LIABILITY

- § 12:174 Conveyance of title
- § 12:175 —Disclosure law governs properties with four dwellings or less
- § 12:176 —Duration of liability
- § 12:177 — —“Reasonable time,” defined
- § 12:178 — —Exception: failure to disclose unreasonable risks
- § 12:179 — —Exception: environmental liability
- § 12:180 — —Transfer of possession
- § 12:181 — — —Residential and commercial premises distinguished
- § 12:182 —Federal law also requires property condition disclosures
- § 12:183 — —ILSFDA’s applicability
- § 12:184 — —ILSFDA’s requirements and prohibitions
- § 12:185 — —ILSFDA liability
- § 12:186 — —Establishing an ILSFDA violation
- § 12:187 —Carbon-monoxide detectors

## VIII. IMMUNITIES

- § 12:188 Immunity from liability

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|                 |  |
|-----------------|--|
| § 12:189        | —Government immunity   |
| § 12:190        | — —State’s immunity waived by statute  |
| § 12:191        | — —Immunity waived by “special relationship”   |
| § 12:192        | — —State’s liability for “dangerous condition”   |
| § 12:193        | —Recreational-use immunity; N.Y. Gen. Oblig. Law<br>§ 9-103  |
| § 12:194        | — —Standard of care  |
| § 12:195        | — —No obligation to inspect  |
| § 12:196        | — —No duty to warn   |
| § 12:197        | — —Property suited for particular recreational<br>activity   |
| § 12:198        | — — —Activities encompassed  |
| § 12:199        | — —Actual or constructive notice of dangerous<br>condition   |
| § 12:200        | — —Risks inherent in certain activities  |
| § 12:201        | — —Injured party’s status irrelevant   |
| § 12:202        | — —“Gross negligence” excluded   |
| § 12:203        | —Police and firefighters: the “fireman’s rule”   |
| § 12:204        | — —Application   |
| § 12:205        | — —Statutory exceptions  |
| § 12:206        | — —Chapter 703 abolished the “fireman’s rule”  |
| § 12:207        | — —Expansion of the strict liability statutory<br>causes of action   |
| § 12:208        | —Statutory immunity for failure to disclose that<br>owner or former occupant infected with AIDS virus  |
| § 12:209        | —Statutory immunity for failure to disclose that<br>property was location of homicide, suicide, death,<br>or any crime constituting a felony |
| APPENDIX 12-1.  | EPA Lead Hazard Information Pamphlet   |
| APPENDIX 12-2.  | Lead-Based Paint Hazard Lease Rider  |
| APPENDIX 12-3.  | Lead-Based Disclosure Form   |
| APPENDIX 12-4.  | Fire Safety Plan   |
| APPENDIX 12-5.  | Guard Lease Rider  |
| APPENDIX 12-6.  | Property Condition Disclosure Statement  |
| APPENDIX 12-7.  | Electronic Lease Offer   |
| APPENDIX 12-8.  | Renewal Lease Form   |
| APPENDIX 12-9.  | Lease/Commencement of Occupancy<br>Notice for Indoor Allergen Hazards  |
| APPENDIX 12-10. | Flood History and Risk Lease Rider/Notice<br>to Residential Tenants  |
| APPENDIX 12-11. | Procedure for Tenants Regarding<br>Suspected Gas Leaks   |

LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

APPENDIX 12-12. Notice Disclosing Tenants' Rights to  
Reasonable Accommodations for Persons  
With Disabilities

# Table of Contents

## CHAPTER 13. TERMINATING THE TENANCY

### I. OVERVIEW

- § 13:1 Power of termination
- § 13:2 —Lease-forfeiture provisions, generally
- § 13:3 — —Termination for breach of a “substantial obligation” of the tenancy
- § 13:4 — —Conditional limitations
- § 13:5 — — —Rent-related defaults
- § 13:6 —Rent-regulated tenancies, generally
- § 13:7 Self-help prohibited for removal of tenants

### II. WHO MAY TERMINATE THE TENANCY

- § 13:8 Landlord or tenant, generally
- § 13:9 Authorized attorneys and agents
- § 13:10 —Compare: no prior dealings
- § 13:11 Officers and other officials

### III. PROCEDURE FOR TERMINATION

- § 13:12 Procedure for termination, generally
- § 13:13 Notice to cure, generally
- § 13:14 —Rent-regulated tenancies
- § 13:15 — —ETPA tenants: notice to cure may be combined with termination notice
- § 13:16 — —ETPA tenants: when notice to cure is not required
- § 13:17 — —“Loft” tenants
- § 13:18 Notice of termination, generally
- § 13:19 —Content of notice
- § 13:20 —Notices terminating rent-regulated tenancies
- § 13:21 — —New York City “Loft” tenants
- § 13:22 Notice of non-renewal: rent regulation
- § 13:23 —ETPA tenants: timing of notice
- § 13:24 —New York City rent-stabilized tenants: timing of notice
- § 13:25 DHCR filing
- § 13:26 —ETPA tenants
- § 13:27 —Rent-controlled tenants

- § 13:28 Service
- § 13:29 DHCR certificate of eviction is required

#### **IV. TERMINATING TENANCIES-AT-WILL OR AT-SUFFERANCE**

- § 13:30 Tenancies-at-will and at-sufferance distinguished
- § 13:31 —Tenancies-at-will
- § 13:32 —Tenancies-at-sufferance
- § 13:33 Termination procedure: service
- § 13:34 Content of notice

#### **V. TERMINATING MONTH-TO-MONTH TENANCIES**

- § 13:35 “Month-to-month” tenancy, defined
- § 13:36 Termination procedures within New York City
- § 13:37 —Content of notice
- § 13:38 —Service
- § 13:39 Termination procedures outside New York City

#### **VI. TERMINATION FOR VIOLATION OF A “SUBSTANTIAL OBLIGATION” OF THE TENANCY**

- § 13:40 Violation of “substantial obligation,” introduction
- § 13:41 —Express and implied substantial obligations
- § 13:42 Examples of “substantial obligations”
- § 13:43 —Covenant to provide access
- § 13:44 —Covenant restricting alterations
- § 13:45 — — “Structural” versus “non-structural” alterations
- § 13:46 — — —Examples of “structural” modifications
- § 13:47 — — —Examples of “non-structural” modifications
- § 13:48 — — —Test utilized to ascertain difference
- § 13:49 — —Satellite dishes
- § 13:50 —Covenant to provide landlord with duplicate key
- § 13:51 —Covenant not to maintain pets
- § 13:52 — —Exception: emotional-support animals
- § 13:53 — —Exception: “elderly” tenants in federal housing
- § 13:54 —Covenant to pay rent
- § 13:55 —Covenant to furnish landlord with security deposit
- § 13:56 —Covenant not to sublet or assign
- § 13:57 —Covenant to use and occupy premises for specified purposes
- § 13:58 — —Use clauses, generally
- § 13:59 — —Home occupations: New York City



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 13:60 — — — Permitted home occupations
- § 13:61 — — — Prohibited home occupations
- § 13:62 — — — Other occupancy restrictions: occupancy limitations
- § 13:63 — Covenant not to install washing machine
- § 13:64 — Premises rendered “wholly unusable”
- § 13:65 Rent-regulated tenants: procedure
- § 13:66 — ETPA tenants
- § 13:67 — — Loft tenants
- § 13:68 — New York City rent-stabilized tenants
- § 13:69 — — Illegal subletting
- § 13:70 — Rent-controlled tenants
- § 13:71 Manufactured-home park tenants

## **VII. TERMINATION FOR IMMORAL OR ILLEGAL USE OR OCCUPANCY**

- § 13:72 Immoral or illegal use or occupancy, introduction
- § 13:73 Examples of illegal or immoral use
- § 13:74 — Drug sales
- § 13:75 — Illegal manufacturing
- § 13:76 — Profiteering
- § 13:77 — Prostitution
- § 13:78 — “Sex club”
- § 13:79 Other tenants and enforcement agencies may initiate eviction procedure
- § 13:80 — Lease agreements for premises used or occupied for illegal purposes are void
- § 13:81 — Evidence
- § 13:82 — Procedure
- § 13:83 — — ETPA tenants
- § 13:84 — — New York City rent-stabilized tenants
- § 13:85 — — Rent-controlled tenants
- § 13:86 — Subsidized-housing tenants

## **VIII. TERMINATION FOR NUISANCE OR OBJECTIONABLE CONDUCT**

- § 13:87 “Nuisance,” defined
- § 13:88 Examples of nuisance
- § 13:89 — Exercising the conditional limitation for rent-related defaults, generally
- § 13:90 — — Chronic nonpayment of rent: residential context
- § 13:91 — Health or fire hazards
- § 13:92 — Illegal drug use and sales
- § 13:93 — Egregious conduct

- § 13:94 —Odor
- § 13:95 —Pets
- § 13:96 — —Dangerous or “wild” animals: New York City
- § 13:97 — —“Dangerous dogs”: New York City
- § 13:98 — —“Dangerous dogs”: New York State
- § 13:99 — —Compare: harboring of cats
- § 13:100 —Property damage
- § 13:101 Procedure for termination: rent-regulated tenants
- § 13:102 —ETPA tenants
- § 13:103 —New York City rent-stabilized tenants
- § 13:104 —Rent-controlled tenants

## **IX. ADDITIONAL GROUNDS FOR REMOVING RENT-REGULATED TENANTS**

- § 13:105 Owner occupancy
- § 13:106 —ETPA units
- § 13:107 — —Exemption for senior citizens, the disabled, and long-term tenants
- § 13:108 — —Non-purchasing tenants under “eviction plan”
- § 13:109 — —Procedure
- § 13:110 — — —Maximum two units may be recovered
- § 13:111 —New York City rent-stabilized units
- § 13:112 — —Exemption for non-purchasing tenants in “non-eviction” conversion plans
- § 13:113 — —Exemption for senior citizens and the disabled
- § 13:114 — —Procedure
- § 13:115 —Rent-controlled units
- § 13:116 — —Exemption for senior citizens, long-term tenants, and the “impaired”
- § 13:117 — —Non-purchasing tenant under “eviction” conversion plan
- § 13:118 — —Exemption for senior citizens and disabled tenants
- § 13:119 — —Procedure
- § 13:120 Nonprimary residence
- § 13:121 —Evidentiary standard
- § 13:122 — —Absence of “paper trail” may not be dispositive
- § 13:123 —ETPA tenants
- § 13:124 —New York City rent-stabilized tenants
- § 13:125 —Rent-controlled tenants
- § 13:126 — —Compare: nonprimary residence: New York City
- § 13:127 Refusal to renew lease
- § 13:128 —ETPA and New York City rent-stabilized tenants
- § 13:129 —Rent-controlled tenants

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 13:130 | Recovery by non-profit institution     |
| § 13:131 | —ETPA tenants                          |
| § 13:132 | —New York City rent-stabilized tenants |
| § 13:133 | — —Procedure                           |
| § 13:134 | —Rent-controlled units                 |
| § 13:135 | Demolition                             |
| § 13:136 | —Rent-stabilized tenants               |
| § 13:137 | —Rent-controlled tenants               |
| § 13:138 | Withdrawal of unit from rental market  |
| § 13:139 | —ETPA units                            |
| § 13:140 | —New York City rent-stabilized units   |
| § 13:141 | —Rent-controlled units                 |
| § 13:142 | Refusal to permit access to landlord   |
| § 13:143 | —ETPA tenants                          |
| § 13:144 | —New York City rent-stabilized tenants |
| § 13:145 | —Rent-controlled tenants               |

## **X. DESTRUCTION OF THE PREMISES**

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 13:146 | Impact of destruction, generally                |
| § 13:147 | Procedure                                       |
| § 13:148 | Lease agreements may vary statutory protections |

## **XI. TERMINATION FOR WASTE**

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 13:149 | Waste, generally                               |
| § 13:150 | Violation of lease provision prohibiting waste |
| § 13:151 | Compensatory damages and forfeiture            |
| § 13:152 | —Procedure for termination                     |
| § 13:153 | Evidence of waste                              |

## **XII. TERMINATION OF A RESIDENTIAL LEASE BY SENIOR CITIZENS ENTERING CERTAIN HEALTH OR ADULT CARE FACILITIES OR HOUSING PROJECTS**

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 13:154 | Senior citizens may terminate their leases |
| § 13:155 | Procedure for termination                  |
| § 13:156 | Penalties for a landlord's interference    |
| § 13:157 | Statute's protections may not be waived    |

## **XIII. TERMINATION BY TENANT ENTERING MILITARY SERVICE**

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 13:158 | Tenant entering military service may terminate lease |
|----------|--|

- § 13:159 Scope of statute's protection
- § 13:160 Procedure for termination
- § 13:161 Tenant's rent liability upon exercise of termination option
- § 13:162 Landlord's remedies
- § 13:163 Penalties for a landlord's interference

#### **XIV. TERMINATION OF NON-TENANT OCCUPANTS**

- § 13:164 Procedure for termination of non-tenant occupants
- § 13:165 Content of notice to quit
- § 13:166 —Compare: notice must set forth termination date
- § 13:167 —Compare: notice must set forth ground and facts in support thereof
- § 13:168 —Compare: alternative theories of recovery
- § 13:169 Service of notice to quit

APPENDIX 13-1. Civil Court Directives, Assignment of "Drug Cases," Civil Court of the City of New York (10/19/89)

APPENDIX 13-2. Civil Court Directive, Access Orders, Civil Court of the City of New York (10/17/89)

### **CHAPTER 14. NONPAYMENT PROCEEDINGS**

#### **I. OVERVIEW**

- § 14:1 Historical perspective
- § 14:2 —Common-law antecedents
- § 14:3 —Summary remedy
- § 14:4 —Current state of nonpayment proceeding
- § 14:5 Introductory considerations
- § 14:6 —Curable nature of rent defaults
- § 14:7 — —Lease must expressly permit exercise of conditional limitation for rent defaults
- § 14:8 — —Exercise of conditional limitation for rent-related defaults is enforceable in commercial cases but usually not in residential context
- § 14:9 —Rent tender made by third party may be rejected
- § 14:10 —Absence of lease or other rental agreement, generally
- § 14:11 Jurisdiction
- § 14:12 Venue
- § 14:13 —New York City

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 14:14 —Outside New York City

## II. RENT DEMANDS

- § 14:15 Whether characterized as “condition precedent” or “jurisdictional requisite,” rent demand is critical to a proceeding’s maintenance
- § 14:16 Oral rent demand
- § 14:17 —Lease may prohibit oral demand
- § 14:18 Written rent demand
- § 14:19 —When made
- § 14:20 —By whom signed
- § 14:21 — —Attorneys as “debt collectors”
- § 14:22 — —FDCPA’s impact on summary proceedings
- § 14:23 — —Potential liability under Federal Fair Debt Collection Practices Act (“FDCPA”)
- § 14:24 — — —Determining whether attorney is “debt collector” under FDCPA
- § 14:25 — — —Exception for legal remedies
- § 14:26 — — —Determining whether attorney is “debt collector” under FDCPA—Application of FDCPA to landlord-tenant matters
- § 14:27 — — —Protects “consumers” only
- § 14:28 — — —“Debts” covered by FDCPA
- § 14:29 — — — —Rental arrears fall within FDCPA’s definition of “debt”
- § 14:30 — — — —Dishonored checks
- § 14:31 — — — —Business debts excluded from FDCPA’s ambit
- § 14:32 — — — —Amount of potential damages
- § 14:33 — — — —Avoiding noncompliance with the FDCPA
- § 14:34 — — — —Content of communications
- § 14:35 — — — —Thirty day dispute-validation period
- § 14:36 — — — —Defining “initial communication”
- § 14:37 — — — —Standard for determining whether communication violates FDCPA
- § 14:38 — — — —Timing of communications
- § 14:39 — — — —Place of communications
- § 14:40 — — — —Governing statute of limitations
- § 14:41 — —Potential liability under New York’s consumer protection statute
- § 14:42 — —Compare: absence of handwritten signature
- § 14:43 —Statutory minimum written notice
- § 14:44 —Lease may expand statutory notice period
- § 14:45 — —Standard “default” provisions may not apply

- § 14:46 — —Standard “Bills and Notices” provision may not apply
- § 14:47 Month-to-month tenants
- § 14:48 Written rent demand—Service
- § 14:49 Sufficiency of demand
- § 14:50 —Compare: whether absence of precision results in dismissal
- § 14:51 —Compare: whether absence of specific payment date results in dismissal
- § 14:52 —What demand may include
- § 14:53 —What demand may not include
- § 14:54 Defects in rent demand may be uncorrectable
- § 14:55 Length of time rent demand is effective
- § 14:56 Service requisites for written rent demand

### **III. OTHER PREDICATE NOTICES OR PROCEDURES**

- § 14:57 Notice of claim against government and municipal tenants
- § 14:58 —Time requirements for notice
- § 14:59 — —County tenants
- § 14:60 — —Municipal tenants: New York City
- § 14:61 — —Municipal tenants: other cities
- § 14:62 — —Town tenants
- § 14:63 — —Village tenants
- § 14:64 Federally subsidized tenants
- § 14:65 Certification procedure for New York City “Section 8” tenants
- § 14:66 —Subsidized share of rent unpaid
- § 14:67 —Tenant’s share of unpaid rent

### **IV. NOTICE OF PETITION**

- § 14:68 Overview
- § 14:69 Who may issue Notice of Petition
- § 14:70 —Special rule in New York City Civil Court
- § 14:71 —Commencement by Order to Show Cause
- § 14:72 Form of Notice of Petition
- § 14:73 —Quality, size, legibility, and language
- § 14:74 —Caption
- § 14:75 —Parties
- § 14:76 — —Petitioner
- § 14:77 — —Agent or attorney
- § 14:78 — —Person holding power of attorney
- § 14:79 — —Condominium board of managers

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 14:80  | — — Respondents  |
| § 14:81  | — — — Tenant’s estate  |
| § 14:82  | — — — Guarantors   |
| § 14:83  | — — — “Section 8” tenants: New York City   |
| § 14:84  | — — — Subtenants   |
| § 14:85  | — — — Compare: known respondent identified by<br>fictitious name                 |
| § 14:86  | Content of Notice of Petition  |
| § 14:87  | — Jurisdictions applying N.Y. Real Property Actions<br>and Proceedings Law § 732 |
| § 14:88  | — — Import of respondent’s nonappearance   |
| § 14:89  | — — Timing of answer   |
| § 14:90  | — — Place to answer  |
| § 14:91  | — — — New York City Civil Court  |
| § 14:92  | — — Relief sought by landlord  |
| § 14:93  | — — — Additional notice requirements: New York<br>City                           |
| § 14:94  | — Jurisdictions applying N.Y. Real Property Actions<br>and Proceedings Law § 731 |
| § 14:95  | — — Place of hearing   |
| § 14:96  | — — Hearing date and time  |
| § 14:97  | — — Advise of preclusive impact  |
| § 14:98  | — — Relief sought  |
| § 14:99  | — Official Notice of Petition forms satisfy statutory<br>requirements            |
| § 14:100 | — — Compare: form may waive “no counterclaim”<br>lease clause                    |
| § 14:101 | — — Military-service notice  |

## V. PETITION

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 14:102 | Overview  |
| § 14:103 | Form of Petition  |
| § 14:104 | — Quality, size, legibility, and language                                     |
| § 14:105 | — Caption   |
| § 14:106 | — Parties   |
| § 14:107 | — Attorney’s endorsement  |
| § 14:108 | Content of Petition   |
| § 14:109 | — Statement of the petitioner’s interest                                      |
| § 14:110 | — — Detailed factual recitation of ownership is not<br>required               |
| § 14:111 | — — Corporate petitioner  |
| § 14:112 | — — — Foreign corporations  |
| § 14:113 | — — — — Nature and extent of foreign entity’s state<br>contact is dispositive |
| § 14:114 | — Statement of respondent’s interest  |

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 14:115 — — Compare: whether Petition must recite dates of  
lease’s execution, commencement, and expiration
- § 14:116 — — Necessary parties
- § 14:117 — — Corporate respondent
- § 14:118 — — Municipal or governmental respondent
- § 14:119 — — Unknown tenants, undertenants, or occupants
- § 14:120 — Description of premises
- § 14:121 — — Apartment number required
- § 14:122 — — Premises may be described on map or plan  
attached to Petition
- § 14:123 — — Description should be complete
- § 14:124 — Facts upon which proceeding is predicated
- § 14:125 — — Specifics relating to rent default
- § 14:126 — — — Specifics relating to rent demand
- § 14:127 — — — Specifics related to notice’s issuance and  
service
- § 14:128 — — Sample statements
- § 14:129 — Multiple-dwelling registration statement for  
premises located within New York City
- § 14:130 — — What Petition must allege
- § 14:131 — — — *De facto* multiple-dwellings
- § 14:132 — — — Other *de facto* multiple-dwellings: lofts
- § 14:133 — — — “Owner obligations” under the Loft Law
- § 14:134 — — Failure to attach registration receipt
- § 14:135 — — Authorization may be required to secure  
certified copy of registration statement
- § 14:136 — Statement of rent-regulatory status
- § 14:137 — — Subsidized housing
- § 14:138 — — — New York City “Section 8” tenants
- § 14:139 — — — Petition should include certification  
statement
- § 14:140 — — — Attachments may substitute for  
certification statement
- § 14:141 — — Sample statements of rent regulation’s  
applicability or exemption: New York City
- § 14:142 — — — Commercial premises
- § 14:143 — — — Condominium unit occupied by unregulated  
tenant
- § 14:144 — — — Cooperative unit occupied by unregulated  
tenant
- § 14:145 — — — Rent-controlled unit
- § 14:146 — — — Rent-stabilized unit
- § 14:147 — — — Two-family home
- § 14:148 — Relief sought
- § 14:149 Verification



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 14:150 —Form of verification
- § 14:151 —Who may verify
- § 14:152 —Corporate petitioner
- § 14:153 —Partnership petitioner
- § 14:154 —Government petitioner
- § 14:155 —When attorney may verify

## VI. SERVICE OF PROCESS

- § 14:156 Overview
- § 14:157 Lease may not limit statutory requirements
- § 14:158 Who may serve process
  - § 14:159 —Record-keeping requirements
  - § 14:160 —Licensing requirement: New York City
  - § 14:161 — —Compare: consequences of process server's inability to present license or other records
- § 14:162 Who must be served
- § 14:163 Timing of service efforts: Notice of Petition and Petition
- § 14:164 Methods of service
  - § 14:165 —Personal service
    - § 14:166 — —Where personal service may be made
    - § 14:167 — —Corporate respondent
      - § 14:168 — — —Secretary of State
      - § 14:169 — — —Corporate employee
    - § 14:170 — —Partnership respondent
    - § 14:171 — —Government respondent
    - § 14:172 — —Incarcerated respondent
    - § 14:173 — —Military personnel
    - § 14:174 — —When personal service is complete
  - § 14:175 —Substituted service
    - § 14:176 — —Suitable age and discretion requirement
      - § 14:177 — — —Service upon minors
      - § 14:178 — — —Respondent's employees
        - § 14:179 — — — —Compare: delivery to tenant's subtenant
      - § 14:180 — — —Landlord's (or building) employees
      - § 14:181 — — —Respondent's neighbors and guests
    - § 14:182 — —Substituted service must be made at the premises
      - § 14:183 — — —Mailing requirement
      - § 14:184 — — —When service is complete
    - § 14:185 —Conspicuous-place service
      - § 14:186 — —"Reasonable application" standard
    - § 14:187 — —Residential respondents
      - § 14:188 — — —Attempts made on weekends and prior to normal work hours

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 14:189 — — — —Attempts made during regular business hours
- § 14:190 — — — —Attempts made during normal rest hours
- § 14:191 — — — —Attempts made on Sundays, religious holidays and days of observance
- § 14:192 — — — —Where attempts should be made in respondent's absence: when whereabouts are known
- § 14:193 — — — —Where attempts should be made in respondent's absence: when whereabouts are unknown
- § 14:194 — — — —Commercial tenants
- § 14:195 — — — —During business hours
- § 14:196 — — — —Where attempts should be made in respondent's absence: when whereabouts are known
- § 14:197 — — — —Where attempts should be made in respondent's absence: when whereabouts are unknown
- § 14:198 — — — —Mailing requirement
- § 14:199 — — — —Presumption of regularity and receipt
- § 14:200 — — — —When conspicuous-place service is complete
- § 14:201 Mailing requirement
- § 14:202 —Individual respondent
- § 14:203 —Business respondent
- § 14:204 —Use of the full and complete address (including ZIP Code) is suggested
- § 14:205 —Presumption of regularity and receipt
- § 14:206 Filing proof of service
- § 14:207 —When to file
- § 14:208 —What to file
- § 14:209 —Filing defects
- § 14:210 —Late filings
- § 14:211 —Compare: delivery to judge
- § 14:212 New York City Civil Court "postcard requirement:" residential cases only
- § 14:213 —Content of postcard
- § 14:214 —Sanction for noncompliance

## VII. ANSWER

- § 14:215 Overview
- § 14:216 Who may answer
- § 14:217 Timing of answer
- § 14:218 —Where N.Y. Real Property Actions and Proceedings Law § 732 is applicable

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 14:219 | —When N.Y. Real Property Actions and Proceedings<br>Law § 732 is not applicable  |
| § 14:220 | Form of Answer   |
| § 14:221 | —Oral  |
| § 14:222 | —Written   |
| § 14:223 | — —Quality, size, legibility, and language                                       |
| § 14:224 | — —Caption   |
| § 14:225 | — —Service and filing  |
| § 14:226 | Content of Answer  |
| § 14:227 | —Denials   |
| § 14:228 | —Defenses  |
| § 14:229 | —Counterclaims   |
| § 14:230 | — —Exception for “inextricably related”<br>counterclaims                         |
| § 14:231 | — — —Attorney’s fees   |
| § 14:232 | — — —Rent overcharge   |
| § 14:233 | — — —Prior claim pending   |
| § 14:234 | — — —Security-deposit disputes   |
| § 14:235 | — — —Warranty of habitability  |
| § 14:236 | — —Severance of unrelated counterclaims  |
| § 14:237 | — — —Violations of state and Federal Fair Credit<br>Reporting Acts               |
| § 14:238 | — —Exception for “compulsory counterclaims”                                      |
| § 14:239 | —Verification  |
| § 14:240 | —Jury demand   |
| § 14:241 | — —When demand must be made  |
| § 14:242 | — —Jury waivers  |
| § 14:243 | — — —By lease agreement  |
| § 14:244 | — — —By interposing equitable claims or defenses                                 |
| § 14:245 | Failure to answer: effect and consequences                                       |
| § 14:246 | —Where N.Y. Real Property Actions and<br>Proceedings Law § 732 is applicable     |
| § 14:247 | — —Judicially imposed protections have not been<br>sanctioned                    |
| § 14:248 | —Where N.Y. Real Property Actions and<br>Proceedings Law § 732 is not applicable |
| § 14:249 | —Vacating a default  |
| § 14:250 | — —Requisite elements  |
| § 14:251 | — — —Excusable default   |
| § 14:252 | — — —Meritorious defense   |
| § 14:253 | —Filing of non-military affidavit  |
| § 14:254 | — —Recitation of factual particulars is suggested                                |
| § 14:255 | — —Sanctions may ensue for irregularities  |

## VIII. TENANT DEFENSES TO THE NONPAYMENT PROCEEDING

- § 14:256 Court lacks “subject matter” jurisdiction over proceeding
- § 14:257 —Defective predicate notices, generally
- § 14:258 Court lacks *in personam* jurisdiction over respondent
- § 14:259 —Objection must be detailed and specific
- § 14:260 —Traverse hearings
- § 14:261 — — —Testimony of process server in New York City
- § 14:262 — — —Compare: consequences of process server’s inability to produce license or other records
- § 14:263 — — —Affidavit of service
- § 14:264 —Waiver of service-related objections
- § 14:265 Other “jurisdictional” objections: pleading-related defects
- § 14:266 —Notice of Petition defects
- § 14:267 —Defects in Notice of Petition—Clerk’s endorsement
- § 14:268 — — —Compare: Notice of Petition issued by attorney or landlord
- § 14:269 — — —Hearing date and time
- § 14:270 — — —Misleading Notice of Petition
- § 14:271 — — —Court name and venue omitted
- § 14:272 — — —Misstatement as to party’s name or status
- § 14:273 —Petition defects
- § 14:274 — —Caption defects
- § 14:275 — — —Misstatement as to party’s name or status
- § 14:276 — — —Compare: petitioner not identified as agent
- § 14:277 — — —Compare: known respondent identified by fictitious name
- § 14:278 — — —Defects as to parties’ interests
- § 14:279 — — —Proper petitioners
- § 14:280 — — —Improper petitioners
- § 14:281 — — — —Agent or attorney
- § 14:282 — — — —Person holding power of attorney
- § 14:283 — — — —Compare: whether irregularity will serve to vacate a default
- § 14:284 — — — —Assignee of rents
- § 14:285 — — — —Condominium board of managers
- § 14:286 — — — —Former receiver
- § 14:287 — — — —Proper respondents
- § 14:288 — — — —Tenant’s estate
- § 14:289 — — — —“Section 8” tenants: New York City
- § 14:290 — — — —Subtenants

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 14:291 | — — —Improper respondents  |
| § 14:292 | — — —Condominium unit owners   |
| § 14:293 | — — —Guarantors  |
| § 14:294 | — — —Month-to-month tenants  |
| § 14:295 | — —Defective description   |
| § 14:296 | — — —Apartment number missing or misidentified   |
| § 14:297 | — — —Description incomplete  |
| § 14:298 | — — —Omission of map or floor plan attached to pleadings   |
| § 14:299 | — — —Absence of square footage and/or percentage allocation of floor space                           |
| § 14:300 | — — —Errors may be amendable   |
| § 14:301 | — —Multiple-dwelling registration statement defects  |
| § 14:302 | — — —Recital errors are amendable  |
| § 14:303 | — — —Registration lapses are correctable   |
| § 14:304 | — — —Lofts and <i>de facto</i> multiple-dwellings  |
| § 14:305 | — — —Failure to register   |
| § 14:306 | — — —Failure to attach registration receipt to pleadings   |
| § 14:307 | — — — —Authorization may be required to secure certified copy  |
| § 14:308 | — — —Errors or omissions in filed registration statement may also be corrected                       |
| § 14:309 | — — —Any irregularity is waivable  |
| § 14:310 | — —Defects in statement of facts upon which proceeding is predicated, generally                      |
| § 14:311 | — — —Specifics of rent default omitted   |
| § 14:312 | — — —Allegation of rent demand omitted   |
| § 14:313 | — — —Specifics related to notice’s issuance and service  |
| § 14:314 | — —Defects in statement of rent-regulatory status  |
| § 14:315 | — — —Compare: whether failure to allege correct rent-regulatory status of premises is “fatal” defect |
| § 14:316 | — — —Subsidized housing  |
| § 14:317 | — — — —New York City “Section 8” tenants   |
| § 14:318 | — —Warranty of habitability  |
| § 14:319 | —Defective verification  |
| § 14:320 | — —Notarial errors   |
| § 14:321 | — —Attorney’s verification   |
| § 14:322 | —Defective rent demand   |
| § 14:323 | — —Sufficiency of demand   |
| § 14:324 | — —Compare: whether “factual specificity” is required  |
| § 14:325 | — —Demand made by wrong party  |

LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 14:326 — —Oral demand must have been made upon  
proper party
- § 14:327 — —Improper service of written demand
- § 14:328 — —Objection may be waived
- § 14:329 Actual eviction
- § 14:330 — —Actual partial eviction
- § 14:331 — —Examples: claim successfully asserted
- § 14:332 — —Examples: claim not successfully asserted
- § 14:333 Constructive eviction
- § 14:334 — —Partial constructive eviction
- § 14:335 — —Examples: claim successfully asserted
- § 14:336 — —Examples: claim not successfully asserted
- § 14:337 — —Defense has limited reach for subtenants
- § 14:338 Certificate of occupancy
- § 14:339 — —When irregularity directly impacts tenant
- § 14:340 — —When irregularity lacks direct impact
- § 14:341 — —When premises are exclusively commercial or are  
not situated within multiple-dwelling
- § 14:342 — —When tenant is complicit
- § 14:343 Discharge in bankruptcy
- § 14:344 *Laches*
- § 14:345 — —Effect
- § 14:346 — —Strict “three month rule” no longer rigidly  
followed
- § 14:347 — —Tenant initially bears burden of proof
- § 14:348 — —Landlord’s excessive delay
- § 14:349 — —Prejudice to tenant
- § 14:350 — —Landlord must then show reasonable excuse for  
delay
- § 14:351 — —Not a defense in commercial disputes
- § 14:352 Harassment
- § 14:353 — —Residential tenant
- § 14:354 — —Commercial tenant
- § 14:355 No landlord-tenant relationship
- § 14:356 — —Lack of contract or agreement
- § 14:357 — —Parties to contract of sale
- § 14:358 — —Tenants-in-common
- § 14:359 — —Debtor-creditor
- § 14:360 — —Mortgagor-mortgagee
- § 14:361 — —Employer-employee
- § 14:362 No multiple-dwelling registration
- § 14:363 Payment of rent demanded
- § 14:364 — —Accord and satisfaction
- § 14:365 — —Proof
- § 14:366 — —Modification of lease agreement: rent reduction

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 14:367 | —Compromise and settlement  |
| § 14:368 | — —Waiver of attorney’s fees  |
| § 14:369 | — —Tenant is entitled to recovery of security deposit when stipulation is silent      |
| § 14:370 | —Rent offered and refused   |
| § 14:371 | Party not in possession   |
| § 14:372 | —Removal prior to proceeding’s commencement   |
| § 14:373 | —Removal after proceeding’s commencement  |
| § 14:374 | —Factual determination  |
| § 14:375 | Unlawful rent   |
| § 14:376 | —Proof  |
| § 14:377 | Violations  |
| § 14:378 | —N.Y. Real Property Actions and Proceedings Law § 755 stay                            |
| § 14:379 | — —Burden of proof  |
| § 14:380 | — —Tenant-caused condition  |
| § 14:381 | — —Rent deposit required  |
| § 14:382 | — —Vacatur  |
| § 14:383 | —Rent abatement: N.Y. Multiple Dwelling Law § 302-a                                   |
| § 14:384 | — —Where applicable   |
| § 14:385 | — —“Rent-impairing violation”   |
| § 14:386 | — —Burden of proof  |
| § 14:387 | — —Rent deposit required  |
| § 14:388 | —“Spiegel” defense: N.Y. Social Services Law § 143-b                                  |
| § 14:389 | Warranty of habitability  |
| § 14:390 | —Waiver void  |
| § 14:391 | —Types of conditions found violative of statute                                       |
| § 14:392 | —Claims of habitability breaches made to DHCR   |
| § 14:393 | —Mitigating factors   |
| § 14:394 | — —Tenant’s misconduct  |
| § 14:395 | — —Strike or labor dispute  |
| § 14:396 | —Available relief: rent reduction or abatement, attorney’s fees, and punitive damages |
| § 14:397 | — —Award may be reduced by prior agency determination                                 |
| § 14:398 | —Defense has limited reach for subtenants   |
| § 14:399 | —Defense is unavailable to sublessors or other tenants not in possession              |
| § 14:400 | —Defense is inapplicable to commercial disputes                                       |
| § 14:401 | —Defense is unavailable to condominium owners   |

## IX. MOTION PRACTICE

|          |          |
|----------|----------|
| § 14:402 | Overview |
|----------|----------|

- § 14:403 Calendar practice
- § 14:404 Motion to dismiss
- § 14:405 Motion for summary judgment
- § 14:406 Judicial estoppel
- § 14:407 Disclosure
- § 14:408 —“Ample need” requirement, generally
- § 14:409 —“Ample need” in nonpayment proceedings
- § 14:410 —Presumption in favor of discovery in economic-infeasibility cases
- § 14:411 —Exceptions
- § 14:412 — —Notice to admit
- § 14:413 — —Notice to produce
- § 14:414 —Possessory judgment may ensue for disclosure noncompliance
- § 14:415 Bill of particulars
- § 14:416 —Compare: “ample need”
- § 14:417 Failure to oppose a motion, generally

## **X. STIPULATIONS**

- § 14:418 Overview
- § 14:419 Procedure
- § 14:420 Form of stipulation
- § 14:421 Essential elements
- § 14:422 —Statement of rent due
- § 14:423 —Rental arrears payment schedule
- § 14:424 —Repair obligations
- § 14:425 — —If repairs unnecessary
- § 14:426 —Remedy for default
- § 14:427 — —Restoration of case to court calendar
- § 14:428 — —Issuance of final judgment
- § 14:429 — — —Consent judgment is not appealable
- § 14:430 — —Attorney’s fees
- § 14:431 — —Termination of proceeding
- § 14:432 Presumption that agreement is understood and accepted once signed
- § 14:433 Enforcement of stipulations
- § 14:434 —*De minimis* defaults
- § 14:435 — —Late payment of rent arrears
- § 14:436 — —Court may excuse minor default to avoid forfeiture
- § 14:437 —“Time is of the essence”
- § 14:438 —Waivers of statutory rights
- § 14:439 — —Warranty of habitability
- § 14:440 — —Rent overcharges, illegal rents, or waivers of rent regulation



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 14:441 —Allocation requisites with *pro se* litigants: New York City
- § 14:442 Vacating stipulation
- § 14:443 —Fraud, collusion, or mistake
- § 14:444 — —Misapplication of stipulated payments
- § 14:445 — —Rent tender made by third party may be rejected
- § 14:446 — —Rent tendered by third party pursuant to stipulation
- § 14:447 —Unjust or harsh terms
- § 14:448 —Party unrepresented by counsel

## XI. HEARING AND TRIAL

- § 14:449 Overview
- § 14:450 Trier of fact
- § 14:451 —New York City Civil Court Housing Judges
- § 14:452 *Pro se* litigants, generally
- § 14:453 Adjournments
- § 14:454 —New York City Civil Court
- § 14:455 — —Content of Notice of Petition: New York City
- § 14:456 —Excessive adjournments by landlord
- § 14:457 Trial procedures
- § 14:458 —Opening statements
- § 14:459 —Petitioner's *prima facie* case
- § 14:460 —Tenant's affirmative defenses and counterclaims
- § 14:461 —Summations
- § 14:462 Trial motions
- § 14:463 —Motion to dismiss
- § 14:464 —Motion to conform pleadings to proof
- § 14:465 Trial Transcripts
- § 14:466 Judicial estoppel

## XII. JUDGMENT AND WARRANT

- § 14:467 Judgment
- § 14:468 —Amendments
- § 14:469 —Defects
- § 14:470 —Enforcement of money judgments
- § 14:471 —Interest
- § 14:472 — —Stipulations: amount recoverable upon breach
- § 14:473 —Judicially imposed conditions and protections have not been sanctioned
- § 14:474 Notice of Eviction and warrant
- § 14:475 —Content of Notice of Eviction
- § 14:476 —Calculating earliest eviction date

- § 14:477 — —When personal service of the Notice of Eviction is effected
- § 14:478 — —When other than personal service of Notice of Eviction is effected
- § 14:479 —Additional Notice of Eviction after thirty days or stay of eviction
- § 14:480 —Preparation of written inventory
- § 14:481 —“Eviction” versus “legal possession,” distinction examined
- § 14:482 — —Procedures relating to “evictions”
- § 14:483 — —Procedures relating to “legal possessions”
- § 14:484 — —Landlord’s liability for remaining personalty
- § 14:485 —Items which may not be removed by Marshal
- § 14:486 —Warehouse sale of stored goods to satisfy a lien
- § 14:487 —“Social Service Call-Ins”
- § 14:488 —Parties against whom warrant is enforceable
- § 14:489 Stays, generally
- § 14:490 —New York City
- § 14:491 — —To whom post-trial stay applications may be referred
- § 14:492 — — —Referral exceptions
- § 14:493 Vacating the warrant
- § 14:494 —Examples: application of “good cause shown” standard
- § 14:495 Impact of rent acceptance after warrant’s issuance

### **XIII. ATTORNEYS’ FEES**

- § 14:496 “American rule”
- § 14:497 Residential tenants have reciprocal rights
- § 14:498 Commercial tenants must negotiate entitlement to attorney’s fees
- § 14:499 Statutory tenancies
- § 14:500 “Prevailing party”
- § 14:501 —Fees on fees
- § 14:502 —Compare: when dispute’s scope is limited to tenant’s recovery of abatement
- § 14:503 —Compare: proceedings resolved by stipulation
- § 14:504 Advance notice of intent to recover fees may not be required
- § 14:505 Entitlement is predicated upon “ultimate outcome”
- § 14:506 Attorneys’ fee claim should be asserted within same action or proceeding
- § 14:507 Fees may not be recoverable from a Section 8 tenant

### **XIV. FORMS**

- § 14:508 Form 14-1: Rent demand: residential tenant

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|                |  |
|----------------|--|
| § 14:509       | Form 14-2: Rent demand: commercial tenant  |
| § 14:510       | Form 14-3: Notice of petition: New York City Civil Court [NYCRR § 208.42(d)]   |
| § 14:511       | Form 14-4: Notice of petition: New York City Civil Courts [22 NYCRR § 210.42(b)]                                       |
| § 14:512       | Form 14-5: Notice of petition: New York State District Courts [22 NYCRR § 212.42(b)]                                   |
| § 14:513       | Form 14-6: Nonpayment petition   |
| § 14:514       | Form 14-7: Sample Military Affidavit   |
| § 14:515       | Form 14-8: Verification: individual  |
| § 14:516       | Form 14-9: Verification: corporate   |
| § 14:517       | Form 14-10: Verification: partnership  |
| § 14:518       | Form 14-11: Verification: attorney   |
| § 14:519       | Form 14-12: Affidavit of service by personal delivery  |
| § 14:520       | Form 14-13: Affidavit of service by substituted service  |
| § 14:521       | Form 14-14: Affidavit of service by conspicuous place service  |
| § 14:522       | Form 14-15: Answer with counterclaims  |
| § 14:523       | Form 14-16: Notice of motion to dismiss proceeding with affidavit in support   |
| § 14:524       | Form 14-17: Order to show cause to vacate default judgment and warrant   |
| § 14:525       | Form 14-18: Affidavit in support of application to vacate default  |
| § 14:526       | Form 14-19: Stipulation settling nonpayment proceeding   |
| § 14:527       | Form 14-20: Stipulation settling nonpayment proceeding with final judgment in favor of petitioner                      |
| § 14:528       | Form 14-21: Judgment upon tenant's failure to answer (outside New York City)   |
| § 14:529       | Form 14-22: Warrant  |
| § 14:530       | Form 14-23: 72 hour notice of eviction   |
| § 14:531       | Form 14-24: Notice of Eviction   |
| § 14:532       | Form 14-25: Authorization to secure certified copy of MDR  |
| APPENDIX 14-1. | Civil Court Directives, Ejectment Actions in Civil Court, Civil Court of the City of New York (10/02/96)               |
| APPENDIX 14-2. | Directives and Procedures, Reorganization of Civil Parts in Civil Court, Civil Court of the City of New York (9/09/02) |
| APPENDIX 14-3. | Legal/Statutory Memorandum, Papers Filed in Court, Civil Court of the City of New York (12/22/94)                      |

LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- APPENDIX 14-4. Legal/Statutory Memorandum, Power of Attorney, Civil Court of the City of New York (10/01/96)
- APPENDIX 14-5. Procedures for Commencing Housing Court Cases against Tenants in the Section 8 Existing Housing Certificate or Voucher Program (1995)
- APPENDIX 14-6. Civil Court Directive, Severance of Individuals Named, But Not Served, Civil Court of the City of New York (7/22/02)
- APPENDIX 14-7. Civil Court Directive, Severance or Discontinuance Against Individuals Served, Civil Court of the City of New York (10/01/02)
- APPENDIX 14-8. Legal/Statutory Memorandum, Non-Military Affidavits, Civil Court of the City of New York (05/27/10)
- APPENDIX 14-9. Ascertaining a Tenant's Military Status
- APPENDIX 14-10. Civil Court Directive, Identifying Data on Petitions, Civil Court of the City of New York (11/01/1990)
- APPENDIX 14-11. Civil Court Directive, Service of Process, Description of Individual Served, Civil Court of the City of New York (5/01/91)
- APPENDIX 14-12. Civil Court Directive, Identifying Data on Petitions, Civil Court of the City of New York (11/01/1990)
- APPENDIX 14-13. Civil Court Directive, Amended Postcard Rule, Civil Court of the City of New York (10/01/91)
- APPENDIX 14-14. Directives & Procedures, Answers in Non-Payment Proceeding, Civil Court of the City of New York (04/28/97)
- APPENDIX 14-15. Legal/Statutory Memorandum, Answers in Summary Proceedings, Civil Court of the City of New York (12/06/03)
- APPENDIX 14-16. Civil Court Directive, Timeliness of Jury Demands in Summary Proceedings to Recover Real Property, Civil Court of the City of New York (6/08/98)
- APPENDIX 14-17. Civil Court Direction, Entry of Default Judgments, Civil Court of the City of New York (01/20/00)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

|                 |   |
|-----------------|---|
| APPENDIX 14-18. | Civil Court Directive, Access Orders, Civil Court of the City of New York (10/17/89)  |
| APPENDIX 14-19. | Advisory Notice, Allocutions of Stipulation in Landlord and Tenant Cases, Civil Court of the City of New York (04/06/07)  |
| APPENDIX 14-20. | Civil Court Directive, Poor Persons Petitions Waiver of Fees Under Amendment to CPLR § 1101, Civil Court of the City of New York (11/16/92)                                     |
| APPENDIX 14-21. | Civil Court Directive, Poor Persons Petitions Waiver of Fees Under Amendment to CPLR § 1101, Civil Court of the City of New York (11/16/92)                                     |
| APPENDIX 14-22. | Legal/Statutory Memorandum, Poor Persons Represented by Pro Bono or Legal Services Attorney, Civil Court of the City of New York (09/01/92)                                     |
| APPENDIX 14-23. | Civil Court Directive, Short Form Orders–Application for Deposit of Rent and/or Use and Occupancy, Application for Attorney Fees, Civil Court of the City of New York (4/22/91) |
| APPENDIX 14-24. | Civil Court Directive, Correction of Judgments, Civil Court of the City of New York (10/02/96)  |
| APPENDIX 14-25. | Chief Clerk’s Memorandum, Fees for Copying Civil/Housing Trial Recordings, Civil Court of the City of New York (07/11/97)   |
| APPENDIX 14-26. | Civil Court Directive, Judgments, Complex, Assistance to the Clerk in Determining Details, Civil Court of the City of New York (03/20/91)                                       |
| APPENDIX 14-27. | Legal/Statutory Memorandum, Sheriff or Marshall’s Fees, Civil Court of the City of New York (10/23/00)  |
| APPENDIX 14-28. | Civil Court Directive, Interest Rates on Judgments, Civil Court of the City of New York (11/03/97)  |
| APPENDIX 14-29. | Legal/Statutory Memorandum, Notice of Entry, Civil Court of the City of New York (01/03/95)   |
| APPENDIX 14-30. | Civil Court Directive, Service of Eviction Notices, Civil Court of the City of New York (04/14/00)  |

LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- APPENDIX 14-31. Legal/Statutory Memorandum, Order to Show Cause Procedure under N.Y. Real Prop. Acts. Law § 747(a), Civil Court of the City of New York (11/03/97)
- APPENDIX 14-32. Directives and Procedures, Judgments in Summary Proceedings: Name of Parties, Civil Court of the City of New York (09/06/05)
- APPENDIX 14-33. Legal/Statutory Memorandum, Pre-Service Filing Chapter 452 of the Laws of 2005, Civil Court of the City of New York (09/08/05)
- APPENDIX 14-34. Civil Court Directive, Entry of Default Judgments, Civil Court of the City of New York (07/14/10)
- APPENDIX 14-35. Directives and Procedures, Default Judgments entered after Hurricane Sandy, Civil Court of the City of New York (12/05/12) (RESCINDED 05/26/15)
- APPENDIX 14-36. Directives and Procedures, Warrant of evictions issued after Hurricane Sandy, Civil Court of the City of New York (12/06/12) (RESCINDED 05/26/15)
- APPENDIX 14-37. Civil Court Directive, Housing Court Attorney Conferences of Stipulations in Non-payment and Holdover Cases (DRP 195, 1/23/12)
- APPENDIX 14-38. Chief Clerk's Memorandum, Defaults against a party (CCR 201, 1/20/12)
- APPENDIX 14-39. Commencing a Nonpayment Proceeding During the Coronavirus Pandemic—RESCINDED 6/18/20
- APPENDIX 14-40. Obtaining a Default Judgment During Coronavirus Pandemic
- APPENDIX 14-41. Enforcing a Warrant of Eviction During Coronavirus Pandemic
- APPENDIX 14-42. Housing Stability and Tenant Protection Act
- APPENDIX 14-43. Housing Stability and Tenant Protection Act—EED
- APPENDIX 14-44. Executive Order 202: Declaring a Disaster Emergency in the State of New York—Coronavirus Pandemic (*subject to subsequent updates & revisions*)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

|                 |  |
|-----------------|--|
| APPENDIX 14-45. | New York State Senate Bill—Prohibiting Certain Evictions During the Coronavirus Pandemic   |
| APPENDIX 14-46. | Resuming Residential Eviction Proceedings in the Wake of the COVID-19 Health Emergency   |
| APPENDIX 14-47. | Management of Small Claims Cases During the Coronavirus Pandemic   |
| APPENDIX 14-48. | Management of Commercial Eviction Proceedings in the New York City Civil Court   |
| APPENDIX 14-49. | Management of Consumer Debt Cases During the Coronavirus Pandemic  |
| APPENDIX 14-50. | Procedure for processing Residential Eviction Proceedings in relation to the COVID-19 Emergency Eviction and Foreclosure Prevention Act of 2020                            |
| APPENDIX 14-51. | Warrant Requirements Under the EEFPA   |
| APPENDIX 14-52. | Management of Pre-Pandemic Eviction Proceedings in the New York City Civil Court—Housing Part  |
| APPENDIX 14-53. | Tenant’s Declaration of Hardship During the COVID-19 Pandemic  |
| APPENDIX 14-54. | Residential and Commercial Eviction Proceedings Upon the Expiration of Chapter 417 of the Laws of 2021   |
| APPENDIX 14-55. | Management of Residential and Commercial Eviction Matters Commenced After March 16, 2020 in the New York City Civil Court  |
| APPENDIX 14-56. | Management of Motions for Default Judgments Residential and Commercial Eviction Matters in the New York City Civil Court   |
| APPENDIX 14-57. | Establishment of a Small Property Part in the New York City Civil Court, Housing Part  |
| APPENDIX 14-58. | Management of Motions for Default Judgments Residential and Commercial Eviction Matters in the New York City Civil Court ( <i>Rescinding</i> DRP 217, DRP 221 and DRP 222) |

## CHAPTER 15. HOLDOVER PROCEEDINGS

### I. OVERVIEW

- § 15:1 History and background
- § 15:2 —Common-law antecedents
- § 15:3 —Summary remedy
- § 15:4 Purpose
- § 15:5 —“Use and occupancy”
- § 15:6 — —Punitive lease valuations are not enforced
- § 15:7 —Distinct from nonpayment proceedings
- § 15:8 Grounds for holdover proceeding
- § 15:9 —Termination for tenant’s breach of “substantial obligation” of the tenancy
- § 15:10 — —Covenant to provide access
- § 15:11 — —Covenant restricting alterations
- § 15:12 — — —“Structural” versus “non-structural” alterations
- § 15:13 — — — —Examples of “structural” modifications
- § 15:14 — — — —Examples of “non-structural” modifications
- § 15:15 — — —Test utilized to ascertain difference
- § 15:16 — — —Satellite dishes
- § 15:17 — —Covenant to provide landlord with duplicate key
- § 15:18 — —Covenant not to maintain pets
- § 15:19 — — —Exception: emotional-support animals
- § 15:20 — — —Exception: “elderly” tenants in federal housing
- § 15:21 — —Covenant to pay rent
- § 15:22 — —Covenant to furnish landlord with security deposit
- § 15:23 — —Covenant not to sublet or assign
- § 15:24 — — —Other occupancy restrictions: occupancy limitations
- § 15:25 — —Covenant to use and occupy premises for specified purposes
- § 15:26 — —Use clauses
- § 15:27 — — —Home occupations: New York City
- § 15:28 — — —Permitted home occupations
- § 15:29 — — —Prohibited home occupations
- § 15:30 — —Covenant not to install washing machine
- § 15:31 —Premises rendered “wholly unusable”
- § 15:32 —Nuisance
- § 15:33 —Tenant’s immoral or illegal use or occupancy
- § 15:34 — —N.Y. Real Prop. Acts. Law § 711(5)
- § 15:35 — —Notice required for rent-regulated units
- § 15:36 — —“Double jeopardy” defense unavailable



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|         |   |
|---------|---|
| § 15:37 | — — Proceeding maintainable by both landlords and tenants                     |
| § 15:38 | — — — Relevant evidence   |
| § 15:39 | — — — Nature and frequency of activity are of import                          |
| § 15:40 | — Other termination grounds under rent-control                                |
| § 15:41 | — — Tenant’s refusal to permit access to landlord                             |
| § 15:42 | — — Occupancy by landlord or immediate family                                 |
| § 15:43 | — — — Exemption for senior citizens, long-term tenants, and the “impaired”    |
| § 15:44 | — — Tenant not using premises for own dwelling                                |
| § 15:45 | — — — Compare: nonprimary residence in New York City                          |
| § 15:46 | — — — Factors of pertinence   |
| § 15:47 | — — Demolition  |
| § 15:48 | — — Withdrawal of unit from rental market                                     |
| § 15:49 | — — Non-purchasing tenant under “eviction” conversion plan                    |
| § 15:50 | — — — Exemption for senior citizens and disabled tenants                      |
| § 15:51 | — Other grounds under Rent Stabilization Code (“RSC”)                         |
| § 15:52 | — — Tenant’s refusal to permit access to landlord                             |
| § 15:53 | — — Tenant’s refusal to renew lease   |
| § 15:54 | — — Illegal sublease  |
| § 15:55 | — — Nonprimary residence  |
| § 15:56 | — — Owner occupancy   |
| § 15:57 | — — — Exemption for non-purchasing tenants in “non-eviction” conversion plans |
| § 15:58 | — — — Exemption for senior citizens and the disabled                          |
| § 15:59 | — — Profiteering  |
| § 15:60 | — — Recovery by non-profit institution  |
| § 15:61 | — — Unit’s withdrawal from rental market                                      |
| § 15:62 | — — Demolition  |
| § 15:63 | — Other grounds under the Emergency Tenant Protection Act (“ETPA”)            |
| § 15:64 | — — Tenant’s refusal to permit access   |
| § 15:65 | — — Tenant’s refusal to renew lease   |
| § 15:66 | — — Demolition  |
| § 15:67 | — — Nonprimary residence  |
| § 15:68 | — — Owner occupancy   |
| § 15:69 | — — — Exemption for senior citizens, the disabled, and long-term tenants      |
| § 15:70 | — — — Maximum two units may be recovered                                      |
| § 15:71 | — — Withdrawal of unit from rental market                                     |
| § 15:72 | — Other grounds: manufactured-home tenants                                    |

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 15:73 Grounds for holdover proceeding against a non-tenant
- § 15:74 —Judgment debtor after execution sale
- § 15:75 —Occupant under cultivation agreement
- § 15:76 —Squatter
- § 15:77 —Former owner or occupant after tax sale
- § 15:78 —Occupant after foreclosure
- § 15:79 —Occupant after termination of life estate
- § 15:80 —Licensee
- § 15:81 — —Exception: marital disputes
- § 15:82 — —Exception: mortgagee or vendee in possession
- § 15:83 —Former owner
- § 15:84 —Vendee in possession
- § 15:85 —Forcible or unlawful entry
- § 15:86 —Occupancy incidental to employment
- § 15:87 Common law right to “self-help”
- § 15:88 Jurisdiction
- § 15:89 Venue
- § 15:90 —New York City
- § 15:91 —Outside New York City

## II. PREDICATE NOTICES

- § 15:92 Predicate notices, defined
- § 15:93 Who may issue notice
- § 15:94 —Prior notice of authority
- § 15:95 —Compare: no prior dealings
- § 15:96 Manner of service
- § 15:97 Notices may not be amended
- § 15:98 When notice is not required—Expired lease
- § 15:99 — —No renewal entitlement exists
- § 15:100 — —No rent has been accepted
- § 15:101 — —No inordinate delay or inaction
- § 15:102 —Illegal or immoral use or occupation by  
unregulated tenant
- § 15:103 Notices to cure
- § 15:104 —Lease-mandated notice to cure
- § 15:105 — —Conditional limitation and rent defaults
- § 15:106 — —Content of notice to cure
- § 15:107 —Notice to cure required by statute
- § 15:108 — —State Rent Control: violation of a substantial  
obligation of the tenancy
- § 15:109 — —New York City Rent Control: violation of  
substantial obligation of the tenancy
- § 15:110 — —Rent Stabilization Law: violation of substantial  
obligation of tenancy

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 15:111 | — — —Other grounds   |
| § 15:112 | — —ETPA: various grounds   |
| § 15:113 | — — —Notice to cure may be combined with<br>termination notice       |
| § 15:114 | — — —Copies of predicate notices should be filed<br>with DHCR        |
| § 15:115 | — — —When notice to cure is not required                             |
| § 15:116 | — —Content of statutory notice to cure                               |
| § 15:117 | — — —Examples: factually deficient notices                           |
| § 15:118 | — — —Examples: factually sufficient notices                          |
| § 15:119 | Notice of nonrenewal   |
| § 15:120 | —Under the RSC   |
| § 15:121 | — —Consequences of missing window period                             |
| § 15:122 | — —Nonprimary residence  |
| § 15:123 | — — —Examples: factually deficient notices                           |
| § 15:124 | — — —Examples: factually sufficient notices                          |
| § 15:125 | — — —Thirty-day notice of termination is also<br>required            |
| § 15:126 | — — —Notices may be combined   |
| § 15:127 | — — —Notices may be signed by agent                                  |
| § 15:128 | — — —No certificate of eviction is required                          |
| § 15:129 | — —Owner occupancy   |
| § 15:130 | — — —Examples: factually deficient notices                           |
| § 15:131 | — — —Examples: factually sufficient notices                          |
| § 15:132 | — — —No certificate of eviction is required                          |
| § 15:133 | — —Recovery by non-profit institution                                |
| § 15:134 | — —Withdrawal of unit from housing market                            |
| § 15:135 | — —Demolition  |
| § 15:136 | —Under ETPR  |
| § 15:137 | — —Nonprimary residence  |
| § 15:138 | — —Owner occupancy   |
| § 15:139 | — —Withdrawal from rental market                                     |
| § 15:140 | Termination notices  |
| § 15:141 | —When required by lease  |
| § 15:142 | —When required by statute  |
| § 15:143 | — —Tenancy “at-will” or “at-sufferance”                              |
| § 15:144 | — — —Tenancy-at-will   |
| § 15:145 | — — —Tenancy-at-sufferance   |
| § 15:146 | — — —Service   |
| § 15:147 | — — —Content of thirty-day notice                                    |
| § 15:148 | — —When no landlord-tenant relationship exists                       |
| § 15:149 | — — —Content of notice to quit                                       |
| § 15:150 | — — —Compare: Whether notice must set forth<br>factual underpinnings |

# LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 15:151 — — — — Compare: Whether notice must proffer  
termination date
- § 15:152 — — — — Compare: whether notice must advise  
occupant of consequences of failure to vacate
- § 15:153 — — — — Compare: Whether alternative theories of  
recovery are permitted
- § 15:154 — — — — Service of notice to quit
- § 15:155 — — — — Month-to-month tenants
- § 15:156 — — — — Within New York City
- § 15:157 — — — — Content of predicate notice
- § 15:158 — — — — No reason for termination required
- § 15:159 — — — — Notice may be issued by landlord or its  
agent
- § 15:160 — — — — Subtenants need not be served with notice
- § 15:161 — — — — Service of notice
- § 15:162 — — — — Outside New York City
- § 15:163 — — — — New York City rent-stabilized tenants
- § 15:164 — — — — Content of termination notice
- § 15:165 — — — — Grounds and length of notice
- § 15:166 — — — — Violation of substantial obligation of  
tenancy
- § 15:167 — — — — Refusal to renew lease
- § 15:168 — — — — Nuisance or objectionable conduct
- § 15:169 — — — — Illegal occupancy
- § 15:170 — — — — Illegal or immoral use
- § 15:171 — — — — Refusal to provide access
- § 15:172 — — — — Illegal subletting
- § 15:173 — — — — Waiver prohibited
- § 15:174 — — — — Method of service
- § 15:175 — — — — ETPA tenants
- § 15:176 — — — — Content of termination notice
- § 15:177 — — — — Timeframe of notice
- § 15:178 — — — — Refusal to renew
- § 15:179 — — — — Violation of substantial obligation of  
tenancy, nuisance or objectionable conduct, illegal  
or immoral use, and refusal to provide access
- § 15:180 — — — — Nonprimary residence
- § 15:181 — — — — DHCR filing required
- § 15:182 — — — — Service
- § 15:183 — — — — Certificate of eviction required
- § 15:184 — — — — Owner occupancy
- § 15:185 — — — — Withdrawal from rental market
- § 15:186 — — — — Rent-controlled tenants
- § 15:187 — — — — Content of termination notice
- § 15:188 — — — — Grounds and timeframe for notice

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 15:189 | — — — — Nuisance, objectionable conduct, illegal occupancy, and illegal or immoral use                   |
| § 15:190 | — — — — Violation of substantial obligation of tenancy   |
| § 15:191 | — — — — Refusal to renew lease   |
| § 15:192 | — — — — Refusal to permit access   |
| § 15:193 | — — — — Tenant not using premises for own dwelling: New York City  |
| § 15:194 | — — — — DHCR filing  |
| § 15:195 | — — — — DHCR certificate of eviction required  |
| § 15:196 | — — — — Compare: Occupants remaining in possession after death or surrender of rent-controlled tenant    |
| § 15:197 | — — — — Manufactured-home park tenants   |
| § 15:198 | — — — — Notice of Claim against government and municipal tenants   |
| § 15:199 | — — — — Time requirements for notice   |
| § 15:200 | — — — — County tenants   |
| § 15:201 | — — — — Municipal tenants: New York City   |
| § 15:202 | — — — — Municipal tenants: Other cities  |
| § 15:203 | — — — — Town tenants   |
| § 15:204 | — — — — Village tenants  |
| § 15:205 | — — — — Federally-subsidized tenants   |
| § 15:206 | — — — — Certification procedure for New York City “Section 8” tenants                                    |
| § 15:207 | — — — — Holdover proceedings related to termination or suspension of rent subsidy or assistance contract |
| § 15:208 | — — — — All other holdover proceedings   |

## III. NOTICE OF PETITION

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 15:209 | Overview                                    |
| § 15:210 | Who may issue Notice of Petition            |
| § 15:211 | — Special rule in New York City Civil Court |
| § 15:212 | — Commencement by Order to Show Cause       |
| § 15:213 | Form of Notice of Petition                  |
| § 15:214 | — Quality, size, legibility, and language   |
| § 15:215 | — Caption                                   |
| § 15:216 | — Parties                                   |
| § 15:217 | — — Petitioner                              |
| § 15:218 | — — — Agent or attorney                     |
| § 15:219 | — — — — Person holding power of attorney    |
| § 15:220 | — — — Assignee of rents                     |
| § 15:221 | — — — Condominium board of managers         |
| § 15:222 | — — — Former receiver                       |
| § 15:223 | — — Respondents                             |

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 15:224 — — — Tenant's estate
- § 15:225 — — — Compare: joinder of tenant's estate when lease has expired
- § 15:226 — — — Guarantors
- § 15:227 — — — "Section 8" tenants: New York City
- § 15:228 — — — Subtenants
- § 15:229 — — — Compare: Known respondent identified by fictitious name
- § 15:230 Content of Notice of Petition
- § 15:231 —Place of hearing
- § 15:232 —Hearing date and time
- § 15:233 —Import of respondent's nonappearance
- § 15:234 —Relief sought
- § 15:235 — —Additional notice requirements: New York City
- § 15:236 Official Notice of Petition forms satisfy statutory requirements
- § 15:237 —Compare: form may waive "no counterclaim" lease clause
- § 15:238 —Military-service notice

## IV. THE PETITION

- § 15:239 Overview
- § 15:240 Form of the Petition—Quality, size, legibility, and language
- § 15:241 —Caption
- § 15:242 —Parties
- § 15:243 —Attorney's endorsement
- § 15:244 Content of Petition
- § 15:245 —Statement of petitioner's interest
- § 15:246 — —Detailed factual recitation is not required
- § 15:247 — —Corporate petitioner
- § 15:248 — — —Foreign corporations
- § 15:249 — — — —Nature and extent of foreign entity's state contact is dispositive
- § 15:250 —Statement of respondent's interest
- § 15:251 — —Compare: Whether Petition must recite dates of lease's execution, commencement, and expiration
- § 15:252 — —Necessary parties
- § 15:253 — —Corporate respondent
- § 15:254 — —Employee respondent
- § 15:255 — —Licensee respondent
- § 15:256 — —Municipal or government respondent
- § 15:257 — —Squatter respondent
- § 15:258 — —Unknown tenants, undertenants, or occupants

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 15:259 | —Description of premises   |
| § 15:260 | — —Apartment number required   |
| § 15:261 | — —Premises may be described on map or floor plan attached to Petition   |
| § 15:262 | — —Description should be complete  |
| § 15:263 | —Use of square footage   |
| § 15:264 | —Facts upon which proceeding is predicated   |
| § 15:265 | —Statement as to service of predicate notices  |
| § 15:266 | —Multiple dwelling registration statement for premises located within New York City  |
| § 15:267 | — —Compare: Whether registration requirements are applicable to holdover proceedings when no rent is sought, or no landlord-tenant relationship exists |
| § 15:268 | — —What Petition must allege   |
| § 15:269 | — — <i>De facto</i> multiple dwellings   |
| § 15:270 | — —Other <i>de facto</i> multiple dwellings: lofts   |
| § 15:271 | — —Failure to attach registration receipt  |
| § 15:272 | — —Authorization may be required to secure certified copy of registration statement  |
| § 15:273 | — — —Compare: Correction of registration lapse after proceeding’s commencement   |
| § 15:274 | —Statement of rent-regulatory status   |
| § 15:275 | — —Subsidized housing  |
| § 15:276 | — —New York City “Section 8” tenants   |
| § 15:277 | — — —Petition should include certification statement   |
| § 15:278 | — — —Attachments may substitute for certification statement  |
| § 15:279 | — —Statements as to rent regulation’s applicability or exemption: New York City  |
| § 15:280 | — — —Commercial premises   |
| § 15:281 | — — —Cooperative unit occupied by unregulated tenant   |
| § 15:282 | — — —Condominium unit occupied by unregulated tenant   |
| § 15:283 | — — —Rent-controlled unit  |
| § 15:284 | — — —Rent-stabilized unit  |
| § 15:285 | — — —Two-family home   |
| § 15:286 | —Relief sought   |
| § 15:287 | Verification   |
| § 15:288 | —Form of verification  |
| § 15:289 | —Who may verify  |
| § 15:290 | — —Corporate petitioner  |
| § 15:291 | — —Partnership petitioner  |

- § 15:292 — —Government petitioner
- § 15:293 — —When attorney may verify

## V. SERVICE OF PROCESS

- § 15:294 Overview
- § 15:295 Lease may not limit statutory requirements
- § 15:296 Who may serve process
- § 15:297 —Record-keeping requirements
- § 15:298 —Licensing requirement: New York City
- § 15:299 — —Compare: Consequences of process server's inability to present license or other records
- § 15:300 Who must be served
- § 15:301 Timing of service efforts: Notice of Petition and Petition
- § 15:302 —Too much notice
- § 15:303 —Too little notice
- § 15:304 Methods of service
- § 15:305 —Personal service
- § 15:306 — —Where personal service may be made
- § 15:307 — — —Incarcerated respondent
- § 15:308 — — —Military personnel
- § 15:309 — —Corporate respondent
- § 15:310 — — —Secretary of State
- § 15:311 — — —Corporate employee
- § 15:312 — —Partnership respondent
- § 15:313 — —Government respondent
- § 15:314 — —When personal service is complete
- § 15:315 —Substituted service
- § 15:316 — —Suitable age and discretion requirement
- § 15:317 — — —Service upon minors
- § 15:318 — —Respondent's employees
- § 15:319 — — —Compare: Delivery to tenant's subtenant
- § 15:320 — —Landlord's (or building) employees
- § 15:321 — —Respondent's neighbors and guests
- § 15:322 — —Substituted service must be made at premises
- § 15:323 — —Mailing requirement
- § 15:324 — —When service complete
- § 15:325 —Conspicuous-place service
- § 15:326 — —"Reasonable application" standard
- § 15:327 — — —Residential respondents
- § 15:328 — — — —Attempts made on weekends and prior to normal work hours
- § 15:329 — — — —Attempts made during regular business hours



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 15:330 | — — — —Attempts made during normal rest hours  |
| § 15:331 | — — — —Attempts made on Sundays, religious holidays, and days of observance                |
| § 15:332 | — — — —Where attempts should be made in respondent's absence: when whereabouts are known   |
| § 15:333 | — — — —Where attempts should be made in respondent's absence: when whereabouts are unknown |
| § 15:334 | — — — —Commercial tenants  |
| § 15:335 | — — — —During business hours   |
| § 15:336 | — — — —Where attempts should be made in respondent's absence: When whereabouts are known   |
| § 15:337 | — — — —Where attempts should be made in respondent's absence: When whereabouts are unknown |
| § 15:338 | — —Mailing requirement   |
| § 15:339 | — — —Presumption of regularity and receipt   |
| § 15:340 | — —When conspicuous-place service is complete  |
| § 15:341 | Mailing requirement  |
| § 15:342 | —Individual respondent   |
| § 15:343 | —Business respondent   |
| § 15:344 | —Use of full and complete address, including ZIP Code, is suggested                        |
| § 15:345 | —Presumption of regularity and receipt   |
| § 15:346 | Filing proof of service  |
| § 15:347 | —When to file  |
| § 15:348 | —What to file  |
| § 15:349 | —Filing defects  |
| § 15:350 | —Late filings  |
| § 15:351 | —Compare: Delivery to judge  |
| § 15:352 | New York City Civil Court "postcard requirement": Residential cases only                   |
| § 15:353 | —Content of postcard   |
| § 15:354 | —Sanction for noncompliance  |

## VI. THE ANSWER

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 15:355 | Overview                                 |
| § 15:356 | Who may Answer                           |
| § 15:357 | Timing of Answer                         |
| § 15:358 | Form of Answer                           |
| § 15:359 | —Oral                                    |
| § 15:360 | —Written                                 |
| § 15:361 | —Quality, size, legibility, and language |

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 15:362 — —Caption
- § 15:363 — —Service and filing
- § 15:364 Content of Answer
- § 15:365 —Denials
- § 15:366 —Defenses
- § 15:367 —Counterclaims
- § 15:368 — —Exception for “inextricably related” counter claims
- § 15:369 — — —Attorney’s fees
- § 15:370 — — —Failure to disclose defective conditions
- § 15:371 — — —Rent overcharge
- § 15:372 — — — —Prior claim pending
- § 15:373 — — —Retaliatory eviction
- § 15:374 — — —Warranty of habitability
- § 15:375 — —Severance of unrelated counterclaims
- § 15:376 — — —Failure to provide electricity, heat, and/or hot water
- § 15:377 — — —Intentional infliction of mental and emotional distress
- § 15:378 — — —Violations of state and federal FDLPA’s
- § 15:379 — —Exception for “compulsory counterclaims”
- § 15:380 —Verification
- § 15:381 Jury demand
- § 15:382 —When demand must be made
- § 15:383 —Jury waiver by lease agreement
- § 15:384 —Jury waiver by interposing equitable claims or defenses
- § 15:385 Failure to answer: Effect and consequences
- § 15:386 —Vacating a default
- § 15:387 — —Requisite elements
- § 15:388 — — —Excusable default
- § 15:389 — —Excusable default—Meritorious defense
- § 15:390 —Filing of non-military affidavit
- § 15:391 — —Recitation of factual particulars is suggested
- § 15:392 — —Sanctions may ensue for irregularities

## VII. TENANT DEFENSES TO THE HOLDOVER PROCEEDING

- § 15:393 Court lacks “subject matter” jurisdiction over proceeding
- § 15:394 —Defective predicate notices
- § 15:395 Court lacks *in personam* jurisdiction over the respondent
- § 15:396 —Objection must be detailed and specific

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 15:397 | — Traverse hearings   |
| § 15:398 | — — Testimony of process server in New York City  |
| § 15:399 | — — — Compare: consequences of process server’s inability to produce license or other records |
| § 15:400 | — — Affidavit of service  |
| § 15:401 | — Waiver of service-related objections  |
| § 15:402 | Other “jurisdictional” objections: Pleading-related defects                                   |
| § 15:403 | — Notice of Petition defects  |
| § 15:404 | — Defects in the Notice of Petition—Clerk’s endorsement                                       |
| § 15:405 | — — Compare: Notice of Petition issued by attorney or landlord                                |
| § 15:406 | — — Hearing date and time   |
| § 15:407 | — — Misleading Notice of Petition   |
| § 15:408 | — — Court name and venue omitted  |
| § 15:409 | — — Misstatement as to party’s name or status   |
| § 15:410 | — Petition defects  |
| § 15:411 | — — Caption defects   |
| § 15:412 | — — — Misstatement as to party’s name or status   |
| § 15:413 | — — — Compare: petitioner not identified as agent   |
| § 15:414 | — — — Compare: Known respondent identified by fictitious name                                 |
| § 15:415 | — — Defects as to parties’ interests  |
| § 15:416 | — — — Proper petitioners  |
| § 15:417 | — — — Improper petitioners  |
| § 15:418 | — — — — Agent or attorney   |
| § 15:419 | — — — — Person holding power of attorney  |
| § 15:420 | — — — — Compare: whether irregularity will serve to vacate default                            |
| § 15:421 | — — — — Condominium board of managers   |
| § 15:422 | — — — — Former receiver   |
| § 15:423 | — — — Proper respondents  |
| § 15:424 | — — — — Tenant’s estate   |
| § 15:425 | — — — — “Section 8” tenants: New York City  |
| § 15:426 | — — — — Subtenants  |
| § 15:427 | — — — Improper respondents  |
| § 15:428 | — — — — Condominium unit owners   |
| § 15:429 | — — — — Tenant’s estate, once lease has expired   |
| § 15:430 | — — — — Guarantors  |
| § 15:431 | — Defective description   |
| § 15:432 | — — Apartment number missing or misidentified   |
| § 15:433 | — — Description incomplete  |
| § 15:434 | — — Omission of map or plan attached to the pleadings   |

# LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 15:435 — — —Errors may be amendable
- § 15:436 — — —Multiple-dwelling registration statement defects
- § 15:437 — — —Compare: Whether registration requirements are applicable to holdover proceedings when no rent is sought or no landlord-tenant relationship exists
- § 15:438 — — —Recital errors are amendable
- § 15:439 — — —Registration lapses are correctable
- § 15:440 — — —Lofts and *de facto* multiple-dwellings
- § 15:441 — — —Failure to register
- § 15:442 — — —Failure to attach registration receipt to pleadings
- § 15:443 — — — —Authorization may be required to secure certified copy
- § 15:444 — — —Errors or omissions in the filed registration statement may also be corrected
- § 15:445 — — —Any irregularity is waivable
- § 15:446 — — —Defects in statement of rent-regulatory status
- § 15:447 — — —Compare: whether failure to allege correct rent-regulatory status of premises is “fatal” defect
- § 15:448 — — —Subsidized housing
- § 15:449 — — — —New York City “Section 8” tenants
- § 15:450 — — —Defects in recitation of facts authorizing removal
- § 15:451 — — —When there is no landlord-tenant relationship
- § 15:452 — — —When proceeding is based on a tenant’s nonprimary residence: New York City
- § 15:453 — — —When proceeding is based on owner occupancy: New York City
- § 15:454 — — —Asserting alternative grounds for removal
- § 15:455 — — —Defects in statement of service of predicate notices
- § 15:456 — — —Notice-related defects are waivable and not “jurisdictional”
- § 15:457 — — —Defective verification
- § 15:458 — — —Notarial errors
- § 15:459 — — —Attorney’s verification
- § 15:460 — — —Other “jurisdictional” objections: Pleading-related defects—Petition defects—Warranty of habitability
- § 15:461 — — —Other “jurisdictional” objections: Pleading-related defects—Defective or deficient predicate notice
- § 15:462 — — —Notices are not amendable
- § 15:463 — — —Improper signatory
- § 15:464 — — —Prior notice of authority

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 15:465 | — — —Compare: no prior dealings   |
| § 15:466 | — —Service of predicate notices   |
| § 15:467 | — — —Service objections may be waived   |
| § 15:468 | — —Equivocal notice   |
| § 15:469 | — —Failure to serve notice to cure  |
| § 15:470 | — —Failure to serve notice of termination   |
| § 15:471 | —Defective notice of nonrenewal   |
| § 15:472 | — —Insufficient facts supporting grounds for<br>nonrenewal                                    |
| § 15:473 | — —Untimely notice  |
| § 15:474 | Certificate of eviction required  |
| § 15:475 | Nonprimary residence  |
| § 15:476 | —Factors of pertinence  |
| § 15:477 | —Examples of landlord’s demonstration of<br>nonprimary residence                              |
| § 15:478 | —Examples of landlord’s nonprimary residence<br>claim defeated                                |
| § 15:479 | —Incurable nature of conduct  |
| § 15:480 | Party not in possession   |
| § 15:481 | —Removal prior to proceeding’s commencement   |
| § 15:482 | —Removal after proceeding’s commencement  |
| § 15:483 | —Factual determination  |
| § 15:484 | Rent acceptance   |
| § 15:485 | —Rent acceptance prior to proceeding’s<br>commencement  |
| § 15:486 | — —Compare: rent acceptance, in and of itself, may<br>not be sufficient to create a tenancy   |
| § 15:487 | — —Compare: Consequences of payment’s “mere<br>receipt”                                       |
| § 15:488 | — —Compare: Rent acceptance may not reinstate<br>regulated tenancy after notice of nonrenewal |
| § 15:489 | — —Compare: When waiver would violate public<br>policy  |
| § 15:490 | —Effect of rent acceptance after proceeding’s<br>commencement                                 |
| § 15:491 | — —“Use and occupancy,” distinguished   |
| § 15:492 | Retaliatory eviction  |
| § 15:493 | —May be waived  |
| § 15:494 | —Not defense to nonpayment of rent  |
| § 15:495 | —Presumption of retaliation: triggering elements  |
| § 15:496 | — —Complaint to governmental agency   |
| § 15:497 | — —Tenant sought to enforce rights against<br>landlord  |
| § 15:498 | — —Judgment, inspection, or order issued against<br>landlord                                  |

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 15:499 —Rebutting the presumption
- § 15:500 —When presumption is inapplicable
- § 15:501 —Penalties
- § 15:502 Harassment
- § 15:503 —Residential tenant
- § 15:504 —Commercial tenant
- § 15:505 Succession rights to rent-regulated premises
- § 15:506 —“Family members,” defined
- § 15:507 —“Companions,” defined
- § 15:508 — —Factors demonstrative of “emotional and financial relationship”
- § 15:509 — — —Examples: Succession entitlement demonstrated
- § 15:510 — — —Examples: Succession entitlement not demonstrated
- § 15:511 —Length of occupancy
- § 15:512 —Primary residence
- § 15:513 Waiver and estoppel
- § 15:514 —Statutory waivers: Pets
- § 15:515 — —Compare: When delay is attributable to “legitimate settlement negotiations” or “discontinuance on consent” premised upon “procedural infirmity”
- § 15:516 —Non-waiver clauses
- § 15:517 —Compare: When waiver would violate public policy
- § 15:518 —Compare: Whether landlord’s conduct can “create” regulated tenancy
- § 15:519 —Compare: When renewal lease issues in accordance with requirements of regulatory scheme during course of on-going litigation
- § 15:520 —Compare: When renewal lease issues before or after “Golub” notice

## VIII. MOTION PRACTICE

- § 15:521 Overview
- § 15:522 Calendar practice
- § 15:523 Motion to dismiss
- § 15:524 —Impact of dismissal on predicate notices
- § 15:525 Motion for summary judgment
- § 15:526 Judicial estoppel
- § 15:527 Failure to oppose a motion, generally
- § 15:528 Disclosure
- § 15:529 —“Ample need” requirement
- § 15:530 — —Surveillance evidence
- § 15:531 — —Nonprimary residence

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 15:532 | — — —Tenant may not be entitled to reciprocal disclosure      |
| § 15:533 | — —Owner’s use  |
| § 15:534 | — — —Superfluous or cumulative disclosure will be discouraged |
| § 15:535 | — —Illegal subletting   |
| § 15:536 | — —Succession rights  |
| § 15:537 | — —Medical issues   |
| § 15:538 | —Exceptions   |
| § 15:539 | — —Notice to Admit  |
| § 15:540 | — —Notice to Produce  |
| § 15:541 | —Possessory judgment may ensue for disclosure noncompliance   |
| § 15:542 | Bill of particulars   |
| § 15:543 | —Compare: “ample need”  |

## IX. STIPULATIONS

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 15:544 | Overview   |
| § 15:545 | Procedure  |
| § 15:546 | Form of stipulation  |
| § 15:547 | Drafting agreement   |
| § 15:548 | —When respondent agrees to cure                                    |
| § 15:549 | —When respondent agrees to vacate                                  |
| § 15:550 | —Remedy for default  |
| § 15:551 | — —Restoration of case to court calendar                           |
| § 15:552 | — —Final judgments and warrant of eviction                         |
| § 15:553 | — — —Consent judgment is not appealable                            |
| § 15:554 | — —Attorney’s fees   |
| § 15:555 | — —Termination of proceeding                                       |
| § 15:556 | Rent tendered by third party pursuant to stipulation               |
| § 15:557 | Presumption that agreement is understood and accepted once signed  |
| § 15:558 | Enforcement of stipulations  |
| § 15:559 | — <i>De minimis</i> defaults                                       |
| § 15:560 | — —Default during “probationary period”                            |
| § 15:561 | — —Courts have excused defaults to avoid forfeiture                |
| § 15:562 | —“Time is of the essence”  |
| § 15:563 | —Waivers of statutory rights                                       |
| § 15:564 | — —Rent overcharges, illegal rents, or waivers of rent regulations |
| § 15:565 | —Allocation requisites with <i>pro se</i> litigants: New York City |
| § 15:566 | Vacating the stipulation   |
| § 15:567 | —Fraud, collusion, or mistake                                      |

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 15:568 — —Misapplication of stipulated payments
- § 15:569 — —Rent tender made by third party may be rejected
- § 15:570 —Unjust or harsh terms
- § 15:571 —Party unrepresented by counsel

### **X. HEARING AND TRIAL**

- § 15:572 Overview
- § 15:573 Trier of fact
- § 15:574 —New York City Civil Court Housing Judges
- § 15:575 *Pro se* litigants, generally
- § 15:576 Adjournments
- § 15:577 —New York City Civil Court
- § 15:578 — —Content of Notice of Petition: New York City
- § 15:579 —Excessive adjournments by landlord
- § 15:580 Trial procedures
- § 15:581 —Opening statements
- § 15:582 —Petitioner's *prima facie* case
- § 15:583 — —Use and occupancy
- § 15:584 —Tenant's affirmative defenses and counterclaims
- § 15:585 —Summations
- § 15:586 Trial motions
- § 15:587 —Motion to dismiss
- § 15:588 —Motion to conform pleadings to the proof
- § 15:589 Trial transcripts
- § 15:590 Judicial estoppel

### **XI. JUDGMENT AND WARRANT**

- § 15:591 Judgment
- § 15:592 —Amendments
- § 15:593 —Defects
- § 15:594 — —Enforcement of money judgments
- § 15:595 —Interest
- § 15:596 — —Stipulations: amounts recoverable upon breach
- § 15:597 —Judicially imposed protections have not been sanctioned
- § 15:598 Notice of Eviction and warrant
- § 15:599 Content of Notice of Eviction
- § 15:600 —Calculating the earliest eviction date
- § 15:601 — —When personal service of Notice of Eviction is effected
- § 15:602 — —When other than personal service of the Notice of Eviction is effected



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 15:603 | —Additional Notice of Eviction after 30 days or stay of eviction                                    |
| § 15:604 | —Preparation of written inventory   |
| § 15:605 | —“Eviction” versus “legal possession” examined  |
| § 15:606 | — —Procedures relating to “evictions”   |
| § 15:607 | — —Procedures relating to “legal possessions”   |
| § 15:608 | — — —Landlord’s liability for remaining personalty  |
| § 15:609 | —Items which may not be removed   |
| § 15:610 | —Warehouse sale of stored goods to satisfy a lien   |
| § 15:611 | —“Social Service Call-Ins”  |
| § 15:612 | —Parties against whom warrant is enforceable  |
| § 15:613 | Staying the warrant: New York City residential tenants  |
| § 15:614 | —When proceeding is based on lease violation  |
| § 15:615 | — —Extending cure period  |
| § 15:616 | — —Compare: When cure must be completed   |
| § 15:617 | — —Compare: when post-judgment cure is afforded to tenant despite “statutory” nature of breach      |
| § 15:618 | — —Compare: When stay is authorized by CPLR § 2201  |
| § 15:619 | —When tenant cannot locate new dwelling   |
| § 15:620 | — —When inapplicable  |
| § 15:621 | —To whom post-trial application may be referred   |
| § 15:622 | — —Referral exceptions  |
| § 15:623 | —Entitlement to stay may not be waived  |
| § 15:624 | —Additional stay-related relief   |
| § 15:625 | Staying the warrant outside New York City: when tenant cannot locate new dwelling                   |
| § 15:626 | Staying the warrant outside New York City: When tenant cannot locate new dwelling—When inapplicable |
| § 15:627 | Staying the warrant: Commercial tenants   |
| § 15:628 | Staying the warrant: commercial tenants—Tenant must demonstrate entitlement to stay                 |
| § 15:629 | —Length of stay may not be indefinite or excessive  |
| § 15:630 | Vacating the warrant  |

## **XII. ATTORNEYS’ FEES**

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 15:631 | “American rule”                                       |
| § 15:632 | Residential tenants have reciprocal rights            |
| § 15:633 | Commercial tenants must negotiate right to legal fees |
| § 15:634 | Statutory tenancies                                   |
| § 15:635 | “Prevailing party”                                    |
| § 15:636 | —Fees on fees   |

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 15:637 —Compare: Primary-residence cases
- § 15:638 —Bona fides of party's claim or defense is not dispositive
- § 15:639 —Proceedings resolved by stipulation
- § 15:640 —Advance notice of intent to recover fees may not be required
- § 15:641 —Entitlement is predicated upon "ultimate outcome"
- § 15:642 Attorney's fee claim should be asserted within same action or proceeding
- § 15:643 Fees may not be recoverable from a Section 8 tenant

### **XIII. FORMS**

- § 15:644 Form 15-1: Notice to cure
  - § 15:645 Form 15-2: Notice of non-renewal
  - § 15:646 Form 15-3: Ten day notice to quit
  - § 15:647 Form 15-4: Thirty day notice of termination
  - § 15:648 Form 15-5: Notice of termination
  - § 15:649 Form 15-6: Notice of petition: New York City Civil Court [22 NYCRR § 208.42(b)]
  - § 15:650 Form 15-7: Notice of petition: New York State City Courts [22 NYCRR § 210.42(b)]
  - § 15:651 Form 15-8: Notice of petition: New York State District Courts [22 NYCRR § 212.42(b)]
  - § 15:652 Form 15-9: Holdover petition
  - § 15:653 Form 15-10: Verification: individual
  - § 15:654 Form 15-11: Verification: corporate
  - § 15:655 Form 15-12: Verification: partnership
  - § 15:656 Form 15-13: Verification: attorney
  - § 15:657 Form 15-14: Answer with counterclaim
  - § 15:658 Form 15-15: Stipulation wherein tenant agrees to cure lease violation
  - § 15:659 Form 15-16: Stipulation where tenant agrees to vacate premises
- 
- APPENDIX 15-1. Civil Court Directives, Assignment of "Drug Cases," Civil Court of the City of New York (10/19/89)
  - APPENDIX 15-2. Civil Court Directives, Ejectment Actions in Civil Court, Civil Court of the City of New York (10/02/96)
  - APPENDIX 15-3. Directives and Procedures, Reorganization of Civil Parts in Civil Court, Civil Court of the City of New York (9/09/02)
  - APPENDIX 15-4. Procedures for Commencing Housing

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|                 |   |
|-----------------|---|
|                 | Court Cases against Tenants in the<br>Section 8 Existing Housing Certificate<br>or Voucher Program (1995)   |
| APPENDIX 15-5.  | Legal/Statutory Memorandum, Papers<br>Filed in Court, Civil Court of the City of<br>New York (12/22/94)   |
| APPENDIX 15-6.  | Legal/Statutory Memorandum, Power of<br>Attorney, Civil Court of the City of New<br>York (10/01/96)   |
| APPENDIX 15-7.  | Civil Court Directive, Severance or<br>Discontinuance Against Individuals<br>Served, Civil Court of the City of New<br>York (10/01/02)                    |
| APPENDIX 15-8.  | Civil Court Directive, Severance of<br>Individuals Named, But Not Served,<br>Civil Court of the City of New York<br>(7/22/02)                             |
| APPENDIX 15-9.  | Legal/Statutory Memorandum, Non-<br>Military Affidavits, Civil Court of the<br>City of New York (05/27/10)  |
| APPENDIX 15-10. | Ascertaining a Tenant's Military Status   |
| APPENDIX 15-11. | Civil Court Directive, Identifying Data on<br>Petitions, Civil Court of the City of New<br>York (11/01/1990)  |
| APPENDIX 15-12. | Civil Court Directive, Service of Process,<br>Description of Individual Served, Civil<br>Court of the City of New York (5/01/91)                          |
| APPENDIX 15-13. | Civil Court Directive, Amended Postcard<br>Rule, Civil Court of the City of New<br>York (10/01/91)  |
| APPENDIX 15-14. | Legal/Statutory Memorandum, Answers in<br>Summary Proceedings, Civil Court of<br>the City of New York (12/06/03)  |
| APPENDIX 15-15. | Civil Court Directive, Timeliness of Jury<br>Demands in Summary Proceedings to<br>Recover Real Property, Civil Court of<br>the City of New York (6/08/98) |
| APPENDIX 15-16. | Civil Court Direction, Entry of Default<br>Judgments, Civil Court of the City of<br>New York (01/20/00)   |
| APPENDIX 15-17. | Advisory Notice, Allocutions of Stipulation<br>in Landlord and Tenant Cases, Civil<br>Court of the City of New York (04/06/07)                            |

LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- APPENDIX 15-18. Civil Court Directive, Poor Persons  
Petitions Waiver of Fees Under  
Amendment to CPLR § 1101, Civil Court  
of the City of New York (11/16/92)
- APPENDIX 15-19. Civil Court Directive, Access Orders, Civil  
Court of the City of New York (10/17/89)
- APPENDIX 15-20. Civil Court Directive, Short Form  
Orders—Application for Deposit of Rent  
and/or Use and Occupancy, Application  
for Attorney Fees, Civil Court of the  
City of New York (4/22/91)
- APPENDIX 15-21. Chief Clerk’s Memorandum, Fees for  
Copying Civil/Housing Trial Recordings,  
Civil Court of the City of New York  
(07/11/97)
- APPENDIX 15-22. Civil Court Directive, Judgments,  
Complex, Assistance to the Clerk in  
Determining Details, Civil Court of the  
City of New York (03/20/91)
- APPENDIX 15-23. Legal/Statutory Memorandum, Sheriff or  
Marshal’s Fees, Civil Court of the City  
of New York (10/23/00)
- APPENDIX 15-24. Legal/Statutory Memorandum, Notice of  
Entry, Civil Court of the City of New  
York (01/03/95)
- APPENDIX 15-25. Legal/Statutory Memorandum, Order to  
Show Cause Procedure under N.Y. Real  
Prop. Acts. Law § 747(a), Civil Court of  
the City of New York (11/03/97)
- APPENDIX 15-26. Directives and Procedures, Judgments in  
Summary Proceedings: Name of Parties,  
Civil Court of the City of New York  
(09/06/05)
- APPENDIX 15-27. Civil Court Directive, Correction of  
Judgments, Civil Court of the City of  
New York (10/02/96)
- APPENDIX 15-28. Civil Court Directive, Interest Rates on  
Judgments, Civil Court of the City of  
New York (11/03/97)
- APPENDIX 15-29. Civil Court Directive, Service of Eviction  
Notices, Civil Court of the City of New  
York (04/14/00)
- APPENDIX 15-30. Legal/Statutory Memorandum, Pre-Service  
Filing Chapter 452 of the Laws of 2005,

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|                 |  |
|-----------------|--|
|                 | Civil Court of the City of New York<br>(09/08/05)  |
| APPENDIX 15-31. | Civil Court Directive, Entry of Default Judgments, Civil Court of the City of New York (07/14/10)  |
| APPENDIX 15-32. | Directives and Procedures, Default Judgments entered after Hurricane Sandy, Civil Court of the City of New York (12/05/12) (RESCINDED 05/26/15)            |
| APPENDIX 15-33. | Directives and Procedures, Warrant of evictions issued after Hurricane Sandy, Civil Court of the City of New York (12/06/12) (RESCINDED 05/26/15)          |
| APPENDIX 15-34. | Civil Court Directive, Sealing of Housing Court files containing psychiatric evaluations (DRP 199, 1/30/13)  |
| APPENDIX 15-35. | Housing Stability and Tenant Protection Act  |
| APPENDIX 15-36. | Housing Stability and Tenant Protection Act—EED  |
| APPENDIX 15-37. | Executive Order 202: Declaring a Disaster Emergency in the State of New York—Coronavirus Pandemic ( <i>subject to subsequent updates &amp; revisions</i> ) |
| APPENDIX 15-38. | New York State Senate Bill—Prohibiting Certain Evictions During the Coronavirus Pandemic   |
| APPENDIX 15-39. | Procedure for scheduling Holdover Proceedings filed in person, by mail or e-filed during the COVID-19 Pandemic   |
| APPENDIX 15-40. | Notice Required on Holdover Proceedings filed during the COVID-19 Pandemic   |
| APPENDIX 15-41. | Resuming Residential Eviction Proceedings in the Wake of the COVID-19 Health Emergency   |
| APPENDIX 15-42. | Management of Small Claims Cases During the Coronavirus Pandemic   |
| APPENDIX 15-43. | Management of Commercial Eviction Proceedings in the New York City Civil Court   |
| APPENDIX 15-44. | Management of Consumer Debt Cases During the Coronavirus Pandemic  |
| APPENDIX 15-45. | Procedure for processing Residential   |

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

### Eviction Proceedings in relation to the COVID-19 Emergency Eviction and Foreclosure Prevention Act of 2020

- APPENDIX 15-46. Warrant Requirements Under the EEFPA
- APPENDIX 15-47. Management of Pre-Pandemic Eviction Proceedings in the New York City Civil Court — Housing Part
- APPENDIX 15-48. Tenant’s Declaration of Hardship During the COVID-19 Pandemic
- APPENDIX 15-49. Residential and Commercial Eviction Proceedings Upon the Expiration of Chapter 417 of the Laws of 2021
- APPENDIX 15-50. Management of Residential and Commercial Eviction Matters Commenced After March 16, 2020 in the New York City Civil Court
- APPENDIX 15-51. Management of Motions for Default Judgments Residential and Commercial Eviction Matters in the New York City Civil Court
- APPENDIX 15-52. Establishment of a Small Property Part in the New York City Civil Court, Housing Part
- APPENDIX 15-53. Management of Motions for Default Judgments Residential and Commercial Eviction Matters in the New York City Civil Court (*Rescinding* DRP 217, DRP 221 and DRP 222)

## CHAPTER 16. OTHER ACTIONS AND PROCEEDINGS

### I. RENT STRIKES

- § 16:1 Overview
- § 16:2 —Compelling compliance with warranty of habitability
- § 16:3 — —Warranty of habitability
- § 16:4 — —Breach of the warranty of habitability
- § 16:5 — — —Compare: no “luxury standard”
- § 16:6 —Other uses of rent strike
- § 16:7 Constitutional underpinnings
- § 16:8 State statutes facilitate tenants’ associational activities

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|         |  |
|---------|--|
| § 16:9  | —Landlord may not utilize eviction proceeding for retaliatory purposes               |
| § 16:10 | — —Purpose of statute  |
| § 16:11 | — —Assertion of retaliatory eviction as a defense or counterclaim                    |
| § 16:12 | —Rent withholding by tenants may be statutorily authorized                           |
| § 16:13 | —Examples: tenants directed to remit rent during dispute’s pendency                  |
| § 16:14 | —Examples: tenants permitted to withhold rent during dispute’s pendency              |
| § 16:15 | Parties who may commence rent strike   |
| § 16:16 | Parties against whom rent strike may be instituted                                   |
| § 16:17 | —Ramifications of rent strike against receivers and administrators                   |
| § 16:18 | Consolidation of cases   |
| § 16:19 | —Common questions of law or fact   |
| § 16:20 | —To avoid inconsistent outcomes  |
| § 16:21 | —“Judicial economy”  |
| § 16:22 | —New York City Civil Court: consolidation of related cases is encouraged             |
| § 16:23 | — —Demonstration of “good cause” required to oppose consolidation                    |
| § 16:24 | — —Consolidation of summary proceedings with Supreme Court litigation is discouraged |
| § 16:25 | Availability of injunctive relief  |
| § 16:26 | —Standards for preliminary injunction  |
| § 16:27 | — —Likelihood of ultimate success on merits  |
| § 16:28 | — —“Irreparable harm” absent grant of preliminary injunction                         |
| § 16:29 | — — —Existence of “adequate remedy-at-law” will defeat irreparability claim          |
| § 16:30 | — —Balancing of equities in movant’s favor   |
| § 16:31 | — —Undertaking required as <i>quid pro quo</i>                                       |
| § 16:32 | — — —Must reflect actual damage which may be sustained                               |
| § 16:33 | —Grant of ultimate relief disfavored   |
| § 16:34 | —Procedure   |
| § 16:35 | Accounting may be required   |
| § 16:36 | —Accounting standards  |
| § 16:37 | —Segregation of funds  |
| § 16:38 | Protests and picketing   |
| § 16:39 | Abatements   |
| § 16:40 | —Hearing will be required  |
| § 16:41 | — —Evidence  |

- § 16:42 —Factors determining abatement
- § 16:43 — —Assessing the measure of damages

## II. ARTICLE 7-A PROCEEDINGS

- § 16:44 Generally
- § 16:45 —Applicable to “multiple dwellings”
- § 16:46 Historical context
- § 16:47 —Liberal construction of Article 7-A
- § 16:48 —Conflicting statutes
- § 16:49 —Administrator’s appointment considered drastic remedy
- § 16:50 —New York City: HPD’s role
- § 16:51 Statutory threshold
- § 16:52 —Petitioners in Article 7-A proceeding
- § 16:53 —Tenants must have requisite standing
- § 16:54 —Failure to proffer one-third of building’s tenants
- § 16:55 —“Owners,” defined
- § 16:56 — —City as “owner”
- § 16:57 — —Estate as “owner”
- § 16:58 — —Receiver as “owner”
- § 16:59 — — —Functions of receiver
- § 16:60 — —Registered managing agent as “owner”
- § 16:61 —Grounds for Article 7-A proceeding’s maintenance
- § 16:62 —Deleterious conditions
- § 16:63 —Multiple violations of the Housing Code
- § 16:64 — —Standards utilized within New York City to determine severity of conditions
- § 16:65 Withholding of rents during course of Article 7-A proceeding
- § 16:66 —Alleging breach of warranty of habitability against administrator
- § 16:67 Duration of conditions
- § 16:68 —Compare: withholding of rents without commencing Article 7-A proceeding
- § 16:69 Venue
- § 16:70 Pleadings required to commence proceeding
- § 16:71 —Notice of Petition
- § 16:72 —Petition
- § 16:73 — —Identity of parties
- § 16:74 — — —HPD must be named as a respondent
- § 16:75 — —Tenants need not provide an estimate of correction costs
- § 16:76 —Service of the Notice of Petition and Petition upon all “respondents”



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 16:77  | — —Timing of service   |
| § 16:78  | — —Methods of service  |
| § 16:79  | — — —“Due diligence,” defined  |
| § 16:80  | — — —Substituted service   |
| § 16:81  | — — — —Service upon managing agent   |
| § 16:82  | — — —Service upon mortgagees or lienors  |
| § 16:83  | — — —“Nail and mail”   |
| § 16:84  | — — —Filing pleadings and proofs of service  |
| § 16:85  | —Notice to non-petitioning tenants   |
| § 16:86  | —Intervention by non-petitioning tenants   |
| § 16:87  | Answer   |
| § 16:88  | —Filing of the answer  |
| § 16:89  | —Statutory defenses  |
| § 16:90  | — —Conditions are non-existent or have been remedied                                       |
| § 16:91  | — —Tenants have caused the deleterious conditions  |
| § 16:92  | — —Refusal of entry/access   |
| § 16:93  | —Non-statutory defenses  |
| § 16:94  | — —Economic infeasibility  |
| § 16:95  | — — —Difficulty of establishing defense  |
| § 16:96  | — —Futility  |
| § 16:97  | — — —“Good intentions” are no defense  |
| § 16:98  | Reply  |
| § 16:99  | Trial  |
| § 16:100 | Time periods for adjournments  |
| § 16:101 | Judgment   |
| § 16:102 | Application to correct conditions by owner, mortgagee, or lienor of record following trial |
| § 16:103 | —Corrective compliance by owner or other interested party                                  |
| § 16:104 | —When repairs are not diligently effected  |
| § 16:105 | — —Distribution of posted security   |
| § 16:106 | Appointment of Article 7-A administrator   |
| § 16:107 | —Who may be appointed  |
| § 16:108 | — —New York City   |
| § 16:109 | — — —HPD as administrator  |
| § 16:110 | —Criteria for individual’s appointment   |
| § 16:111 | —Rules and regulations governing the selection of administrators                           |
| § 16:112 | — —List of administrators  |
| § 16:113 | — — —Exception for New York City   |
| § 16:114 | —Functions of administrator  |
| § 16:115 | — —Remedying conditions  |
| § 16:116 | — — —Loans from HPD  |
| § 16:117 | — — —Plan of correction  |

LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 16:118 — — Rent collection and legal proceedings
- § 16:119 — — — Collection of proceeds in excess of lawful rent
- § 16:120 — — — Tenants' entitlement to rent abatements
- § 16:121 — — — Administrator must fail to perform in a reasonable manner
- § 16:122 — — — Rent increases
- § 16:123 — — Renting or leasing
- § 16:124 — — — Lease terms
- § 16:125 — — — Annulling a lease
- § 16:126 Article 7-A administrators and the Division of Housing and Community Renewal ("DHCR")
- § 16:127 — Failure to maintain services
- § 16:128 — Rent restorations
- § 16:129 — Overcharge
- § 16:130 — — Refunds, judgments, and treble damages
- § 16:131 — Rent registration
- § 16:132 — Vacate orders
- § 16:133 — Harassment
- § 16:134 Payments priorities
- § 16:135 — Payment of other charges incurred prior to appointment
- § 16:136 Posting of undertaking
- § 16:137 Maintenance of accounts
- § 16:138 Presentation or settlement of accounts
- § 16:139 — Administrators must properly itemize receipts and expenditures
- § 16:140 — Court may review account
- § 16:141 — Service of motion
- § 16:142 — Owner and administrator, distinguished
- § 16:143 — Rights of owner once administrator is appointed
- § 16:144 — — Owner not relieved of liability during administrator's tenure
- § 16:145 Administrator and receiver may co-exist
- § 16:146 — Compare: functions of administrator and receiver
- § 16:147 — Naming and/or serving receiver as respondent
- § 16:148 — Administrator as receiver
- § 16:149 — Asserting warranty of habitability against receiver
- § 16:150 Administrator and successor owner
- § 16:151 Intervention
- § 16:152 — Intervention by subsequent purchaser
- § 16:153 — — Intervention as of right
- § 16:154 — — Permissive intervention
- § 16:155 When administrator should not be appointed

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 16:156 —Compare: availability of “non-economic viability” defense
- § 16:157 Discharge of administrator
- § 16:158 —Consent to the administrator’s removal
- § 16:159 —Failure to perform duties
- § 16:160 — —Compare: HPD’s responsibility for administrator’s conduct
- § 16:161 Reappointment of administrator
- § 16:162 Judicial responsibility for Article 7-A administrators in City of New York
- § 16:163 —Limitation on judicial appointment authority
- § 16:164 —Criminal proceeding against administrator
- § 16:165 —Lease clauses waiving Article 7-A proceeding are unenforceable
- § 16:166 Attorney’s fees in Article 7-A proceeding
- § 16:167 —Landlords’ entitlement to attorneys’ fee
- § 16:168 — —Attorney’s fees awarded to landlord even when tenants receive abatement in nonpayment proceeding
- § 16:169 —Tenants’ entitlement to attorney’s fees
- § 16:170 — —Statutory right to recovery

## III. *YELLOWSTONE* INJUNCTIONS

- § 16:171 Overview
- § 16:172 Historical overview
- § 16:173 Parties who may seek *Yellowstone* relief
- § 16:174 —Assignees
- § 16:175 —Residential tenants
- § 16:176 —Sublessors and sublessees
- § 16:177 Standards applicable to *Yellowstone* injunction
- § 16:178 —Requisite elements
- § 16:179 — —The tenant holds a valid lease
- § 16:180 — —Notice of default or other comparable notice has issued
- § 16:181 — — —Content of notice
- § 16:182 — — —Extension of notice of cure
- § 16:183 Standards applicable to *Yellowstone* injunction—  
Requisite elements—Notice of default or other comparable notice has issued—Incurable defaults
- § 16:184 Standards applicable to *Yellowstone* injunction—  
Application is timely made
- § 16:185 — —When curative period has expired
- § 16:186 — — —Exceptions to *Yellowstone*’s curative deadlines
- § 16:187 — — —Disputes over tenant’s “timeliness”

# LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 16:188 — —Tenant possesses “desire and ability” to cure defaults
- § 16:189 — — —Failure to demonstrate “desire and ability” to cure
- § 16:190 — — —Tenant is not required to cure all defaults
- § 16:191 *Yellowstone’s* applicability to nonpayment of rent
- § 16:192 —In response to rent demand: *Yellowstone* not available
- § 16:193 — —Availability of post-judgment cure and “adequate remedy-at-law”
- § 16:194 — — —*Yellowstone’s* inapplicability to rent defaults
- § 16:195 —Service of “notice to cure” as predicate to holdover
- § 16:196 — —Commercial holdover affords no post-judgment cure
- § 16:197 — —Conditional limitation enforceable within commercial context
- § 16:198 — — —Compare: enforcement of conditional limitation for nonpayment of rent held contrary to public policy
- § 16:199 — —Conditional limitation not enforceable within residential context
- § 16:200 — — —Compare: availability of post-judgment cure in residential context in New York City
- § 16:201 Procedure
- § 16:202 —Papers in support of motion
- § 16:203 —Service of application
- § 16:204 — —Personal service of papers and pleadings is usually directed
- § 16:205 — —Supreme Court holds exclusive jurisdiction
- § 16:206 —Venue
- § 16:207 Court-imposed conditions
- § 16:208 —Undertakings
- § 16:209 — —Examples of undertaking requirements
- § 16:210 — —Lessor’s recovery may not be limited to sum set as undertaking
- § 16:211 —Payment of “use and occupancy”
- § 16:212 — —Justification for grant of “use and occupancy”
- § 16:213 Consequences of *Yellowstone’s* denial
- § 16:214 —*Res judicata* implications of *Yellowstone’s* denial
- § 16:215 Multiple notices to cure
- § 16:216 Curative options available to residential tenant within New York City
- § 16:217 —Statute’s application is limited to New York City’s residential dwellings
- § 16:218 —Post-judgment cure applies to ejectment actions

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 16:219 —New York City residential tenant may still move for *Yellowstone* relief
- § 16:220 — —Compare: when ten-day stay is sufficient time within which to effect the cure

## IV. “HP” PROCEEDINGS

- § 16:221 Overview
- § 16:222 Governing statutes, procedural mechanisms and other considerations
- § 16:223 —New York City Civil Court Act (“NYCCCA”)
- § 16:224 —Housing Maintenance Code (“HMC”)
- § 16:225 — —Duty applies to vacant apartments
- § 16:226 —Multiple Dwelling Law (“N.Y. Mult. Dwell. Law”)
- § 16:227 —Jurisdiction over “HP” proceedings
- § 16:228 —Some examples of “HP” proceedings
- § 16:229 —Petitioners in “HP” proceeding
- § 16:230 — —Evacuated tenants
- § 16:231 — — —Rationale for “HP’s” applicability to evacuees
- § 16:232 — —Licensees
- § 16:233 — — —Compare: squatters
- § 16:234 — —Rent-regulated tenants
- § 16:235 — —Subtenants
- § 16:236 —Parties who may not maintain “HP” proceeding
- § 16:237 —Department of Housing Preservation and Development (“HPD”)
- § 16:238 — —Emergency Repair Program
- § 16:239 — — —Recouping costs and expenses
- § 16:240 — — —Right to challenge an HPD lien
- § 16:241 — — —Owner’s right to challenge HPD’s charges for repairs
- § 16:242 —Respondents to “HP” proceeding
- § 16:243 — —“Owner,” defined
- § 16:244 — — —Condominium as “owner”
- § 16:245 — — —Piercing corporate veil
- § 16:246 — — —Compare: corporate officer not necessarily liable
- § 16:247 — — —Managing agent as “owner”
- § 16:248 — — —New York City as “owner”
- § 16:249 —Prerequisites to initiation of “HP” proceeding
- § 16:250 — —HPD fails to issue Notice of Violation
- § 16:251 — —HPD issues Notice of Violation and landlord fails to take corrective action
- § 16:252 — — —Compare: “hazardous” or “immediately hazardous” violations

# LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 16:253 — —Owner has incorrectly certified that all violations have been removed and HPD fails to reinspect
- § 16:254 —Content of Notice of Violation
- § 16:255 — —Service of Notice of Violation
- § 16:256 — — —Compare: “immediately hazardous” violations
- § 16:257 — —Time to correct violations
- § 16:258 — — —Extension of time to correct violations
- § 16:259 — —Certificate of correction
- § 16:260 — — —Failure to file certificate of correction
- § 16:261 — — —Reinspection
- § 16:262 —Procedural mechanics
- § 16:263 — —Petition or Affidavit
- § 16:264 — — —Required allegations
- § 16:265 — — —Relief sought
- § 16:266 — — —Verification
- § 16:267 — —Service
- § 16:268 — — —Place of service
- § 16:269 — — —Proof of service
- § 16:270 — —Fee
- § 16:271 — — —Waiver of court fees
- § 16:272 — —Notice of pendency may not be utilized
- § 16:273 — —*Prima facie* elements of the “HP” proceeding
- § 16:274 — —Ownership or other control by the respondent
- § 16:275 — —Tenancy
- § 16:276 — —Violations
- § 16:277 — —Defenses to “HP” proceeding
- § 16:278 — —Lack of jurisdiction
- § 16:279 — —Repairs have been completed
- § 16:280 — —Tenant’s lack of standing
- § 16:281 — —Economic infeasibility
- § 16:282 — —Defenses to “HP” proceeding—Economic infeasibility—Discovery in economic-infeasibility cases
- § 16:283 — —Defenses to “HP” proceeding—Economic infeasibility—Factors in evaluating this defense
- § 16:284 — — —Defense may not be used as a “shield”
- § 16:285 — —Result of a successful “HP” proceeding is “Order to Correct”
- § 16:286 — —Violation classifications: New York City
- § 16:287 — —Extension of time to correct
- § 16:288 — —Failure of owner to correct violations: compliance hearing
- § 16:289 — —Procedural posture

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 16:290 | — — —Service   |
| § 16:291 | — — —Defenses in mitigation of penalties   |
| § 16:292 | — — —Proving mitigation or elements thereof  |
| § 16:293 | — — —Absent mitigation, there can be no reduction<br>of fines                          |
| § 16:294 | — — —Penalties assessed  |
| § 16:295 | — — —“Non-hazardous” (Class “A”) violations  |
| § 16:296 | — — —“Hazardous” (Class “B”) violations  |
| § 16:297 | — — —“Immediately hazardous” (Class “C”) violations                                    |
| § 16:298 | — — — —Penalties for failure to provide heat or hot<br>water; temperature requirements |
| § 16:299 | — — — —Penalties involving illegal heating system                                      |
| § 16:300 | — — —False certification of correction   |
| § 16:301 | — — —Tenants do not recover penalties  |
| § 16:302 | —Settlement of fines   |
| § 16:303 | — — —Tenant input not necessarily dispositive  |
| § 16:304 | — — —Contempt proceedings  |
| § 16:305 | —Classification of “HP” contempt proceeding  |
| § 16:306 | —Judgment  |
| § 16:307 | —Attorney’s fees   |

## V. CONTEMPT PROCEEDINGS

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 16:308 | Overview  |
| § 16:309 | Statutory authority   |
| § 16:310 | —Criminal contempt  |
| § 16:311 | — — —Examples of conduct triggering criminal-<br>contempt sanctions |
| § 16:312 | —Civil contempt   |
| § 16:313 | — — —Examples of conduct triggering civil-contempt<br>sanctions     |
| § 16:314 | —Future contempts   |
| § 16:315 | —Standards of proof   |
| § 16:316 | — — —Criminal contempt  |
| § 16:317 | — — — —Elements for a finding of criminal contempt                  |
| § 16:318 | — — — —“Double jeopardy” protections                                |
| § 16:319 | — — —Civil contempt   |
| § 16:320 | — — — —Elements of civil-contempt finding                           |
| § 16:321 | —Procedural posture   |
| § 16:322 | — — —Form of criminal contempt application                          |
| § 16:323 | — — —Form of civil contempt application                             |
| § 16:324 | — — —Notice requirements  |
| § 16:325 | — — — —“Warning” on face of application                             |
| § 16:326 | — — —Service requirements of contempt applications                  |

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 16:327 — — —Civil contempt
- § 16:328 — — —Criminal contempt
- § 16:329 —Appointment of counsel
- § 16:330 —Jury trials
- § 16:331 — —Criminal contempt
- § 16:332 — — —“Petty offense” as opposed to “serious offense”
- § 16:333 — — —Contempt fine must comprise “serious” sanction
- § 16:334 — — —Corporations
- § 16:335 — —Civil contempt
- § 16:336 —Repercussions of contempt finding
- § 16:337 — —Civil contempt
- § 16:338 — — —When actual loss or damages not shown
- § 16:339 — — —Incarceration
- § 16:340 — —Criminal contempt
- § 16:341 — — —Incarceration
- § 16:342 — — —Fine
- § 16:343 — —Incarceration and fine
- § 16:344 Attorney’s fees

## VI. “POOR PERSON” PETITIONS

- § 16:345 Overview
- § 16:346 Purpose
- § 16:347 —Depositions
- § 16:348 — —Translation costs
- § 16:349 —Jury fees
- § 16:350 — —Time to make jury demand
- § 16:351 —Witness fees
- § 16:352 —Appeals
- § 16:353 — —Stenographic transcripts
- § 16:354 Content of application
- § 16:355 —When motion not necessary
- § 16:356 — —Attorney’s certification
- § 16:357 —Service of motion and papers
- § 16:358 —Order granting leave to prosecute as “poor person”
- § 16:359 Factors considered by court in determining whether “poor person” status should be granted
- § 16:360 —Mathematical calculations
- § 16:361 — —Examples of when poor-person status granted
- § 16:362 Assignment of counsel
- § 16:363 —Historically, assignment of counsel was required
- § 16:364 —Rebutting appointment of counsel
- § 16:365 —Assignment of counsel is not mandatory in civil disputes



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 16:366 —Private counsel: contingency-fee arrangements permitted
- § 16:367 Distribution of recovery

## VII. ILLEGAL EVICTIONS

- § 16:368 Overview
- § 16:369 —Types of “evictions”
- § 16:370 — —“Legal eviction”
- § 16:371 — — —Compare: “illegal eviction”
- § 16:372 — —Compare: constructive eviction
- § 16:373 —Historical perspective
- § 16:374 —“English” rule
- § 16:375 —Common law
- § 16:376 —Modifications to common law
- § 16:377 —Emergence of summary eviction-proceedings and forcible entry and detainer statutes
- § 16:378 — —Evolution of forcible entry and detainer statutes
- § 16:379 — —Composition of “forcible” entry
- § 16:380 —Pre-1981 unlawful entry and detainer statutes
- § 16:381 —Modern unlawful entry and detainer statutes
- § 16:382 Tenants’ entitlement to judicial proceedings after wrongful eviction
- § 16:383 Tenants’ right to judicial proceeding after wrongful eviction—Types of “tenants” within statute’s ambit
- § 16:384 — —Commercial tenants
- § 16:385 — —Manufactured-home tenants
- § 16:386 — —Subtenants
- § 16:387 — —Tenant evicted pursuant to judgment of possession later reversed
- § 16:388 — —“Thirty-day test” may protect other occupants
- § 16:389 —Defendants or respondents in illegal lock-out case
- § 16:390 —Agents or employees of landlord
- § 16:391 —City or governmental agency as landlord
- § 16:392 — —Compare: city or governmental agency may utilize “self-help” to evict non-tenants
- § 16:393 —Commercial-property owners
- § 16:394 —Hotel owners
- § 16:395 —Manufactured-home park owners
- § 16:396 —Prime tenants
- § 16:397 Procedural posture
- § 16:398 —Content of Affidavit
- § 16:399 —Venue
- § 16:400 —Statute of limitations

# LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 16:401 —Jurisdictional considerations
- § 16:402 —“Self-help” provision within lease
- § 16:403 —“Lock-out” permitted by lease reentry clause
- § 16:404 Tenant’s remedies
- § 16:405 —Treble damages
- § 16:406 — —Statutory history
- § 16:407 — —Prohibited conduct
- § 16:408 — —Application of statute to “tenant” or other party holding possessory entitlements
- § 16:409 — — —Physical possession is not required
- § 16:410 — —Treble damages are discretionary
- § 16:411 — —Treble damages distinguished from punitive damages
- § 16:412 — —Insurance coverage of treble damages award is proscribed
- § 16:413 —Punitive damages
- § 16:414 — —Simultaneous award of treble and punitive damages
- § 16:415 — — —Absent malice or heinous conduct, court will only award treble damages
- § 16:416 — —Insurance coverage of treble- and punitive-damage awards is proscribed
- § 16:417 —Compensatory damages
- § 16:418 — —Loss of profits
- § 16:419 —Emotional distress
- § 16:420 —Restoration
- § 16:421 Factors considered when party is seeking restoration
- § 16:422 —No statutory time frame for non-tenant’s occupancy
- § 16:423 — —Restoration without treble damages
- § 16:424 —Ejectment
- § 16:425 Illegal lock-out and new tenant
- § 16:426 —Factors impacting reinstatement
- § 16:427 — —New tenant forced to vacate
- § 16:428 — — —Compare: when new tenant will not be displaced
- § 16:429 —Procedural considerations when new tenant is in place
- § 16:430 —Impact of warrant of eviction
- § 16:431 Special proceeding to restore “non-tenant”
- § 16:432 —Parties
- § 16:433 —Elements of unlawful-eviction proceeding
- § 16:434 —“Self-help” evictions against non-tenants
- § 16:435 — —Squatters
- § 16:436 — —Licensees

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 16:437 — “Self-help” with assistance of police officers may be “peaceable”
- § 16:438 — —Compare: when police assistance is “forcible”
- § 16:439 — —Compare: landlord’s threat of imprisonment is “forcible”
- § 16:440 — “Self-help” is judicially discouraged
- § 16:441 — Relief available to non-tenant when “self-help” is forcefully used
- § 16:442 Illegal evictions within New York City: New York City Unlawful Eviction Law (“NYCUEL”)
- § 16:443 — 1984 amendment: coverage extended to one- and two-family dwellings
- § 16:444 — — 1985 amendment: coverage extended to tenants in occupancy for fewer than thirty days
- § 16:445 — Parties subject to NYCUEL’s protections
- § 16:446 Illegal evictions within New York City: New York City Unlawful Eviction Law (NYCUEL)—Parties subject to NYCUEL’s protections—Tenants
- § 16:447 — —Occupants for thirty days or longer
- § 16:448 — —Occupants for less than thirty days
- § 16:449 — —Licensees
- § 16:450 — —Squatters
- § 16:451 Illegal evictions within New York City: New York City Unlawful Eviction Law (“NYCUEL”)—Parties exempted from liability
- § 16:452 — Conduct proscribed
- § 16:453 — —Failure to restore
- § 16:454 — Criminal and civil penalties
- § 16:455 — —Criminal penalties
- § 16:456 — —Civil penalties

## VIII. APPOINTMENT OF GUARDIAN *AD LITEM*

- § 16:457 Court’s power to appoint guardian
- § 16:458 — Procedural predicates
- § 16:459 — Public-policy considerations
- § 16:460 — Mental Hygiene Law, distinguished
- § 16:461 — —Landlord may be excluded from Supreme Court proceedings

## IX. FORMS

- § 16:462 Form 16-1: Notice of petition for the appointment of an administrator pursuant to Article 7-A
- § 16:463 Form 16-2: Verified petition to appoint administrator pursuant to Article 7-A

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 16:464 Form 16-3: Verification: individual
- § 16:465 Form 16-4: Order to show cause for *Yellowstone* relief
- § 16:466 Form 16-5: Affidavit in support of *Yellowstone* relief
- § 16:467 Form 16-6: *Yellowstone* summons
- § 16:468 Form 16-7: Verified *Yellowstone* complaint
- § 16:469 Form 16-8: Verification: individual
- § 16:470 Form 16-9: Verification: corporate
- § 16:471 Form 16-10: Order to show cause directing the correction of violations
- § 16:472 Form 16-11: Verified petition in support of order to show cause directing the correction of violations
- § 16:473 Form 16-12: Verification: individual
- § 16:474 Form 16-13: Order to show cause to restore to the calendar for a compliance hearing and for assessment of civil penalties
- § 16:475 Form 16-14: Affidavit in support of order to show cause to restore to the calendar for a compliance hearing for the assessment of civil penalties
- § 16:476 Form 16-15: Judgment for civil penalties
- § 16:477 Form 16-16: Order to show cause to punish for contempt and for civil penalties (punishable by fine and/or imprisonment)
- § 16:478 Form 16-17: Affidavit in support of motion to punish for contempt
- § 16:479 Form 16-18: *Ex Parte* order granting leave to proceed as a “poor person” and to waive court fees
- § 16:480 Form 16-19: Affidavit in support of an application to commence an action as a “poor person”
- § 16:481 Form 16-20: Order to show cause for restoration and damages after unlawful eviction
- § 16:482 Form 16-21: Verified petition in support of order to show cause for restoration and damages resulting from unlawful eviction
- § 16:483 Form 16-22: Verification: individual
- § 16:484 Form 16-23 Verification: corporate
- § 16:485 Form 16-24: Order to show cause for restoration and damages after unlawful eviction of “non-tenant”
- § 16:486 Form 16-25: Verified petition in support of order to show cause for restoration of “non-tenant” to possession
- § 16:487 Form 16-26: Verification
- § 16:488 Form 16-27: Verification: corporate
- § 16:489 Notice of default (commercial)

APPENDIX 16-1. Civil Court Directive, Access Orders, Civil Court of the City of New York (10/17/89)

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- APPENDIX 16-2. Civil Court Directive, Poor Person  
Petitions—Free Index Numbers for HP  
Actions (11/16/92)
- APPENDIX 16-3. Civil Court Directive, Timeliness of Jury  
Demands in Summary Proceedings to  
Recover Real Property, Civil Court of the  
City of New York (6/08/98)
- APPENDIX 16-4. Civil Court Directives, Ejectment Actions in  
Civil Court, Civil Court of the City of  
New York (10/02/96)
- APPENDIX 16-5. Management of Pre-Pandemic Eviction  
Proceedings in the New York City Civil  
Court (Part I)
- APPENDIX 16-6. Management of Commercial Eviction  
Proceedings in the New York City Civil  
Court
- APPENDIX 16-7. Management of Pre-Pandemic Eviction  
Proceedings in the New York City Civil  
Court - Housing Part

# Table of Contents

## CHAPTER 17. ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEEDINGS

### I. STATE ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURE ACT GOVERNS AGENCY ADJUDICATION

- § 17:1 Commencing agency adjudicatory proceedings
- § 17:2 —Commencing a proceeding before the DHCR
- § 17:3 — —DHCR may institute proceedings
- § 17:4 — —Attorney General may commence a proceeding
- § 17:5 Notice requirement
- § 17:6 —Notice of hearing
- § 17:7 —Service of notice
- § 17:8 —Notice of DHCR proceedings
- § 17:9 — —Time to answer
- § 17:10 — —Actions by local rent administrator
- § 17:11 Hearings
- § 17:12 —Hearing may be informal
- § 17:13 — —“Fair trial” requirement
- § 17:14 — —Due process requirement
- § 17:15 —Hearings must meet minimum standards
- § 17:16 — —Agency may be divested of jurisdiction when prejudice to party results
- § 17:17 — —Reasonable-time requirement for adjudicatory proceedings
- § 17:18 —Failure to conduct hearing may render record insufficient
- § 17:19 —Discretionary hearings before DHCR
- § 17:20 Standard of review
- § 17:21 —Deference to agency’s interpretation
- § 17:22 —Standard of review to challenge regulation
- § 17:23 Evidence
- § 17:24 —Complete record
- § 17:25 — —No agency determinations based on evidence outside the record
- § 17:26 — —Inadequate record annuls agency’s decision
- § 17:27 —No requirement to comply with technical rules of evidence
- § 17:28 —Substantial-evidence standard
- § 17:29 — —Reviewing court exercises judicial function
- § 17:30 —Hearsay evidence

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 17:31 — —Hearsay admissible in administrative proceedings
- § 17:32 — — —Determination must be supported by some substantial evidence
- § 17:33 — — —Unsworn hearsay documentation not acceptable
- § 17:34 —Best evidence rule
- § 17:35 —Burden of proof
- § 17:36 —Weight and sufficiency of evidence
- § 17:37 — —Conflicting evidence
- § 17:38 — —Resulting inferences
- § 17:39 —Hearing officer must review all evidence
- § 17:40 — —Agency's witnesses must have firsthand knowledge
- § 17:41 — —Need not be same hearing officer
- § 17:42 —Presumption of validity
- § 17:43 Opportunity to be heard
- § 17:44 —Final opportunity to be heard
- § 17:45 —Lack of fact-finding hearing
- § 17:46 *Res judicata* applicable to administrative determinations
- § 17:47 —Administrative determination is binding on agency
- § 17:48 —Relation back to original complaint
- § 17:49 —Impact not limited to dispute's participants
- § 17:50 —Full and fair opportunity to contest prior decision required

## II. DHCR PETITION FOR ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW

- § 17:51 Introduction
- § 17:52 PAR must meet filing, form, and content requirements
- § 17:53 —Person filing must be "aggrieved"
- § 17:54 —Joint PAR may be filed
- § 17:55 —DHCR may consolidate PARs
- § 17:56 —Time for filing PAR
- § 17:57 — —Under rent-control regulations
- § 17:58 — — —Exception: certificate of eviction
- § 17:59 —Under ETPR
- § 17:60 — —Under New York City Rent Stabilization Code
- § 17:61 — —Time for filing PAR runs from "issuance date" of District Rent Office order
- § 17:62 — — —Presumption of parties' receipt of DHCR order

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|         |   |
|---------|---|
| § 17:63 | — — —Agency’s mailing of order to former owner<br>may not excuse default                        |
| § 17:64 | — — —Failure to file timely PAR bars reconsideration<br>of District Rent Office order           |
| § 17:65 | — — —Exception: request for reconsideration<br>permitted under limited circumstances            |
| § 17:66 | —Form and content of PAR  |
| § 17:67 | — —DHCR form must be used for PAR against<br>District Rent Office orders                        |
| § 17:68 | — — —Exception: no prescribed form for rent-<br>controlled units outside New York City          |
| § 17:69 | — —No prescribed form for PAR of state rent-<br>control regulations                             |
| § 17:70 | — — —Compare: RSC and ETPR  |
| § 17:71 | — —Letter does not satisfy PAR form requirements  |
| § 17:72 | — —Administrative review generally limited to<br>record before District Rent Office             |
| § 17:73 | Service and filing of PAR   |
| § 17:74 | —Filing requirements  |
| § 17:75 | —PAR filed against New York City district rent<br>office order concerning rent-stabilized units |
| § 17:76 | —PAR filed against order issued under rent control  |
| § 17:77 | — —Proof of service   |
| § 17:78 | Time for filing answer to PAR   |
| § 17:79 | —Under rent-control regulations   |
| § 17:80 | —Under rent-stabilization regulations   |
| § 17:81 | —Action by commissioner   |
| § 17:82 | Stays pending PAR determination   |
| § 17:83 | —Automatic stay of retroactive portion of order<br>pending PAR determination                    |
| § 17:84 | — —Example: rent overcharge   |
| § 17:85 | — —Example: certificate of eviction   |
| § 17:86 | —Additional discretionary stay of prospective<br>portion of order                               |
| § 17:87 | —Summary proceeding stayed pending PAR<br>determination   |
| § 17:88 | Final determination by commissioner   |
| § 17:89 | —Remand is not “final” determination  |
| § 17:90 | —Scope of relief  |
| § 17:91 | —Effect of change in law or regulations while PAR<br>is pending                                 |
| § 17:92 | —Time within which commissioner should take final<br>action                                     |
| § 17:93 | — —DHCR retains jurisdiction beyond time limits<br>for review of its orders                     |



- § 17:94 — — —Comity, judicial economy, and administrative finality
- § 17:95 —DHCR PAR denials must be reported to party
- § 17:96 Modification or revocation of PAR's determination based on illegality, irregularity in vital matters, or fraud
- § 17:97 —Correction of illegality
- § 17:98 —Reopening based on irregularity
- § 17:99 — —Example: irregularity in rent rollback
- § 17:100 — —Example: irregularity involving untimely PARs
- § 17:101 — —Example: irregularity in improper service of initial legal-rent notice
- § 17:102 — —Example: irregularity in service of administrative complaint
- § 17:103 — —Compare: DHCR's failure to mail reminder notice is not an irregularity
- § 17:104 —Modification of clerical errors
- § 17:105 —Advance notice of agency's election to reopen proceeding is not required
- § 17:106 Judicial review of final DHCR determination

### **III. ARTICLE 78 PROCEEDING TO COMPEL, PROHIBIT, OR REVIEW ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION**

- § 17:107 Purpose of an Article 78 proceeding
- § 17:108 Mandamus proceeding to compel action
- § 17:109 —Agency's jurisdiction not terminated by mandamus proceeding
- § 17:110 —Mandamus to compel final determination of PAR
- § 17:111 Prohibition proceeding
- § 17:112 —Class-action alternative
- § 17:113 Judicial-review proceeding
- § 17:114 —Exhaustion of administrative remedies is prerequisite
- § 17:115 — —Final administrative determination by DHCR
- § 17:116 — —Impact requirement
- § 17:117 — — —Remitted case not final determination
- § 17:118 — — — —DHCR can appeal remand order
- § 17:119 — —Exhaustion of remedies not applicable when agency action is beyond the grant of powers
- § 17:120 —Judicial review of "deemed denial" of DHCR PAR
- § 17:121 — —PAR "deemed denied" after ninety days
- § 17:122 — —"Deemed denial" does not constitute final determination on the merits
- § 17:123 —Statute of limitations for judicial review

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 17:124 | — — Four months, generally  |
| § 17:125 | — — — Exception: sixty days for final DHCR determinations   |
| § 17:126 | — — When statutory period begins to run   |
| § 17:127 | — — — Receipt requirement   |
| § 17:128 | — Scope of judicial review  |
| § 17:129 | — — No <i>de novo</i> review  |
| § 17:130 | — — Agency proceedings have different evidentiary standards   |
| § 17:131 | — Standard of review: “rational basis”  |
| § 17:132 | — — Agency interpretation is accorded deference   |
| § 17:133 | — — — Exception: when agency determination is <i>ultra vires</i>  |
| § 17:134 | — — Grounds for judicial review   |
| § 17:135 | — — — Action was “arbitrary and capricious”   |
| § 17:136 | — — — — Unreasonable agency delay may yield “arbitrary and capricious” determination  |
| § 17:137 | — Standard of review: “rational basis”—Grounds for judicial review—Action was “arbitrary and capricious”—Unruly meeting did not render determination arbitrary and capricious |
| § 17:138 | — Standard of review: “rational basis”—Grounds for judicial review—Determination not supported by substantial evidence  |
| § 17:139 | — — — — Whole-record rule   |
| § 17:140 | — — — — “Legal residuum rule” no longer applicable  |
| § 17:141 | — — — — “Quasi judicial” proceeding subject to substantial-evidence test  |
| § 17:142 | Litigating an Article 78 proceeding   |
| § 17:143 | — Supreme Court jurisdiction  |
| § 17:144 | — Party seeking review  |
| § 17:145 | — Time for service of Article 78 petition   |
| § 17:146 | — — Effect of error in time for service   |
| § 17:147 | — Service of process  |
| § 17:148 | — — Service on DHCR   |
| § 17:149 | — — — Timely service required on both DHCR and attorney general   |
| § 17:150 | — — Service on New York City Loft Board   |
| § 17:151 | — — Service by mail   |
| § 17:152 | — — Petition and notice of petition required to confer jurisdiction   |
| § 17:153 | — Pleadings   |
| § 17:154 | — — Verified pleadings  |
| § 17:155 | — — Answer must be specific   |
| § 17:156 | — — Submission of record  |

- § 17:157 — —Service of reply
- § 17:158 — —Evidentiary support required if triable issue of fact alleged
- § 17:159 — —Objection in point of law
- § 17:160 — — —Failure to state cause of action
- § 17:161 — —Pre-answer motion to dismiss
- § 17:162 — — —Procedure if motion to dismiss denied
- § 17:163 — —New matter in Answer
- § 17:164 —Transfer to Appellate Division
- § 17:165 — —Transfer analysis
- § 17:166 — —Substantial evidence questions must relate to facts
- § 17:167 — —Mere allegations insufficient to trigger transfer
- § 17:168 — —*De novo* review of transfer question
- § 17:169 —Stay of proceedings or enforcement
- § 17:170 — —Stay as ancillary relief only
- § 17:171 —Judgment
- § 17:172 — —Grant of initial or complete relief to petitioner
- § 17:173 — — —Incidental monetary relief
- § 17:174 — — — —Attorney’s fees
- § 17:175 — — — —Lost profits
- § 17:176 — — —Exception: when agency determination concerns federal regulation
- § 17:177 — —Dismissal of proceeding
- § 17:178 — — —Dismissal on merits
- § 17:179 —*Res judicata* and collateral estoppel
- § 17:180 — —*Res judicata* effect of prior Article 78 adjudication
- § 17:181 — —*Res judicata* effect of agency proceedings on courts

## CHAPTER 18. LOFTS AND SROS

### I. THE LOFT LAW

- § 18:1 Loft Law: historical perspective
- § 18:2 Overview of the 1982 statute
- § 18:3 —Interim multiple-dwelling (“IMD”) defined
- § 18:4 —Interim multiple dwelling (“IMD”) defined—  
Definition of IMD expanded tenant protections
- § 18:5 —Interim multiple dwelling (“IMD”) defined—  
“Living independently,” defined
- § 18:6 — —Non-residential use may be permitted
- § 18:7 — — —Some buildings are inherently incompatible with residential use

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|         |  |
|---------|--|
| § 18:8  | —Tenant protections  |
| § 18:9  | —Owner obligations   |
| § 18:10 | — —When registration not required  |
| § 18:11 | — —“Hardship exemptions”   |
| § 18:12 | — — —Deadline has lapsed   |
| § 18:13 | —Loft Board  |
| § 18:14 | — —Board’s composition   |
| § 18:15 | — —Delegation of responsibility  |
| § 18:16 | —Regulations   |
| § 18:17 | —Applications and determinations   |
| § 18:18 | — —Application procedures  |
| § 18:19 | — — —Amended pleadings   |
| § 18:20 | — — —“Affected parties,” defined   |
| § 18:21 | — — —Answers   |
| § 18:22 | — — — —Extensions of time to file an answer  |
| § 18:23 | — —Dispute referred for hearing  |
| § 18:24 | — —Conferences and hearings  |
| § 18:25 | — —Determinations  |
| § 18:26 | Appealing Board determinations   |
| § 18:27 | —Grounds for reconsideration   |
| § 18:28 | —1987 amendment  |
| § 18:29 | — —Constitutionality of 1987 amendment   |
| § 18:30 | — —“BRAC” tax  |
| § 18:31 | 1992 renewal statute   |
| § 18:32 | Subsequent renewal statutes  |
| § 18:33 | Coverage   |
| § 18:34 | —Registration  |
| § 18:35 | — —Circumstances requiring registration  |
| § 18:36 | — —Registration deadlines  |
| § 18:37 | — —Governing statute of limitations  |
| § 18:38 | — —Content of registration applications  |
| § 18:39 | — —Annual filing and fee requirement   |
| § 18:40 | —Coverage disputes   |
| § 18:41 | — —“Protected residential occupants,” defined  |
| § 18:42 | — —Protections extended to “prime lessee” and<br>“occupant in possession” prior to statute’s effective<br>date |
| § 18:43 | — — —“Prime lessee,” defined   |
| § 18:44 | — —Possession date is operative  |
| § 18:45 | — —Succession entitlements   |
| § 18:46 | Code compliance  |
| § 18:47 | —Legalization process, described   |
| § 18:48 | — —“Tenant-safety plan”  |
| § 18:49 | — —Narrative statement   |
| § 18:50 | — — —Content of narrative statement  |

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 18:51 — — —Service of narrative statement
- § 18:52 — — —Scheduling of conference
- § 18:53 — — —Occupant objections
- § 18:54 — — —Asserting claim of permanent “unreasonable interference”
- § 18:55 — — — —Permanent “unreasonable interference,” defined
- § 18:56 — — — —Examples: “unreasonable interference”
- § 18:57 — — — —Cost not dispositive
- § 18:58 — — — —Alternate plan must highlight cost increases
- § 18:59 — — — —Loft Board will initiate proceeding to resolve plan disputes
- § 18:60 — — — —Temporary “unreasonable interference” based upon work performance
- § 18:61 — — — —Diminishment of services
- § 18:62 — — — —Certification of plans
- § 18:63 — — — —Non-conforming units
- § 18:64 — — — —Decoverage
- § 18:65 — — — —Example: Board’s reluctance to decover units
- § 18:66 — — — —Access
- § 18:67 — — — —Notices required for work which will take one day or less
- § 18:68 — — — —Notices required for work which will take more than one day
- § 18:69 — — — —Access application
- § 18:70 — — — —Content of, and service procedures for, access application
- § 18:71 — — — —Occupant’s response
- § 18:72 — — — —Hearing
- § 18:73 — — — —Dismissal
- § 18:74 — — — —Penalty for noncompliance
- § 18:75 — — — —Compliance deadlines
- § 18:76 — — — —1982 statute
- § 18:77 — — — —Filing of narrative statement
- § 18:78 — — — —Present-day impact
- § 18:79 — — — —1987 amendment
- § 18:80 — — — —1992 renewal statute
- § 18:81 — — — —Filing of narrative statement
- § 18:82 — — — —“Deemed in compliance”
- § 18:83 — — — —Amendment not retroactive
- § 18:84 — — — —1996 renewal statute
- § 18:85 — — — —1999 renewal statute
- § 18:86 — — — —2001, 2002, and 2008 renewal statutes
- § 18:87 — — — —Consequences of untimely compliance or noncompliance

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 18:88  | — — Findings of noncompliance and civil penalties  |
| § 18:89  | — — — Defenses   |
| § 18:90  | — — — Consequences of nonpayment of fines  |
| § 18:91  | — — — Application for extension considered in tandem with noncompliance application              |
| § 18:92  | — — Inability to recover rent  |
| § 18:93  | — Applications for extensions of time  |
| § 18:94  | — — Applications to extend the pre-2002 deadlines are not moot                                   |
| § 18:95  | — — Securing extensions of time  |
| § 18:96  | Rent regulation  |
| § 18:97  | — Base rent/“Loft Board Order No. 1”   |
| § 18:98  | — — Amount set by lease in effect on December 21, 1982   |
| § 18:99  | — — Permissible escalators   |
| § 18:100 | — — — Examples: Loft Board’s incorporation of escalators into base rent                          |
| § 18:101 | — — Percentage increases   |
| § 18:102 | — — Surcharges   |
| § 18:103 | — Units covered by 1987 amendment  |
| § 18:104 | — 1992 renewal statute: increases upon completion of code-compliance steps                       |
| § 18:105 | — 1996, 1999, 2001, 2002, and 2010 renewal statutes  |
| § 18:106 | — Waiver of rights   |
| § 18:107 | — Treble damages   |
| § 18:108 | — Six-year statute of limitations  |
| § 18:109 | — — Operative timeframe  |
| § 18:110 | — Loft Board’s final rent-order  |
| § 18:111 | — — LE application   |
| § 18:112 | — — — Contents of application  |
| § 18:113 | — — — Financed work  |
| § 18:114 | — — — Precertification procedure   |
| § 18:115 | — — — — Certification by CPA   |
| § 18:116 | — — — — Certification by architect   |
| § 18:117 | — — — Auditors’ role   |
| § 18:118 | — — — — Is claimed work reimbursable?  |
| § 18:119 | — — — — Auditor will compare claimed charges with schedule of costs and apply regulatory formula |
| § 18:120 | — — — — Cost allocation  |
| § 18:121 | — — — Service and filing of application  |
| § 18:122 | — — — Tenants’ answer  |
| § 18:123 | — — — Executive Director’s role  |
| § 18:124 | — — — Rent increases   |
| § 18:125 | — — — — Code-compliance rent-increase  |

LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 18:126 — — — —RGB increase
- § 18:127 — — — —Loft Board’s order
- § 18:128 — — — —“Notice of RGB Increase” procedure
- § 18:129 — — — —Content of “Notice of RGB Increase” packet
- § 18:130 — — — —Service and filing
- § 18:131 Improvements
- § 18:132 — — — —Historical perspective
- § 18:133 — — — —Statutory protection
- § 18:134 — — — —Unanswered questions
- § 18:135 — — — —“Improvements,” defined
- § 18:136 — — — —“Fixtures,” defined
- § 18:137 — — — —“Alterations and development,” defined
- § 18:138 — — — —Removable items and statutory rights excluded
- § 18:139 — — — —Procedure for selling and buying improvements
- § 18:140 — — — —Expedited procedure
- § 18:141 — — — —Disclosure Form
- § 18:142 — — — —Content of Disclosure Form
- § 18:143 — — — —Service of Disclosure Form
- § 18:144 — — — —“Ten advisories”
- § 18:145 — — — —Second sales prohibited
- § 18:146 — — — —Challenge application
- § 18:147 — — — —Why most challenge applications dispute fair  
market value
- § 18:148 — — — —“Good-faith estimate” required
- § 18:149 — — — —Filing requirements
- § 18:150 — — — —Consequences of owner’s action or inaction
- § 18:151 — — — —Tenant’s answer
- § 18:152 — — — —Tenant objections to propriety of challenge  
application
- § 18:153 — — — —Hearing
- § 18:154 — — — —Right to purchase at price determined by  
Loft Board
- § 18:155 — — — —Rent deregulated upon owner’s purchase of  
improvements
- § 18:156 — — — —Rights of incoming tenant if owner does not  
purchase
- § 18:157 — — — —Participation of incoming tenant not needed  
to effect sale
- § 18:158 — — — —Filing requirements
- § 18:159 — — — —Penalties for noncompliance
- § 18:160 — — — —“Fair-market value,” defined
- § 18:161 — — — —“Fair-market value” not reduced when  
improvements are not code compliant
- § 18:162 — — — —Rebuttable presumption of fair-market value
- § 18:163 — — — —Depreciation

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 18:164 | —Who has right to sell                                    |
| § 18:165 | — —Protected residential occupant                         |
| § 18:166 | — —Non-primary resident                                   |
| § 18:167 | Sale of rights  |
| § 18:168 | —Filing requirements                                      |
| § 18:169 | — —Content of “Rider B”                                   |
| § 18:170 | — —Content of “Inspection Form”                           |
| § 18:171 | Abandonment   |
| § 18:172 | —“Abandonment,” defined                                   |
| § 18:173 | —Examples: “abandonment” cases                            |
| § 18:174 | Summary proceedings                                       |
| § 18:175 | —Nonpayment proceedings                                   |
| § 18:176 | — —Registration requirement                               |
| § 18:177 | — —Conformance with code-compliance timetable<br>required |
| § 18:178 | —Holdover proceedings                                     |
| § 18:179 | — —Registration requirement                               |
| § 18:180 | — —Grounds for proceeding’s institution                   |
| § 18:181 | — — —Subletting   |
| § 18:182 | — — —Profiteering   |
| § 18:183 | — —Predicate notices                                      |

## II. SINGLE ROOM OCCUPANCY UNITS (“SROS”)

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 18:184 | “SROs,” defined                                      |
| § 18:185 | —Classification of SRO buildings                     |
| § 18:186 | — —“Multiple dwelling,” defined                      |
| § 18:187 | — —“Class A” multiple dwelling, defined              |
| § 18:188 | — —“Class B” multiple dwelling, defined              |
| § 18:189 | History and background of SROs                       |
| § 18:190 | —SROs were once considered a “blight”                |
| § 18:191 | —Enactment of legislative protections                |
| § 18:192 | — —“Anti-harassment” protections                     |
| § 18:193 | — —“Moratoriums” on development                      |
| § 18:194 | — — —Hardship exemptions                             |
| § 18:195 | —Number of SRO units as of last survey               |
| § 18:196 | Rent-stabilization protection and exemptions         |
| § 18:197 | —“Hotel,” defined                                    |
| § 18:198 | —“Transient occupancy,” defined                      |
| § 18:199 | —“Permanent tenant,” defined                         |
| § 18:200 | — —Rights of permanent tenants                       |
| § 18:201 | — — —“Notice of Rights”                              |
| § 18:202 | — — —Entitlement to continued occupancy              |
| § 18:203 | — — —Grounds for eviction (without DHCR<br>approval) |



## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 18:204 — — — Grounds for evictions (with DHCR approval)
- § 18:205 — — — Protections against “harassment”
- § 18:206 — — — Legal regulated rent
- § 18:207 — — — Rent increases
- § 18:208 — — — Registration requirements
- § 18:209 — — — Overcharges
- § 18:210 — — — Provide written receipt for rent
- § 18:211 — — — Required services
- § 18:212 Taxes
- § 18:213 — New York City Hotel Room Occupancy Tax
- § 18:214 — — “Permanent resident” not required to pay tax
- § 18:215 — — Includes percentage tax and fixed dollar amount
- § 18:216 — — — Fixed-dollar amount: how assessed
- § 18:217 — State and city sales-tax
- § 18:218 — — “Permanent resident” is defined differently from “permanent tenant”
- § 18:219 Unlawful Eviction Law
- § 18:220 — Consequences of “illegal lockout”
- § 18:221 Local Law 19 of 1983 (the SRO anti-harassment statute)
- § 18:222 — How triggered (mechanisms of law)
- § 18:223 — “Single room occupancy multiple dwelling,” defined
- § 18:224 — — If “Class A,” must actually be used as a rooming house
- § 18:225 — Statutory exemptions
- § 18:226 — — HPD “approved programs”
- § 18:227 — Waivers
- § 18:228 — “Harassment,” defined
- § 18:229 — — Presumptions
- § 18:230 — “Inquiry period,” defined
- § 18:231 — Application
- § 18:232 — — Who should file application
- § 18:233 — — Content of application
- § 18:234 — — Filing fee
- § 18:235 — Process
- § 18:236 — — Notice of application
- § 18:237 — — Initial-determination stage
- § 18:238 — — Hearing stage
- § 18:239 — — HPD decisions
- § 18:240 — Post-determination stage
- § 18:241 — Suspension and rescission of certification
- § 18:242 — Survived constitutional challenge

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 18:243 Local Law 68 of 2014—“Harassment,” defined

### III. LOFT AND SRO MATERIALS

§ 18:244 Loft Board  
§ 18:245 SRO Housing  
§ 18:246 —DHPD  
§ 18:247 —DHCR  
§ 18:248 —Rent Guidelines Board

### IV. FORMS

§ 18:249 Application for certification of no harassment or exemption

APPENDIX 18-1. Notice of Rights (DHCR Advisory Opinion 87-2)  
APPENDIX 18-2. Rent Guidelines Board Hotel Orders #1 through #53 (1971 to 2024)  
APPENDIX 18-3. 2015 Hotel Order #45  
APPENDIX 18-4. 2016 Hotel Order #46  
APPENDIX 18-5. 2017 Hotel Order #47  
APPENDIX 18-6. 2018 Hotel Order #48  
APPENDIX 18-7. 2019 Hotel Order #49  
APPENDIX 18-8. 2020 Hotel Order #50  
APPENDIX 18-9. 2021 Hotel Order #51  
APPENDIX 18-10. 2022 Hotel Order #52  
APPENDIX 18-11. 2023 Hotel Order #53  
APPENDIX 18-12. 2024 Hotel Order #54

## CHAPTER 19. GOVERNMENT SUBSIDIZED HOUSING

### I. FEDERAL PROGRAMS

§ 19:1 Federal programs, in general  
§ 19:2 “Section 8” housing program  
§ 19:3 —Types of Section 8 programs  
§ 19:4 —Rental-rehabilitation housing programs  
§ 19:5 —New construction  
§ 19:6 —Substantially-rehabilitated housing  
§ 19:7 —Basis of subsidy  
§ 19:8 —Attachment to tenant  
§ 19:9 —Attachment to structure

## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 19:10 — —Term of certificate or voucher
- § 19:11 —Compare: landlord required to continue to accept  
Section 8 vouchers after landlord opts-out of a  
project-based program
- § 19:12 —Eligibility for Section 8 assistance
- § 19:13 — —“Low-income families,” defined
- § 19:14 — —“Very low-income families,” defined
- § 19:15 — —Compare: Westchester County
- § 19:16 — —Notice of denial
- § 19:17 — —Grounds for denial
- § 19:18 — —Informal review
- § 19:19 — — —Exception
- § 19:20 —Amount of assistance
- § 19:21 — —Certificate program
- § 19:22 — —Voucher program
- § 19:23 — —Vacancy payments
- § 19:24 —Private-landlord participation
- § 19:25 — —Disapproval of tenant’s application to lease  
particular unit
- § 19:26 — — —Mandatory disapproval of owners
- § 19:27 — — —Discretionary denial
- § 19:28 — —Termination or expiration of the assistance  
contract
- § 19:29 — —Termination of housing-assistance payments to  
landlord
- § 19:30 —Preemption of state and local law
- § 19:31 — —Compare: rent-regulated lease superseded
- § 19:32 — —Compare: occupancy restrictions
- § 19:33 —Interpretation
- § 19:34 —Creation of Section 8 tenancy
- § 19:35 —Tenant selection
- § 19:36 — —Preferences
- § 19:37 — — —Federal preferences
- § 19:38 — — —Local preferences
- § 19:39 — — —Preference for senior citizens
- § 19:40 — — —Non waiting-list assistance
- § 19:41 — —Example: priority
- § 19:42 — —Permissible screening standards
- § 19:43 —Rental agreement
- § 19:44 — —HUD addendum example: new construction
- § 19:45 — —Prohibited provisions
- § 19:46 — —Renewal leases
- § 19:47 — — —Compare: public-housing agencies
- § 19:48 —Amount of rent and rent increases
- § 19:49 — —Initial rent

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|         |   |
|---------|---|
| § 19:50 | — — —Maximum ceiling  |
| § 19:51 | — — —Tenants may sue for rent overcharges                           |
| § 19:52 | — — —Compare: no federal “due process”<br>challenge                 |
| § 19:53 | — — —“Reasonableness” limitation                                    |
| § 19:54 | — — —Voucher program  |
| § 19:55 | — — —Local rent-regulation applies                                  |
| § 19:56 | — — —Exceptions: exemptions from state and local<br>rent-regulation |
| § 19:57 | — — —Rent adjustments during tenancy term                           |
| § 19:58 | — — —Annual increases   |
| § 19:59 | — — —No due process right to “formula”<br>rent-increases            |
| § 19:60 | — — —Increases based on landlord’s costs                            |
| § 19:61 | — — —Limitations on increases in the assistance<br>payment          |
| § 19:62 | — — —Obligations during Section 8 tenancy                           |
| § 19:63 | — — —Landlord obligations   |
| § 19:64 | — — —Examples of habitability standards                             |
| § 19:65 | — — —Inspection obligations   |
| § 19:66 | — — —Remedies   |
| § 19:67 | — — —Damages  |
| § 19:68 | — — —Tenant obligations   |
| § 19:69 | — — —Housing-agency liability                                       |
| § 19:70 | — — —Application of security deposit                                |
| § 19:71 | — — —Enforcement  |
| § 19:72 | — — —Security deposits  |
| § 19:73 | — — —Termination of Section 8 tenancies                             |
| § 19:74 | — — —“Good cause” required  |
| § 19:75 | — — —Breach of the lease  |
| § 19:76 | — — —Violations of law  |
| § 19:77 | — — —“Other good cause”   |
| § 19:78 | — — —Exception to “other good cause”<br>termination                 |
| § 19:79 | — — —Waiver inapplicable  |
| § 19:80 | — — —Nonpayment by housing agency                                   |
| § 19:81 | — — —Termination by tenant  |
| § 19:82 | — — —Service of termination notice                                  |
| § 19:83 | — — —Notice of termination of assistance-payments<br>contract       |
| § 19:84 | — — —Compare: <i>Williams</i> consent judgment                      |
| § 19:85 | — — —Certification procedures                                       |
| § 19:86 | — — —Housing-authority objection                                    |
| § 19:87 | — — —When certification is required                                 |
| § 19:88 | — — —Intervention   |

# LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 19:89  | — — — —Joining housing authority as party  |
| § 19:90  | — — — —Tenant's response-time  |
| § 19:91  | — — — —Content of Certification  |
| § 19:92  | — — — —Other notices   |
| § 19:93  | — — — —Recovering unpaid subsidies   |
| § 19:94  | — — —Notice of Petition and Petition   |
| § 19:95  | — —Termination and eviction procedures   |
| § 19:96  | — —Compare: tenants of public-housing projects are<br>entitled to administrative hearing |
| § 19:97  | — — —Exception to hearing requirement  |
| § 19:98  | — — —Rights of other household members to<br>hearing                                     |
| § 19:99  | — — —Challenging validity of termination notices   |
| § 19:100 | — — —Review procedures   |
| § 19:101 | — —Attorney's fees   |
| § 19:102 | —Restoration as remedy for wrongful eviction   |
| § 19:103 | Targeted Section 8   |
| § 19:104 | HOME program   |
| § 19:105 | —Eligible housing  |
| § 19:106 | — —Mixed housing   |
| § 19:107 | —Rental assistance   |
| § 19:108 | — —Assistance contract   |
| § 19:109 | — —Amount of assistance  |
| § 19:110 | —Tenant selection and income qualifications  |
| § 19:111 | — —Federal preferences   |
| § 19:112 | —Rental agreement  |
| § 19:113 | —Amount of rent  |
| § 19:114 | — —Rent increases  |
| § 19:115 | —Landlord obligations  |
| § 19:116 | —Tenant obligations  |
| § 19:117 | — —Security deposits   |
| § 19:118 | —Participating jurisdiction's responsibilities   |
| § 19:119 | —Termination of tenancy  |
| § 19:120 | Loan programs  |
| § 19:121 | —Types of loan programs  |
| § 19:122 | —General requirements of loan programs   |
| § 19:123 | — —Landlord participation  |
| § 19:124 | — — —Eligibility   |
| § 19:125 | — — —Disapproval   |
| § 19:126 | — — —Review of disapproval   |
| § 19:127 | — —Tenant selection  |
| § 19:128 | — — —Eligibility restrictions  |
| § 19:129 | — —Tenant notices  |
| § 19:130 | — —Tenant organization   |
| § 19:131 | — —Rental agreement  |

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 19:132 | — —Rent increases                                 |
| § 19:133 | — —Right of action                                |
| § 19:134 | — —Hazard reduction                               |
| § 19:135 | —Termination of tenancies in subsidized projects  |
| § 19:136 | — —“Good cause” required                          |
| § 19:137 | — — —Grounds for termination                      |
| § 19:138 | — —Notice terminating the tenancy                 |
| § 19:139 | — —Eviction                                       |
| § 19:140 | — —Termination of tenancies in HUD-owned projects |
| § 19:141 | —Adjusting affordability restrictions             |
| § 19:142 | — —Grounds for disapproval                        |
| § 19:143 | — — —“Materially increased hardship,” defined     |
| § 19:144 | — — —Sufficiency of affordable housing            |
| § 19:145 | — —Federal incentives and transfer                |
| § 19:146 | — — —Disapproval                                  |
| § 19:147 | — — —Rent increases                               |
| § 19:148 | — — —Housing standards                            |
| § 19:149 | — — —Qualified purchasers                         |
| § 19:150 | — — — —“Priority purchasers,” defined             |
| § 19:151 | — — — —“Qualified purchasers,” defined            |
| § 19:152 | — — — —“Resident councils,” defined               |
| § 19:153 | — —Notice to tenants                              |
| § 19:154 | —Preemption                                       |
| § 19:155 | — —Preemption request                             |
| § 19:156 | — — —Notice to tenants                            |
| § 19:157 | — — —Notice of intent to file preemption request  |
| § 19:158 | — — —Content of preemption request                |
| § 19:159 | — — —Decision                                     |
| § 19:160 | — —Rent increases                                 |
| § 19:161 | — —Maintaining affordability restrictions         |
| § 19:162 | —Section 221                                      |
| § 19:163 | — —Eligibility                                    |
| § 19:164 | — —Amount of rent and rent increases              |
| § 19:165 | — — —Due process                                  |
| § 19:166 | —Section 236 Housing Program                      |
| § 19:167 | — —Interest-reduction payments                    |
| § 19:168 | — —Rental-assistance payments                     |
| § 19:169 | — — —Eligibility                                  |
| § 19:170 | — — — —Determination of eligibility               |
| § 19:171 | — — — —Tenant categories                          |
| § 19:172 | — — —Amount of assistance                         |
| § 19:173 | — — —Rental agreement                             |
| § 19:174 | Rent-supplement assistance                        |

- § 19:175 Low-income housing credits
- § 19:176 —Landlord participation
- § 19:177 —Eligibility
- § 19:178 —Contract term
- § 19:179 —Credit amount
- § 19:180 —Amount of rent
- § 19:181 —State monitoring
- § 19:182 —Other programs

## II. NEW YORK STATE PROGRAMS

- § 19:183 Generally
- § 19:184 Housing companies
- § 19:185 —Limited-profit housing companies  
    ("Mitchell-Lamas")
- § 19:186 — —New York City
- § 19:187 —Limited-dividend housing companies
- § 19:188 —Redevelopment companies
- § 19:189 — —Supervision
- § 19:190 — —Senior citizen rent subsidies
- § 19:191 — —New York City
- § 19:192 General requirements
- § 19:193 —Income requirements
- § 19:194 — —Income amount
- § 19:195 — —Income increases
- § 19:196 —Tenant selection
- § 19:197 — —Senior citizen set-asides
- § 19:198 — —Preferences
- § 19:199 — —Intra-project transfers
- § 19:200 — —Admissions criteria
- § 19:201 — — —Disapproval
- § 19:202 — —Succession entitlements
- § 19:203 —Rental agreement
- § 19:204 — —Required provisions
- § 19:205 — —Leasing interview
- § 19:206 — —Staff apartments
- § 19:207 —Amount of rent and rent increases
- § 19:208 — —Rent increases
- § 19:209 — — —Notice of rent change
- § 19:210 — —Additional rent
- § 19:211 —Parties' respective obligations during tenancy
- § 19:212 — —Landlord obligations
- § 19:213 — — —Housing standards
- § 19:214 — — —Special services
- § 19:215 — — —Privacy of tenant information

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 19:216 | — — —Tenant associations                                    |
| § 19:217 | — —Tenant obligations                                       |
| § 19:218 | — — —Security deposits                                      |
| § 19:219 | —Project rules and regulations                              |
| § 19:220 | —Termination of tenancy                                     |
| § 19:221 | — —Nonpayment of rent                                       |
| § 19:222 | — —Abandonment  |
| § 19:223 | — —Holdover proceedings                                     |
| § 19:224 | — — —Exception to eviction certification                    |
| § 19:225 | — —Procedure  |
| § 19:226 | —Dissolution  |
| § 19:227 | — —Permitted dissolution                                    |
| § 19:228 | — —Certificate of no objection                              |
| § 19:229 | — — —Exception  |
| § 19:230 | — —Notice of intent to dissolve                             |
| § 19:231 | — — —Content of notice                                      |
| § 19:232 | — — —Tax exemption  |
| § 19:233 | — — —Final notice   |
| § 19:234 | — —Public-information meeting                               |
| § 19:235 | — —Rent regulation  |
| § 19:236 | Capital programs  |
| § 19:237 | —Low-income housing trust-fund program                      |
| § 19:238 | — —Landlord participation                                   |
| § 19:239 | — — —“Eligible areas,” defined                              |
| § 19:240 | — — —Sale of premises                                       |
| § 19:241 | — — —Contract term/regulatory period                        |
| § 19:242 | — — —Profits  |
| § 19:243 | — — —Performance review                                     |
| § 19:244 | — —Tenant selection   |
| § 19:245 | — — —“Very low-income,” defined                             |
| § 19:246 | — — —Preferences  |
| § 19:247 | — — —Income verification                                    |
| § 19:248 | — — —Displacement prohibited                                |
| § 19:249 | — —Local rent-regulation                                    |
| § 19:250 | — — —Exception  |
| § 19:251 | — —Oversight  |
| § 19:252 | — — —Remedies for breach                                    |
| § 19:253 | — —Rental agreement   |
| § 19:254 | — — —Additional protection for disabled and elderly tenants |
| § 19:255 | — — —Tenants’ rights and responsibilities                   |
| § 19:256 | — — —Non-English speaking communities                       |
| § 19:257 | — —Amount of rent   |
| § 19:258 | — — —Rent increases   |



## LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 19:259 — — — — Rent increase based upon increased income
- § 19:260 — — Applicability of rent regulations
- § 19:261 — — Low-income turnkey housing trust fund program
- § 19:262 — — Eligible developers
- § 19:263 — — — Negligence liability
- § 19:264 — — Eligible landlords
- § 19:265 — — — Sale of premises
- § 19:266 — — Tenant selection
- § 19:267 — — — Preferences
- § 19:268 — — — Income verification
- § 19:269 — — — Rental agreement
- § 19:270 — — Amount of rent
- § 19:271 — — — Rent increases
- § 19:272 — — Regulatory period
- § 19:273 — — Oversight
- § 19:274 — — — Remedies for breach
- § 19:275 Housing Development Fund
- § 19:276 — — Loan eligibility
- § 19:277 — — Housing Development Fund Companies (“HDFCs”)
- § 19:278 — — Tenant eligibility
- § 19:279 Municipal Housing Development Funds
- § 19:280 — — Rural Rental Assistance Program
- § 19:281 — — — “Rural areas,” defined
- § 19:282 — — Amount of assistance
- § 19:283 — — Landlord participation
- § 19:284 — — Tenant selection
- § 19:285 — — — Preferences
- § 19:286 — — Amount of rent and rent increases

### III. NEW YORK CITY PROGRAMS

- § 19:287 Generally
- § 19:288 Loan programs
- § 19:289 — — Tenant selection
- § 19:290 — — Preferences
- § 19:291 — — Amount of rent and rent increases
- § 19:292 — — Security deposits
- § 19:293 — — Inspection
- § 19:294 — — Termination of tenancy
- § 19:295 Tax-exemption programs
- § 19:296 — — “J-51” Program
- § 19:297 — — Eligibility
- § 19:298 — — Rent regulation

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 19:299 — —Affidavit of no harassment
- § 19:300 — —Rental agreement
- § 19:301 — —SCRIE
- § 19:302 — —421-a tax exemption
- § 19:303 — —Rental agreement
- § 19:304 — —Amount of rent and rent increases

## IV. FORMS

- § 19:305 Form 19-1: Certification of basis for eviction proceeding against tenant participating in the section 8 existing housing program
- § 19:306 Form 19-2: Notice to tenants of preemption request
- APPENDIX 19-1. Williams v. New York City Housing Authority - Second Partial Consent Judgment
- APPENDIX 19-2. Procedures for Commencing Housing Court Cases against Tenants in the Section 8 Existing Housing Certificate or Voucher Program (1995)

## CHAPTER 20. BANKRUPTCY IMPLICATIONS

### I. BANKRUPTCY COURT

- § 20:1 Source and history of United States bankruptcy law
- § 20:2 Bankruptcy Reform Act of 1978
- § 20:3 — —Bankruptcy court's coequal jurisdiction deemed unconstitutional
- § 20:4 — —Bankruptcy court is subordinate unit of district court
- § 20:5 — —Designation of bankruptcy courts
- § 20:6 — —Appointment of bankruptcy judges
- § 20:7 — — —New York State's districts and judges
- § 20:8 — — —Judicial Conference makes recommendations
- § 20:9 — — —Assessment of need for bankruptcy judges
- § 20:10 — — —Appointment terms
- § 20:11 — — —Dispute as to appointment
- § 20:12 — — —Bankruptcy judges may serve in proximate districts
- § 20:13 — — —Removal of bankruptcy judges
- § 20:14 — — —Bankruptcy judges' salaries and character of service
- § 20:15 — —Chief bankruptcy judge

LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 20:16 — —Bankruptcy judges' staff
- § 20:17 The Bankruptcy Abuse Prevention and Consumer Protection Act of 2005 ("BAPCPA")
- § 20:18 Powers of bankruptcy court
- § 20:19 —Bankruptcy court is "court of equity"
- § 20:20 — —"Estoppel," defined
- § 20:21 —Limitation of "equitable power"
- § 20:22 —Power to modify or vacate stipulations and prior orders
- § 20:23 — —*Nunc pro tunc* orders are permitted as justice requires
- § 20:24 —Bankruptcy courts may impose remedies for debtor's abusive practices
- § 20:25 — —Bankruptcy court may award sanctions and impose attorney's fees
- § 20:26 Jurisdiction of bankruptcy cases and proceedings
- § 20:27 —"Case under the Code," defined
- § 20:28 —"Proceedings" arising under Code, or arising in or related to case under the Code, defined
- § 20:29 —"Arising under the Code," or "arising in or related to a case under the Code," defined
- § 20:30 — —Abstention from hearing certain cases
- § 20:31 Jurisdiction over "property"
- § 20:32 Venue of Code cases
- § 20:33 Venue of proceedings "arising under the Code" or "arising in or related to cases under the Code"
- § 20:34 —Venue of proceedings "arising in or related to a case under the Code" which are brought by the trustee appointed in such case
- § 20:35 Right to jury trials in personal injury or wrongful-death case preserved
- § 20:36 Change of venue permitted
- § 20:37 Removal and remand of claims related to bankruptcy cases
- § 20:38 —Equitable considerations that warrant decision to remand
- § 20:39 —Eviction proceedings should be remanded to state court
- § 20:40 —Compare: equitable grounds that trigger abstention
- § 20:41 Procedures
- § 20:42 —Bankruptcy judges hear and determine all cases under Code and all "core proceedings"
- § 20:43 — —"Core" v. "noncore" distinction
- § 20:44 — —"Core proceeding," defined
- § 20:45 — —Examples of "core" proceedings
- § 20:46 — —"Noncore" proceeding, defined

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 20:47 — —Core/noncore dichotomy is issue of law for bankruptcy court’s determination
- § 20:48 — —Bankruptcy court’s core/noncore determination is subject to *de novo* district court review
- § 20:49 — —Bankruptcy judges may hear “noncore” proceeding that is otherwise related to Code case
- § 20:50 — —Abstention from hearing certain cases
- § 20:51 — —Abstention provisions implicate question of whether bankruptcy court should exercise jurisdiction
- § 20:52 — —Factors relevant to bankruptcy court’s decision whether to abstain
- § 20:53 — —State-court eviction proceedings
- § 20:54 — —Adversary proceeding involving state landlord-tenant law
- § 20:55 — —Compare: equitable grounds that warrant decision to remand
- § 20:56 — —Appealability of bankruptcy court’s abstention decision
- § 20:57 — —District court may withdraw any case or proceeding referred to bankruptcy court
- § 20:58 — —Jury trials
- § 20:59 — —Appeals to district court
- § 20:60 — —Appellate procedure
- § 20:61 — —Court of appeals conducts plenary review
- § 20:62 — —Standards governing stay pending appeal

## II. UNITED STATES TRUSTEE

- § 20:63 Generally
- § 20:64 Appointment and term of the United States trustee
- § 20:65 Appointment of assistant United States trustees
- § 20:66 Official stations
- § 20:67 — —Removal of trustee
- § 20:68 Vacancies in the office of the United States trustee
- § 20:69 Duties of the United States trustee and supervision by the Attorney General
- § 20:70 — —United States trustees supervise and may serve as the chapter trustees
- § 20:71 — —United States trustees supervise the administration of cases and the chapter trustees
- § 20:72 — —United States trustee may appoint a “standing trustee”
- § 20:73 Compare: Chapter 7, 11, or 13 trustee

## III. UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY CODE AND RULES ORGANIZATION AND STRUCTURE

- § 20:74 Title 11 of United States Code

- § 20:75 Code organization
- § 20:76 —Configuration of Code chapters
- § 20:77 —Official Code citation will reflect chapter and section
- § 20:78 Bankruptcy Rules, local-court rules, and judge’s rules govern procedure
- § 20:79 —Bankruptcy Rules
- § 20:80 —General provisions of bankruptcy rules
- § 20:81 — —Rule 9010: Representation and Appearances

#### IV. RELEVANT DEFINITIONS AND RULES OF CONSTRUCTION

- § 20:82 “Adequate assurance of future performance,” defined
- § 20:83 “Adequate assurance of prompt cure,” defined
- § 20:84 “Administrative expense,” defined
- § 20:85 “Adversary proceedings,” defined
- § 20:86 “Allowed” claim, defined
- § 20:87 “After notice and a hearing,” defined
- § 20:88 Bankruptcy “trustee,” defined
- § 20:89 —Compare: United States trustee
- § 20:90 “Claim,” defined
- § 20:91 —“Contingent claim,” defined
- § 20:92 —“Right to payment,” defined
- § 20:93 “Claim against the debtor,” defined
- § 20:94 “Consumer debt,” defined
- § 20:95 “Contested matters,” defined
- § 20:96 —“Contested matters” are brought by motion
- § 20:97 —Applicable procedural rules
- § 20:98 “Creditor,” defined
- § 20:99 —Code classifies several different types of creditors
- § 20:100 “Cure,” defined
- § 20:101 “Debt,” defined
- § 20:102 “Debtor,” defined
- § 20:103 “Default,” defined
- § 20:104 “Entity,” defined
- § 20:105 “Equity security,” defined
- § 20:106 “Equity security holder,” defined
- § 20:107 “Estate property,” defined
- § 20:108 “Executory contract,” defined
- § 20:109 “Indenture,” defined
- § 20:110 “Indenture trustee”
- § 20:111 “Individual with regular income,” defined
- § 20:112 “Involuntary case,” defined

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 20:113 | —Requirements for commencement of involuntary case                             |
| § 20:114 | “Joint case,” defined  |
| § 20:115 | “May not,” defined   |
| § 20:116 | “Order for relief,” defined  |
| § 20:117 | —“Order for relief” distinguished from “petition date” and “commencement date” |
| § 20:118 | “Party-in-interest,” generally   |
| § 20:119 | “Person,” defined  |
| § 20:120 | “Petition,” defined  |
| § 20:121 | “Prompt cure,” defined   |
| § 20:122 | “Proof of claim,” defined  |
| § 20:123 | —Simultaneous petitions prohibited   |
| § 20:124 | “Single asset real estate,” defined  |
| § 20:125 | “Small business debtor,” defined   |
| § 20:126 | “Transfer,” defined  |
| § 20:127 | BAPCPA: new definitions  |
| § 20:128 | “Voluntary case,” defined  |
| § 20:129 | —“Debtor’s principal residence,” defined                                       |
| § 20:130 | —“Incidental property,” defined  |

## V. OVERVIEW OF CODE CHAPTERS 7, 11 AND 13

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 20:131 | Chapter 7: “Liquidation”                                 |
| § 20:132 | —Who may be chapter 7 debtor                             |
| § 20:133 | —Chapter 7 interim trustee                               |
| § 20:134 | —Chapter 7 trustee                                       |
| § 20:135 | — —Duties of chapter 7 trustee                           |
| § 20:136 | —Creditors’ committee                                    |
| § 20:137 | —Conversion of chapter 7 case                            |
| § 20:138 | —Dismissal of chapter 7 case                             |
| § 20:139 | — —Dismissal permitted for abuse of chapter 7 provisions |
| § 20:140 | — — —Using a “means test” to determine “abuse”           |
| § 20:141 | — — —“Current monthly income” defined                    |
| § 20:142 | — — —Mandatory reductions to “current monthly income”    |
| § 20:143 | — — —Permissible reductions to “current monthly income”  |
| § 20:144 | —Authorization to operate debtor’s business              |
| § 20:145 | —Distribution of estate property                         |
| § 20:146 | —Impediments to debtor’s discharge                       |
| § 20:147 | —Debts discharged  |
| § 20:148 | — —Exceptions to discharge under chapter 7, 11, or 13    |

# LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 20:149 —Objections to discharge considered
- § 20:150 —Revocation of discharge possible
- § 20:151 —Effect of discharge
- § 20:152 Chapter 11: “Reorganization”
- § 20:153 —Who may be chapter 11 debtor
- § 20:154 —“Debtor-in-possession,” defined
- § 20:155 —“Substantial consummation,” defined
- § 20:156 —Creditors’ committee appointed in chapter 11 case
- § 20:157 — —Committee’s composition
- § 20:158 — —Committee’s powers and duties
- § 20:159 —Appointment of trustee or examiner permitted
- § 20:160 — —Trustee is elected by creditors
- § 20:161 — —When examiner may be appointed
- § 20:162 — —Termination of the trustee’s appointment
- § 20:163 — —Duties of the trustee
- § 20:164 — —Authorization to operate business
- § 20:165 — —Duties of trustee and examiner
- § 20:166 — —Duties of examiner
- § 20:167 — —Rights, powers, and duties of chapter 11 debtor-in-possession
- § 20:168 —Right to be heard
- § 20:169 —Conversion or dismissal of chapter 11 case
- § 20:170 —Chapter 11 plan of reorganization
- § 20:171 — —Exclusive filing period
- § 20:172 — —Special provisions for small business debtors
- § 20:173 — —Classification of claims or interests under plan
- § 20:174 — —Contents of chapter 11 plan
- § 20:175 — —Impairment of claims or interests under plan
- § 20:176 — —Plan acceptance
- § 20:177 — —Plan modification
- § 20:178 — —Plan confirmation hearing
- § 20:179 — —Effect of plan confirmation
- § 20:180 — —Implementation of plan
- § 20:181 — —Court can revoke confirmation order
- § 20:182 Chapter 13: adjustment of debts of individual with regular income
- § 20:183 —Who may be chapter 13 debtor
- § 20:184 —Chapter 13 trustee
- § 20:185 —Estate property remains with debtor
- § 20:186 —Conversion or dismissal of chapter 13 case
- § 20:187 —Chapter 13 plan
- § 20:188 — —Modification of plan prior to confirmation
- § 20:189 — —Plan’s confirmation hearing
- § 20:190 — —Plan confirmation
- § 20:191 — —Objections to plan

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |   |
|----------|---|
| § 20:192 | — — —“Disposable income,” defined                     |
| § 20:193 | —Payments under plan                                  |
| § 20:194 | —Effects of plan confirmation                         |
| § 20:195 | —Discharge of debtor                                  |
| § 20:196 | —Modification of plan after confirmation              |
| § 20:197 | — — —Requirements for plan’s modification             |
| § 20:198 | — — —“Unanticipated change,” defined                  |
| § 20:199 | — — —“Substantial change,” defined                    |
| § 20:200 | — — —New plan must comply with Code                   |
| § 20:201 | —Revocation of order of confirmation                  |
| § 20:202 | Chapters 9 and 12 of Code                             |
| § 20:203 | Bankruptcy fees                                       |
| § 20:204 | —Fee for filing bankruptcy case                       |
| § 20:205 | —Quarterly fees must be paid to United States trustee |
| § 20:206 | —Imposition of costs                                  |

## VI. MISCELLANEOUS ASPECTS OF CASE ADMINISTRATION

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 20:207 | Case administration  |
| § 20:208 | Ramifications of filing involuntary petition                                   |
| § 20:209 | —Creditor may join in petition   |
| § 20:210 | —Debtor may answer petition  |
| § 20:211 | —Petitioners may have to file bond   |
| § 20:212 | —Debtor continues to operate business  |
| § 20:213 | —In chapter 7 case, trustee may be appointed                                   |
| § 20:214 | —Court orders relief against debtor  |
| § 20:215 | —Court may award costs and fees upon petition’s dismissal                      |
| § 20:216 | —Grounds for petition’s dismissal  |
| § 20:217 | — — Court may dismiss bankruptcy case in the debtor’s and creditors’ interests |
| § 20:218 | Trustee or examiner can be removed for “cause”                                 |
| § 20:219 | Employment of “professional persons”   |
| § 20:220 | —Limitation on compensation of professional persons                            |
| § 20:221 | —Compensation of officers  |
| § 20:222 | —Interim compensation may be awarded   |
| § 20:223 | —Sharing of compensation prohibited  |
| § 20:224 | Meeting of creditors and equity-security holders                               |
| § 20:225 | —Debtor is examined at “341(a) Meeting”  |
| § 20:226 | —Rule 2004 examination compared  |
| § 20:227 | Effect of case conversion  |
| § 20:228 | Effect of dismissal of bankruptcy case   |



- § 20:229 Closing and reopening cases
- § 20:230 Use, sale or lease of property
- § 20:231 —“Cash collateral,” defined
- § 20:232 —Motion prohibiting or conditioning use, sale, or lease of property or seeking authorization to use cash collateral

## VII. CLAIMS AND ADMINISTRATIVE EXPENSES

- § 20:233 Claims against estate
- § 20:234 —Filing of proofs of claim or interests required
- § 20:235 — —Certain “informal” proofs of claim permitted
- § 20:236 — —Filing time and place
- § 20:237 — — —Filing time in chapter 7 and 13 cases
- § 20:238 — — —Filing time in chapter 11 case
- § 20:239 —“Bar date,” defined
- § 20:240 —Effect of filing claim
- § 20:241 —Late claims may be barred
- § 20:242 —Timely-filed claim is “allowed” absent objection
- § 20:243 — —Upon objection court determines “allowable” amount
- § 20:244 — — —*Prima facie* evidence of the claim’s validity and amount
- § 20:245 — — —Determination of right to payment and enforcement of claim
- § 20:246 — —Rejection of unexpired lease triggers “prepetition” claim
- § 20:247 — — —Limitation of landlord’s general unsecured claim
- § 20:248 — — — —Future-rent claims
- § 20:249 — — —Claim arising from rejection of unexpired lease is not subject to statutory bar-date
- § 20:250 — —Court may reconsider claim that has been allowed or disallowed
- § 20:251 —Allowance of “administrative expenses”
- § 20:252 — —“Administrative expense,” defined
- § 20:253 — — —Administrative expenses have “priority” in distribution
- § 20:254 — — —Term “administrative expense” narrowly construed
- § 20:255 — — —Commercial landlord need not demonstrate benefit to the estate
- § 20:256 — — — —Involuntary case “gap creditors” are excepted from administrative expense “first priority” status
- § 20:257 — — —Import of future rent claims arising out of assumed lease

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 20:258 — — — Claims for post-rejection rent as priority  
“administrative expense” subject to court’s  
discretion and subject to “estate benefit” test
- § 20:259 — — — — Measure of post-rejection use and  
occupancy value
- § 20:260 — — — Postpetition rental payments are not  
subtracted from post-rejection cap
- § 20:261 — Determination of secured status
- § 20:262 — Priority of claims and expenses

## VIII. DEBTOR’S DUTIES AND ESTATE PROPERTY

- § 20:263 Debtor’s duties
- § 20:264 — Expired leases are not estate property
- § 20:265 — Certain “individual property” is exempt from  
estate property
- § 20:266 Bankruptcy discharge
- § 20:267 Effect of discharge
- § 20:268 — Restriction on enforcing dischargeable claim  
against debtor
- § 20:269 Preference avoidance
- § 20:270 — Policy goals behind preference avoidance
- § 20:271 — — Current rent payments not deemed “preference”
- § 20:272 Fraudulent transfers and obligations
- § 20:273 — Fraudulent intent demonstrated by circumstances
- § 20:274 — Nonclaimant has right to jury trial when trustee  
seeks to recover fraudulent conveyance
- § 20:275 — Trustee may avoid transfers as “stand-in” for  
unsecured creditor
- § 20:276 Abandonment of estate property

## IX. “AUTOMATIC STAY”

- § 20:277 “Automatic stay” impacts lease and any pending  
litigation
- § 20:278 — “Automatic stay,” defined
- § 20:279 “Automatic stay,” defined—BAPCPA: new changes  
regarding “automatic stay” and any pending  
litigation
- § 20:280 — — Certain actions stayed
- § 20:281 — — Certain actions or proceedings not stayed
- § 20:282 — — Duration of the stay
- § 20:283 — — Jurisdiction to determine whether action or  
proceeding is stayed
- § 20:284 — Stay enjoins all eviction efforts
- § 20:285 — No “self help” recourse against tenant

# LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 20:286 —Security deposit “frozen”
- § 20:287 — —Landlord retains setoff rights
- § 20:288 — —Stay should be vacated to exercise right to apply security
- § 20:289 — —Creditor bears burden of proving setoff entitlement
- § 20:290 — — —Security deposit treated as “secured” claim
- § 20:291 — —Payment of security deposit to tenant not required
- § 20:292 —Damages are only available as against “individuals” for willful violation of stay
- § 20:293 — —Compare: inadvertent violation of stay is not within statute’s purview
- § 20:294 —Inapplicability of automatic stay to an expired commercial lease
- § 20:295 — —Rationale for stay’s inapplicability to expired commercial lease
- § 20:296 — —Compare: unexpired commercial leases
- § 20:297 — —Compare: stay’s application to expired residential lease
- § 20:298 —Relief from “automatic stay”
- § 20:299 — —Relief from automatic stay is secured by way of motion
- § 20:300 — —Compare: no hearing necessary to prevent “irreparable damage”
- § 20:301 — —Requirements for stay’s modification
- § 20:302 — — —Code does not define “for cause”
- § 20:303 — — —Lack of “adequate protection” furnishes “cause”
- § 20:304 — — — —“Adequate protection,” defined
- § 20:305 — — — —“Indubitable equivalent,” defined
- § 20:306 — — — —Condominium association and cooperative corporation are “secured creditors”
- § 20:307 — — — —Desire to litigate in another forum may also constitute “cause”
- § 20:308 — — — —Factors considered by court
- § 20:309 — — — —State court judgment can furnish “cause”
- § 20:310 — — — —Exhaustion of appeals not required
- § 20:311 — — — —State-court warrant of eviction furnishes “cause”
- § 20:312 — — — —Interest after warrant’s issuance
- § 20:313 — — — —Exhaustion of appeals not required
- § 20:314 — — — —Jurisdictional effect of order lifting stay
- § 20:315 — — — —Landlord-tenant relationship may be reinstated by landlord

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 20:316 | — — — Failure to pay postpetition rent constitutes “cause”                                       |
| § 20:317 | — — — “Bad faith” filing of bankruptcy petition constitutes “cause”                              |
| § 20:318 | — — — Additional basis for stay’s modification   |
| § 20:319 | — — — — “Equity,” and “equity cushion,” defined  |
| § 20:320 | — — — — “Necessary to an effective reorganization,” defined                                      |
| § 20:321 | — — Burden of proof and <i>prima facie</i> case on motion to vacate stay                         |
| § 20:322 | — — — Debtor’s lack of equity  |
| § 20:323 | — — — <i>Prima facie</i> case and burden of proof on motion to vacate automatic stay “for cause” |
| § 20:324 | — — — — Establishing <i>prima facie</i> case of lack of adequate protection                      |
| § 20:325 | — — Court’s discretion to lift stay  |
| § 20:326 | — — Stay termination date  |

## X. EXECUTORY CONTRACTS AND UNEXPIRED LEASES

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| § 20:327 | Unexpired lease may be “assumed” or “rejected”   |
| § 20:328 | — Purpose and effect of Code sections regarding assumption and rejection of leases                         |
| § 20:329 | — — Conflict over whether unexpired leases need be executory   |
| § 20:330 | — Only “true” or “bona fide” leases may be assumed   |
| § 20:331 | — — Indicia that agreement does not constitute “true” lease  |
| § 20:332 | — Right to assume or reject lease is discretionary   |
| § 20:333 | — — Courts apply “business judgment rule” to application to assume or reject unexpired lease               |
| § 20:334 | — Effect of assumption   |
| § 20:335 | — — Not every lease provision is enforceable   |
| § 20:336 | — — — Lease subordination clauses are usually enforced in bankruptcy                                       |
| § 20:337 | — Code prohibitions on lease assumption or assignment  |
| § 20:338 | — Rent-stabilized and rent-controlled tenancies are “lease-based” and capable of being assumed or rejected |
| § 20:339 | Assumption of lease contingent upon “cure” or “adequate assurance” of “prompt cure” of default             |
| § 20:340 | — “Adequate assurance of prompt cure,” defined   |
| § 20:341 | — — Compare: in chapter 13 case, the arrearages may be cured via the plan process                          |

LANDLORD AND TENANT PRACTICE IN NEW YORK

- § 20:342 —“Adequate assurance of future performance,”  
defined
- § 20:343 —Specific Code requirements for “shopping center”  
leases
- § 20:344 — —BAPCPA: new changes regarding assignments  
of “shopping center” leases
- § 20:345 — —Landlord bears burden of proving that complex  
is “shopping center”
- § 20:346 — —“Shopping center,” defined
- § 20:347 —Compensation of landlord’s actual pecuniary loss
- § 20:348 — —Legal fees and interest
- § 20:349 —Certain lease defaults exempt from cure  
requirement
- § 20:350 —Lessor need not provide incidental services or  
supplies prior to assumption without compensation
- § 20:351 Time periods for assumption of lease
- § 20:352 —In chapter 11 or 13 case, an unexpired residential  
lease may be assumed at any time prior to plan  
confirmation
- § 20:353 — —No fixed time limit for assumption of  
residential lease in chapter 11 and 13 cases
- § 20:354 —Certain leases must be assumed within sixty days  
after order for relief
- § 20:355 — —Chapter 7 trustee usually does not assume  
debtor’s residential lease
- § 20:356 — —“Cause” to extend time within which to assume  
or reject lease, defined
- § 20:357 — —Formal motion is required to assume lease
- § 20:358 — — —Debtor’s lease assumption lacks *res judicata*  
effect in subsequently filed bankruptcy case
- § 20:359 — — —Courts diverge on whether order extending  
time to assume must be entered within sixty day  
period
- § 20:360 — — —Compare: court may rule upon timely filed  
motion to assume lease after sixty day period
- § 20:361 — — —Landlord may be precluded from asserting  
that lease was rejected
- § 20:362 — — — —“Waiver,” defined
- § 20:363 — — — —Courts diverge on whether landlord’s  
acceptance of rent after lease is deemed rejected  
constitutes waiver
- § 20:364 — — — —Estoppel can also serve as defense to  
statutory forfeiture
- § 20:365 Threshold inquiry into lease’s existence
- § 20:366 —Lease is not terminated by tenant’s bankruptcy  
filing

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 20:367 —Issuance of state-court warrant of eviction terminates landlord-tenant relationship, leaving no leasehold interest to be assumed
- § 20:368 —On motion to assume lease, court’s inquiry is limited to “business judgment”
- § 20:369 Performance of commercial lease’s terms until assumption or rejection
- § 20:370 —BAPCPA: change in amount of time to assume, assume and assign, or reject
- § 20:371 —Commercial landlord’s administrative claim entitlement
- § 20:372 —Not all commercial-lease covenants must be timely performed during statutory period
- § 20:373 —Debtor is not required to timely pay damages for breaches of all lease covenants
- § 20:374 Lease may be assigned, notwithstanding prohibition or restriction
- § 20:375 —Subsequent to assignment, assignee bears primary liability for rent while trustee (or debtor) and estate are relieved of liability
- § 20:376 —In event of assignment, security deposit may be required
- § 20:377 —Exceptions to right to assign lease
- § 20:378 Effect of lease rejection
- § 20:379 —Lease’s rejection does not repudiate or terminate agreement
- § 20:380 —Rejection of prime lease results in rejection of sublease
- § 20:381 —Effect of lease rejection when debtor is lessor

## **XI. “BAD FAITH” BY DEBTOR**

- § 20:382 “Bad faith” filing furnishes “cause” to dismiss the petition, to convert case, or to vacate automatic stay
- § 20:383 —Good faith inquiry on plan filing compared
- § 20:384 —“Bad faith” encompasses both objective and subjective element
- § 20:385 —Factors utilized to determine “bad faith” filing
- § 20:386 — —Intent to frustrate creditors or collaterally attack state-court judgment not conclusive of bad faith
- § 20:387 — —Vacating automatic stay due to “bad faith” filing compared
- § 20:388 Bankruptcy plan must be proposed in good faith
- § 20:389 —Chapter 13 plan must be proposed in “good faith”
- § 20:390 —Chapter 11 plan must be proposed in “good faith”

- § 20:391 Serial bankruptcy filings, constitute “badge” of bad faith
- § 20:392 —“Serial filings,” defined
- § 20:393 —Certain subsequent filings justified
- § 20:394 —Code prohibits or limits various forms of serial filings
- § 20:395 — —Rationale for one hundred and eighty day prohibition
- § 20:396 —Prospective relief from automatic stay as remedy for abusive practices of serial filers

## **XII. FORMS**

- § 20:397 Form 20-1: Notice of Appearance and Demand for Service of Papers
- § 20:398 Form 20-2: Notice of Motion, Inter Alia, for an Order Pursuant to 11 U.S.C.A. Section 362 to Vacate Automatic Stay and for Payment of Rent and/or Use and Occupancy
- § 20:399 Form 20-3: Application in Support of Landlord’s Motion to Vacate the Stay
- § 20:400 Form 20-4: Order Vacating Stay and Granting Other Relief
- § 20:401 Form 20-5: Conditional Order Extending Debtor’s Time to Assume or Reject Lease [and Addressing Other Related Leasehold Issues]
- § 20:402 Form 20-6: Notice of Settlement of Order and Supporting Affidavit [Based Upon Default in Compliance With Conditional Order]
- § 20:403 Form 20-7: Order Vacating Stay [Based Upon Default on Conditional Order]
- § 20:404 Form 20-8: Order Denying Debtor’s Motion to Extend Time to Assume or Reject Lease and Granting Vacatur of the Automatic Stay
- § 20:405 Form 20-9: Stipulation of Settlement and Order Rejecting Lease and, Inter Alia, Vacating Stay
- § 20:406 Form 20-10: Stipulation and Order Reducing Claim

### **Table of Laws and Rules**

### **Table of Cases**

### **Index**