

Table of Contents

PART I. DISCIPLINARY PROCEDURES

CHAPTER 1. FOUNDATIONS OF JUDICIAL DISCIPLINE

- § 1:1 Introduction
- § 1:2 New Jersey Constitution
- § 1:3 Public policy
- § 1:4 The New Jersey Code of Judicial Conduct
- § 1:5 Rules of Court
- § 1:6 The Advisory Committee on Judicial Conduct
- § 1:7 Types of discipline
- § 1:8 Seminal judicial disciplinary case—In re Mattera
- § 1:9 In re Mattera
- § 1:10 Conclusion

CHAPTER 2. THE JUDICIAL DISCIPLINARY PROCESS

- § 2:1 Introduction
- § 2:2 Governing Rules of Court
- § 2:3 The Advisory Committee on Judicial Conduct
- § 2:4 Preliminary investigation
- § 2:5 Confidentiality during investigative phase
- § 2:6 Private admonitions to judges
- § 2:7 Formal disciplinary proceedings
- § 2:8 Sample Advisory Committee on Judicial Conduct
(ACJC) Complaint
- § 2:9 Sample Advisory Committee on Judicial Conduct
(ACJC) Answer
- § 2:10 Action by the Supreme Court
- § 2:11 Removal from judicial office—Matter of Mullen, 253
N.J. 49, 289 A.3d 406 (2022)
- § 2:12 Other disciplinary actions
- § 2:13 Progressive discipline
- § 2:14 Post-discipline obligations of judges
- § 2:15 Challenges to recommended discipline in a
presentment

CHAPTER 3. DEFENDING A JUDICIAL DISCIPLINE CASE

- § 3:1 In general
- § 3:2 Grievance procedures—In general
- § 3:3 Grievance procedures for the general public
- § 3:4 Grievance form
- § 3:5 Informal conference
- § 3:6 Formal proceedings before the ACJC—Filing an answer
- § 3:7 —Sample complaint and answer
- § 3:8 Stipulation of discipline
- § 3:9 Conduct of the hearing
- § 3:10 Return of ACJC presentment
- § 3:11 Arguing a case before the Supreme Court
- § 3:12 Aggravating and mitigating factors—In general

A. AGGRAVATING FACTORS

- § 3:13 Violations of public policy
- § 3:14 Criminal offenses
- § 3:15 Harm to others
- § 3:16 Pattern of misconduct
- § 3:17 Lack of contrition

B. MITIGATING FACTORS

- § 3:18 Contrition and rehabilitation
- § 3:19 Prior unblemished record
- § 3:20 Single Act of misconduct
- § 3:21 Recovery from a serious medical condition

PART II. MISCONDUCT

CHAPTER 4. DRUNK DRIVING

- § 4:1 Prohibition on hearing drunk driving cases following arrest
- § 4:2 Cases resulting in a public reprimand
- § 4:3 Statement of the Supreme Court concerning Justice Clifford, and Advisory Committee Report and Recommendations
- § 4:4 Cases resulting in censure
- § 4:5 Case resulting in suspension from judicial office

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 5. PERSONAL AND PROFESSIONAL MISCONDUCT

- § 5:1 Standard of review for personal conduct
- § 5:2 *In re Reddin*, 221 N.J. 221 (2015)
- § 5:3 Misconduct related to personal life: Examples
- § 5:4 Judicial standards and basis for discipline
- § 5:5 Range of discipline
- § 5:6 Suspension from judicial office
- § 5:7 Hearing cases while ineligible to practice law
- § 5:8 *Matter of Brady*, 243 N.J. 395, 235 A.3d 175 (2020)
- § 5:9 Prohibition on hearing domestic violence cases

CHAPTER 6. CONDUCT OF JUDICIAL PROCEEDINGS

- § 6:1 Public policy
- § 6:2 Abuse of attorneys and litigants
- § 6:3 Cases resulting in removal
- § 6:4 *Matter of Russo*, 242 N.J. 179, 231 A.3d 563 (2020)
- § 6:5 Cases resulting in censure
- § 6:6 Cases resulting in public reprimand
- § 6:7 Conduct of trial
- § 6:8 Cases resulting in removal
- § 6:9 Cases resulting in suspension
- § 6:10 Cases resulting in censure or reprimand
- § 6:11 Cases resulting in no discipline
- § 6:12 Ticket-fixing—Introduction
- § 6:13 —Cases resulting in removal from judicial office
- § 6:14 —Cases resulting in suspension from the practice of law
- § 6:15 —Cases resulting in public reprimands
- § 6:16 Administrative responsibilities
- § 6:17 Bias and prejudice—Introduction
- § 6:18 Rules of court—Pretrial disqualification for bias
- § 6:19 Bias during the course of trial
- § 6:20 Bias resulting in formal discipline
- § 6:21 Bias resulting in a suspension from judicial office
- § 6:22 Conclusion
- § 6:23 Egregious legal errors during trial—Reasonably prudent and competent judge standard
- § 6:24 *In re DiLeo* 216 N.J. 449, 83 A.3d 11 (2014)

CHAPTER 7. EXTRAJUDICIAL ACTIVITIES

- § 7:1 Introduction

- § 7:2 The Advisory Committee on Extrajudicial Conduct
- § 7:3 Guidelines for Extrajudicial Activities
- § 7:4 Disciplinary cases—Overview
- § 7:5 Appearances on broadcast media
- § 7:6 Attendance at social events
- § 7:7 Case resulting in public reprimand
- § 7:8 Case resulting in suspension of license to practice law
- § 7:9 Parallel Careers—In general
- § 7:10 Employment as an entertainer—In re Advisory Letter No. 3-11
- § 7:11 Son employed on municipal police force—In re Advisory Letter 7-11

CHAPTER 8. SEXUAL HARASSMENT

- § 8:1 Introduction
- § 8:2 Public policy
- § 8:3 Burden of proof
- § 8:4 Credibility determinations
- § 8:5 Aggravating and mitigating factors
- § 8:6 Cases resulting in suspension from judicial office
- § 8:7 In re Seaman
- § 8:8 Cases resulting in reprimands
- § 8:9 Case resulting in private reprimand
- § 8:10 Cases resulting in removal from judicial office

CHAPTER 9. POLITICAL ACTIVITIES

- § 9:1 Introduction
- § 9:2 Case resulting in suspension from judicial office
- § 9:3 Cases resulting in public reprimand
- § 9:4 Supreme Court statement imposing discipline
- § 9:5 Involvement in politics by spouses of judges
- § 9:6 Application of Gaulkin
- § 9:7 The Reappointment Process—In general
- § 9:8 —Statement by the Supreme Court

CHAPTER 10. CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

- § 10:1 Introduction

A. REPRESENTATION OF PRIVATE CLIENTS— APPEARANCES BEFORE PUBLIC AGENCIES AND BODIES

- § 10:2 Cases resulting in public reprimands
- § 10:3 Case involving censure

TABLE OF CONTENTS

B. LEGAL MALPRACTICE

§ 10:4 Case involving public reprimand

C. CONTACTING OTHER JUDGES ON BEHALF OF CLIENTS

§ 10:5 Cases resulting in public reprimands

§ 10:6 Cases Resulting in Censure

§ 10:7 Cases resulting in suspension from practice of law

D. REPRESENTATION OF FAMILY MEMBERS

§ 10:8 Case resulting in censure

§ 10:9 Cases resulting in removal from judicial office

E. SEEKING FUTURE EMPLOYMENT BY A SITTING JUDGE

§ 10:10 DeNike v. Cupo

F. PUBLIC ASSOCIATION WITH LITIGANTS

§ 10:11 In general

§ 10:12 Family members on the municipal police department

§ 10:13 Municipal employees

G. RECUSALS

§ 10:14 Recusal—In General

§ 10:15 Recusal required by statute—NJSA 2A:15-49 (1903)

§ 10:16 Recusal required by Rule 1:12-1 and Rule 1:12-2

§ 10:17 Recusal required Code of Judicial Conduct

§ 10:18 Recusal required by the Rules of Professional Conduct

§ 10:19 Recusal required by Supreme Court Directive

§ 10:20 Recusal based upon post-judicial career employment

§ 10:21 Recusal based upon going litigation

§ 10:22 Recusal based upon personal animosity

§ 10:23 Recusal based upon ethnic or cultural bias

§ 10:24 Recusal based upon prior representation

§ 10:25 Recusal not necessarily required—Prior rulings in a case

§ 10:26 —Pending judicial conduct complaint

CHAPTER 11. CRIMINAL CONDUCT

§ 11:1 Introduction

- § 11:2 Criminal prosecutions—Duties inherent in judicial office
- § 11:3 Cases resulting in removal and disbarment
- § 11:4 In the Matter of Coruzzi
- § 11:5 Reciprocal discipline imposed on a judge's license to practice law
- § 11:6 Case resulting in removal and suspension from practice
- § 11:7 Case resulting in removal
- § 11:8 Cases resulting in resignation and suspension from practice
- § 11:9 Conclusion

PART III. JUDICIAL DISCIPLINE IN ADMINISTRATIVE COURTS

CHAPTER 12. DISCIPLINE IN THE OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

- § 12:1 Office of Administrative Law—Introduction
- § 12:2 Judicial Code of Conduct for Administrative Law Judges
- § 12:3 General causes for discipline
- § 12:4 Range of disciplinary sanctions
- § 12:5 Office of Administrative Law Advisory Committee on Judicial Conduct—Preliminary investigations
- § 12:6 Formal disciplinary hearings

CHAPTER 13. DISCIPLINE FOR WORKERS' COMPENSATION JUDGES

- § 13:1 Code of Conduct for Judges of the Workers' Compensation Court
- § 13:2 Causes for discipline or removal
- § 13:3 Authorized range of discipline
- § 13:4 Investigation of allegations of judicial misconduct: Commission on Judicial Performance
- § 13:5 Final disciplinary hearing

CHAPTER 14. SOCIAL MEDIA PLATFORMS

- § 14:1 In general
- § 14:2 Sexual content posted to social media sites

CHAPTER 15. THE COUNTY SURROGATE

- § 15:1 County surrogates—In general

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 15:2 In re Conda 72 N.J. 229, 370 A. 2d 16

§ 15:3 County surrogates—Discipline

APPENDIX A CODE OF JUDICIAL CONDUCT

CANON 1 AN INDEPENDENT AND IMPARTIAL JUDICIARY IS INDISPENSABLE TO JUSTICE. A JUDGE THEREFORE SHALL UPHOLD AND SHOULD PROMOTE THE INDEPENDENCE, INTEGRITY AND IMPARTIALITY OF THE JUDICIARY

Rule 1.1 Independence, Integrity and Impartiality of the Judiciary

Rule 1.2 Compliance With the Law

CANON 2 A JUDGE SHALL AVOID IMPROPRIETY AND THE APPEARANCE OF IMPROPRIETY

Rule 2.1 Promoting Confidence in the Judiciary

Rule 2.2 External Influences on Judicial Conduct

Rule 2.3 Avoiding Abuse of the Prestige of Judicial Office

Rule 2.4 Testifying as a Character Witness

CANON 3 A JUDGE SHALL PERFORM THE DUTIES OF JUDICIAL OFFICE IMPARTIALLY AND DILIGENTLY

Rule 3.1 Precedence of Judicial Office

Rule 3.2 Competence

Rule 3.3 Judicial Independence

Rule 3.4 Decorum

Rule 3.5 Demeanor

Rule 3.6 Bias and Prejudice

Rule 3.7 Ensuring the Right to be Heard

Rule 3.8 *Ex Parte* Communications

Rule 3.9 Diligence

Rule 3.10 Judicial Statements on Pending and Impending Cases

Rule 3.11 Broadcasting

Rule 3.12 Communication With Jurors

Rule 3.13 Judicial Administration

Rule 3.14 Supervisory Duties

Rule 3.15 Responding to Judicial and Lawyer Misconduct

Rule 3.16 Administrative Appointments

Rule 3.17 Disqualification

CANON 4 A JUDGE MAY ENGAGE IN ACTIVITIES TO IMPROVE THE LAW, THE LEGAL SYSTEM AND THE ADMINISTRATION OF JUSTICE

Rule 4 Activities Related to the Judicial Function

**CANON 5 A JUDGE SHALL SO CONDUCT THE JUDGE'S
EXTRAJUDICIAL ACTIVITIES AS TO MINIMIZE THE RISK OF
CONFLICT WITH JUDICIAL OBLIGATIONS**

- Rule 5.1 Extrajudicial Activities in General
- Rule 5.2 Avocational Activities
- Rule 5.3 Affiliation With Discriminatory Organizations
- Rule 5.4 Participation in Educational, Religious, Charitable,
Fraternal or Civic Organizations and Activities
- Rule 5.5 Financial, Business, or Remunerative Activities
- Rule 5.6 Acceptance of Gifts, Loans, Bequests, Benefits, or Other
Things of Value
- Rule 5.7 Disclosure of Information
- Rule 5.8 Fiduciary Activities
- Rule 5.9 Serving as Arbitrator or Mediator
- Rule 5.10 Practice of Law
- Rule 5.11 Appointments to Governmental Positions

**CANON 6 A JUDGE SHALL NOT RECEIVE COMPENSATION FOR
QUASI-JUDICIAL AND EXTRAJUDICIAL ACTIVITIES**

- Rule 6 Compensation for Quasi-Judicial and Extrajudicial Activities

CANON 7 A JUDGE SHALL REFRAIN FROM POLITICAL ACTIVITY

- Rule 7 Political Activity
Applicability

**APPENDIX B GUIDELINES FOR EXTRAJUDICIAL
ACTIVITIES FOR NEW JERSEY JUDGES—ANNOTATED**

- I APPLICABILITY
- II GENERAL GUIDELINES
- III LAW-RELATED ACTIVITIES
- IV NON-LAW-RELATED ACTIVITIES
- V FUNDRAISING ACTIVITIES
- VI TESTIMONIALS, AWARDS AND OTHER HONORS
- VII BUSINESS AND FINANCIAL ACTIVITIES
- VIII FIDUCIARY ACTIVITIES
- IX ARBITRATION
- X POLITICAL ACTIVITIES
- XI LETTERS OF RECOMMENDATION

Table of Laws and Rules

Table of Cases

Index

Table of Contents

PART I. PRESENTMENTS FROM THE ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON JUDICIAL CONDUCT

CHAPTER 1. IMPROPER *EX PARTE* COMMUNICATIONS

- § 1:1 Foreword
- § 1:2 Introduction
- § 1:3 Ex parte communications—In re Piscal
- § 1:4 Ex Parte communications—In re Elias
- § 1:5 Involvement in plea bargaining/*ex parte*
communications—In re Delehey
- § 1:6 Ex Parte Communications with municipal prosecutor
during trial—In re McCloskey
- § 1:7 Ex Parte Communications with municipal prosecutor
prior to trial—In re Diamond
- § 1:8 Ex parte communications—In re Wright
- § 1:9 —In re Amana
- § 1:10 Improper contact with litigant—In re Montes
- § 1:11 *Ex parte* communication with police

CHAPTER 2. SEXUAL HARASSMENT

- § 2:1 Offensive touching and sexual harassment
- § 2:2 Offensive touching of a subordinate judicial employee—
In re Council
- § 2:3 Consensual sexual relations with a subordinate—In re
Campbell
- § 2:4 Offensive touching—In re Jones
- § 2:5 Municipal Court Judge—Remarks from the bench
implicating sexual innuendo—In re Rodriguez
- § 2:6 —Criminal allegations (Diverted through PTI); Sexual
harassment
- § 2:7 Sexual harassment of subordinate employees

CHAPTER 3. ABUSE OF LITIGANTS

- § 3:1 Introduction
- § 3:2 Abuse of litigants—In re Rzemieniewski
- § 3:3 Conflict of interest/abuse of litigants—In re Saltman
- § 3:4 Intemperate conduct—Maisto

- § 3:5 —Abuse of Attorneys—In re Giles
- § 3:6 Intemperate conduct with court staff—Outside employment by a full-time judge—In re McElroy
- § 3:7 Intoxicated while on the bench—Pattern of misconduct—In re Sasso
- § 3:8 Abuse of contempt of court powers—In re Toth
- § 3:9 Bias and intemperate conduct—In re Citta
- § 3:10 Inappropriate attempts at humor in the court room—In re Convery
- § 3:11 Rude, disrespectful and intimidating shouted remarks to a litigant—In re Baker
- § 3:12 Vulgar characterization of counsel to other litigants—In re Portelli
- § 3:13 Manifestations of bias toward litigants—In re Rivas
- § 3:14 Abuse of contempt of court powers—In re Adames
- § 3:15 Sexual innuendo and inappropriate attempt at humor from the bench—In re Rodriguez
- § 3:16 Deprivation of litigants rights—Matter of Rasul, 245 N.J. 267, 245 A.3d 535 (2021)
- § 3:17 Incompetence—In re Kassel

CHAPTER 4. CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

- § 4:1 Introduction
- § 4:2 Business dealings with litigants—In re Sciuto
- § 4:3 Representing municipal employees—In re Obuch
- § 4:4 —In re Davenport
- § 4:5 Failure to Recuse—In re Solomon
- § 4:6 Improper contact with litigant—In re Montes
- § 4:7 Creating and purposefully concealing a conflict of interest—In re Appleby
- § 4:8 Representing a municipal court litigant in a related matrimonial matter—In re Bowkely
- § 4:9 Failing to recuse in conflict cases—In re Scattergood
- § 4:10 Conflict of interest—Newman
- § 4:11 Conflict of interest with litigant—In re Bowkley
- § 4:12 Conflict of interest with court staff—In re Miniman
- § 4:13 Family members before the court/conflict of interest—In re Council
- § 4:14 Hearing numerous cases where respondent's landlord appeared as defense attorney—Matter of Munoz, 244 N.J. 390, 240 A.3d 870 (2020)
- § 4:15 Surrogate conflict of interest; advancing personal interests; failure to recuse
- § 4:16 Superior Court Judge—Conflict of interest

CHAPTER 5. POLITICAL INVOLVEMENT

- § 5:1 Introduction

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 5:2 Presence at a political event—In re Sanchez
- § 5:3 Photographed with Criminally Charged Public Official—
In re Rodriguez
- § 5:4 Surrogates
- § 5:5 Case resulting in censure
- § 5:6 Matter of Conda
- § 5:7 Case involving suspension from office—In re Curcio
- § 5:8 In re Curcio—ACJC Presentment

CHAPTER 6. DRUNK-DRIVING

- § 6:1 Introduction
- § 6:2 Failure to report infraction to assignment judge—In re
Frese
- § 6:3 —In re Parsons
- § 6:4 With related incident of domestic violence—In re
Paragano
- § 6:5 Progressive discipline—In re Williams
- § 6:6 Obstructing police investigation—In re Tourison
- § 6:7 High blood-alcohol level—Extensive post-arrest
rehabilitation efforts—In re Jones

CHAPTER 7. PATTERN OF JUDICIAL MISCONDUCT

- § 7:1 Introduction
- § 7:2 In re Smoger

CHAPTER 8. INSUBORDINATION

- § 8:1 Introduction
- § 8:2 In re Gross-Quatrone

CHAPTER 9. PERJURY AND FALSE EVIDENCE BEFORE THE ACJC

- § 9:1 Introduction
- § 9:2 In re DeAvila-Silebi

CHAPTER 10. ADVANCING PRIVATE OR PERSONAL INTERESTS

- § 10:1 Introduction
- § 10:2 Use of Judicial Office to Advance Private Interests—
Business Card—In re Rivera-Soto
- § 10:3 Use of Judicial Office to Advance Personal Interests—
In re Palmer
- § 10:4 —In re Wright
- § 10:5 —In re Benitez
- § 10:6 E-mail abuse and advancing private interests—In re
DeBello

- § 10:7 Advancing private interests—In re Muller
- § 10:8 Using judicial office to advance the private interests of another—In re Inacio
- § 10:9 Advancing a private interest and progressive discipline—In re Baptista

CHAPTER 11. MISUSE OF JUDICIAL OFFICE

- § 11:1 Introduction
- § 11:2 Letterhead—In re Sonstein
- § 11:3 Business card—In re McElroy
- § 11:4 Improper influence—In re Kohlhepp
- § 11:5 Ex parte communications—In re Amana
- § 11:6 Advancing private interests—In re Baptista
- § 11:7 Using judicial office to advance the private interests of another—In re Inacio
- § 11:8 Fraudulent business practices; failure to report litigation; judicial wage garnishment—In re Cook
- § 11:9 Intentional misuse of judicial office; Unauthorized access and sharing of criminal case history—In re Batelli
- § 11:10 Improper expenditure of DWI funds for personal enrichment without authority—In re Corradino

CHAPTER 12. ADMINISTRATIVE MISCONDUCT

- § 12:1 Ineligible to practice law
- § 12:2 ACJC opinion in In re Killen
- § 12:3 In re Cecilia Guzman, Judge of the Municipal Court

CHAPTER 13. OUTSIDE EMPLOYMENT

- § 13:1 In general
- § 13:2 Outside employment—In re Thurber

Table of Laws and Rules

Table of Cases

Index