

CRIMINAL LAW DEFENCES

prepared by
Pat Knoll, Q.C., *of the Alberta Bar*
Professor Emeritus of Law, University of Calgary
and
Lisa Silver, B.A., LL.B., LL.M.
of the Alberta and Ontario Bars
Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Calgary

Table of Cases

Table of Statutes

Table of Regulations

I. Introduction	\$1
1. Offences	\$1
(a) Physical Element and Mental Element	\$1
(b) Categories of Offences	\$5
(i) Mens Rea	\$5
(ii) Strict Liability	\$10
(iii) Absolute Liability	\$11
(c) Summary and Indictable Offences	\$12
2. Defences	\$15
(a) Defence Defined	\$15
(b) General Defences and Particular Defences	\$16
(c) Common Law Defences	\$17
(d) Nature of Justification and Excuse	\$20
(e) Duty of Trial Judge	\$21
(f) Presumption of Innocence	\$22
(g) Persuasive and Evidential Burdens	\$23
(i) General	\$23
(ii) Burden on Crown	\$24
(iii) Burden on Defence	\$27

CRIMINAL LAW DEFENCES

(h) Procedure	§32
(i) Right to be Present at Trial	§32
(ii) Right to Full Answer and Defence	§34
(iii) Pleas	§39
A. Permitted Pleas	§39
B. Plea of Not Guilty	§40
C. Plea of Guilty	§41
D. Refusal to Plead	§42
E. Plea of Guilty to Included or Other Offence	§43
F. Withdrawal of Guilty Plea	§45
II. Exemptions	§46
1. Conjugal Unity	§46
(a) General	§46
(b) Conspiracy Between Spouses	§47
(c) Competence and Compellability	§48
(i) Common Law Rule	§48
(ii) Statutory Rule	§49
(iii) Privileged Inter-spousal Communications	§50
2. De Minimis Non Curat Lex	§53
(a) Definition of De Minimis Defence	§53
(b) Application of De Minimis Defence	§54
3. Immunity	§55
(a) Children	§55
(b) Crown Immunity	§57
(c) Immunity of Crown Attorneys and Judges	§60
(d) Internationally Protected Persons	§62
(i) Consular Officers and Employees	§62
(ii) Diplomatic Agents	§64
(iii) International Organization Representatives	§67
(iv) NATO Representatives	§70
(v) Sovereigns and Heads of Foreign States	§75
(e) Parliamentary Immunity	§76
(i) Members of Senate and House of Commons	§76
(ii) Members of Provincial Legislatures	§79
(f) Military Personnel	§80
4. Mental Disorder	§82

TABLE OF CLASSIFICATION

(a) Exemption from Conviction	§82
(b) Presumption of Mental Order	§83
(c) Mental Disorder at Time of Trial	§84
(d) Burden of Proof on Defence	§85
(e) Mental Disorder Raised by Crown	§88
(f) When Persons are Mentally Disordered	§91
(i) Disease of the Mind	§91
(ii) Delusions	§99
(iii) Meaning of “Incapable”	§100
(iv) Meaning of “Appreciate”	§101
(v) Meaning of “Nature and Quality”	§102
(vi) Meaning of “Knowing”	§103
(vii) Meaning of “Wrong”	§104
(viii) Automatism and Mental Disorder	§105
(g) Consequence of Mental Disorder Verdict	§106
(h) Condition Short of Mental Disorder	§109
III. Justifications	§111
1. Defence of Property	§111
(a) Justifiable Force to Prevent Injury to Property	§111
(b) Defence of Property	§112
(c) Defence of Personal Property	§113
(d) Defence of Real Property	§114
(e) Defence of Property and Claim of Right	§115
(f) Defence of Property and Enforcement of the Law	§116
(g) Reasonable Force	§117
2. Obedience to Superior Orders	§118
3. Protection of Persons Administering and Enforcing the Law	§121
(a) Conduct Required or Authorized by Law	§121
(b) Use of Force to Prevent Commission of Offence	§127
(c) Arrest of Wrong Person	§128
(d) Duty of Person Arresting	§129
(e) Preventing Breach of the Peace	§130
(f) Suppression of Riots	§131
(g) Excessive Force	§132
4. Protection of Persons in Authority	§133
(a) Correction of Child by Force	§133

CRIMINAL LAW DEFENCES

(b) Surgical Operations	§137
(c) Excessive Force	§138
5. Public Good	§139
6. Self-defence and Defence of Others	§141
(a) General Test for Self-defence	§141
(b) Prevention of Immediate and Serious Injury to Any Person	§144
(c) Retreat	§145
(d) Burden of Proof	§146
(e) Previous Acts of Violence by Victim	§147
(f) Excessive Force	§149
IV. Excuses	§150
1. Accident	§150
(a) Accident Defined	§150
(b) Nature of Defence	§151
(c) Accident as a Complete Defence	§152
(d) Accident and Homicide	§153
2. Automatism	§157
(a) Automatism Defined	§157
(b) Nature of Defence	§158
(c) Burden of Proof	§159
(d) Questions of Law and Fact	§160
(e) Automatism and Mental Disorder	§163
(f) Automatism and Intoxication	§169
(g) Causes of Automatism	§170
3. Colour of Right and Lack of Fraudulent Intent	§171
(a) Colour of Right	§171
(i) Colour of Right Defined	§171
(ii) Nature of Defence	§172
(iii) Availability of Defence	§173
(iv) Burden of Proof	§174
(v) Mistake of Civil Law	§175
(vi) Mistake of Fact	§176
(vii) Reasonableness of Belief	§177
(b) Lack of Fraudulent Intent	§178
4. Duress	§179

TABLE OF CLASSIFICATION

(a) Nature of Defence	§179
(b) Common Law Defence	§181
(c) Statutory Defence	§189
(d) Obligation to Retreat from Threat	§190
(e) Compulsion of Spouse	§191
(f) Burden of Proof	§192
5. Intoxication	§193
(a) Nature of Defence	§193
(b) The Modern Canadian Test	§195
(c) Specific and General Intent	§196
(d) Voluntary and Involuntary Intoxication	§201
(e) Degree of Intoxication	§204
(f) General Instructions to Jury	§206
(g) Included Offences	§212
(h) Intoxication and Attempt	§213
(i) Intoxication and Parties	§214
(j) Intoxication and Murder	§217
(k) Intoxication and Other Defences	§219
(i) Automatism	§219
(ii) Mental Disorder	§220
(iii) Mistake	§221
(iv) Provocation	§222
(v) Self-defence	§223
(vi) Cumulative Effect	§225
(l) Drugs and Alcohol	§226
(m) Burden of Proof	§227
6. Mistake of Fact and Law	§228
(a) Mistake of Fact	§228
(i) Mistake of Fact Defined	§228
(ii) Nature of Defence	§229
(iii) Reasonableness of Belief	§230
(iv) Honest Belief and Wilful Blindness	§234
(v) Burden of Proof	§236
(vi) Mistake and Transferred Mens Rea	§237
(vii) Colour of Right	§238
(viii) Mistake and Voluntary Intoxication	§239
(ix) Mistake and Forgetfulness in Failing to Appear	§241

CRIMINAL LAW DEFENCES

(b) Mistake of Law	§243
(i) Mistake of Penal Law	§243
(ii) Mistake of Civil Law	§246
(iii) Mistake of Law or Fact	§247
(iv) Officially Induced Error	§248
(v) Obedience to De Facto Law	§251
(vi) Non-publication of Law	§252
7. Necessity	§253
(a) Nature of Defence	§253
(b) Availability of Defence	§254
(c) Illegality or Contributory Fault	§258
(d) Burden of Proof	§259
(e) Necessity and Distress	§260
8. Prank	§262
(a) Nature of Defence	§262
(b) Defence Rejected	§263
(c) Defence Applied	§264
9. Provocation	§265
(a) Partial Defence to Murder	§265
(b) Provocation Defined	§266
(c) Questions of Law and Fact	§267
(d) Elements of Defence	§269
(i) Heat of Passion	§269
(ii) Sudden Provocation	§270
(iii) Victim's Conduct	§271
(e) Objective Test	§274
(f) Subjective Test	§277
(g) Provocation and Intoxication	§278
(h) Legal Right to Act	§280
(i) Self-induced Provocation	§281
(j) Third-party Provocation	§283
(k) Burden of Proof	§284
V. Procedural Defences	§285
1. Abuse of Process	§285
(a) Nature of Defence	§285
(b) Jurisdiction of Courts	§288

TABLE OF CLASSIFICATION

(c) Burden of Proof	§289
(d) When Motion to Stay Proceedings to be Made	§291
(e) What Constitutes Abuse of Process	§292
(i) Breach of Police or Crown Undertaking	§292
(ii) Collection of Civil Debt	§294
(iii) Delay in Institution of Criminal Proceedings	§295
(iv) Patent Unfairness	§296
(v) Perjury Prosecutions	§297
(vi) Re-laid Informations	§298
(vii) Stay of Proceedings	§299
2. Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms	§300
(a) General	§300
(b) Remedies	§301
(c) Legal Rights	§304
(d) Reasonable Limits	§308
(e) Striking Down Legislation	§309
3. Entrapment	§311
(a) Entrapment Defined	§311
(b) Nature of Defence	§313
(c) Procedure	§314
(d) Random Virtue Testing	§318
4. Lack of Official Consent	§320
(a) Provincial Attorney General	§320
(b) Attorney General of Canada	§321
(c) When Consent must be Obtained	§322
(d) Failure to Obtain Consent	§323
(e) Sufficiency of Consent	§324
(f) Proof of Consent	§325
5. Multiple Conspiracies	§326
(a) General Prohibition	§326
(b) Application of Defence	§327
6. Res Judicata	§328
(a) General	§328
(b) Double Jeopardy and Autrefois	§330
(i) Special Pleas	§330
(ii) Validity of Plea	§331
(iii) Plea in Summary Conviction Matters	§333

CRIMINAL LAW DEFENCES

(iv) Trial of Special Plea	§334
(v) Quashed Indictment or Information	§338
(vi) Withdrawal of Information	§339
(vii) Foreign Courts	§342
(c) Rule Against Multiple Convictions (Kienapple Principle)	§344
(i) The Rule	§344
(ii) Explanation of the Rule	§346
(iii) Application of the Rule	§353
(d) Multiple Convictions — Criminal Code	§355
(e) Issue Estoppel	§356
(i) Issue Estoppel Defined	§356
(ii) Constituent Elements	§357
(iii) Finality	§359
(iv) Identity of Issues	§360
(v) Issue Estoppel and Perjury	§362
(f) Inconsistent Verdicts	§365
(i) General	§365
(ii) Conspiracy Verdicts	§366
(iii) Parties	§367
(iv) Onus on Defence	§368
7. Time Limitations	§369
(a) Indictable Offences	§369
(b) Summary Conviction Proceedings	§370
VI. Other Defences	§376
1. Alibi	§376
(a) Alibi Defined	§376
(b) Nature of Defence	§377
(c) Raising Alibi Defence	§378
(i) How Raised	§378
(ii) When Raised	§381
(iii) Pre-trial Silence of Accused	§383
(d) Evidence of Alibi	§385
(i) Accused as Sole Witness	§385
(ii) Failure of Accused to Testify	§386
(iii) Family and Associates as Witnesses	§389
(e) Burden of Proof	§390

TABLE OF CLASSIFICATION

(f) Alibi Disbelieved or Proven False	§391
(g) Failure to Call Notified Alibi Evidence	§392
(h) Rebuttal to Alibi	§393
2. Consent	§394
(a) Common Law	§394
(b) Consent to Fight	§399
(c) Contact Sports	§402
(d) Mistaken Belief in Consent	§404
(e) Statutory Exclusion	§407
(f) Burden of Proof	§410
3. Defences to Attempt Offences	§411
(a) Impossibility	§411
(i) Availability of Defence	§411
(ii) Impossibility and Conspiracy	§413
(b) Intoxication	§414
(c) Mere Preparation	§415
4. Defence of Corporation	§417
(a) Absolute and Strict Liability Offences	§417
(b) Mens Rea Offences	§418
(c) Defences to Mens Rea Offences	§420
(d) Constitutionally Invalid Legislation	§424
5. Defences to Drug Offences	§425
(a) Agent for the Purchaser	§425
(b) De Minimis Non Curat Lex	§428
(c) Entrapment	§429
(d) Licence	§430
(e) Possession for Innocent Purpose	§431
6. Defences to Planned and Deliberate Murder	§432
7. Defences for Parties	§437
(a) Abandonment of Common Unlawful Purpose	§437
(b) Alibi of Another Party	§438
(c) Renunciation of Criminal Purpose	§439
(d) Duress	§440
(e) Intoxication	§441
(f) Mere Presence or Passive Acquiescence	§443
(g) No Common Intention	§444
8. Defences to Provincial Offences	§446

CRIMINAL LAW DEFENCES

(a) Categories of Provincial Offences	§446
(b) Nature of Provincial Offences	§447
(c) Defences to Mens Rea Offences	§448
(d) Defences to Strict Liability Offences	§449
(e) Defences to Absolute Liability Offences	§450
(f) Other Defences	§451
(i) Abuse of Process	§451
(ii) Act of God	§452
(iii) Crown Immunity	§455
(iv) De Minimis Non Curat Lex	§456
(v) Non-publication of Law	§457
(vi) Officially Induced Error	§458
(vii) Collateral Attack on Validity	§459
(g) Burden of Proof	§461
9. Failure to Prove Essential Elements	§463
(a) General	§463
(b) Identification	§464
(c) Territorial Jurisdiction	§467
(i) Requirement to Prove Territorial Jurisdiction	§467
(ii) Offences Outside Canada	§470
(iii) Offences Outside Province	§472
(iv) Offences Within Province but Outside Territorial Division	§474
(d) Date and Time	§475
(e) Ownership of Property	§477
10. Innocent Finder of Lost or Abandoned Property	§478
(a) Rights and Obligations of Finders Under Common Law	§478
(b) Abandoned Property	§479
(c) Lost Property	§482
11. Miscellaneous	§484
(a) Battered Spouse Syndrome	§484
(b) Chronic Fatigue Syndrome	§485
(c) Delirium Tremens	§486
(d) Dementia	§487
(e) Fetal Alcohol Syndrome Disorder	§488
(f) Double Intent	§489
(g) False Memory Syndrome	§490

TABLE OF CLASSIFICATION

(h) Homosexual Panic	§491
(i) Infanticide	§492
(j) Medical Assistance in Dying	§493
(k) Panic Attack Defence	§494
(l) Post-traumatic Stress Disorder	§495
(m) Prison Environment Syndrome	§496
(n) Reasonable Excuse	§497
(o) Reflex Action	§499
(p) Sexsomnia	§500
(q) Suicide Pact	§501
(r) Superhero Syndrome	§502
(s) Transient Global Amnesia	§503
12. Reasonable Explanation	§504
13. Ultra Vires Legislation	§507
(a) Power to Enact Criminal Law	§507
(b) Criminal Law Defined	§508
(c) Ultra Vires	§509
14. Reasonable Expectation	§511

Index

