# Index

ABSTRACT LAWS	ADMINISTRATIVE AGENCIES
Fact/law paradigm, 10	—Cont'd
Mixed questions of fact and law, 12	Adjudications—Cont'd
ABUSE OF DISCRETION	judicial review, <b>260</b>
STANDARD OF REVIEW	records adequacy issues, 260
Generally, 18, 83 et seq.	Arbitrary and Capricious Standard of
Agency actions. See Arbitrary and	Review, this index
Capricious Standard of Review,	Auer Standard of Review, this index
this index	Authority
Appellate court rulings as to defer-	generally, 136
ence standards, 89	APA grants, 139
Broadly-defined fluid concepts, 18	carve-outs from Chevron defer-
Broadly vs closely confined discre-	ence, failure of agency to use
tion, <b>86</b>	delegated authority, 244
Deferential nature of review, 84	congressional authorization to act,
Equitable discretion, 92	137, 145, 197
Evidence assessments, <b>85</b>	rulemaking authority grants, 223
Federal rules provisions, 83	separation of powers concerns, 138
Fluid concepts broadly-defined, 18	Case or controversy limitations on
Four principal standards	judicial review, 148
distinguished, 3	Comparing and contrasting the principal standards of review,
Inherent powers, 83	273 et seq.
Limits on unbounded discretion, 90	Congressional authorization to act,
Mixed questions of law and fact, <b>18</b> Preserved vs unpreserved claims, <b>4</b>	137
Sound discretion, 90	Congressionally delegated lawmak-
Statutory delegations of discretion,	ing authority, 137, 145, 197
84, 86	Discretionary agency actions, judicial
Supervision of litigation issues, <b>83</b>	review limitations, 194
Unbounded discretion, limits on, 90	Establishment by organic statutes, 137
ACQUITTAL	Executive agencies, <b>137</b>
See Judgment of Acquittal, this index	Exhaustion of administrative reme-
ADJUDICATIONS	dies limitation on judicial relief,
See Administrative Agencies, this	Final agency actions, <b>188</b>
index	Finality doctrine, <b>169</b>
ADMINISTRATIVE AGENCIES	Four-part test of interpretive rules,
Generally, 135 et seq.	202
Adjudications	Independent agencies, <b>137</b>
generally, <b>136</b>	Informal actions, reviewability, <b>196</b>
formal, <b>226</b> , <b>270</b>	Initial decisions, 270
10111101, 220, 210	minut decisions, 210

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENCIES	ADMINISTRATIVE AGENCIES
—Cont'd	—Cont'd
Interpretive rules. See Agency Interpretive Rules, this index	Substantial Evidence Standard of Review, this index
Issue waivers limiting judicial	Tentative decisions, 270
review, 183	Tests of finality, 199
Jurisdictional limitations on judicial review, threshold, <b>147</b>	Threshold jurisdictional and prudential limitations on judicial
Mootness limitations on judicial review, <b>148</b> , <b>165</b>	review, <b>147</b> Vagueness challenges to rules, <b>281</b>
No action decisions, reviewability, 195	Waivers limiting judicial review, issue waivers, 183
No-law-to-apply test, <b>194</b> Non-final actions, reviewability, <b>196</b>	Zone-of-interests test, standing limitations on judicial review, <b>205</b>
Notice requirement of agency rules,	ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES
281 Organic statutes establishing, 137	Generally, 270
Parameters of judicial review of	ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURE
agency actions, 187 et seq.	ACT (APA)
Policy statements, reviewability, 196	Generally, 139
Presumptive reviewability of agency	§ 702, <b>143, 188, 198, 206</b>
actions	§ 704, <b>144, 198</b>
generally, 188	§ 706, <b>140</b>
final actions, 199	§ 706(1), <b>144</b>
Priorities issues, reviewability, 195	§ 706(2), <b>142</b>
Prudential limitations on judicial	§ 554(a), <b>226</b>
review, threshold, 147	§ 701(a), <b>187</b>
Reasoned decisionmaking require-	§ 706(2)(A), <b>253, 259, 279</b>
ment	§ 553(b)(3), <b>282</b>
generally, 259 et seq., 283	§ 556(b), <b>270</b>
see also Arbitrary and Capricious Standard of Review, this	§ 557(c), <b>284</b>
index	§ 706(2)(C), <b>211</b>
Recommended decisions, 270	§ 706(2)(e), <b>226</b>
Record on appeal requirements, <b>284</b>	§ 706(2)(E), <b>269</b>
Ripeness limitations on judicial	Authority grants, 139
review, <b>148, 175</b>	Chevron deference
Rulemaking, this index	generally, <b>211 et seq.</b>
Scope of agency actions, <b>136</b>	see also Chevron Standards of
Sovereign immunity issues, <b>149</b>	Review, this index
Standing limitations on judicial	Defining a cause of action, 143
review	District vs appellate court review
generally, <b>147</b> , <b>158</b>	roles, 145
zone-of-interests test, <b>205</b>	Federal question jurisdiction over
Statutory limitations on judicial	APA causes of action, <b>139</b>
review, <b>190</b>	Finality, 198
Statutory standing, 209	Findings and conclusions, substantial
Subject matter jurisdiction over	evidence supporting, <b>269</b>
judicial review, <b>147</b>	Generous review provisions, <b>188</b>

## ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURE ACT (APA)—Cont'd

Procedural requirements, 261
Scope and standards of review, 140
Subject matter jurisdiction, 139
Substantial evidence supporting findings and conclusions, 269
Zone-of-interests test, 205, 208

## AFFECTS SUBSTANTIAL RIGHTS STANDARD

Generally, **103** Plain error, **119, 126** Prejudice, **121** 

#### **AGENCY ACTIONS**

Preclusion of Judicial Review of Agency Actions, this index Presumptive Reviewability of Agency Actions, this index

## AGENCY AUTHORIZING STATUTES

Generally, 137
APA relationship, 139
Chevron Standards of Review, this index
Construction of Agency Authorizing Statutes, this index
Delegations of authority, 137
Organic statutes, 137
Parameters of judicial review of agency actions, 187 et seq.
Separation of powers limitations, 138

#### AGENCY DIRECTIVES

Action mandates, 220
Policy statements, 196
Presumption of judicial review of, 189, 193

#### AGENCY ENABLING STATUTES

See Agency Authorizing Statutes, this index

## AGENCY INTERPRETATIONS OF STATUTES

See also Chevron Standards of Review, this index Fair notice requirement, **285** 

#### AGENCY INTERPRETIVE RULES

Force and effect of, 196 Four-part test of, 202 Reviewability, 196

#### AGENCY OPINION LETTERS

Chevron deference, Legal effect, **194, 224, 238** Policy statements in, Skidmore review,

#### AGENCY ORGANIC STATUTES

See Agency Authorizing Statutes, this index

#### AMOUNT IN CONTROVERSY

See Subject Matter Jurisdiction, this index

## ARBITRARY AND CAPRICIOUS STANDARD OF REVIEW

Generally, **194**, **259** et seq.
Chevron Step Two compared, **273**Comparing and contrasting the principal standards of review, **273** et seq.

Due process mandate, 262
Factual basis of an agency's action review, 259
Grounds of action, 265
Heightened standards, 263
Importance of agency record, 265

Inadequate agency records, 265
Minimum rationality, 262
Reasoned basis analysis, 265
Reasoned decisionmaking require-

ment, **259 et seq., 284**Reasoning, review of, **259** 

Recordkeeping, importance of, **265** Revocations of established rules, **262** 

State Farm framework generally, **259** 

Chevron Step Two compared, 275

Substantial evidence review distinguished, **271** 

Substantial evidence standard compared, **278** 

#### ARISING UNDER FEDERAL LAW

See Subject Matter Jurisdiction, this index

#### ARTICLE III STANDING

See Standing, Art. III, this index

### **AUER STANDARD OF REVIEW**

Generally, 253

Chevron Step Two deference compared, **253** 

Comparing and contrasting the principal standards of review, **273 et seq.** 

Construction by agency of own regulations, 253

Regulation construction issues, 253

#### **BENCH TRIALS**

Clearly erroneous standard of review, judicial fact-finding, 23

Fact/law paradigm, 11

Judgment on Partial Findings in Civil Bench Trials, this index

Judicial fact-finding, clearly erroneous standard of review, 23

### BURDEN OF PERSUASION ON APPEAL

Judicial fact-finding, 26

## CAPABLE OF REPETITION, YET EVADING REVIEW

Generally, 166

### **CAPRICIOUS ACTIONS**

Arbitrary and Capricious Standard of Review, this index

### CASE-OR-CONTROVERSY

Administrative agencies judicial review, **148** 

Preservation of error requirements, jurisdictional issues exceptions,

Separation of powers principles underlying, 31

Standing requirement compared, 43,

#### **CAUSATION**

See Standing, Art. III, this index

#### **CHAPMAN STANDARD**

Harmless error doctrine, **96**, **107** Substantial rights impacts, **117** 

#### CHENERY RULE

Generally, 140, 265

#### CHEVRON STANDARDS OF REVIEW

Generally, 211 et seq.

Allocation of interpretive authority between agencies and courts, **211** 

Ambiguities in statutes, **221**, **245** 

Arbitrary and capricious standard of review, Chevron Step Two compared, 273

Carve-outs from Chevron deference generally, **237 et seq.** 

divided responsibility issues, 247 executive agency actions, 247

failure of agency to use delegated authority, 244

force-of-law rulemaking, 238

generic statutes, 247

litigation positions, 246

major questions, 238

multiple agency responsibility issues, 247

Chevron Step One, 216

Chevron Step Two

generally, 221

arbitrary and capricious standard of review compared, **273** 

Auer deference compared, 253

consistency of interpretations, 230

force-of-law agency actions, **224** implied delegations of authority,

231

judicial assessments of reasonableness, **226** 

State Farm framework compared, 275

Chevron Step Zero, 238

Comparing and contrasting the principal standards of review, **273 et seq.** 

Congressional intent, judicial vs agency interpretations of, 213

Congressionally delegated authority limitations, 223

Consistency of interpretations, Chevron Step Two, 230

## CHEVRON STANDARDS OF REVIEW—Cont'd

Divided responsibility carve-outs from Chevron deference, **247** 

Executive agency action carve-outs from Chevron deference, **247** 

Failure of agency to use delegated authority, **244** 

Force-of-law agency actions, **224** 

Force-of-law rulemaking, carve-outs from Chevron deference, **238** 

Generic statute carve-outs from Chevron deference, **247** 

Implied delegations of agency authority

generally, 222

Chevron Step Two, 231

Judicial assessments of reasonableness, Chevron Step Two, **226** 

Judicial vs agency interpretations of congressional intent, 213

Legislative history interpretations, **229** 

Limitations on congressionally delegated authority, **223** 

Litigation position carve-out from Chevron deference, **246** 

Major question carve-outs from Chevron deference, 238

Multiple agency responsibility carveouts from Chevron deference, 247

Plain meaning, Chevron Step One, 216

Rulemaking, this index

Skidmore deference, **248**State Farm framework, Chevron Step

Two compared, **275**Supreme Court opinion, **211** 

### CLEARLY ERRONEOUS STANDARD OF REVIEW

Bench trials, judicial fact-finding, 23 Burden of persuasion on appeal, judicial fact-finding, 26

Definition, 24

Documentary evidence, judicial fact-finding, **25** 

Due regard standard as to judicial fact-finding, 23

#### CLEARLY ERRONEOUS STANDARD OF REVIEW

—Cont'd

Four principal standards distinguished, 3

Judgment on partial findings in civil bench trials, 78

Judicial fact-finding

generally, 23

bench trials, 23

burden of persuasion on appeal, 26

documentary evidence, 25

due regard standard, 23

oral testimony, 25

plausibility measure, 25, 26

presumption of correctness, 25, 27

Oral testimony, judicial fact-finding, 25

Plausibility measure of judicial factfinding, **25**, **26** 

Preserved vs unpreserved claims, 4 Presumption of correctness, judicial

fact-finding, **25**, **27** 

Sufficiency of the evidence supporting factual findings, civil cases, 6

#### COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL

Restraints on appellate decisionmaking, 29

## COMMITTED TO AGENCY DISCRETION

Reviewability, 187, 194

## CONGRESSIONAL

**AUTHORIZATION TO ACT** 

Generally, 137, 229

### CONGRESSIONALLY DELEGATED LAWMAKING AUTHORITY

Generally, **137**, **145**, **197** 

## CONSERVATION OF JUDICIAL RESOURCES

See Judicial Resources, Conservation of, this index

## CONSTITUTIONAL CONSIDERATIONS

Fact/law paradigm generally, **17** 

## CONSTITUTIONAL CONSIDERATIONS—Cont'd

Fact/law paradigm—Cont'd overriding constitutional constraints, **21** 

Fundamental requirements, 3
Harmless error doctrine, presumptive harm, 96

Jurisdiction, Article III prerequisites, 30

Preservation of claims of structural constitutional errors, **97** 

Presumptive harm, harmless error doctrine, **96** 

Structural errors, preservation of claims of, **97** 

### CONSTRUCTION OF AGENCY AUTHORIZING STATUTES

Generally, 211

Allocation of interpretive authority between agencies and courts, 211

Arguments against deference, 215 Chevron Standards of Review, this index

Deference, 211

Delegations of agency authority, explicit or implicit, **222** 

Implicit or explicit delegations of agency authority, 222

Legislative history interpretations, **229** 

Plain meaning, Chevron Step One, **216** 

Reasonableness, 226

#### COURTS, DISTRICT AND APPELLATE COMPARED

Allocations of decisional authority, **3** Fact/law paradigm, **3**, **7** Institutional capacities, **18** 

#### CREDIBILITY DETERMINATIONS

Agency findings, 270
Clearly-erroneous standard, 15
Deference to finder of fact, 24
Fact/law paradigm, 14
Judgment as a matter of law, 63
Summary judgment stage, 51

#### CRIMINAL PROCEEDINGS

Double Jeopardy Clause, **3, 21**Judgment of Acquittal, this index
Preservation of error, **5**Standard of review, **5** 

#### **DEFERENCE**

Abuse of Discretion Standard of Review, this index Arbitrary and Capricious Standard of

Review, this index
Arguments against deference, 215

Auer Standard of Review, this index Chevron deference

generally, 211 et seq.

see also Chevron Standards of Review, this index

Construction of Agency Authorizing Statutes, this index

District court

discretionary decisions, 5 findings of fact, 5

Skidmore deference, 248

#### **DELEGATED AUTHORITY**

Administrative Agencies, this index Congressionally Delegated Lawmaking Authority, this index

## DE NOVO STANDARD OF REVIEW

Civil jury trials, judgment as a matter of law motions, **61** 

Clarification of legal principles through, **14** 

Collateral order doctrine, summary judgment denials, **58** 

Conclusions of law

generally, 29 et seq.

challenges, 5

Constitution Article III prerequisites, 30

Standing, Art. III, this index Subject Matter Jurisdiction, this

index
Constitution Article III prerequisites,

30 Definition, 30

Factual findings establishing subject matter jurisdiction, 39

#### DE NOVO STANDARD OF REVIEW—Cont'd

Four principal standards distinguished, 3

Judgment as a Matter of Law, this index

Judgment of Acquittal, this index Judgment on partial findings in civil bench trials, **79** 

Judicial restraints on appellate decisionmaking, **29** 

Law vs fact questions, 7

Plain-error standard distinguished, 71

Plastic nature of, 30

Preserved vs unpreserved claims, 4 Standing, Art. III, this index Subject Matter Jurisdiction, this

index Sufficiency of evidence challenges,

Summary judgment practice, **53 et seq.** 

#### DEVOID OF EVIDENCE TEST

Plain error review, 72

### DIRECTED VERDICT

See Judgment as a Matter of Law, this index

#### DISCRETION

Administrative agency actions generally, **194 et seq** 

see also Arbitrary and Capricious Standard of Review, this index

District court decisions generally, **83 et seq.** 

see also Abuse of Discretion Standard of Review, this index

## DISINTERESTED WITNESS REQUIREMENT

Judgment as a matter of law, **63** Summary judgment, **56** 

### **DIVERSITY JURISDICTION**

See Subject Matter Jurisdiction, this index

### DOUBLE JEOPARDY CLAUSE

Generally, 3, 21

### DOUBLE JEOPARDY CLAUSE

—Cont'd

Judgment of acquittal, 70

#### **DUE PROCESS CLAUSE**

Arbitrary and capricious standard of review, 262

Fair notice requirement of agency rules, **281** 

Judgment of acquittal in jury trials, **68** 

Review standard considerations, 3

#### **ENABLING STATUTES**

See Agency Authorizing Statutes, this index

#### ERRORS OF LAW

See De Novo Standard of Review, this index

### ESTOPPEL BY JUDGMENT

Judgment on partial findings in civil bench trials, 77

#### **EVIDENCE**

Abuse of discretion review, evidence assessments, **85** 

Judgment as a Matter of Law, this index

Judgment of Acquittal, this index Standing, relevance of evidence on merits of claim, **52** 

Substantial Evidence Standard of Review, this index

Sufficiency of the Evidence, this index

Summary judgment practice, evidentiary requirements, **55** 

# EXCEPTIONAL CIRCUMSTANCES

See Plain Error Standard of Review, this index

### EXHAUSTION OF ADMINISTRATIVE REMEDIES

Judicial relief limitation on, 180

#### EXPRESS DELEGATION

Agency action taken pursuant to, 227, 232

#### EXPRESS DELEGATION—Cont'd

Congressional delegation gaps creating, 213

## FACIAL VS FACTUAL CHALLENGES

Standing distinctions, 49

#### FACT/LAW PARADIGM

Generally, 7 et seq.

See also Mixed Questions of Law and Fact, this index

Abstract laws, 10

Abstract legal norms, 12

Abstract legal norms or principles, laws defined in terms of, 8

Actual malice findings, 15

Agency actions

generally, 269 et seq.

see also Substantial Evidence Standard of Review, this index

Alternative interpretation of the evidence in agency actions, 271

Basic facts, 7

Bench trials, 11

Common sense concepts, 13

Constitutional constraints, overriding, 21

Constitutional protection issues, 17 Credibility determinations, agency actions, 270

Deference to discretionary decisions, district court findings, 5

Deference to findings of fact, district court findings, 5

Definition, 3

Distinctions, 7, 12

District court decisions, 7 et seq.

Findings and conclusions, substantial evidence supporting, APA, **269** 

Findings of fact challenges, preservation of error requirement, **5** 

Fluid principles applications, 14

Functional analysis, 14

Functional considerations, 16

Harmless error, 11

Historical facts

generally, 7, 12

judgment on partial findings in civil bench trials, 79

#### FACT/LAW PARADIGM—Cont'd

Inferences, 7

Judicial glosses on statutory language, 11

Jury trial rights as to factual determinations, 3

Jury trial rights issues, 10

Limits of the paradigm, 12

Mixed questions, 12, 21

Preservation of error on findings of fact challenges, **5** 

Primary facts, 7

Repeated judicial interpretations distinguishing, 13

Subsidiary findings of fact, 17

Substantial evidence supporting findings and conclusions, APA, 269

Theory informing the paradigm: the functional approach, 13

#### FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM

Rule 12(b)(6), 40

#### **FAIR ASSURANCE**

Harmless error findings, 105, 115

### FAIR NOTICE REQUIREMENT

Agency interpretation of statutes, **285** Due process, **281** 

#### FEDERAL QUESTION JURISDICTION

Generally, 34

See also Subject Matter Jurisdiction, this index

Administrative Procedure Act causes of action, 139

Immaterial federal claims, 40

#### FEDERAL RULES

Appellate Procedure 3(c), 95

Civil Procedure

50, 7

11, 18

52, **23** 

56, **50, 51** 

59, **64** 50, **69** 

61, 95

46, 98

50, 99

FEDERAL RULES—Cont'd	FINALITY OF AGENCY ACTIONS
Civil Procedure—Cont'd	—Cont'd
1, 101	Tests of finality, 199
61, <b>112</b>	FITNESS FOR REVIEW
51, <b>126</b>	See Ripeness Doctrine, this index
44.1, <b>29</b>	FORFEITURE
52(a)(5), <b>6, 98</b> 52(a)(6), <b>23</b>	Plain Error Standard of Review, this
52(a)(0), 23 52(a)(1), (2), <b>23</b>	index
12(b), <b>99</b>	Preservation of Claims of Error, this
12(b)(1), <b>32, 52</b>	index
12(b)(6), <b>33, 51</b>	FORMAL ADJUDICATION
39(b), <b>91</b>	See Administrative Agencies, this
51(c), (d), <b>98</b>	index
51(d), <b>95</b>	
12(h)(1), <b>33, 99</b>	FORMAL RULEMAKING
12(h)(3), <b>33</b>	See Rulemaking, this index
50 (judgment as a matter of law),	FORUM NON CONVENIENS
61 et seq.	Abuse of discretion review, 89, 92
52 (judgment on partial findings),	FOUR-PART TEST
77 et seq. 56 (summary judgment practice),	See Plain Error Standard of Review,
53 et seq.	this index
Criminal Procedure	FUNCTIONAL APPROACH
1, 101	Fact/law paradigm issues, 13
52(a), <b>95</b>	Mixed findings of law and fact issues,
52 advisory committee's notes, 119	79
51(b), <b>98</b>	
52(b), <b>6, 95, 119</b>	FUNDAMENTAL ERROR
12(c)(3), <b>99</b>	Plain error distinguished, 6
23(c), <b>74</b>	GENUINE ISSUE OF MATERIAL
29(c)(3), <b>64</b>	FACT
30(d), <b>95</b> , <b>98</b> , <b>119</b>	Reasonable jury directed verdict stan-
11(h), <b>95</b>	dard distinguished, 54
29 (judgment of acquittal), <b>67 et</b> seq.	Summary judgment practice, <b>54</b> , <b>56</b>
Evidence	GRAVE DOUBT
103(a), <b>95, 112</b>	Harmless error analysis, 95, 104, 113
1101(a), <b>101</b>	GUILTY VERDICTS
103 advisory committee's note,	See also Judgment of Acquittal, this
126	index
103(c), <b>127</b>	Appellate review of the underlying
103(e), <b>6, 95</b>	factual findings, 3
FINALITY OF AGENCY ACTIONS	Sixth Amendment restraints on appel-
Generally, <b>169</b> , <b>188</b>	late review, 3
APA, <b>198</b>	HABEAS CORPUS
Reviewability of non-final actions,	Civil nature of federal proceedings
197	generally, 102

#### HABEAS CORPUS—Cont'd

Civil nature of federal proceedings —Cont'd substantial rights issues, 111 Harmless error doctrine, 102, 114 Mixed questions of fact and law, 17

#### HARD LOOK REVIEW

Agency activities incompletely recorded, 259

#### **HARDSHIP**

Ripeness doctrine applications, 175

### HARMLESS BEYOND A REASONABLE DOUBT

Generally, 102 Civil cases, 117 Criminal cases, 107

### HARMLESS ERROR DOCTRINE

Generally, 101 et seq.

Burden of establishing harmlessness, criminal vs civil proceedings, 96, 114

Case-specific approach to constitutional harmlessness review, 109

Chapman test of harmfulness generally, 102 civil cases applicability, 117 criminal cases, 107

Civil cases

generally, 112

substantial rights test, 112

Constitutional errors, presumptive harm, 96

Criminal cases

generally, 102 et seq.

substantial rights test, 102

Criminal vs civil proceedings, burden of establishing harmlessness, 96, 114

Fact/law paradigm, 11

Federal habeas corpus proceedings,

Intrinsically harmful constitutional errors, 109

Intrinsically harmful structural defects, 102

## HARMLESS ERROR DOCTRINE

—Cont'd

Kotteakos test of harmfulness, 102, 103, 115

Possible error, finding of harmlessness as to. 102

Preservation of claims of error rules compared, 95

Preservation requirement, 101

Presumptive harm, constitutional errors, 96

Reasonable doubt, harmless beyond generally, 102

civil cases, 117

criminal cases, 107

Sanders standard, 112

Structural constitutional errors, 95

Structural defects, 102, 109

Substantial rights test

generally, 101

civil cases, 112

criminal cases, 102

#### IMPLIED DELEGATION

See Chevron Standards of Review, this index

#### INFORMAL ADJUDICATION

See Administrative Agencies, this index

#### INFORMAL RULEMAKING

See Rulemaking, this index

#### INJURY IN FACT

See Standing, Art. III, this index

#### INTEREST OF JUSTICE **STANDARD**

See Plain Error Standard of Review, this index

### INTERPRETATIVE RULES, **AGENCY**

See Construction of Agency Authorizing Statutes, this index

### **IQBAL TWO-PRONGED** APPROACH TO STANDING

Generally, 49

#### ISSUE WAIVER IN REVIEW OF JUDGMENT OF ACQUITTAL AGENCY ACTIONS —Cont'd Bench trials—Cont'd Generally, 183 petty offenses, 74 JACKSON STANDARD reasonable doubt standard and, 74 See Judgment of Acquittal, this index renewal of motion, 76 JUDGMENT AS A MATTER OF substantial evidence' test, 74 LAW Burden of proof, bench trials, 76 Generally, 61 De novo standard of review, bench Burden of proof, 62 trials, 74, 75 Civil jury trials, 61 Double jeopardy considerations, jury Credibility determinations, 63 trials, 70 Directed verdict practice compared, Due process requirements, jury trials, Fact questions subject to resolution Inferences, reasonability of, jury trithrough, 61 als, 72 Genuine issue summary judgment Jackson standard standard distinguished, 62 bench trials, 74 Joined motion for new trial, 64 jury trials, 68 Judgment notwithstanding the Joined new trial motions, jury trials, verdict, 64 **70** Jury trial rights issues, 62 Jury trials New trial motions combined with generally, 67 et seq. motions for, 64 double jeopardy considerations, 70 Preservation of error challenges to due process requirements, 68 rulings, 7 inferences, reasonability of, 72 Procedural requirements, 65 Jackson standard, 68 Reasonable juror standard, 62 joined new trial motions, 70 Renewed motions, post verdict, 64 manifest miscarriage of justice Standard of proof issues, 63 formulation, 73 Sua sponte rulings, 64 preservation of objection, 74 Sufficiency of evidence challenges, prima facie case, motion challengde novo review, 62 ing, 69 Summary judgment practice, 54 reasonability of inferences, 72 Verdict, motions after, 64 reasonable doubt standard and, 67 Weighing of evidence, 63 reasonable inferences, 68 JUDGMENT NOTWITHSTANDING renewal of motion after verdict, 69 THE VERDICT reserved rulings, 69 See Judgment as a Matter of Law, rulings, preservation of error, 70 this index time for making motion, 69 JUDGMENT OF ACQUITTAL waivers, 73 Generally, 67 et seq. weighing of evidence, 68 Bench trials Manifest miscarriage of justice generally, 74 formulation, jury trials, 73 burden of proof, 76 Petty offenses, bench trials, 74 de novo standard of review, 74, 75 Preservation of objection, jury trials, Jackson standard, 74 74

### JUDGMENT OF ACQUITTAL —Cont'd

Prima facie case, motion challenging, jury trials, 69

Reasonability of inferences, jury trials, **72** 

Reasonable doubt

bench trials, 74

judgment of acquittal motions in jury trials, 67

jury trials, 67

Reasonable inferences, jury trials, 68

Renewal of motion

after verdict, jury trials, 69

bench trials, 76

Reserved rulings, jury trials, 69 Substantial evidence test, bench tri-

als, 74

Time for making motion, jury trials,

Waivers, jury trials, 73

Weighing of evidence, jury trials, 68

### JUDGMENT ON PARTIAL FINDINGS IN CIVIL BENCH TRIALS

Generally, 77 et seq.

Clearly erroneous standard, 78

Conclusions of law, de novo review of. 79

De novo review, 79

Estoppel by judgment, 77

Findings of fact

presumptive correctness of, 78

separate statement of, 77

Historical facts findings, 79

Mixed questions of law and fact, 79

Preservation requirement, 79

Presumptive correctness of findings of fact, 78

Res judicata, 77

Separate statement of findings of fact,

Subsidiary facts findings, 79

### JUDICIAL RESOURCES, **CONSERVATION OF**

Fact/law paradigm, 24 Finality doctrine, 169

### JUDICIAL RESOURCES. CONSERVATION OF—Cont'd

Preservation of claim rules, 3, 131

Standing doctrine, 168

Summary judgment practice, 53

### JUDICIAL RESTRAINT DOCTRINES

Law-of-the-circuit, law-of-the-case,

#### JURISDICTION

Personal Jurisdiction, this index Subject Matter Jurisdiction, this index

#### JURY TRIAL

See Trial by Jury, this index

### KOTTEAKOS TEST OF **HARMFULNESS**

Generally, 102, 103, 115

#### LAW AND FACT QUESTIONS

Fact/Law Paradigm, this index Mixed Questions of Law and Fact, this index

#### LAW-OF-THE-CASE

Judicial restraint doctrines, 29

### LAW-OF-THE-CIRCUIT

Judicial restraint doctrines, 29

#### LEGAL CONCLUSIONS

See De Novo Standard of Review, this index

### **LEGAL ERRORS**

See De Novo Standard of Review, this index

### LITIGATION POSITION

Treatment of on review of agency action, 246

#### **MANIFEST INJUSTICE**

See Plain Error Standard of Review, this index

### MANIFESTLY CONTRARY TO THE STATUTE TEST

Generally, 214, 228

#### MATERIAL FACT REQUIREMENT

Summary judgment practice, 54

#### MISCARRIAGE OF JUSTICE

See Plain Error Standard of Review, this index

#### MIXED FINDINGS

See Mixed Questions of Law and Fact, this index

## MIXED QUESTIONS OF LAW AND FACT

Generally, 8, 12

See also Fact/Law Paradigm, this index

Abuse of discretion standard, 18 Constitutional constraints, overriding,

Judgment on partial findings in civil bench trials, 79

Jurisdictional facts, 40

Precedential rulings, 22

Standing, Art. III, 44

Subject matter jurisdiction, factual findings establishing, **39** 

Summary judgment practice, 61

#### MOOTNESS DOCTRINE

Administrative agencies judicial review, **148**, **165** 

#### **MULTIPART TEST**

Plain error reversal, 11

## NEW ISSUES RAISED ON REVIEW

Plain error review standard, 3

#### **NEW TRIAL MOTIONS**

Abuse of discretion review, **70**Judgment as a matter of law motions combined with, **64** 

### NO LAW TO APPLY EXCEPTION TO REVIEW OF AGENCY ACTION

Generally, 194

#### NONCONSTITUTIONAL ERROR

See Harmless Error Doctrine, this index

#### NOT GUILTY VERDICTS

Double Jeopardy Clause protection from review, **3**, **21**, **23** 

#### NOTICE

Agency interpretation of statutes, fair notice requirement, **285** 

### NOTICE-AND-COMMENT RULEMAKING

See Rulemaking, this index

## ON-THE-RECORD REVIEW OF AGENCY ACTION

Standard of review, 271

#### OPINION LETTERS OF AGENCIES

See Agency Opinion Letters, this index

## PARTIAL FINDINGS IN CIVIL BENCH TRIALS

Judgment on Partial Findings in Civil Bench Trials, this index

## PERMISSIBLE CONSTRUCTION STANDARD

Chevron Step Two, 213

### PERSONAL JURISDICTION

Subject matter jurisdiction issues distinguished, **33** 

Subject matter jurisdiction threshold questions, 32

Waiver of challenges to, 33

## PLAIN ERROR STANDARD OF REVIEW

Appellate court discretion as to application, **119** 

Burden of satisfying standard, 120 Circuits having differing views, 6

generally, 125 et seq.

exceptional circumstances, 125 sufficiency of the evidence supporting jury verdicts, 6

Clear error, 120

Civil cases

Criminal cases, four-part test of plain error, 126

De novo standard distinguished, 71

#### PRE-ENFORCEMENT REVIEW PLAIN ERROR STANDARD OF REVIEW—Cont'd OF AGENCY ACTIONS Discretion of appellate court as to Generally, 155, 173 et seq. application, 119 PRESERVATION OF CLAIMS OF Exceptional circumstances, 3 **ERROR** civil cases, 125 Generally, 4, 95 et seq. framework. 6 Abandonment, waiver as, 100 Forfeited-but-reversible error, 6 Appeal, waiver of claim on, 100 Four-part test Burden of satisfying plain error rule, generally, 112 judicial review of unpreserved criminal cases, 126 claims and arguments, 120 fourth prong, 123 Civil cases Olano standard, 119, 126 forfeited errors, 97 structural errors, applicability to, iudicial review of unpreserved claims and arguments, 125 et Four principal standards distinguished, 3 sufficiency of the evidence sup-Fundamental error standard porting civil verdicts, 6 distinguished, 6 sufficiency of the evidence sup-Injustice, application to avoid, 126 porting factual findings, 6 Manifest injustice review, 5 sufficiency of the evidence sup-Miscarriage of justice review, 5 porting jury verdicts, 6 Multipart test of reversibility, 11 Criminal cases New issues raised on review, 3 generally, 5, 119 et seq. Obvious error, 120 forfeited errors, 97 Olano standard judicial review of unpreserved four-part test of plain error, 119, claims and arguments, 119 et 126 seq. Preserved and unpreserved claims, 4 Discretion of appellate court, judicial Structural errors, applicability to, 111 review of unpreserved claims and arguments, 119 Substantial rights requirement, 120 Estoppel, 96 Sufficiency of the evidence supporting jury verdicts in civil cases, 6 Extinguishment of waived errors, 98 Findings of fact challenges, 5 PLENARY REVIEW Forfeited-but-reversible error, 6 See De Novo Standard of Review, Forfeiture this index generally, 5 civil cases, 97 POLICY STATEMENTS OF criminal cases, 97 AGENCIES discretion of appellate court as to Generally, 136 application of plain error rule, Reviewability, 187, 196 PRECLUSION OF JUDICIAL doctrine, forefeiture, 96 REVIEW OF AGENCY four-part test of plain error, 126 **ACTIONS** injustice, application of plain error standard to avoid, 126 Generally, 150 Implied preclusion, 154 legal error, 100

## ERROR—Cont'd Forfeiture—Cont'd subject matter jurisdiction challenges, 32 waiver distinguished, 7 Four-part plain error test. See Plain Error Standard of Review, this index Harmless error doctrine, 101 Harmless error standard compared, Injustice, application of plain error standard to avoid, 126 Intentional relinquishment or abandonment, 98 Judgment as a matter of law motions, Judgment of acquittal practice, jury trials, 70, 74 Judgment on partial findings in civil bench trials, 79 Judicial review of unpreserved claims and arguments generally, 119 et seq. see also Plain Error Standard of Review, this index burden of satisfying plain error rule, **120** civil cases, 125 et seq. criminal cases, 119 et seq. discretion of appellate court, 119 substantial rights requirement, 120 Jurisdictional issues exceptions, 7 Jury trials, judgment of acquittal practice, **70**, **74** Legal error, forfeiture, 100 Mixed questions of law and fact, 22 Procedural requirements, 98 Structural constitutional errors, 97 Subject matter jurisdiction challenges, 32 Substantial rights requirement, judicial review of unpreserved claims and arguments, 120 Sufficiency of the evidence supporting jury verdicts in civil cases, 6 Unpreserved claims and arguments

generally, 119 et seq.

PRESERVATION OF CLAIMS OF

## PRESERVATION OF CLAIMS OF ERROR—Cont'd

Unpreserved claims and arguments
—Cont'd
Plain Error Standard of Review,
this index

Waiver

abandonment, 100
appeal, waiver of claim on, 100
doctrine, waiver, 96
extinguishment, 98
forfeiture distinguished, 7

## PRESUMPTION OF CORRECTNESS

Judicial fact-finding, 25, 27

## PRESUMPTIVE REVIEWABILITY OF AGENCY ACTIONS

Generally, **188** Final actions, **199** 

#### PRUDENTIAL STANDING

Generally, 32

#### REASONABLE DOUBT

Harmless beyond a reasonable doubt generally, 102 civil cases, 117 criminal cases, 107 Judgment of Acquittal, this index Legal nature of issue, 67

## REASONABLE INTERPRETATION TEST

Generally, 214

### REASONABLE JURY STANDARD

Directed verdict standard, genuine issue requirement distinguished, 54

Judgment as a matter of law, **62** Jury trial rights, **77** 

### REASONED DECISIONMAKING

Generally, **259 et seq., 283**See also Arbitrary and Capricious
Standard of Review, this index

### REDRESSABILITY

See Standing, Art. III, this index

#### **RE-EXAMINATION CLAUSE**

See Trial by Jury, this index

#### REMOVAL JURISDICTION

Generally, 35

#### **RES JUDICATA**

Judgment on partial findings in civil bench trials, 77

## REVIEWABILITY OF AGENCY ACTIONS

Generally, 135

See also Administrative Agencies, this index

#### RIPENESS DOCTRINE

Administrative agencies review, **148**, **175** 

District court decisions review hardship issues, 175 sua sponte rulings, 198

#### RULEMAKING

Generally, 136

Arbitrary and capricious standard of review, revocations of established rules, **262** 

Authority grants, 223

Carve-outs from Chevron deference, force-of-law rulemaking, 238

Chevron deference accorded, 226

Clarity requirements, 281

Comment periods, 184

Enforcement policies, 195

Final rules, notice, 282

Force-of-law rulemaking, carve-outs from Chevron deference, 238

Formal rulemaking hearing, 202

Informal rulemaking, fair notice requirements, **282** 

Notice and comment rulemaking, 202 Notice of a proposed rulemaking, 282 Notice requirement of agency rules,

281

Procedural requirements, 141

Refusals to institute, reviewability, **195** 

Revocations of established rules, arbitrary and capricious standard of review. **262** 

#### RULEMAKING—Cont'd

Vagueness challenges, 281

## SCOPE OF JUDICIAL REVIEW OF AGENCY ACTIONS

Generally, 140

#### SEMINOLE ROCK CASE

See Auer Standard of Review, this index

#### SEPARATION OF POWERS

Administrative agencies' authority, 138

Case-and-controversy requisites, principles underlying, **31** Standing doctrine, **43** 

#### SEVENTH AMENDMENT

Re-examination Clause, 77

#### SIXTH AMENDMENT

Limited review of jury findings of guilt, **3**, **21** 

## SKIDMORE STANDARD OF REVIEW

Generally, 248

Comparing and contrasting the principal standards of review, **273 et seq.** 

#### **SOVEREIGN IMMUNITY ISSUES**

Administrative agencies, 149

#### STANDARD OF PROOF ISSUES

Summary judgment practice, 54

#### STANDING, ART. III

Generally, 42

Abstract injuries, 162

Actual or imminent injury, 46

Actual or imminently threatened injury, **42** 

Administrative agencies, standing limitations on judicial review

generally, 147, 158

zone-of-interests test, 205

Burden of establishing, 43, 49

Case or controversy requirement compared, 43, 45

Causation

generally, 44

#### STANDING, ART. III—Cont'd STANDING, ART. III—Cont'd Causation—Cont'd Sua sponte rulings, 49 redressability distinguished, 47 Summary judgment stage challenges, Concreteness, 161 Trial, standing challenges arising Concrete vs abstract injury, 44 during, **51**, **53** Conjectural or hypothetical threats, Well-pleaded factual allegations establishing, 50 Constitution Article III prerequisites, STARE DECISIS De novo review of challenges, 53 Judicial restraint doctrine, 29 Elements of requirement, 44 STATE COURT PRECEDENT Establishing, 43, 48 Effect on appellate review in federal Evidence on merits of claim, courts, 37 relevance to standing issues, 52 Facial vs factual challenges, 49 STATE FARM DECISION Generalized grievances, 162 See Arbitrary and Capricious Stan-Imminence requirement, 46 dard of Review, this index Injury actually or imminently STATUTORY INTERPRETATION threatened, 42 IN CHEVRON DECISION Injury in fact, 43 See Chevron Standards of Review, Intangible harms, 45 this index Intangible injuries, 162 Joined plaintiffs, 48 STATUTORY LIMITATIONS ON Merits of claim evidence, relevance JUDICIAL REVIEW OF AGENCY ACTIONS to standing issues, 52 Mixed fact and law questions sup-Generally, **190** porting, 44 Zone-of-interests test, 205 Mootness doctrine, 32 STRUCTURAL ERRORS Nature vs merits of claim, 44 Harmless error doctrine, 95, 102, 109 Particularized injury, 45, 161 Plain error standard of review Preservation of error requirements, applicability, 111 jurisdictional issues exceptions, SUA SPONTE RULINGS Proof of facts supporting, 51 Judgment as a matter of law, **64** Ripeness, review of agency actions, Proof of standing in the appellate 198 courts, 164 Standing, Art. III, 49 Prudential standing, 32 Subject-matter jurisdiction chal-Purpose of doctrine, 42 lenges, 33 Qui tam actions, 45 Redressability SUBJECT MATTER generally, 44 JURISDICTION causation distinguished, 47 Abstention doctrines, 32 Separation of powers principles Administrative agencies judicial review, 147 underlying, 31, 43 Administrative Procedure Act, 139 Source vs merits of claim, 44 Alienage, 34 Statutory claims, 45 Arising under federal law, 36, 40 Statutory standing, administrative agency actions, 209 Burden of establishing, 35

## SUBJECT MATTER JURISDICTION—Cont'd

Clear statement rule, 41

Collateral order doctrine, summary judgment denials, **58** 

Congressional intent as to statutory restrictions on, 42

Constitution Article III prerequisites, 30

De novo standard of review, 30

Diversity, 34, 39

Establishing, 35

Factual findings establishing, 39

Forfeiture of challenges to, 32

Mixed jurisdictional facts, 40

Personal jurisdiction issues distinguished, **33** 

Personal jurisdiction threshold questions, **32** 

Preservation of error requirements, jurisdictional issues exceptions,

Standing, Art. III, this index

Sua sponte rulings, 33

Substantive vs jurisdictional statutory requirements, **41** 

Supplemental jurisdiction over related claims, **35** 

Types of, 34

Waiver of challenges to, 32

#### SUBSIDIARY FACTS FINDINGS

Judgment on partial findings in civil bench trials, 79

### SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE STANDARD OF REVIEW

Generally, 269 et seq.

Alternative interpretation of the evidence, **271** 

Arbitrary and capricious review distinguished, **271** 

Arbitrary and capricious standard compared, **278** 

Comparing and contrasting the principal standards of review, **273 et seq.** 

Credibility determinations, 270

Whole-record substantial evidence review, **270** 

## SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE TEST OF GLASSER

Generally, 68

### SUBSTANTIAL RIGHTS

See also Harmless Error Doctrine, this index

## SUFFICIENCY OF THE EVIDENCE

Challenges, de novo review, 62

Civil cases, preservation of error, sufficiency of the evidence supporting factual findings challenges, **6** 

Criminal trials. See Judgment of Acquittal, this index

Preservation of error, sufficiency of the evidence supporting factual findings challenges in civil cases, **6** 

#### **SUMMARY JUDGMENT**

Generally, **53 et seq.** 

Admissibility of evidence issues, 57

Appeals from denials, 58

Burden of production, shifting of, 56

Burden of proof, 55

Challenges, standing, 50

Collateral order doctrine, 58

Denials, appeals from, 58

De novo review of rulings, 54

Evidentiary requirements, 55

Finality of denials, 58

Genuine issue requirement

generally, **54**, **56** 

judgment as a matter of law distinguished, **62** 

Inferences from evidence, **56** 

Interlocutory nature of denials, 58

Judgment as a matter of law

generally, 54

genuine issue standard

distinguished, 62

Material fact requirement, 54

Mixed fact and law questions, 61

Reeves test, 56

Shifting of burden of production, 56

Standard of proof issues, 54

#### SUMMARY JUDGMENT—Cont'd

Standing, summary judgment stage challenges, **50** 

Witness credibility issues, 57

## SUPPLEMENTAL JURISDICTION

Generally, 35

#### TRIAL BY JURY

Civil jury trials

of. 77

judgment as a matter of law, **61** Fact/law distinctions, **10** 

Factual determinations on appeal, 3 Findings of fact, appellate review, 22 Findings of jury, standard of review

Judgment as a matter of law in civil jury trials, **61** 

Judgment as a matter of law rulings and right to jury trial, 62

Judgment of Acquittal, this index Preservation of error, sufficiency of the evidence supporting civil verdicts, **6** 

Reasonable juror standard, 77
Re-examination Clause of the
Seventh Amendment, 77
Standard of review of jury findings,

## ULTRA VIRES ACTION BY AGENCY

Judicial review, 155, 193

#### UNPRESERVED CLAIMS

See Preservation of Claims of Error, this index

## UNREASONABLE DELAY IN AGENCY ACTION

Generally, 136, 141

### VERMONT YANKEE DECISION

Rulemaking procedures, 141, 261

### **VOLUNTARY CESSATION**

Mootness doctrine exception, 166

#### WAIVER

Issue waivers limiting judicial review, **183** 

Judgment of acquittal, jury trials, **73** Personal jurisdiction, challenges to,

Preservation of Claims of Error, this index

Subject matter jurisdiction, challenges to, **32** 

## WELL-PLEADED FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS

Standing established by, **50** 

### **ZONE-OF-INTERESTS STANDING**

Administrative agencies, standing limitations on judicial review, **205, 208**