

# Index

## **ABSENCE OR PRESENCE**

- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, absence of comments, § 3:10
- Review of final rules, absence of congressional direction, § 19:18

## **ABUSE OF DISCRETION**

- Definitions or distinctions, § 16:13

## **ACCESS**

- Analysis and impact requirements, access to underlying data, § 7:37

## **ACTUAL NOTICE**

- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, actual notice exceptions from rulemaking, § 3:54

## **ADDITIONAL MATTERS**

- Analysis and Impact Requirements** (this index)

## **ADEQUACY OR INADEQUACY**

- Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, inadequate response to comments, Test 8, § 16:11
- Development of rule, adequacy of notice regarding issues, § 5:8

## **ADJUDICATION**

- Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, § 18:26
- Definitions or distinctions, § 2:13
- Preambles and history of rules, impact of rules on adjudicated case precedents, § 10:5
- Rulemaking contrasted to. **Adjudication, Rulemaking Contrasted to** (this index)

## **ADJUDICATION, RULEMAKING CONTRASTED TO**

- Generally, § 22:1 et seq.

## **ADJUDICATION, RULEMAKING CONTRASTED TO—Cont'd**

- Agency avoidance of rulemaking, judicial review of, § 22:2
- Agency leaders' incentives to choose, § 22:14
- Avoidance of rulemaking, judicial review of agency, § 22:2
- Benefits of rulemaking, § 22:16
- Burdens of using adjudication, § 22:11
- Changes
  - courts require statements regarding changes, § 22:15
  - interpretations, changes of, § 22:4
- Choice
  - adjudication chosen over rules, § 22:1
  - agency leaders' incentives to choose, § 22:14
  - consequences of choices, § 22:10
- Consequences of choices, § 22:10
- Courts require statements regarding changes, § 22:15
- Discovery advantage in adjudication, § 22:12
- Due process, § 22:17
- Efficiency rationales, § 22:6
- Evidence, substantial evidence standard, § 22:13
- Future issues for adjudication and rulemaking, § 22:18
- Incentives to choose, agency leaders', § 22:14
- Influencers, adjudication insulates against, § 22:8
- Insulation, adjudication insulates against influencers, § 22:8
- Interpretations, changes of, § 22:4
- Judicial review of agency avoidance of rulemaking, § 22:2

**ADJUDICATION, RULEMAKING**

**CONTRASTED TO—Cont'd**

- Limits on standing, effects of, § 22:19
- Other case developments, § 22:20
- Possible trends, § 22:9
- Prosecutorial discretion guidance not final agency rule, § 22:21
- Rationale, efficiency, § 22:6
- Reasons for choices, § 22:5
- Standards, substantial evidence standard, § 22:13
- Standing, effects of limits on, § 22:19
- Stare decisis certainty, loss of, § 22:7
- Statements regarding changes, courts require, § 22:15
- Substantial evidence standard, § 22:13
- Supreme court landmark cases, § 22:3
- Trends, possibility of, § 22:9

**ADMINISTRATION**

- Policy changes after elections, § 19:22

**ADMINISTRATIVE RECORD**

- Definitions or distinctions, § 2:10

**ADOPTION OF RULE**

- Delay in, § 14:3

**ADVANCEMENTS**

- Development of rule, advanced notice of proposed rulemaking, § 5:6

**ADVICE LETTERS**

- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, advice letters of agency, § 3:62

**ADVISORY COMMITTEES**

- Development of rule, § 5:10

**ADVISORY OPINION**

- Definitions or distinctions, § 2:11

**AGENCY**

- Adjudication, Rulemaking Contrasted To** (this index)

**AGENCY—Cont'd**

- Analysis and impact requirements, review of agency inaction on environmental issues, § 7:41
- Appeal and review, agency assertion of nonreviewability, § 15:8
- Avoiding Rulemaking Procedures** (this index)
- Deference to Agency Choices in Rulemaking** (this index)
- Handling of rulemaking comments. **Agency Handling of Rulemaking Comments** (this index)
- Incentives of agency leaders to choose, § 22:14
- Initiation of rule, agency staff development of rules, § 4:3
- Judicial review of agency avoidance of rulemaking, § 22:2
- Making, Assembling, and Responding to Comments** (this index)
- Political influence on final rules, agency management, § 11:1
- Preambles and history of rules, effect on prior agency rules and guidelines, § 10:4
- Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

**AGENCY HANDLING OF RULEMAKING COMMENTS**

- Generally, § 8:1
- Alternative proposals, impact of comments making, § 8:3
- Analysis under small business impact legislation (SBREFA), § 8:6
- Building administrative record, § 8:9
- Cross-examination, formal rulemaking hearings and, § 8:13
- Duty to respond to comments in preambles, § 8:5
- Evidence
  - formal rulemaking hearings and, § 8:12
  - official notice of evidence, § 8:14
- Failure to make comments on issues, effects of, § 8:11

## INDEX

### AGENCY HANDLING OF RULEMAKING COMMENTS

#### —Cont'd

- Files and filing. Records, *infra*
- Formal rulemaking hearings
  - cross-examination, § 8:13
  - evidence, § 8:12
- Hearings. Formal rulemaking hearings, *supra*
- Hidden influences upon rule, paper trails of, § 8:8
- Influence, paper trails of hidden influences upon rule, § 8:8
- Internet, comment on rules received via, § 8:18
- Late-filed comments, effect of, § 8:10
- Legal objections, impact of, § 8:2
- Meetings during comment periods, § 8:4
- Notice of evidence, official, § 8:14
- Objections, impact of legal objections, § 8:2
- Official notice of evidence, § 8:14
- Other government entities, comments by, § 8:7
- Paper trails of hidden influences upon rule, § 8:8
- Preambles, duty to respond to comments in, § 8:5
- Processing comments, § 8:1
- Records
  - building administrative record, § 8:9
  - late-filed comments, effect of, § 8:10
  - reopening, § 8:16
- Reopening the record, § 8:16
- Responding to comments in preambles, duty as to, § 8:5
- SBREFA (analysis under small business impact legislation), § 8:6
- Secret data used in rulemaking, § 8:15

### AGENDA

- Initiation of rule, regulatory agendas, § 4:6

### ALTERNATES OR ALTERNATIVES

- Agency handling of rulemaking comments, impact of comments making alternative proposals, § 8:3
- Analysis and impact requirements, consideration of alternatives, § 7:40
- Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, alternatives considered, Test 7, § 16:10
- Making, assembling, and responding to comments, looking for win/win alternative, § 6:6
- Negotiated rules, § 9:1

### ANALYSIS

- Impact requirements. **Analysis and Impact Requirements** (this index)
- RFA weakness, analysis and impact requirements, § 7:16
- SBREFA, analysis under small business impact legislation, § 8:6

### ANALYSIS AND IMPACT REQUIREMENTS

- Generally, § 7:1 *et seq.*
- Access to underlying data, § 7:37
- Additional matters
  - choices, § 7:14
  - impact analysis requirements, § 7:6
- Agency inaction on environmental issues, review of, § 7:41
- Alternatives, consideration of, § 7:40
- Assessment stage, environmental, § 7:26
- Categorical exclusions, § 7:22
- Consideration of alternatives, § 7:40
- Context of rulemaking proceeding, § 7:23
- Contrasts to economic analysis, § 7:35
- Council on environmental quality, role of, § 7:38
- Coverage definitions, § 7:21

**ANALYSIS AND IMPACT**

**REQUIREMENTS—Cont'd**

Data, access to underlying, § 7:37  
 Definitions, coverage definitions, § 7:21  
 Economic analysis, contrasts to, § 7:35  
 Endangered species evaluation of rules, § 7:42  
 Environmental impact analysis, § 7:20 to 7:42  
 Environmental impact statement, § 7:27  
 Exceptions or exclusions  
     generally, § 7:19  
     categorical exclusions, § 7:22  
     security exception, § 7:34  
 Executive orders  
     generally, § 7:2  
     litigation over executive order analysis, § 7:5  
 Experience in litigation, § 7:17  
 Federal agency required actions, § 7:10  
 Finding of no significant impact (FONSI), § 7:29  
 Flexibility, Regulatory Flexibility Act, § 7:8 to 8 to 19  
 FONSI (finding of no significant impact), § 7:29  
 History, § 7:18  
 Impact analysis, environmental, § 7:20  
 Impact statement, environmental, § 7:27  
 Inaction of agency on environmental issues, review of, § 7:41  
 Litigation  
     executive order analysis, litigation over, § 7:5  
     experience, § 7:17  
     NEPA litigation, § 7:31  
     procedural issues in, § 7:32  
     Mechanisms of agency, § 7:24  
     Methods, generally, § 7:1  
 NEPA  
     litigation, § 7:31

**ANALYSIS AND IMPACT**

**REQUIREMENTS—Cont'd**

NEPA—Cont'd  
     standing to assert NEPA rights, § 7:33  
     statutory scheme of NEPA, § 7:20  
     three stages of NEPA analysis, § 7:25  
 OIRA, § 7:15  
 OMB oversight of impacts, § 7:4  
 Operations, Regulatory Flexibility Act, § 7:12  
 Orders. Executive orders, supra  
 Outcomes, § 7:9  
 Override of agency expertise by political managers, § 7:3  
 Oversight, OMB oversight of impacts, § 7:4  
 Paperwork Reduction Act, § 7:7  
 Perceptions, § 7:30  
 Political managers, override of agency expertise by, § 7:3  
 Predicting impacts, rule of reason in, § 7:39  
 Procedure  
     generally, § 7:11  
     litigation, procedural issues in, § 7:32  
 Quality of environment, role of council on, § 7:38  
 Reduction, Paperwork Reduction Act, § 7:7  
**Regulatory Flexibility Act (RFA)**  
     (this index)  
 Review of agency inaction on environmental issues, § 7:41  
 Role of council on environmental quality, § 7:38  
 Rule of reason in predicting impacts, § 7:39  
 SBA, § 7:15  
 Security exception, § 7:34  
 Small entities, § 7:13  
 Standing to assert NEPA rights, § 7:33  
 State actions, § 7:36

## INDEX

### ANALYSIS AND IMPACT

#### REQUIREMENTS—Cont'd

- Statements
  - environmental impact statement, § 7:27
  - supplementing statements, § 7:28
- Statutory scheme of NEPA, § 7:20
- Supplementing statements, § 7:28
- Three stages of NEPA analysis, § 7:25
- Underlying data, access to, § 7:37
- Weakness of RFA, § 7:16

### ANNOUNCEMENTS

- Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, announcements receiving deference, § 18:10

### APPEAL AND REVIEW

- Absence of congressional direction, court review of final rules, § 19:18
- Administrations, change of, § 19:22
- Agency assertion of nonreviewability, § 15:8
- Analysis and impact requirements, review of agency inaction on environmental issues, § 7:41
- Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, contrasting to substantial evidence review, § 16:15
- Arguments on judicial review, § 19:19
- Arlington decision, importance of, § 15:99
- Attorney fee payments, § 19:21
- Aversion, judicial aversion to constitutional bases for review, § 19:4
- Avoidance of rulemaking
  - agency, judicial review of avoidance by, § 22:2
  - procedures, § 3:13
- Change of administrations, § 19:22
- Changes in policy, court review of final rules, § 19:17
- Complete or completion, substantial evidence support, § 17:5

### APPEAL AND REVIEW—Cont'd

- Congressional direction, absence of, § 19:18
- Constitutional issues
  - application of constitutional norms, court review of final rules, § 19:6
  - due process issues, § 19:3
  - equal protection arguments, § 19:9
  - final rules, court review of, generally, § 19:2 to 19:14
  - history of constitutional differentiation, court review of final rules, § 19:5
  - judicial aversion, court review of final rules, § 19:4
  - vagueness, court review of final rules, § 19:8
- Deference on policy choices, court review of final rules, § 19:20
- Defining the standard, substantial evidence support, § 17:4
- De novo review, court review of final rules, § 13:5
- Development of rule, internal review of proposed rule texts, § 5:5
- Disappearance of formal rulemaking, substantial evidence support, § 17:6
- Discretionary review, procedural defenses against rulemaking litigation, § 15:68
- Due process, court review of final rules, § 19:3
- Equal protection arguments, court review of final rules, § 19:9
- Excess delegation claims, court review of final rules, § 19:7
- Exhaustion, nonreviewability and, § 15:9
- Final rules, court review of
  - absence of congressional direction, § 19:18
  - arguments on judicial review, § 19:19
  - aversion, judicial aversion to constitutional bases for review, § 19:4

**APPEAL AND REVIEW—Cont'd**

Final rules, court review of—Cont'd  
 changes in policy, § 19:17  
 congressional direction, absence of, § 19:18  
 constitutional issues, supra  
 deference on policy choices, § 19:20  
 de novo review, § 13:5  
 due process issues, § 19:3  
 equal protection arguments, § 19:9  
 excess delegation claims, § 19:7  
 injunction, review by, § 13:2  
 jurisdiction for review of rules, § 13:4  
 Morgan principle, application of, § 19:16  
 other bases for, generally, § 19:1 et seq.  
 policy issues, § 19:15 to 19:20  
 preemption conflicts, § 19:12  
 pre-enforcement review of rules under APA, § 13:1  
 procedural violations, § 19:1  
 property rights claims, § 19:11  
 records for review, § 13:3  
 reluctance, judicial, § 19:15  
 retroactivity of rules, § 19:13  
 separation of powers conflicts, § 19:10  
 unconstitutional vagueness, § 19:8  
 vacating invalidated final rules, § 13:6  
 vagueness, unconstitutional, § 19:8  
 Formal rulemaking disappearance, substantial evidence support, § 17:6  
 Harmless error in review, § 13:9  
 Injunction, review by, § 13:2  
 Jurisdiction, court review of final rules, § 13:4  
 Making, assembling, and responding to comments, recognizing imbalance of judicial review power, § 6:7

**APPEAL AND REVIEW—Cont'd**

Merger of standards not complete, substantial evidence support, § 17:5  
 Morgan principle, court review of final rules, § 19:16  
 Nonreviewable matters  
 generally, § 15:1 to 15:13  
 agency assertion of nonreviewability, § 15:8  
 exhaustion, nonreviewability and, § 15:9  
 Presidential action is nonreviewable, § 15:4  
 procedural defenses against rulemaking litigation, generally, § 15:1  
 rarity of nonreviewability, § 15:3  
 some generally nonreviewable rules are reviewable, § 15:6  
 Policy issues, court review of final rules, § 19:15 to 19:20  
 Preambles and history of rules, utility of preamble on judicial review, § 10:3  
 Preemption conflicts, court review of final rules, § 19:12  
 Pre-enforcement review of rules under APA, § 13:1  
 Presidential action is nonreviewable, § 15:4  
 Presumption favoring reviewability, § 15:5  
 Procedural defenses against rulemaking litigation  
 Arlington decision, importance of, § 15:99  
 discretionary review, § 15:68  
 nonreviewable matters, supra  
 Presidential action is nonreviewable, § 15:4  
 presumption favoring reviewability, § 15:5  
 proposed actions, no review of, § 15:17  
 rarity of nonreviewability, § 15:3  
 ripeness for review, § 15:16

## INDEX

### APPEAL AND REVIEW—Cont'd

- Procedural defenses against rulemaking litigation—Cont'd
  - rules subject to, § 15:20
  - some generally nonreviewable rules are reviewable, § 15:6
  - timeliness of review requests, § 15:14
- Procedural violations, court review of final rules, § 19:1
- Property rights claims, court review of final rules, § 19:11
- Proposed actions, no review of, § 15:17
- Rarity of nonreviewability, § 15:3
- Rationale, reviewing rules for substantial evidence support, § 17:2
- Records, court review of final rules, § 13:3
- Reluctance, judicial, § 19:15
- Remand decisions in district courts, § 13:8
- Remedies, reviewing rules for substantial evidence support, § 17:7
- Retroactivity of rules, court review of final rules, § 19:13
- Ripeness for review, § 15:16 to 15:34
- Separation of powers conflicts, court review of final rules, § 19:10
- Some generally nonreviewable rules are reviewable, § 15:6
- Standards
  - avoiding rulemaking procedures, § 3:57
  - defining the standard, § 17:4
  - merger of standards not complete, § 17:5
  - substantial evidence support, reviewing rules for, generally, § 17:1
- Statutory or nonstatutory review, § 13:7
- Substantial evidence
  - generally, § 17:1 et seq.

### APPEAL AND REVIEW—Cont'd

- Substantial evidence—Cont'd
  - arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, § 16:15
  - complete or completion, merger of standards not complete, § 17:5
  - defining the standard, § 17:4
  - disappearance of formal rulemaking, § 17:6
  - formal rulemaking, disappearance of, § 17:6
  - merger of standards not complete, § 17:5
  - rationale, § 17:2
  - remedies, § 17:7
  - standards, supra
- Timeliness of review requests, § 15:14
- Unconstitutional vagueness, court review of final rules, § 19:8
- Vacating invalidated final rules, § 13:6
- Vagueness, unconstitutional, § 19:8

### APPEARANCE

- Appeal and review, disappearance of formal rulemaking, § 17:6

### APPLICATION

- Appeal and Review** (this index)
- Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, retroactive application, § 16:23
- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, application of exception to cases, § 3:17

### **Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

### APPROVAL

- Consent or Approval** (this index)

### ARBITRARY OR VULNERABLE TO REVERSAL

- Abuse of discretion term, § 16:13
- Alternatives considered, Test 7, § 16:10
- Benefits factors, § 16:18

**ARBITRARY OR VULNERABLE  
TO REVERSAL—Cont’d**

Cost factors, § 16:18  
 Courts  
     substantial evidence review,  
         contrasting to, § 16:15  
     substitution of judgment, § 16:14  
 Definitions, abuse of discretion term,  
     § 16:13  
 Discovery, explanatory statements  
     and, § 16:19  
 Evidence, contrasting to substantial  
     evidence review, § 16:15  
 Evolution in case law, § 16:3  
 Exclusion, § 16:21  
 Experts, disagreement of, § 16:22  
 Explanations  
     statements, § 16:19  
     Test 3, § 16:6  
 Factors, Test 1, § 16:4  
 Factual bases, Test 4, § 16:7  
 Forecasting, predictive models and  
     forecasts, § 16:20  
 History in case law, § 16:3  
 Ignoring important aspect, Test 5,  
     § 16:8  
 Importance of articulating agency  
     rationales, § 16:26  
 Important aspect ignored, Test 5,  
     § 16:8  
 Inadequate response to comments,  
     Test 8, § 16:11  
 Inclusion, § 16:21  
 Inconsistency, Test 6, § 16:9  
 Models or samples, predictive models  
     and forecasts, § 16:20  
 Modification of rules, § 16:17  
 New legislation, rules impacted by,  
     § 16:24  
 “Otherwise not in accordance with  
     law,” § 16:25  
 Overview, § 16:1  
 Predictive models and forecasts,  
     § 16:20  
 Presumptions of validity, § 16:16  
 Rational connection of rule to  
     problem, Test 9, § 16:12

**ARBITRARY OR VULNERABLE  
TO REVERSAL—Cont’d**

Relationship to statute, Test 2, § 16:5  
 Response to comments as inadequate,  
     Test 8, § 16:11  
 Retroactive application, § 16:23  
 Review, contrasting to substantial  
     evidence review, § 16:15  
 Scope factors, § 16:21  
 Sources, Test 1, § 16:4  
 Standards, supreme court’s State  
     Farm standard, § 16:2  
 State Farm standard, § 16:2  
 Statements, explanatory statements  
     and discovery, § 16:19  
 Statutes, Test 2, § 16:5  
 Substantial evidence review, contrast-  
     ing to, § 16:15  
 Substitution of judgment, § 16:14  
 Supreme court, State Farm standard,  
     § 16:2  
 Tests  
     alternatives considered, Test 7,  
         § 16:10  
     explanations, Test 3, § 16:6  
     factors, Test 1, § 16:4  
     factual bases, Test 4, § 16:7  
     ignoring important aspect, Test 5,  
         § 16:8  
     important aspect ignored, Test 5,  
         § 16:8  
     inadequate response to comments,  
         Test 8, § 16:11  
     inconsistency, Test 6, § 16:9  
     rational connection of rule to  
         problem, Test 9, § 16:12  
     relationship to statute, Test 2,  
         § 16:5  
     response to comments as inade-  
         quate, Test 8, § 16:11  
     sources, Test 1, § 16:4  
 Validity, presumptions of, § 16:16  
 Withdrawal of rules, § 16:17

**ARGUMENTS**  
**Avoiding Rulemaking Procedures**  
 (this index)

## INDEX

### **ARGUMENTS—Cont'd**

- Judicial review, arguments on, § 19:19
- Making, assembling, and responding to comments, effectiveness in comments, § 6:11, 6:12

### **ARLINGTON DECISION**

- Appeal and review, § 15:99
- Procedural defenses against rulemaking litigation, § 15:99

### **ASSEMBLY OF**

- Comments. **Making, Assembling, and Responding to Comments** (this index)
- Development of rule, assembling proposed rule, § 5:1

### **ASSERTIONS**

- Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

### **ASSESSMENT**

- Analysis and impact requirements, environmental assessment stage, § 7:26

### **ATTITUDE**

- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, attitude of agency, § 3:3

### **ATTORNEY FEE PAYMENTS**

- Appeal and review, § 19:21

### **AVERSION**

- Constitutional bases for review, judicial aversion to, § 19:4

### **AVOIDANCE OR AVOIDABILITY**

- Appeal and Review** (this index)
- Non-agency exemption, § 3:64
- Procedures. **Avoiding Rulemaking Procedures** (this index)

### **AVOIDING RULEMAKING PROCEDURES**

- Absence of comments, § 3:10
- Actual notice exceptions from rulemaking, § 3:54

### **AVOIDING RULEMAKING**

#### **PROCEDURES—Cont'd**

- Advice letters of agency, § 3:62
- Agency
  - arguments against, § 3:15
  - attitudes, § 3:3
- Appeal or review, standard of judicial review, § 3:57
- Application of exception to cases, § 3:17
- Arguments
  - agency, argument against, § 3:15
  - commonly heard agency arguments, § 3:56
- Attitude of agency, § 3:3
- Background of exceptions, § 3:4
- Benefits exception, § 3:24
- Binding nature of rules, § 3:60
- Burden on agency, § 3:11
- Case law drawing distinctions, § 3:63
- Categories, defining of, § 3:26
- Changes to existing rules, clarifications and, § 3:37
- Chosen name for “rule,” effect of, § 3:51
- Clarifications and changes to existing rules, § 3:37
- Comment, nonenforceability of rules adopted without notice and, § 3:49
- Commonly heard agency arguments, § 3:56
- Comparison, interpretive rules compared to adjudications, § 3:36
- Construction or interpretation. Interpretation, *infra*
- Continuum as distinction, not dichotomy, § 3:41
- Defenses, harmless error defense, § 3:61
- Deference
  - generally, § 3:29
  - good cause claims, judicial deference to, § 3:14
- Definitions or distinctions
  - case law drawing, § 3:63

**AVOIDING RULEMAKING PROCEDURES—Cont'd**

Definitions or distinctions—Cont'd  
 categories, defining, § 3:26  
 dichotomy, distinction is continuum not, § 3:41  
 interpretation of defined terms, § 3:40  
 types of rules distinguished, § 3:30  
 Delayed effective date, good cause exception for, § 3:18  
 Delegation of power or authority, time when agency has no legislative rulemaking delegation, § 3:34  
 Designation. Name or naming, infra  
 Dichotomy, distinction is continuum, not, § 3:41  
 Differentiating interpretive from other rules, § 3:39  
 Direct final rulemaking and avoiding the notice and comment process, § 3:50  
 Discretion of agency, effect of, § 3:55  
 Documents, guidance documents, § 3:48  
 Enforcement, nonenforceability of rules adopted without notice and comment, § 3:49  
 Environmental harms, § 3:16  
 Exceptions or exemptions  
     actual notice exceptions from rulemaking, § 3:54  
     applying exception to cases, § 3:17  
     background of exceptions, § 3:4  
     benefits exception, § 3:24  
     delayed effective date, good cause exception for, § 3:18  
     experience with exceptions, § 3:5  
     foreign affairs exception, § 3:21  
     good cause, § 3:7 to 3:18  
     internal management exception, § 3:22  
     interpretations, § 3:25, 3:28  
     introduction to rulemaking exceptions, § 3:1  
     military exceptions, § 3:21

**AVOIDING RULEMAKING PROCEDURES—Cont'd**

Exceptions or exemptions—Cont'd  
 narrowly read exception, § 3:8  
 per se exemptions, § 3:52  
 policy statements, exception for, § 3:25  
 procedural regulations exception, § 3:23  
 proprietary rules exceptions, § 3:20  
 Exemptions or exclusions. Exceptions or exemptions, supra  
 Existing rules or regulations  
     clarifications and changes to existing rules, § 3:37  
     explanation of existing law, § 3:31  
     inconsistency with existing regulations, § 3:32  
 Experience with exceptions, § 3:5  
 Explanation of existing law, § 3:31  
 Foreign affairs exception, § 3:21  
 Good cause  
     delayed effective date, good cause exception for, § 3:18  
     exceptions, § 3:7 to 3:18  
     judicial deference to good cause claims, § 3:14  
 Good cause exception for interim final rules, § 3:19  
 Guidance  
     documents, § 3:48  
     states and regulated persons, guidance to, § 3:45  
 Harmless error defense, § 3:61  
 Important policy reasons, § 3:9  
 Inconsistency with existing regulations, § 3:32  
 Internal management exception, § 3:22  
 Interpretation  
     defined terms, § 3:40  
     differentiating interpretive from other rules, § 3:39  
     exceptions or exemptions, § 3:25, 3:28

## INDEX

### **AVOIDING RULEMAKING PROCEDURES—Cont'd**

- Interpretation—Cont'd
  - must interpret something, interpretive rules, § 3:27
  - role of interpretive rule, § 3:38
  - rules, generally, § 3:35, 3:36
  - time when cannot be used, § 3:43
- Introduction to rulemaking exceptions, § 3:1
- Judicial deference to good cause claims, § 3:14
- Judicial review, § 3:13
- Layout of chapter, § 3:6
- Letters, agency advice letters, § 3:62
- Litigation, § 3:42
- Manuals, § 3:46
- Military exceptions, § 3:21
- Mistake or error, harmless error defense, § 3:61
- Must interpret something, interpretive rules, § 3:27
- Name or naming
  - chosen name for “rule,” effect of, § 3:51
  - specific named persons, rules for, § 3:53
- Narrowly read exception, § 3:8
- New duties, interpretive rules creating, § 3:35
- Nonenforceability of rules adopted without notice and comment, § 3:49
- Notice
  - actual notice exceptions from rulemaking, § 3:54
  - nonenforceability of rules adopted without notice and comment, § 3:49
- Operational aspects, § 3:12
- Per se exemptions, § 3:52
- Policy statements
  - generally, § 3:47
  - exception for, § 3:25
- Postal service exclusion, § 3:65
- Precedents, serving as, § 3:33

### **AVOIDING RULEMAKING PROCEDURES—Cont'd**

- Procedural regulations exception, § 3:23
- Proprietary rules exceptions, § 3:20
- Remedies, § 3:58
- Retroactivity, § 3:59
- Role of interpretive rule, § 3:38
- Specific named persons, rules for, § 3:53
- Standard of judicial review, § 3:57
- States and regulated persons, guidance to, § 3:45
- Statutory rights, § 3:2
- Suspension of rules, § 3:44
- Time or date
  - good cause exception for delayed effective date, § 3:18
  - interpretation, time when cannot be used, § 3:43
- Types of rules distinguished, § 3:30

### **BENEFITS**

- Adjudication, rulemaking contrasted to, § 22:16
- Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, benefits factors, § 16:18
- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, benefits exception, § 3:24

### **BINDING NATURE**

- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, § 3:60

### **BUILDING RECORD**

- Agency handling of rulemaking comments, building administrative record, § 8:9
- Making, assembling, and responding to comments, § 6:4

### **BURDEN OF PROOF**

- Adjudication, rulemaking contrasted to, § 22:11
- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, burden on agency, § 3:11
- Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

**CASE LAW**

- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, case law drawing distinctions, § 3:63
- Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, § 18:20

**CATEGORIES**

- Analysis and impact requirements, categorical exclusions, § 7:22
- Defining of categories, § 3:26

**CHANGE OR MODIFICATION**

- Adjudication, Rulemaking**
  - Contrasted To** (this index)
- Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, modification of rules, § 16:17
- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, clarifications and changes to existing rules, § 3:37
- Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, changes of position, § 18:15
- Final rules review, changes in policy, § 19:17
- Statements regarding changes, courts require, § 22:15

**CHOICES**

- Adjudication, Rulemaking**
  - Contrasted to** (this index)
- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, effect of chosen name for “rule,” § 3:51
- Congress** (this index)
- Deference to Agency Choices in Rulemaking** (this index)

**CLAIRITY OF DRAFTING  
AGENCY GUIDANCE**

- Plain Writing Act, § 5:13

**CLARITY OR CLARIFICATION**

- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, clarifications and changes to existing rules, § 3:37
- Development of rule, clarity of terms in proposed rule, § 5:2
- Making, assembling, and responding to comments, § 6:8

**COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL**

- Procedural defenses against rulemaking litigation, § 15:98

**COMMENTS**

- Agency Handling of Rulemaking Comments** (this index)
- Assembling comments. **Making, Assembling, and Responding to Comments** (this index)
- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, nonenforceability of rules adopted without notice and comment, § 3:49
- Making, Assembling, and Responding to Comments** (this index)
- Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

**COMMON ARGUMENTS**

- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, commonly heard agency arguments, § 3:56

**COMPARISON**

- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, interpretive rules compared to adjudications, § 3:36

**COMPLETE OR COMPLETION**

- Appeal and review, substantial evidence support, § 17:5

**CONGRESS**

- Appeal and review, absence of congressional direction, § 19:18
- Choices
  - dislike for rule, effect of congressional, § 20:2
  - individual inputs by members of congress, effect of, § 20:4
  - satisfaction of congressional requirements, § 20:1
  - silence, § 20:3
- Deference to agency choices in rulemaking in face of congressional nonaction, § 18:21
- Dislike for rule, effect of congressional, § 20:2

## INDEX

### CONGRESS—Cont'd

Final rules, congressional influences on, § 11:4

Individual inputs by members of congress, effect of, § 20:4

**Initiation of Rule** (this index)

Satisfaction of congressional requirements, § 20:1

Silence, § 20:3

### CONSENT OR APPROVAL

Making, assembling, and responding to comments, understanding internal approval stages of agency, § 6:9

Negotiated rules, consent settlements impacting rules, § 9:3

### CONSENT SETTLEMENTS

Negotiated rules, consent settlements impacting rules, § 9:3

### CONSEQUENCES OF CHOICES

Adjudication, rulemaking contrasted to, § 22:10

### CONSIDERATION

**Alternates or Alternatives** (this index)

Analysis and impact requirements, consideration of alternatives, § 7:40

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, alternatives considered, Test 7, § 16:10

**Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

### CONSISTENCY

**Inconsistency** (this index)

### CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

**Appeal and Review** (this index)

**Due Process** (this index)

Equal protection, court review of final rules, § 19:9

**Preemption of State Actions by Federal Rules** (this index)

### CONSTITUTIONAL LAW—Cont'd

Unconstitutional vagueness, final rules review by court, § 19:8

### CONSTRUCTION OR INTERPRETATION

Adjudication, changes of interpretations, § 22:4

**Avoiding Rulemaking Procedures** (this index)

Defined terms, interpretation of, § 3:40

### CONTENT

Preamble, content of, § 10:1

### CONTEXT

Analysis and impact requirements, context of rulemaking proceeding, § 7:23

### CONTINUUM

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, continuum as distinction, not dichotomy, § 3:41

### CONTRASTS

**Adjudication, Rulemaking Contrasted To** (this index)

Analysis and impact requirements, contrasts to economic analysis, § 7:35

### COSTS OR EXPENSES

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, cost factors, § 16:18

Making, assembling, and responding to comments, effective arguments in comments concerning costs, § 6:12

### COUNCIL ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

Analysis and impact requirements, § 7:38

### COURTS

Adoption of rule, response to delays in, § 14:3

**Arbitrary or Vulnerable to Reversal** (this index)

**COURTS—Cont'd**

- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, judicial deference to good cause claims, § 3:14
- Changes, courts require statements regarding, § 22:15
- Deference to Agency Choices in Rulemaking** (this index)
- Delays in rulemaking, response to adoption of rule, delay in, § 14:3
- litigation issues, § 14:4
- process issues, § 14:4
- refusal to adopt rules, § 14:2
- Final rules, court review of. **Appeal and Review** (this index)
- Negotiated rules, court-imposed rulemaking, § 9:2
- Process issues, response to delays in rulemaking, § 14:4
- Refusal to adopt rules, § 14:2
- Response to delays in rulemaking. Delays in rulemaking, response to, *supra*
- Review. **Appeal and Review** (this index)

**COVERAGE**

- Definitions, § 7:21

**CROSS-EXAMINATION**

- Agency handling of rulemaking comments, formal rulemaking hearings and cross-examination, § 8:13

**DATA**

- Analysis and impact requirements, access to underlying data, § 7:37
- Making, assembling, and responding to comments, effective arguments in comments concerning data, § 6:12

**DEFENSES**

- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, harmless error defense, § 3:61
- Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

**DEFERENCE**

- Agency choices. **Deference to Agency Choices in Rulemaking** (this index)
- Appeal and review, deference on policy choices, § 19:20
- Avoiding Rulemaking Procedures** (this index)

**DEFERENCE TO AGENCY CHOICES IN RULEMAKING**

- Adjudication-based interpretations, § 18:26
- Announcements receiving deference, § 18:10
- Case law of deference, § 18:20
- Cases reviewing loper bright challenges, § 18:7
- Changes of position, § 18:15
- Congressional nonaction, deference in face of, § 18:21
- Denial of deference, § 18:13
- Development of modern deference, § 18:9
- Elements of deference, § 18:8
- Expanded statute of limitations for loper bright challenges, § 18:6
- Guidances, deference to, § 18:31
- Inconsistency, § 18:15
- Interaction between two agencies, § 18:24
- Interim rules and preserving status quo, § 18:28
- Judulang decision, deference issues after, § 18:29
- Later Supreme Court deference opinions, § 18:27
- Mead decision, effects of 2001, § 18:19
- Opinion, questions of policy and, § 18:18
- Overturning chevron deference, § 18:1 to 18:5
- chevron deference, § 18:3
- limitations of the loper bright decision, § 18:5
- loper bright, § 18:4

## INDEX

### DEFERENCE TO AGENCY

#### CHOICES IN RULEMAKING

##### —Cont'd

- Overturning chevron deference,  
§ 18:1 to 18:5—Cont'd  
skidmore doctrine, § 18:2
- Own rules, interpretations of, § 18:25
- Partial deference under Skidmore,  
§ 18:16
- Perez decision, § 18:32
- Policy questions, § 18:18
- Rate setting, § 18:22
- Retroactivity, § 18:23
- Scientific questions, § 18:17
- Skidmore, partial deference under,  
§ 18:16
- Social Security acquiescence rulings,  
§ 18:30
- Step one deference, § 18:11
- Step two deference, § 18:12
- Supreme Court's 2011 Chevron  
norms applied in Mayo Founda-  
tion, § 18:14
- Technical questions, § 18:17
- Trump deregulation, effect of,  
§ 18:32

### DEFINITIONS OR DISTINCTIONS

- Abuse of discretion term, § 16:13
- Adjudication, § 2:13
- Administrative record, § 2:10
- Advisory opinion, § 2:11
- Analysis and impact requirements,  
coverage definitions, § 7:21
- Case law drawing, § 3:63
- Categories, defining, § 3:26
- Dichotomy, distinction is continuum  
not, § 3:41
- Formal rules, § 2:8
- Guidance documents and manuals,  
§ 2:7
- Interpretation of defined terms,  
§ 3:40
- Interpretive rules, § 2:4
- Judicial branch issuance of rules,  
§ 2:14
- Legislative rules, § 2:3

### DEFINITIONS OR DISTINCTIONS

##### —Cont'd

- Negotiated rules, § 2:9
- Petitions, § 2:12
- Policy statements, § 2:6
- Procedural rules, § 2:5
- Rule, § 2:1
- Rulemaking, § 2:2
- Substantial evidence support, defin-  
ing the standard, § 17:4
- Types of rules distinguished, § 3:30

### DELAYS

- Adoption of rule, delay in, § 14:3
- Avoiding rulemaking procedures,  
good cause exception for  
delayed effective date, § 3:18
- Court's response to delays in  
rulemaking. **Courts** (this index)
- Litigation issues, § 14:4
- Process issues, § 14:4
- Refusal to adopt rules, § 14:2

### DELEGATION OF POWER OR AUTHORITY

- Avoiding rulemaking procedures,  
time when agency has no  
legislative rulemaking delega-  
tion, § 3:34

### DENIAL

- Refusal or Denial** (this index)

### DE NOVO REVIEW

- Final rules, § 13:5

### DESIGNATION

- Name or Naming** (this index)

### DEVELOPMENT

- Deference to agency choices in  
rulemaking, development of  
modern deference, § 18:9
- Rule. **Development of Rule** (this  
index)

### DEVELOPMENT OF RULE

- Adequacy of notice regarding issues,  
§ 5:8

**DEVELOPMENT OF RULE**

—Cont'd

- Advanced notice of proposed rulemaking, § 5:6
- Advisory committees in rulemaking, § 5:10
- Appeal or review, internal review of proposed rule texts, § 5:5
- Assembling proposed rule, § 5:1
- Clarity of drafting agency guidance under Plain Writing Act, § 5:13
- Clarity of terms in proposed rule, § 5:2
- Formal rulemaking hearings, § 5:11
- Hearings, formal rulemaking hearings, § 5:11
- Hybrid rulemaking model, § 5:12
- Initiation of rule, development of rules by agency staff, § 4:3
- Internal review of proposed rule texts, § 5:5
- Legal effect of rules not adopted, § 5:9
- Negotiated rules, § 5:4
- Notice
  - adequacy of notice regarding issues, § 5:8
  - advanced notice of proposed rulemaking, § 5:6
- Old hybrid rulemaking model, § 5:12
- Policy assertions in rulemaking, § 5:3
- Preambles for proposed rules, preparation of, § 5:7
- Preparation of preambles for proposed rules, § 5:7
- Texts, internal review of proposed rule, § 5:5

**DICHOTOMY**

- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, distinction is continuum, not dichotomy, § 3:41

**DIFFERENTIATION**

- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, differentiating interpretive from other rules, § 3:39

**DIRECTIVES**

- Initiation of Rule (this index)

**DISAPPEARANCE**

- Appeal and review, disappearance of formal rulemaking, § 17:6

**DISCOVERY**

- Adjudication, discovery advantage in, § 22:12
- Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, explanatory statements and discovery, § 16:19

**DISCRETION**

- Appeal and review, procedural defenses against rulemaking litigation, § 15:68
- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, effect of discretion of agency, § 3:55
- Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation (this index)

**DISLIKE**

- Congressional dislike for rule, effect of, § 20:2

**DISTINCTIONS**

- Definitions or Distinctions (this index)

**DOCUMENTS**

- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, guidance documents, § 3:48

**DUE PROCESS**

- Adjudication, rulemaking contrasted to, § 22:17
- Final rules, court review of, § 19:3

**DUTY**

- Agency handling of rulemaking comments, duty to respond to comments in preambles, § 8:5
- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, interpretive rules creating new duties, § 3:35

**ECONOMIC ANALYSIS**

- Contrasts to, § 7:35

INDEX

**EFFECTIVENESS**

**Making, Assembling, and Responding to Comments** (this index)

**EFFICIENCY RATIONALES**

Adjudication, rulemaking contrasted to, § **22:6**

**ELECTIONS**

Policy changes after elections change administrations, § **19:22**

**ELECTRONIC GOVERNMENT PROVISIONS**

Initiation of rule, § **4:7**

**ELEMENTS**

Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, § **18:8**

**ENDANGERED SPECIES EVALUATION OF RULES**

Environmental impact analysis, § **7:42**

**ENFORCEMENT**

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, nonenforceability of rules adopted without notice and comment, § **3:49**

Pre-enforcement review of rules under APA, § **13:1**

**ENVIRONMENT**

**Analysis and Impact Requirements** (this index)

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, § **3:16**

**Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

Role of council on environmental quality, § **7:38**

**ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ANALYSIS**

Generally, § **7:20 to 7:42**

Endangered species evaluation of rules, § **7:42**

**ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT**

Generally, § **7:27**

**EQUAL PROTECTION**

Final rules, court review of, § **19:9**

**ERRORS**

**Mistake or Error** (this index)

**EVIDENCE**

**Agency Handling of Rulemaking Comments** (this index)

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, contrasting to substantial evidence review, § **16:15**

**Burden of Proof** (this index)

Cross-examination, formal rulemaking hearings and, § **8:13**

**Discovery** (this index)

**Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

**Substantial Evidence** (this index)

**EVOLUTION IN CASE LAW**

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, § **16:3**

**EXCEPTIONS OR EXEMPTIONS**

**Analysis and Impact Requirements** (this index)

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, § **16:21**

**Avoiding Rulemaking Procedures** (this index)

Per se exemptions, § **3:52**

Security exception, § **7:34**

**EXCESS OR EXCESSIVENESS**

Final rules review, excess delegation claims, § **19:7**

**EXCLUSIONS**

**Exceptions or Exemptions** (this index)

**EXECUTIVE ORDERS**

**Analysis and Impact Requirements** (this index)

**EXECUTIVE ORDERS—Cont'd**

- Litigation over executive order analysis, § 7:5
- Preemption of state actions by federal rules, executive order coverage, § 21:5

**EXEMPTIONS**

- Exceptions or Exemptions** (this index)

**EXHAUSTION OF REMEDIES**

- Appeal and review, nonreviewability and exhaustion, § 15:9
- Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

**EXISTING RULES OR REGULATIONS**

- Avoiding Rulemaking Procedures** (this index)

**EXPENSES**

- Costs or Expenses** (this index)

**EXPERIENCE**

- Analysis and impact requirements, experience in litigation, § 7:17
- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, experience with exceptions, § 3:5

**EXPERTS**

- Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, disagreement of experts, § 16:22
- Override of agency expertise by political managers, § 7:3

**EXPLANATION**

- Arbitrary or Vulnerable to Reversal** (this index)
- Avoiding rulemaking procedures, explanation of existing law, § 3:31

**EXPRESS PREEMPTION**

- Basics, preemption of state actions by federal rules, § 21:2

**FEDERAL AGENCIES**

- Analysis and impact requirements, federal agency required actions, § 7:10

**FEDERAL RULES**

- Preemption of State Actions by Federal Rules** (this index)

**FILES AND FILING**

- Records** (this index)

**FINAL OR FINALITY**

- Constitutional Law** (this index)
- Political Influence on Final Rules** (this index)
- Rules. **Final Rules** (this index)

**FINAL RULES**

- Abandonment of proposed rule, making a rule final and effective, § 12:10
- Administrative record, making a rule final and effective, § 12:6
- Appeal and Review** (this index)
- Changes from proposal, effects of, § 12:2
- Court review of. **Appeal and Review** (this index)
- Effective dates, generally, § 12:4
- Enforcement of final rule, § 12:8
- Exceptions, § 12:9
- Interim final rules, § 12:5
- Making rule final and effective, generally, § 12:1 et seq.
- Political Influence on Final Rules** (this index)
- Proposals
  - abandonment of proposed rule, § 12:10
  - changes, effects of, § 12:2
- Retroactive rules, § 12:7
- State influence, § 11:5
- Time or timing, § 12:1, 12:3
- Time or timing, generally, § 12:4
- Vacating invalidated final rules, § 13:6
- Waivers, § 12:9

## INDEX

### **FINAL RULES—Cont'd**

White House, political influence on final rules, § **11:2**

### **FINDING OF NO SIGNIFICANT IMPACT (FONSI)**

Analysis and impact requirements, § **7:29**

### **FLEXIBILITY**

**Regulatory Flexibility Act (RFA)**  
(this index)

### **FONSI (FINDING OF NO SIGNIFICANT IMPACT)**

Analysis and impact requirements, § **7:29**

### **FORECASTING**

Predictive models and forecasts, § **16:20**

### **FOREIGN AFFAIRS**

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, foreign affairs exception, § **3:21**

### **FORMAL OR FORMALITY**

**Agency Handling of Rulemaking Comments** (this index)

Appeal and review, formal rulemaking disappearance, § **17:6**

Definitions or distinctions, formal rules, § **2:8**

Development of rule, § **5:11**

Hearings

**Agency Handling of Rulemaking Comments** (this index)

development of rule, § **5:11**

### **FORMAL RULES**

Definitions or distinctions, § **2:8**

### **FUTURE MATTERS**

Adjudication and rulemaking, future issues for, § **22:18**

### **GOOD CAUSE**

**Avoiding Rulemaking Procedures**  
(this index)

### **GUIDANCE**

**Avoiding Rulemaking Procedures**  
(this index)

Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, § **18:31**

Documents and manuals, § **2:7**

### **GUIDELINES**

Preambles and history of rules, effect on prior agency rules and guidelines, § **10:4**

### **HANDLING OF RULEMAKING COMMENTS**

**Agency Handling of Rulemaking Comments** (this index)

### **HARDSHIP**

**Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

### **HARMLESS ERROR**

Appeal and review, § **13:9**

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, harmless error defense, § **3:61**

### **HARM OR INJURY**

**Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

### **HEARINGS**

**Formal or Formality** (this index)

### **HIDDEN INFLUENCES**

Agency handling of rulemaking comments, paper trails of hidden influences upon rule, § **8:8**

### **HISTORY**

Analysis and impact requirements, § **7:18**

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, history in case law, § **16:3**

**Preambles and History of Rules**  
(this index)

### **HYBRID RULEMAKING MODEL**

Development of rule, § **5:12**

**IDEAS**

**Initiation of Rule** (this index)

**IGNORING IMPORTANT ASPECT**

Test 5, arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, § **16:8**

**IMBALANCE**

Making, assembling, and responding to comments, recognition of imbalance of judicial review power, § **6:7**

**IMPACT**

**Analysis and Impact Requirements** (this index)

Preambles and history of rules, impact of rules on adjudicated case precedents, § **10:5**

Regulations. **Analysis and Impact Requirements** (this index)

Requirements. **Analysis and Impact Requirements** (this index)

**IMPACT STATEMENT**

Analysis and impact requirements, § **7:27**

**IMPLIED MATTERS**

Preemption of state actions by federal rules, § **21:3**

**IMPORTANCE**

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, important policy reasons, § **3:9**

Preemption of state actions by federal rules, § **21:1**

Test 5, arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, important aspect ignored, § **16:8**

**INADEQUACY**

**Adequacy or Inadequacy** (this index)

**INCENTIVES**

Agency leaders to choose, § **22:14**

**INCLUSION**

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, § **16:21**

**INCONSISTENCY**

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, inconsistency with existing regulations, § **3:32**

Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, § **18:15**

Test 6, arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, § **16:9**

**INFLUENCE**

Adjudication insulates against influencers, rulemaking contrasted to adjudication, § **22:8**

Agency handling of rulemaking comments, paper trails of hidden influences upon rule, § **8:8**

Initiation of rule, influences of Congress, § **4:4**

**Political Influence on Final Rules** (this index)

**INITIATION OF RULE**

Agency staff development of rules, § **4:3**

Agendas, regulatory, § **4:6**  
Congress

action or inactivity, effect of, § **4:5**  
influences, § **4:4**

Development of rules by agency staff, § **4:3**

Electronic government provisions, § **4:7**

Influences of Congress, § **4:4**

Petitions seeking adoption of rules, § **4:2**

Regulatory agendas, § **4:6**

Sources of rules, § **4:1**

**INJUNCTIONS**

Review by, § **13:2**

**INJURY OR HARM**

**Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

**INSULATION**

Adjudication insulates against influencers, § **22:8**

## INDEX

### INTENT

**Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

### INTEREST IN SUBJECT MATTER

**Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

### INTERIM RULES

Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, § **18:28**

### INTERNAL APPROVAL STAGES

Making, assembling, and responding to comments, understanding internal approval stages of agency, § **6:9**

### INTERNAL MANAGEMENT

#### EXCEPTION

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, § **3:22**

### INTERNAL REVIEW

Proposed rule texts, § **5:5**

### INTERNET

Agency handling of rulemaking comments received via, § **8:18**

### INTERPRETATION

**Construction or Interpretation** (this index)

### INTERPRETIVE RULES

Definitions or distinctions, § **2:4**

### INTRODUCTION TO SUBJECT

Generally, § **1:1**

### JUDICIAL BRANCH ISSUANCE OF RULES

Definitions or distinctions, § **2:14**

### JUDICIAL MATTERS

**Courts** (this index)

### JUDICIAL NOTICE

Procedural defenses against rulemaking litigation, § **15:101**

### JUDICIAL REVIEW

**Appeal and Review** (this index)

### JUDULANG DECISION

Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, § **18:29**

### JURISDICTION

Final rules, court review of, § **13:4**  
Procedural defenses against rulemaking litigation, § **15:94, 15:96**

### LATE-FILED COMMENTS

Agency handling of rulemaking comments, § **8:10**

### LAYOUT OF CHAPTER

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, § **3:6**

### LEGAL ARGUMENTS

Making, assembling, and responding to comments, effectiveness of legal arguments in comments, § **6:11**

### LEGAL EFFECT

Development of rule, legal effect of rules not adopted, § **5:9**  
Preamble, legal effect of, § **10:2**

### LEGISLATION

Definitions or distinctions, § **2:3**  
New legislation, rules impacted by, § **16:24**

### LEGISLATIVE RULES

Definitions or distinctions, § **2:3**

### LETTERS

Agency advice letters, avoiding rulemaking procedures, § **3:62**

### LIKE OR DISLIKE

Congressional dislike for rule, effect of, § **20:2**

### LIMITATIONS

Adjudication, rulemaking contrasted to, effect of limits on standing, § **22:19**

**LITIGATION**

- Analysis and Impact Requirements**  
(this index)
- Avoiding rulemaking procedures,  
§ 3:42
- Delays, litigation issues, § 14:4
- Procedural Defenses Against  
Rulemaking Litigation** (this  
index)

**LOGICAL OUTGROWTH  
STANDARD**

- Making, assembling, and responding  
to comments, § 6:13

**MAKING, ASSEMBLING, AND  
RESPONDING TO  
COMMENTS**

- Generally, § 6:3
- Alternates or alternatives, looking for  
win/win alternative, § 6:6
- Appeal or review, recognizing imbalance  
of judicial review power,  
§ 6:7
- Arguments, effectiveness in comments,  
§ 6:11, 6:12
- Building the record, § 6:4
- Clearly written comments, § 6:8
- Consent or approval, understanding  
internal approval stages of  
agency, § 6:9
- Costs, effective arguments in comments  
concerning, § 6:12
- Data, effective arguments in comments  
concerning, § 6:12
- Effectiveness, generally, § 6:3
- Imbalance of judicial review power,  
recognition of, § 6:7
- Internal approval stages of agency,  
understanding, § 6:9
- Judicial review power, recognition of  
imbalance of, § 6:7
- Legal arguments, effectiveness in  
comments, § 6:11
- Logical outgrowth standard, § 6:13
- Needs of agency, understanding,  
§ 6:5

**MAKING, ASSEMBLING, AND  
RESPONDING TO  
COMMENTS—Cont'd**

- Participating in the rulemaking comment  
process, § 6:1
- Precision in comments, volume  
versus, § 6:10
- Recognizing imbalance of judicial  
review power, § 6:7
- Records, building the record, § 6:4
- Stages, understanding internal  
approval stages of agency, § 6:9
- Time period for comments, § 6:2
- Understanding  
internal approval stages of agency,  
§ 6:9  
needs of agency, § 6:5
- Volume versus precision in comments,  
§ 6:10
- Win/win alternative, looking for,  
§ 6:6
- Writing comments clearly, § 6:8

**MANAGEMENT**

- Political influence on final rules,  
management by agency, § 11:1

**MANUALS**

- Avoiding rulemaking procedures,  
§ 3:46

**MEAD DECISION**

- Deference to agency choices in  
rulemaking, § 18:19

**MECHANISMS OF AGENCY**

- Analysis and impact requirements,  
§ 7:24

**MEETINGS**

- Agency handling of rulemaking comments,  
meetings during comment periods, § 8:4

**MERGER OF STANDARDS NOT  
COMPLETE**

- Appeal and review, substantial evidence  
support, § 17:5

## INDEX

### METHODS

**Analysis and Impact Requirements**  
(this index)

### MILITARY MATTERS

Avoiding rulemaking procedures,  
military exceptions, § 3:21

### MISTAKE OR ERROR

Harmless error defense, § 3:61  
**Procedural Defenses Against  
Rulemaking Litigation** (this  
index)

### MODELS OR SAMPLES

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal,  
predictive models and forecasts,  
§ 16:20  
Development of rule, old hybrid  
rulemaking model, § 5:12

### MODIFICATION

**Change or Modification** (this index)

### MOOTNESS

**Procedural Defenses Against  
Rulemaking Litigation** (this  
index)

### MORGAN PRINCIPLE

Final rules, court review of, § 19:16

### MUST INTERPRET SOMETHING

Avoiding rulemaking procedures,  
§ 3:27

### NAME OR NAMING

**Avoiding Rulemaking Procedures**  
(this index)

Chosen name for “rule,” effect of,  
§ 3:51

Procedural defenses against rulemak-  
ing litigation, statutory designa-  
tion of parties with standing,  
§ 15:40

### NARROWLY READ EXCEPTION

Avoiding rulemaking procedures,  
§ 3:8

### NATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY (NEPA)

**Analysis and Impact Requirements**  
(this index)

### NEEDS

Making, assembling, and responding  
to comments, understanding  
needs of agency, § 6:5

### NEGOTIATED RULES

Alternatives, § 9:1  
Consent settlements impacting rules,  
§ 9:3  
Court-imposed rulemaking, § 9:2  
Definitions or distinctions, § 2:9  
Development of rule, § 5:4

### NEPA (NATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY)

**Analysis and Impact Requirements**  
(this index)

### NEW LEGISLATION

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal,  
rules impacted by new legisla-  
tion, § 16:24

### NON-AGENCY EXEMPTION

Avoiding rulemaking procedures,  
§ 3:64

### NONENFORCEABILITY

Avoiding rulemaking procedures,  
nonenforceability of rules  
adopted without notice and com-  
ment, § 3:49

### NONREVIEWABLE MATTERS

**Appeal and Review** (this index)

### NOTICE

Agency handling of rulemaking com-  
ments, official notice of evi-  
dence, § 8:14

**Avoiding Rulemaking Procedures**  
(this index)

**Development of Rule** (this index)

**NOTICE—Cont'd**

**Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

**OBJECTIONS**

Agency handling of rulemaking comments, impact of legal objections, § 8:2

**OFFICE OF INFORMATION AND REGULATORY AFFAIRS (OIRA)**

Analysis and impact requirements, § 7:15

**OFFICE OF MANAGEMENT AND BUDGET (OMB)**

Analysis and impact requirements, OMB oversight of impacts, § 7:4

Impacts, OMB oversight of, § 7:4  
Political influence on final rules, OMB oversight, § 11:3

**OFFICIAL NOTICE**

Agency handling of rulemaking comments, official notice of evidence, § 8:14

**OIRA**

Analysis and impact requirements, § 7:15

**OLD HYBRID RULEMAKING MODEL**

Development of rule, § 5:12

**OMB**

**Office of Management and Budget (OMB)** (this index)

**OPERATIONAL ASPECTS**

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, § 3:12

**OPERATIONS**

Regulatory Flexibility Act, analysis and impact requirements, § 7:12

**OPINIONS**

Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, questions of policy and opinion, § 18:18

**ORDERS**

**Executive Orders** (this index)

**OTHER GOVERNMENT ENTITIES**

Agency handling of rulemaking comments, § 8:7

**“OTHERWISE NOT IN ACCORDANCE WITH LAW”**

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, § 16:25

**OUTCOMES**

Analysis and impact requirements, § 7:9

**OVERSIGHT**

**Office of Management and Budget (OMB)** (this index)

**OVERVIEW**

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, § 16:1

**Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

**PAPER TRAILS**

Agency handling of rulemaking comments, paper trails of hidden influences upon rule, § 8:8

**PAPERWORK REDUCTION ACT**

Analysis and impact requirements, § 7:7

**PARTIES**

Adjudication, rulemaking contrasted to, effects of limits on standing, § 22:19

NEPA rights, standing to assert, § 7:33

**Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

## INDEX

### **PART OR PARTIAL**

Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, partial deference under Skidmore, § 18:16

### **PERCEPTIONS**

Analysis and impact requirements, § 7:30

### **PEREZ DECISION**

Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, § 18:32

### **PER SE EXEMPTIONS**

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, § 3:52

### **PETITIONS**

Definitions or distinctions, § 2:12  
Initiation of rule, petitions seeking adoption of rules, § 4:2

**Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

### **POLICY**

Appeal and review, policy issues, § 19:15 to 19:20

**Avoiding Rulemaking Procedures** (this index)

Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, policy questions, § 18:18

Definitions or distinctions, § 2:6  
Development of rule, policy assertions in rulemaking, § 5:3

**Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

Statements

**Avoiding Rulemaking Procedures** (this index)  
definitions or distinctions, § 2:6

### **POLITICAL INFLUENCE ON FINAL RULES**

Agency management, § 11:1  
Congressional influences, § 11:4  
Management by agency, § 11:1  
OMB oversight, § 11:3

### **POLITICAL INFLUENCE ON FINAL RULES—Cont'd**

Override of agency expertise by political managers, § 7:3  
Oversight, OMB oversight, § 11:3  
State influence, § 11:5  
White House influence, § 11:2

### **POSSIBLE TRENDS**

Adjudication, rulemaking contrasted to, § 22:9

### **POSTAL SERVICE EXCLUSION**

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, § 3:65

### **PREAMBLES AND HISTORY OF RULES**

Adjudicated case precedents, impact of rules on, § 10:5

Agency handling of rulemaking comments, duty to respond to comments in preambles, § 8:5

Agency rules and guidelines, effect on prior, § 10:4

Content of preamble, § 10:1

Development of rule, preparation of preambles for proposed rules, § 5:7

Guidelines, effect on prior agency rules and, § 10:4

Impact of rules on adjudicated case precedents, § 10:5

Judicial review, utility of preamble on, § 10:3

Legal effect of preamble, § 10:2

Precedents, impact of rules on adjudicated case precedents, § 10:5

Prior agency rules and guidelines, effect on, § 10:4

Utility of preamble on judicial review, § 10:3

### **PRECEDENTS**

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, serving as precedents, § 3:33

Preambles and history of rules, impact of rules on adjudicated

**PRECEDENTS—Cont'd**  
 case precedents, § 10:5

**PRECISION**

Making, assembling, and responding to comments, volume versus precision in comments, § 6:10

**PREDICTIONS**

Analysis and impact requirements, rule of reason in predicting impacts, § 7:39  
 Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, predictive models and forecasts, § 16:20

**PREEMPTION OF STATE ACTIONS BY FEDERAL RULES**

Generally, § 21:1 et seq.  
 Executive order coverage, § 21:5  
 Express preemption, basics of, § 21:2  
 Implied preemption, § 21:3  
 Importance, § 21:1  
 Judicial review of final rules, conflicts, § 19:12  
 Other forms of preemptive effects, § 21:4  
 Scholarship, § 21:6

**PREPARATION**

Development of rule, preparation of preambles for proposed rules, § 5:7

**PRESIDENT OF UNITED STATES**

Litigation over executive order analysis, § 7:5  
 White House (this index)

**PRESUMPTIONS**

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, presumptions of validity, § 16:16

**PRIOR MATTERS**

Preambles and history of rules, effect on prior agency rules and guidelines, § 10:4

**PROCEDURAL DEFENSES AGAINST RULEMAKING LITIGATION**

Generally, § 15:1 et seq.  
 Abbott Decision, ripeness after, § 15:22  
 Adequacy of notice, § 15:80  
 Adjudication, rulemaking context contrasted to, § 15:72  
 Aesthetic harm claims, § 15:53  
 Agency  
     assertion of nonreviewability, § 15:8  
     ripeness won by agencies, § 15:30  
 Allocation of funding, § 15:11  
 Announcement of future intentions, § 15:31  
**Appeal and Review** (this index)  
 Arguments, loss of exhaustion arguments, § 15:75  
 Arlington decision, importance of, § 15:99  
 As-applied challenges to rules, § 15:33  
 Assertions  
     agency assertion of nonreviewability, § 15:8  
     standing, § 15:48  
 Balancing interests, § 15:32  
 Benefits cases, § 15:87  
 Burden of proof  
     challenger, burdens on, § 15:79  
     exhaustion of remedies, burden on claimant regarding, § 15:86  
 Causation of harm, establishment of, § 15:58  
 Comments  
     participation in comments, § 15:82  
     waiver by not commenting, § 15:71  
 Competitive status, § 15:63  
 Consequences, consummation and, § 15:29  
 Constitutional issues, § 15:19, 15:38, 15:76  
 Consummation and consequences, § 15:29

INDEX

**PROCEDURAL DEFENSES  
AGAINST RULEMAKING  
LITIGATION—Cont'd**

- Contrast, rulemaking context  
contrasted to adjudication,  
§ 15:72
- Correction of error, exhaustion where  
agency can, § 15:78
- Courts, exhaustion of remedies,  
§ 15:91
- Declaratory relief, § 15:84
- Delay, effect of, § 15:70
- Denial of standing
  - mootness, § 15:60
  - reasons for, § 15:49
- Discretion
  - exhaustion of remedies, discretion-  
ary review, § 15:68
  - no law to apply, § 15:10
- Economics, judicial economy,  
§ 15:18
- Electoral challenges, § 15:56
- Enforcement of rules, standing in  
private, § 15:47
- Enjoyment loss as harm for standing  
purposes, § 15:55
- Environment
  - enjoyment loss as harm for stand-  
ing purposes, § 15:55
  - standing for environmental claims,  
§ 15:61
- Error. Mistake or error, *infra*
- Evidence
  - burden of proof, *supra*
  - harm or hardship, evidence of,  
§ 15:34
- Exhaustion of remedies, § 15:66 to  
15:95
- Exhaustion of Remedies** (this index)
- Facial challenges to rules, § 15:33
- Factors to be considered, § 15:92
- Finality, § 15:15
- Funding termination and allocation,  
§ 15:11
- Futility, waiver of exhaustion for,  
§ 15:73

**PROCEDURAL DEFENSES  
AGAINST RULEMAKING  
LITIGATION—Cont'd**

- Future intentions, announcement of,  
§ 15:31
- Hardship. Harm or injury, *infra*
- Harm or injury
  - aesthetic harm claims, § 15:53
  - causation of harm, establishment  
of, § 15:58
  - claimed injury denied, § 15:59
  - environmental enjoyment loss as  
harm for standing purposes,  
§ 15:55
  - evidence of, § 15:34
  - showing a personal harm, § 15:57
  - showing of injury to litigant,  
§ 15:43
- Heckler decision, effect of, § 15:2
- Ideological claims, § 15:50
- Imposition by court of exhaustion of  
remedies, § 15:91
- Information Quality Act, § 15:13
- Injury. Harm or injury, *supra*
- Intent
  - announcement of future intentions,  
§ 15:31
  - legislative intent, § 15:7
- Interest in subject matter
  - balancing interests, § 15:32
  - zone of interests protected by stat-  
ute, § 15:42
- Issues of law, ripeness of, § 15:21
- Judicial economy, § 15:18
- Judicial notice, limits on, § 15:101
- Jurisdiction, § 15:94, 15:96
- Legislative intent, § 15:7
- Letters, policy manuals and, § 15:26
- Litigation of rule, standing, § 15:36  
to 15:65
- Loss of exhaustion arguments,  
§ 15:75
- Lost opportunities claims, § 15:50
- Manuals, policy manuals and letters,  
§ 15:26

**PROCEDURAL DEFENSES  
AGAINST RULEMAKING  
LITIGATION—Cont’d**

Mistake or error  
     exhaustion where agency corrects error, § 15:78  
     standing to challenge procedural errors, § 15:52

**Mootness** (this index)

Name, statutory designation of parties with standing, § 15:40

Nonreviewability. **Appeal and Review** (this index)

Notice  
     adequacy of, § 15:80  
     persons affected, notice to, § 15:89

Not required, exhaustion of remedies, § 15:85

Orders, court-ordered actions, § 15:81

Organizational standing, § 15:39

Overview  
     generally, § 15:1  
     exhaustion of remedies, § 15:66  
     ripeness for review, § 15:16  
     standing to litigate a rule, § 15:36

Participation in comments, § 15:82

Parties  
     notice to persons affected, § 15:89  
     standing, *infra*

Petitions  
     generally, § 15:74  
     reconsideration, petitions for, § 15:90

Policy manuals and letters, § 15:26

Policy statements, § 15:74

Premature issues, prevention of court entanglement in, § 15:27

Presidential action is nonreviewable, § 15:4

Presumption favoring reviewability, § 15:5

Prevention of court entanglement in premature issues, § 15:27

Primary jurisdiction, § 15:94

**PROCEDURAL DEFENSES  
AGAINST RULEMAKING  
LITIGATION—Cont’d**

Private enforcement of rules, standing in, § 15:47

Proposed actions, no review of, § 15:17

Prudential standing, § 15:54

Public actions, standing in, § 15:41

Rarity of nonreviewability, § 15:3

Reasons for denying standing, § 15:49

Reconsideration, petitions for, § 15:90

Redressability, § 15:44

Relationship to statutory purpose, § 15:62

Remedies  
     generally, § 15:24, 15:51  
     **Exhaustion of Remedies** (this index)

Remedies in lieu of vacating the rules, § 15:97

Requests, timeliness of review requests, § 15:14

Res judicata and collateral estoppel, § 15:98

Review. **Appeal and Review** (this index)

**Ripeness** (this index)

Safe harbor cases, standing in, § 15:64

Showing of injury or harm, § 15:43, 15:57

Some generally nonreviewable rules are reviewable, § 15:6

Standing  
     assertion of standing, § 15:48  
     environmental matters, § 15:55, 15:61  
     errors, standing to challenge procedural errors, § 15:52  
     litigation of rule, § 15:36 to 15:65  
     mootness, denial of standing because of, § 15:60  
     organizational standing, § 15:39

## INDEX

**PROCEDURAL DEFENSES  
AGAINST RULEMAKING  
LITIGATION—Cont'd**  
Standing—Cont'd  
overview, standing to litigate a  
rule, § 15:36  
private enforcement of rules,  
standing in, § 15:47  
procedural rights cases, § 15:65  
prudential standing, § 15:54  
public actions, § 15:41  
reasons for denying, § 15:49  
rulemaking context for standing  
determinations, § 15:37  
safe harbor cases, § 15:64  
states, standing of, § 15:46  
statutory designation of parties  
with, § 15:40  
violations, procedural violations as  
basis for standing, § 15:45  
States, standing of, § 15:46  
Status, competitive status, § 15:63  
Statutes  
exhaustion of remedies, statutes  
requiring, § 15:88  
relationship to statutory purpose,  
§ 15:62  
standing, statutory designation of  
parties with, § 15:40  
zone of interests protected by statute,  
§ 15:42  
Stays of rules, § 15:95  
Subsets of exhaustion of remedies,  
§ 15:67  
Supplementing administrative record  
in court, § 15:100  
Termination of funding, § 15:11  
Timeliness of review requests,  
§ 15:14  
Venue, § 15:35  
Violations, procedural violations as  
basis for standing, § 15:45  
Waiver  
generally, § 15:83  
comments, waiver by not commenting,  
§ 15:71  
exhaustion for futility, § 15:73

**PROCEDURAL DEFENSES  
AGAINST RULEMAKING  
LITIGATION—Cont'd**  
Zone of interests protected by statute,  
§ 15:42  
**PROCEDURE**  
**Analysis and Impact Requirements**  
(this index)  
Appeal and review, procedural violations,  
§ 19:1  
Avoiding rulemaking procedures,  
procedural regulations exception,  
§ 3:23  
Defenses. **Procedural Defenses  
Against Rulemaking Litigation**  
(this index)  
Definitions or distinctions, § 2:5  
Litigation, procedural issues in,  
§ 7:32  
**PROCESS OR PROCESSING**  
Agency handling of rulemaking comments,  
processing comments,  
§ 8:1  
Delay in rulemaking, response to,  
§ 14:4  
**PROPERTY AND PROPERTY  
RIGHTS**  
Final rules review by court, property  
rights claims, § 19:11  
**PROPOSALS**  
**Development of Rule** (this index)  
**Final Rules** (this index)  
**PROPRIETARY RULES**  
Avoiding rulemaking procedures,  
proprietary rules exceptions,  
§ 3:20  
**PROSECUTORIAL DISCRETION**  
Adjudication, rulemaking contrasted  
to, § 22:21  
**QUALITY**  
Analysis and impact requirements,  
role of council on quality of  
environment, § 7:38

**RATE SETTING**

Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, § 18:22

**RATIONALE**

Adjudication, rulemaking contrasted to, efficiency rationale, § 22:6

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, rational connection of rule to problem, Test 9, § 16:12

Importance of articulating, § 16:26

Substantial evidence support, reviewing rules for, § 17:2

**REASONS FOR CHOICES**

Adjudication, rulemaking contrasted to, § 22:5

**RECOGNITION**

Making, assembling, and responding to comments, recognizing imbalance of judicial review power, § 6:7

**RECORDS**

**Agency Handling of Rulemaking Comments** (this index)

Appeal and review, court review of final rules, § 13:3

Making, assembling, and responding to comments, building the record, § 6:4

**REDUCTION**

Paperwork Reduction Act, analysis and impact requirements, § 7:7

**REFUSAL OR DENIAL**

Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, denial of, § 18:13

Delays, refusal to adopt rules, § 14:2

**Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

**REGULATORY AGENDAS**

Initiation of rule, § 4:6

**REGULATORY FLEXIBILITY ACT (RFA)**

Analysis and impact requirements, generally, § 7:8 to 8 to 19

**REGULATORY FLEXIBILITY ACT (RFA)—Cont'd**

Weakness of RFA, § 7:16

**RELUCTANCE**

Appeal and review, judicial reluctance, § 19:15

**REMAND**

Appellate review of remand decisions in district court, § 13:8

**REMEDIES**

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, § 3:58

**Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

Substantial evidence support, reviewing rules for, § 17:7

**REOPENING RECORD**

Agency handling of rulemaking comments, § 8:16

**RES JUDICATA**

Procedural defenses against rulemaking litigation, § 15:98

**RESPONSES**

Agency handling of rulemaking comments, duty as to responding to comments in preambles, § 8:5

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, response to comments as inadequate, Test 8, § 16:11

**Courts** (this index)

**Making, Assembling, and Responding to Comments** (this index)

**RETROACTIVITY**

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, retroactive application, § 16:23

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, § 3:59

Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, § 18:23

Review of final rules by court, retroactivity of rules, § 19:13

INDEX

**REVERSAL**

**Arbitrary or Vulnerable to Reversal** (this index)

**REVIEW**

**Appeal and Review** (this index)

**RFA**

**Regulatory Flexibility Act (RFA)** (this index)

**RIPENESS**

Abbott Decision, ripeness after, § 15:22

Agencies, ripeness won by, § 15:30  
Exhaustion, ripeness and, § 15:23, 15:77

Issues of law, § 15:21

Particular ripeness claims, § 15:25

Procedural aspects of ripeness claims, § 15:28

Review, ripeness for, § 15:16 to 15:34

**ROLES**

Analysis and impact requirements, role of council on environmental quality, § 7:38

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, role of interpretive rule, § 3:38

**RULE**

Definitions or distinctions, § 2:1

**RULEMAKING**

Definitions or distinctions, § 2:2

**RULE OF REASON**

Analysis and impact requirements, rule of reason in predicting impacts, § 7:39

**SAMPLES**

**Models or Samples** (this index)

**SATISFACTION**

Congressional requirements, § 20:1

**SBA**

**Small Business**

**SBREFA**

Agency handling of rulemaking comments, analysis under small business impact legislation, § 8:6

**SCHOLARSHIP**

Preemption of state actions by federal rules, § 21:6

**SCIENTIFIC QUESTIONS**

Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, § 18:17

**SECRET DATA USED IN RULEMAKING**

Agency handling of rulemaking comments, § 8:15

**SECURITY**

Analysis and impact requirements, security exception, § 7:34

**SEPARATION OF POWERS**

Review by court of final rules, separation of powers conflicts, § 19:10

**SETTLEMENT**

Consent settlements impacting rules, negotiated rules, § 9:3

**SILENCE**

Congress, § 20:3

**SKIDMORE**

Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, partial deference under Skidmore, § 18:16

**SMALL BUSINESS**

Analysis and impact requirements (SBA), § 7:15

SBREFA, analysis under small business impact legislation, § 8:6

**SMALL ENTITIES**

Analysis and impact requirements, § 7:13

**SOCIAL SECURITY**

Deference to agency choices in rulemaking, § 18:30

**SOURCES**

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, Test 1, § 16:4

Initiation, sources of rules, § 4:1

**SPECIFICITY**

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, rules for specific named persons, § 3:53

**STAGES**

Making, assembling, and responding to comments, understanding internal approval stages of agency, § 6:9

**STANDARDS**

**Appeal and Review** (this index)

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, supreme court's State Farm standard, § 16:2

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, standard of judicial review, § 3:57

Substantial evidence standard, rulemaking contrasted to adjudication, § 22:13

**STANDING**

**Parties** (this index)

**STARE DECISIS**

Adjudication, rulemaking contrasted to, loss of stare decisis certainty, § 22:7

**STATE FARM STANDARD**

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, § 16:2

**STATE INFLUENCE**

Final rules, § 11:5

**STATEMENTS**

Adjudication, rulemaking contrasted to, courts require statements regarding changes, § 22:15

**STATEMENTS—Cont'd**

**Analysis and Impact Requirements** (this index)

Change or modification, courts require statements regarding changes, § 22:15

Explanatory statements and discovery, § 16:19

**Policy** (this index)

Supplementing statements, § 7:28

**STATES**

Analysis and impact requirements, § 7:36

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, guidance to states and regulated persons, § 3:45

**Preemption of State Actions by Federal Rules** (this index)

**STATUTES**

Analysis and impact requirements, statutory scheme of NEPA, § 7:20

Avoiding rulemaking procedures, statutory rights, § 3:2

**Procedural Defenses Against Rulemaking Litigation** (this index)

Review, statutory or nonstatutory, § 13:7

**STEP ONE DEFERENCE**

Agency choices in rulemaking, § 18:11

**STEP TWO DEFERENCE**

Agency choices in rulemaking, § 18:12

**SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE**

Adjudication, rulemaking contrasted to, § 22:13

**Appeal and Review** (this index)

Defining the standard, § 17:4

Standard, rulemaking contrasted to adjudication, § 22:13

**SUBSTITUTE OR SUBSTITUTION**

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, substitution of judgment, § 16:14

## INDEX

### **SUPPLEMENTING STATEMENTS**

Analysis and impact requirements,  
§ 7:28

### **SUPREME COURT**

Adjudication, rulemaking contrasted  
to, § 22:3

Chevron norms applied in Mayo  
Foundation, § 18:14

Judulang decision, deference issues  
after, § 18:29

State Farm standard, arbitrary or  
vulnerable to reversal, § 16:2

### **SUSPENSION**

Avoiding rulemaking procedures,  
suspension of rules, § 3:44

### **TECHNICAL QUESTIONS**

Deference to agency choices in  
rulemaking, § 18:17

### **TESTS**

**Arbitrary or Vulnerable to  
Reversal** (this index)

### **TEXTS**

Development of rule, internal review  
of proposed rule, § 5:5

### **THREE STAGES OF NEPA ANALYSIS**

Requirements, § 7:25

### **TIME OR DATE**

Agency handling of rulemaking com-  
ments, effect of late-filed com-  
ments, § 8:10

**Avoiding Rulemaking Procedures**  
(this index)

**Final Rules** (this index)

Future issues for adjudication and  
rulemaking, § 22:18

### **TRENDS**

Adjudication, rulemaking contrasted  
to, § 22:9

### **TRUMP DEREGULATION ACTIVITIES**

Deference to agency choices in  
rulemaking, § 18:32

### **TYPES OF RULES**

Distinguished, § 3:30

### **UNCONSTITUTIONAL VAGUENESS**

Final rules, court review of, § 19:8

### **UNDERLYING DATA**

Analysis and impact requirements,  
access to underlying data, § 7:37

### **UNDERSTANDING**

**Making, Assembling, and Respond-  
ing to Comments** (this index)

### **UTILITY OF PREAMBLE**

Judicial review, utility on, § 10:3

### **VACATING**

Final rules, vacating invalidated,  
§ 13:6

Remedies in lieu of vacating the  
rules, § 15:97

### **VAGUENESS**

Appeal and review, unconstitutional  
vagueness, § 19:8

### **VALIDITY**

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal,  
presumptions of validity,  
§ 16:16

### **VOLUME VERSUS PRECISION**

Making, assembling, and responding  
to comments, volume versus  
precision in comments, § 6:10

### **VULNERABILITY**

**Arbitrary or Vulnerable to  
Reversal** (this index)

### **WAIVER**

Final rules, § 12:9

**Procedural Defenses Against  
Rulemaking Litigation** (this  
index)

### **WEAKNESS**

Analysis and impact requirements,  
weakness of RFA, § 7:16

**WHITE HOUSE**

Final rules, political influence on,  
§ 11:2

Litigation over executive order analysis, § 7:5

**WIN/WIN ALTERNATIVE**

Making, assembling, and responding to comments, § 6:6

**WITHDRAWAL**

Arbitrary or vulnerable to reversal, withdrawal of rules, § 16:17

**WORDS AND PHRASES**

**Definitions or Distinctions** (this index)

**WRITINGS**

Making, assembling, and responding to comments, writing comments clearly, § 6:8