

# Table of Contents

## **BOOK I. GENERAL OUTLINE AND HISTORY OF THE POWERS OF THE COURT OF APPEALS**

### **CHAPTER 1. GENERAL OUTLINE AND SOURCES OF THE POWERS OF THE COURT OF APPEALS**

- § 1:1 The role of the Court of Appeals as a court of limited jurisdiction
- § 1:2 General outline of limitations on the Court's jurisdiction—Appealability
- § 1:3 General outline of limitations on the Court's jurisdiction—Scope of review
- § 1:4 The sources of the Court's powers
- § 1:8 Power of Court's opinions; power to bind lower courts; federal and state issues *[Retitled]*
- § 1:9 Powers of the Chief Judge *[New]*
- § 1:10 Other miscellaneous powers of the Court of Appeals; judicial discipline *[New]*

### **CHAPTER 2. HISTORY OF THE COURT'S JURISDICTION**

- § 2:5 Constitutional amendments since 1925

## **BOOK II. APPEALABILITY TO THE COURT OF APPEALS IN CIVIL CASES**

### **CHAPTER 3. THE REQUIREMENT OF FINALITY**

### **CHAPTER 4. APPLICATION OF THE FINALITY REQUIREMENT**

- § 4:2 Basic features of a final determination—Finality must be immediately effective
- § 4:3 Basic features of a final determination—Order dismissing complaint or petition need not be decision on merits to qualify as final determination
- § 4:4 Orders on motions addressed to pleadings
- § 4:5 Orders on motions for temporary or provisional relief
- § 4:6 Orders that merely administer the course of the litigation
- § 4:7 Orders that decide only some of the issues bearing on the right to relief or the extent of the relief to be awarded
- § 4:8 Order remitting case to tribunal below directing trial or new trial in action
- § 4:10 Order remitting case to tribunal below for further proceedings
- § 4:13 Order on motion to carry out or enforce prior final determination in proceedings for restitution
- § 4:15 Order on motion to vacate prior final determination
- § 4:16 Order on motion to amend prior final determination

### **CHAPTER 5. EXCEPTIONS TO THE FINALITY REQUIREMENT**

- § 5:4 Multiple claims or multiple parties and the doctrine of “implied severance”
- § 5:8 Finality as to one of several claims—Separate causes of action which arise from the same transaction or occurrence or are otherwise interrelated
- § 5:9 Finality as to one of several parties
- § 5:10 The third party finality principle
- § 5:17 Limitations on applicability of the third party finality principle—Motions for intervention or substitution
- § 5:21 Special proceedings relating to arbitration
- § 5:24 Miscellaneous special proceedings
- § 5:25 Miscellaneous special proceedings—Special proceedings provided for in CPLR

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 5:28 Miscellaneous special proceedings—Miscellaneous special proceedings seeking relief in relation to pending or contemplated actions or proceedings
- § 5:29 Miscellaneous special proceedings—Proceedings for review of determinations of commission on judicial conduct
- § 5:30 Order claimed to contravene remittitur of Court of Appeals

**CHAPTER 6. APPEAL AS OF RIGHT AND THE LIMITATIONS THEREON**

- § 6:1 Appeal as of right; In general
- § 6:3 Appeal as of right on basis of dissent
- § 6:4 Appeal as of right on basis of dissent—Requirement of two-justice “dissent” in appellant’s favor
- § 6:5 Appeal as of right on basis of dissent—Requirement that dissent be on question of law
- § 6:6 Appeal as of right on basis of dissent—Effect of partial dissent
- § 6:8 Standards governing direct appeal from lower court or other tribunal
- § 6:10 Limitations on appeal as of right where case originates in lower-level court

**CHAPTER 7. APPEAL AS OF RIGHT ON CONSTITUTIONAL GROUNDS**

- § 7:2 General principles
- § 7:5 General principles—Substantiality of the constitutional question
- § 7:9 The requirement that the asserted constitutional question be directly involved—Appeals pursuant to CPLR 5601(b)(1)
- § 7:11 The requirement that the asserted constitutional question be directly involved—Appeals pursuant to CPLR 5601(b)(2)—Constitutional question must be the only question involved
- § 7:12 The requirement that the asserted constitutional question be directly involved—Appeals pursuant to CPLR 5601(b)(2)—Constitutional question must be one involving validity of statutory provision

**CHAPTER 8. APPEAL AS OF RIGHT FROM ORDER GRANTING NEW TRIAL OR HEARING, UPON STIPULATION FOR JUDGMENT ABSOLUTE**

- § 8:1 The governing provisions

- § 8:3 Strict construction of the governing provisions—Meaning of “new trial” and “new hearing”

## **CHAPTER 9. REVIEW OF NONFINAL ORDER ON APPEAL FROM FINAL DETERMINATION**

- § 9:4 Availability of direct appeal to Court of Appeals  
§ 9:5 Availability of direct appeal to Court of Appeals—  
Requirement that the nonfinal order necessarily affect the final determination  
§ 9:6 Availability of direct appeal to Court of Appeals—  
Proceedings for review of determinations of administrative agencies  
§ 9:7 Availability of direct appeal to Court of Appeals—  
Miscellaneous limitations

## **CHAPTER 10. APPEALS BY PERMISSION**

- § 10:1 Provisions for appeal by permission: In general  
§ 10:2 History and purpose of the provisions  
§ 10:3 Appeal by leave of Court of Appeals from final determination  
§ 10:4 Appeal by leave of Court of Appeals from nonfinal order in special cases  
§ 10:6 Appeal by leave of Appellate Division from nonfinal order on certified question of law  
§ 10:7 Formal principles regarding content of a certified question  
§ 10:13 Review by Court of Appeals of questions of New York law certified by appellate courts of other jurisdictions

## **CHAPTER 11. MISCELLANEOUS LIMITATIONS ON APPEALABILITY**

- § 11:1 Requirement that appellant be a “party aggrieved”  
§ 11:2 Requirement that appellant be a “party aggrieved”—  
Sufficiency of appellant’s interest  
§ 11:3 Requirement that appellant be a “party aggrieved”—  
Where disposition is only partially in appellant’s favor  
§ 11:6 Requirement that appellant be a “party aggrieved”—  
Where appellant claims to be aggrieved by disposition with respect to another party  
§ 11:7 Requirement that appellant be a “party”  
§ 11:8 Effect of a default  
§ 11:9 Effect of a party’s failure to appeal to the Appellate Division  
§ 11:11 Dismissal of appeal on ground of mootness

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 11:12 Dismissal of appeal on ground of mootness—Exception to the general rule

**CHAPTER 12. LIMITATIONS OF TIME**

- § 12:1 Time to take appeal as of right to Court of Appeals—The governing time limitation
- § 12:2 Time to take appeal as of right to Court of Appeals—Excuse of irregularities in taking the appeal
- § 12:3 Time to move for permission to appeal to Court of Appeals
- § 12:4 Extension of time to pursue correct method of seeking appellate review following dismissal or denial of incorrect method
- § 12:5 Effect of reargument, resettlement or amendment

**BOOK III. REVIEWABILITY IN THE COURT OF APPEALS IN CIVIL CASES**

**CHAPTER 13. SCOPE OF REVIEW AVAILABLE IN COURT OF APPEALS**

- § 13:1 The Court of Appeals primarily a court of law
- § 13:2 The distinction between questions of “fact” and questions of “law”
- § 13:3 The distinction between questions of “fact” and questions of “law”—What constitutes legally sufficient evidence
- § 13:4 The distinction between questions of “fact” and questions of “law”—Review in jury cases
- § 13:5 The distinction between questions of “fact” and questions of “law”—Review of determinations of administrative agencies
- § 13:7 Court’s power to review questions of fact, generally; constitutional provisions
- § 13:10 Court’s power to review questions of fact, generally; constitutional provisions—Reluctance of Court of Appeals to exercise full power to review questions of fact or discretion—Limitations on review of unreversed findings of fact
- § 13:11 Court’s power to review questions of fact, generally; constitutional provisions—Reluctance of Court of Appeals to exercise full power to review questions of fact or discretion—Extent of review of facts exercised by Court of Appeals

**CHAPTER 14. PROCEDURAL ASPECTS OF REVIEW OF QUESTIONS OF LAW**

- § 14:1 Preservation for review of questions of law

- § 14:3 Preservation for review of claim that the findings of fact do not warrant the conclusions of law—Jury cases
- § 14:5 Preservation for review of claim that the findings of fact are not supported by legally sufficient evidence

## **CHAPTER 15. REVIEW ON APPEAL FROM REVERSAL OR MODIFICATION BY APPELLATE DIVISION**

- § 15:1 Scope of review on appeal from reversal or modification by Appellate Division
- § 15:14 Disposition by Court of Appeals upon reversal of determination of Appellate Division—When remission to Appellate Division is appropriate
- § 15:15 Disposition by Court of Appeals upon reversal of determination of Appellate Division—When reinstatement of determination of court of first instance is appropriate

## **CHAPTER 16. REVIEWABILITY OF MATTERS OF DISCRETION**

- § 16:1 General overview
- § 16:5 Cases involving “judicial discretion”—Orders granting or denying discretionary remedies
- § 16:6 Cases involving “judicial discretion”—Orders and rulings administering the litigation

## **CHAPTER 17. REVIEWABILITY OF NEW QUESTIONS ON APPEAL**

- § 17:1 In general
- § 17:2 Reviewability of new question which could not have been obviated if raised below
- § 17:3 Reviewability of new question which could not have been obviated if raised below—Where the case was submitted below on a different theory

## **CHAPTER 18. DISPOSITION AFTER DECISION**

- § 18:1 General overview
- § 18:2 Disposition of appeal involving motion to dismiss pleading for insufficiency
- § 18:6 General rule as to unavailability of affirmative relief to a nonappealing party

TABLE OF CONTENTS

**CHAPTER 19. MISCELLANEOUS  
PRACTICE**

- § 19:1 Preliminary appeal statement *[Retitled]*
- § 19:2 Scrutiny of jurisdiction by Court of Appeals
- § 19:3 Appeals selected by Court of Appeals for review by  
alternative procedure *[Retitled]*
- § 19:4 Procedure for perfecting an appeal in the usual course
- § 19:5 Stay of enforcement of judgment or order below pending  
determination of appeal or motion for leave to appeal
- § 19:8 Motion and calendar practice—Motions
- § 19:9 Motion and calendar practice—Calendar practice for  
appeals
- § 19:10 Award of special costs or imposition of sanctions for  
frivolous conduct
- § 19:11 Motions for reargument or amendment of the remittitur
- § 19:12 Proceedings in lower court upon remittitur of Court of  
Appeals

**BOOK IV. APPEALS TO THE COURT  
OF APPEALS IN CRIMINAL CASES**

**CHAPTER 20. AVAILABILITY OF APPEAL  
IN CRIMINAL CASES**

- § 20:1 General overview
- § 20:3 Appeals in certain special proceedings governed by CPLR  
though relating to criminal matters—Habeas corpus  
proceedings
- § 20:4 Appeals in certain special proceedings governed by CPLR  
though relating to criminal matters—Article 78  
proceedings
- § 20:7 Appeals in certain special proceedings governed by CPLR  
though relating to criminal matters—Miscellaneous  
proceedings
- § 20:10 Appeal to Court of Appeals in capital cases—Availability  
of appeal to defendant
- § 20:12 Appeal to Court of Appeals in noncapital cases available  
only from order of intermediate appellate court and by  
permission
- § 20:14 Appeal to Court of Appeals in noncapital cases available  
only from order of intermediate appellate court and by  
permission—Appeal from order of affirmance—  
Availability to defendant of appeal to intermediate  
appellate court

- § 20:15 Appeal to Court of Appeals in noncapital cases available only from order of intermediate appellate court and by permission—Appeal from order of affirmance—Availability to people of appeal to intermediate appellate court
- § 20:16 Appeal to Court of Appeals in noncapital cases available only from order of intermediate appellate court and by permission—Appeal from order of affirmance—Availability to either party of appeal to the Court of Appeals
- § 20:17 Appeal to Court of Appeals in noncapital cases available only from order of intermediate appellate court and by permission—Appeal from determination rendered by intermediate appellate court in first instance
- § 20:19 Appeal to Court of Appeals in noncapital cases available only from order of intermediate appellate court and by permission—Appeal from order of intermediate appellate court other than one of reversal or modification—Appeal from order of intermediate appellate court granting or denying motion to set aside order of that court on ground of ineffective assistance or wrongful deprivation of appellate counsel
- § 20:21 Appeal to Court of Appeals in noncapital cases available only from order of intermediate appellate court and by permission—Appeal from intermediate appellate court’s order of reversal or modification—Requirement that order sought to be appealed be “adverse” or “partially adverse” to appellant
- § 20:22 Appeal to Court of Appeals in noncapital cases available only from order of intermediate appellate court and by permission—Appeal from intermediate appellate court’s order of reversal or modification—Additional limitation on appealability of order of reversal or modification
- § 20:23 Limitations in appeals taken as of right
- § 20:24 Limitations in applications for leave to appeal to Court of Appeals
- § 20:25 Limitations in extension of time for taking an appeal or seeking leave to appeal
- § 20:27 Stay of judgment by order of judge or justice
- § 20:28 Miscellaneous practice
- § 20:29 Waiver, estoppel, or other loss of right to appeal *[New]*

## **CHAPTER 21. REVIEW IN CRIMINAL CASES**

- § 21:1 General overview
- § 21:4 Power of review of Court of Appeals in capital cases—Court’s power to review discretionary orders and to grant new trial in interest of justice

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 21:6 Power of Court of Appeals in noncapital cases on appeal from order of affirmance to review findings of fact made below
- § 21:7 Power of Court of Appeals in noncapital cases on appeal from order of affirmance to review exercises of discretion made below
- § 21:8 Power of Court of Appeals in noncapital cases on appeal from order of affirmance to review sentence
- § 21:9 Miscellaneous aspects of reviewability for Court of Appeals in noncapital cases on appeal from order of affirmance
- § 21:10 Power of review of Court of Appeals in noncapital cases on appeal from order of reversal or modification
- § 21:11 Preservation requirement
- § 21:12 Miscellaneous rules regarding reviewability of claims of legal error
- § 21:13 Doctrine of harmless error
- § 21:14 Affirmance or dismissal of appeal
- § 21:15 Final disposition upon reversal or modification
- § 21:17 Remission to lower court for new trial or other proceedings

## Appendix

Appendix I. Table of Forms

**Table of Laws and Rules**

**Table of Cases**