

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

## Volume 26

### CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION

**Sec.**

- 1.1 The Purpose and Scope of this Book.
- 1.2 The Frontiers of New York State Administrative Law.
- 1.3 The Definition of an Agency.

### CHAPTER 2. PROCEDURAL DUE PROCESS

- 2.1 Introduction.
- 2.2 State Action.
- 2.3 Individualized Action.
- 2.4 Protected Interests.
- 2.5 \_\_\_\_ Fundamental Liberty Interests.
- 2.6 \_\_\_\_ State-Created Property Interests.
- 2.7 \_\_\_\_ State-Created Liberty Interests.
- 2.8 The Process Due.

### CHAPTER 3. ADJUDICATION

- 3.1 Distinguishing Adjudication from Rulemaking.
- 3.2 “Adjudicatory Proceedings” Under SAPA.
- 3.3 Required Process.
- 3.4 \_\_\_\_ Pre-Hearing Process—Initiation.
- 3.5 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Discovery.
- 3.6 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Right to Counsel.
- 3.7 \_\_\_\_ Hearing Process—Rules of Evidence.
- 3.8 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Cross-Examination.
- 3.9 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Official Notice.
- 3.10 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Decisional Record.
- 3.11 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Statement of Decision.
- 3.12 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Burden of Proof.
- 3.13 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Intervention.
- 3.14 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Unreasonable Agency Delay.
- 3.15 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Agency Duty to Decide Consistently.
- 3.16 \_\_\_\_ Intra-Agency Appeals.
- 3.17 Agency Bias.
- 3.18 \_\_\_\_ Structural Protections Against Agency Bias—Internal Separation of Functions.
- 3.19 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ The Central Panel Debate.
- 3.20 \_\_\_\_ Prejudgment and Personal Interest.
- 3.21 \_\_\_\_ Ex Parte Contacts.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Sec.</b>	
3.22	Licensing.
3.23	Res Judicata and Collateral Estoppel Effect of Administrative Adjudications.

## CHAPTER 4. RULEMAKING

4.1	Distinguishing Rulemaking from Other Agency Action.
4.2	Basic Statutory Requirements for Rulemaking.
4.3	___ Rulemaking Notice.
4.4	___ ___ Special Notice Standards for “Minor,” “Obsolete” and “Invalid” Rules.
4.5	___ ___ Special Notice Standards for Emergency Rules.
4.6	___ Comments and Agency Assessment of Comments.
4.7	___ Disclosure of Underlying Data and Studies.
4.8	___ Notice of Adoption and Date of Effectiveness.
4.9	Other Rulemaking Requirements.
4.10	___ Regulatory Impact Statement.
4.11	___ Regulatory Flexibility Analysis.
4.12	___ Rural Area Flexibility Analysis and Job Impact Statement.
4.13	___ Review by the Governor’s Office of Regulatory Reform.
4.14	“Non-rule” Rules.
4.15	___ Interpretive Rules.
4.16	___ Statements of General Policy.
4.17	___ Agency Internal Management.
4.18	___ Other “Non-rule” Rules.
4.19	Bias and Ex Parte Contacts in Rulemaking.
4.20	Rule Filing and Publication.
4.21	Overlapping State and Federal Rules and Declaratory Rulings Regarding Rules.
4.22	Agency Duty to Engage in Rulemaking.
4.23	Mandatory Review of Rules
4.24	The Frontiers of Rulemaking.

## CHAPTER 5. EXTERNAL CONTROLS ON AGENCIES

5.1	Introduction.
5.2	Delegation of Authority to Agencies.
5.3	___ Delegation of Legislative Authority and Ultra Vires Agency Action.
5.4	___ Delegation of Judicial Authority.
5.5	Delegation to Private Entities.
5.6	Appointment and Removal of Agency Heads.
5.7	Political Controls on Agencies.
5.8	Estoppel and Related Doctrines.
5.9	Freedom of Information Law.
5.10	___ Fundamental Requirements.
5.11	___ Exemptions.
5.12	___ Reverse FOIL Actions.
5.13	Open Meetings Law.

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

### **CHAPTER 6. AGENCY ACQUISITION OF INFORMATION**

**Sec.**

- 6.1 Introduction.
- 6.2 Administrative Searches.
- 6.3 Administrative Subpoenas.
- 6.4 Reporting and Recordkeeping Requirements.

### **CHAPTER 7. PRECONDITIONS OF JUDICIAL REVIEW**

- 7.1 Introduction.
- 7.2 Standing to Seek Judicial Review.
- 7.3 — “Injury in Fact” Standing.
- 7.4 — Associational Standing.
- 7.5 — Taxpayer and Voter Standing.
- 7.6 Ripeness.
- 7.7 Final Order Requirement and Limitations on Relief in the Nature of Prohibition.
- 7.8 Primary Jurisdiction.
- 7.9 Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies.
- 7.10 Preclusion of Judicial Review.

### **CHAPTER 8. JUDICIAL REVIEW**

- 8.1 Introduction.
- 8.2 Article 78 Overview and Consolidation of the Common Law Prerogative Writs.
- 8.3 Review of Legal Determinations.
- 8.4 Review of Determinations of Historical Fact.
- 8.5 — “Substantial Evidence” Review.
- 8.6 — “Arbitrary and Capricious” Review.
- 8.7 Review of Discretionary Decisions.
- 8.8 Review of Rules and Policy Determinations.
- 8.9 Tort Actions Against the Government.
- 8.10 Constitutional Damage Actions Against the Government.
- 8.11 Statutes of Limitation in Judicial Review.
- 8.12 — Review of Rules.
- 8.13 — Review of Adjudicatory Proceedings and “Administrative” Actions.
- 8.14 — Review of Non-Discretionary Legal Duties.
- 8.15 — Petitions Seeking Interlocutory Relief in the Nature of Prohibition.
- 8.16 — Tort Actions Against the State.
- 8.17 — Constitutional Damage Actions Against the Government and Officials.
- 8.18 Venue in Judicial Review.
- 8.19 Subject Matter Jurisdiction in Article 78 Proceedings.

### **CHAPTER 9. PRACTICE POINTERS: THE PERMITTING/LICENSING PROCESS**

- 9.1 Introduction.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Sec.</b>	
9.2	Basic Permit Information.
9.3	SAPA and SEQRA Issues.
9.4	SEQRA Issues.
9.5	___ Overview.
9.6	___ Determining Whether SEQRA Applies.
9.7	___ SEQRA Requirements.
9.8	___ Practical Considerations.
9.9	Agency “Players” In the Permit Process.
9.10	Common Issues Relating to the Permit Process—Permits as Privileges.
9.11	___ The Importance of Accuracy and Completeness in a Permit Application.
9.12	___ Opportunities to Expedite the Permit Process.
9.13	___ Opportunities for Variances from Standard Permitting Approaches.
9.14	___ Examples of Types of Permit Conditions or Terms.
9.15	___ Renewal, Suspension, and Revocation Issues.
9.16	Judicial Review.
9.17	___ Overview.
9.18	___ SEQRA Issues.
9.19	Conclusions.
9.20	Permitting Checklists

## CHAPTER 10. PRACTICE POINTERS: THE RULEMAKING PROCESS

10.1	Introduction.
10.2	The Basic Sources of Information for Administrative Rulemaking and Regulations—The New York Code of Rules and Regulations.
10.3	___ The State Register.
10.4	___ Other Important Sources of Information on the Rulemaking Process.
10.5	Overview of the Rulemaking Process.
10.6	Initiation of the Rulemaking Process.
10.7	Practical Tips for Participating in the Traditional Rulemaking Process.
10.8	___ Formal Participation.
10.9	___ Informal Contacts with the Agency.
10.10	___ Informal Contacts with Other Actors.
10.11	Finalizing Regulations.
10.12	Emergency Rulemakings.
10.13	Negotiated Rulemakings.
10.14	___ Process Issues.
10.15	___ Outcome of the New York Negotiating Rulemaking Efforts to Date.
10.16	___ Prospects for the Future in New York.
10.17	Examining and Challenging the Validity of Rulemakings.
10.18	___ Procedural Issues.
10.19	___ Substantive Issues.
10.20	Agency Guidance Documents or “Non-rule” Rules.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Sec.

- 10.21 Conclusion.
- 10.22 Rulemaking Checklists

## CHAPTER 11. PRACTICE POINTERS: THE ENFORCEMENT PROCESS

- 11.1 Introduction.
- 11.2 Strategies to Minimize Actionable Violations.
- 11.3 Agency Fact-Finding in the Pre-Enforcement Phase.
- 11.4 The Agency's Enforcement Options.
- 11.5 The Settlement Negotiations Process.
- 11.6 \_\_\_\_ Process Issues.
- 11.7 \_\_\_\_ Substantive Issues.
- 11.8 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Liability.
- 11.9 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Relief.
- 11.10 The Litigation Process.
- 11.11 The Rules for Initiating a Hearing.
- 11.12 The Identity of the Agency Prosecutor.
- 11.13 Information Gathering.
- 11.14 Agency Information—Gathering Tools.
- 11.15 Pre-Hearing Motions.
- 11.16 Other Pre-Hearing Activities.
- 11.17 Who Will Hear the Case?
- 11.18 Substantive Issues in the Hearing.
- 11.19 Format of the Hearing.
- 11.20 Post-Hearing Process Issues.
- 11.21 Judicial Review of Enforcement Orders.
- 11.22 Conclusions.
- 11.23 Enforcement Checklists.

## CHAPTER 12. ADMINISTRATIVE PRACTICE BEFORE THE STATE DIVISION OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY RENEWAL

- 12.1 Rent Regulation.
- 12.2 \_\_\_\_ Governing Legislation.
- 12.3 \_\_\_\_ Governing Codes.
- 12.4 \_\_\_\_ Related Statutes.
- 12.5 Overview of DHCR's Functions.
- 12.6 Commencement of Administrative Proceedings.
- 12.7 Action by Local District Rent Administrator.
- 12.8 Complete Record Requirement.
- 12.9 Determinations.
- 12.10 Stay Pending DHCR Determination.
- 12.11 Concurrent and Primary Jurisdiction.
- 12.12 Petition for Administrative Review.
- 12.13 \_\_\_\_ Form and Content.
- 12.14 \_\_\_\_ Time for Answer's Filing.
- 12.15 \_\_\_\_ Commissioner's Actions.
- 12.16 \_\_\_\_ Stays Pending Determination.
- 12.17 \_\_\_\_ Commissioner's Final Determination.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Sec.

- 12.18 \_\_\_\_ Effect of Change in Law or Regulations While PAR is Pending.
- 12.19 \_\_\_\_ Time within which Commissioner Must Take Final Action.
- 12.20 Modification or Revocation of a Determination Based on Illegality, Irregularity in Vital Matters or Fraud.
- 12.21 Article 78 Proceeding to Compel, Prohibit or Review Administrative Action.
- 12.22 Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies.
- 12.23 Statute of Limitations for Judicial Review.
- 12.24 Preservation of Issues.
- 12.25 Party Seeking Judicial Review.
- 12.26 Venue and Service of Process.
- 12.27 Standards of Review.
- 12.28 Judgments.

## CHAPTER 13. ADMINISTRATIVE PRACTICE BEFORE SERB AND PERB

- 13.1 Introduction.
- 13.2 Policies and Objectives of the State Employment Relations Act (SERA).
- 13.3 Organization and Structure (SERB).
- 13.4 SERA Section 704; Unfair Labor Practices.
- 13.5 SERA Section 705; Union Representatives and Elections.
- 13.6 SERA Section 702-a; Grievance and Dispute Resolution.
- 13.7 SERA Section 707; Judicial Review and Enforcement.
- 13.8 Miscellaneous SERA Provisions.
- 13.9 Policies and Objectives of the Public Employees' Fair Employment Act (Taylor Law).
- 13.10 Organization and Structure of the Public Employment Relations Board (PERB).
- 13.11 Employee and Union Rights Under the Taylor Law.
- 13.12 Taylor Law Section 209-a; Improper Practices.
- 13.13 Taylor Law Section 207; Determination of Representation Questions.
- 13.14 Taylor Law Section 209; Impasse Procedures.
- 13.15 Taylor Law Section 210; Strike Prohibition.
- 13.16 Taylor Law Section 206 and Section 212; Mini-PERBs.
- 13.17 Judicial Review and Enforcement of PERB Orders; Injunctive Relief.
- 13.18 Miscellaneous Taylor Law Provisions and PERB Services.
- 13.19 Agency Investigations.
- 13.20 \_\_\_\_ Adjudication.
- 13.21 \_\_\_\_ Rulemaking.
- 13.22 SERB Unfair Labor Practice Procedures—Initiation.
- 13.23 \_\_\_\_ Investigation.
- 13.24 \_\_\_\_ Complaint.
- 13.25 \_\_\_\_ Hearing Before Trial Examiner.
- 13.26 \_\_\_\_ Answer.
- 13.27 \_\_\_\_ Hearing Procedure.
- 13.28 \_\_\_\_ Final Agency Decision and Order.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Sec.

- 13.29 SERB Representation Procedures—Initiation and Processing.
- 13.30 \_\_\_\_ Post Hearing.
- 13.31 PERB Procedures.
- 13.32 \_\_\_\_ Initiation.
- 13.33 \_\_\_\_ Director Review.
- 13.34 \_\_\_\_ Notice of Conference.
- 13.35 \_\_\_\_ Answers and Responses.
- 13.36 \_\_\_\_ Hearing.
- 13.37 \_\_\_\_ Decision and Recommended Order.
- 13.38 \_\_\_\_ Exceptions.
- 13.39 \_\_\_\_ Union Certification.
- 13.40 \_\_\_\_ Impasse Resolution.

## CHAPTER 14. ADMINISTRATIVE PRACTICE BEFORE THE NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH

- 14.1 Functions and Mission.
- 14.2 Rulemaking at DOH.
- 14.3 \_\_\_\_ The State Hospital Review and Planning Council.
- 14.4 \_\_\_\_ The Public Health Council.
- 14.5 \_\_\_\_ The State Health Research Council.
- 14.6 \_\_\_\_ The New York City Board of Water Supply.
- 14.7 \_\_\_\_ The Board of Examiners of Nursing Home Administrators.
- 14.8 \_\_\_\_ The New York State Emergency Medical Services Council.
- 14.9 \_\_\_\_ The Council on Human Blood Transfusion Services.
- 14.10 Regulation, Investigation and Enforcement.
- 14.11 \_\_\_\_ Regulation of Public Health Activities and Programs.
- 14.12 \_\_\_\_ Regulation of Professionals.
- 14.13 \_\_\_\_ Regulation of Entities.
- 14.14 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Certificate of Need Review.
- 14.15 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ CON Application Submission.
- 14.16 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Review by DOH Staff and the HSA.
- 14.17 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Review by SHRPC.
- 14.18 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Consideration by PHC.
- 14.19 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Review by the Commissioner.
- 14.20 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Review Criteria for Establishment.
- 14.21 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Review Criteria for Construction.
- 14.22 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ DOH Legal Review.
- 14.23 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Practice Pointers.
- 14.24 Hearings—Overview.
- 14.25 \_\_\_\_ Uniform Hearing Procedures.
- 14.26 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Administrative Law Judges.
- 14.27 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Notice.
- 14.28 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Disclosure.
- 14.29 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Stipulations.
- 14.30 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ General Procedures.
- 14.31 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Witnesses.
- 14.32 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Report and Proposed Order.
- 14.33 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Role of Division of Legal Affairs.
- 14.34 \_\_\_\_ Administrative Tribunal Procedures.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Sec.</b>	
14.35	___ ___ Initiation.
14.36	___ ___ Answer.
14.37	___ ___ Hearing Procedures.
14.38	___ ___ Proposed Decision.
14.39	___ ___ Appeals to Tribunal.
14.40	___ ___ Role of Division of Legal Affairs.
14.41	___ ___ Other Procedures and Proceedings.
14.42	___ ___ Professional Medical Conduct Proceedings.
14.43	___ ___ ___ Initiation.
14.44	___ ___ ___ Stipulations.
14.45	___ ___ ___ Hearings Before Committee of Board.
14.46	___ ___ ___ Committee Decision.
14.47	___ ___ ___ Appeal of Committee Decision.
14.48	___ ___ Access to Records.
14.49	___ ___ Improper Practices Regarding Hospital Staff Membership and Privileges.
14.50	___ ___ Article 28 Proceedings.
14.51	___ ___ Resident Abuse Proceedings.
14.52	Post-Hearing Issues—Reconsideration.
14.53	___ Special Issues in Seeking Judicial Review.

## CHAPTER 15. ADMINISTRATIVE PRACTICE BEFORE THE DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL CONSERVATION

15.1	An Introduction to Environmental Practice in New York.
15.2	An Overview of Environmental Practice Involving the Department of Environmental Conservation.
15.3	DEC's Organizational Structure.
15.4	DEC's Relations with the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency.
15.5	___ Oversight of DEC's Permit Process.
15.6	___ EPA Oversight of DEC Enforcement.
15.7	___ Anticipating DEC's Priorities and Actions.
15.8	___ Citizens' Rights Under the Federal and State Environmental Laws.
15.9	Information-Gathering.
15.10	___ Obtaining Information From DEC.
15.11	___ DEC Information-Gathering Approaches.
15.12	DEC's Permit Process.
15.13	___ Filing an Application Through "Completeness."
15.14	The Permit Process—Notices of Completeness and Notices of Hear- ing.
15.15	___ Pre-Adjudicatory Hearing Activities: Legislative Hearings, Is- sues Conferences, Discovery and Motion Practice.
15.16	___ The Adjudicatory Hearing Itself.
15.17	___ Official Notice.
15.18	___ Burden of Proof.
15.19	___ Ex-Parte Contacts.
15.20	___ DEC's Post-Adjudicatory Hearing Process.
15.21	___ Issuance and Terms.
15.22	___ Modification, Suspension, and Revocation.



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Sec.

- 15.23 \_\_\_\_ Conclusions.
- 15.24 DEC's Enforcement Process.
- 15.25 \_\_\_\_ Pre-Hearing Practice Under Part 622—Notices of Hearing and Complaints.
- 15.26 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Motion Practice and Discovery.
- 15.27 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Pre-Hearing Conferences.
- 15.28 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ "Statements of Readiness for Adjudicatory Hearing."
- 15.29 \_\_\_\_ DEC Hearings—Process, Burden of Proof and Related Issues.
- 15.30 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Substantive Issues To Be Adjudicated.
- 15.31 \_\_\_\_ DEC's Post-Enforcement Hearing Process.
- 15.32 \_\_\_\_ Alternative Enforcement Hearing Tools—Motions for Summary Order and Motions for Expedited Fact Finding.
- 15.33 \_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_ Summary Abatement Orders.
- 15.34 \_\_\_\_ Conclusions Concerning DEC Enforcement.
- 15.35 Rulemaking.
- 15.36 Judicial Review.

## CHAPTER 16. ADMINISTRATIVE PRACTICE BEFORE THE DEPARTMENT OF TAXATION AND FINANCE

- 16.1 Introduction.
- 16.2 Organization of the Department.
- 16.3 \_\_\_\_ The Division of Tax Appeals.
- 16.4 \_\_\_\_ The Tax Appeals Tribunal.
- 16.5 New York State Taxes: An Overview.
- 16.6 \_\_\_\_ The Personal Income Tax.
- 16.7 \_\_\_\_ Business Taxes.
- 16.8 \_\_\_\_ Sales and Use Taxes.
- 16.9 \_\_\_\_ Transfer Taxes.
- 16.10 \_\_\_\_ Miscellaneous Taxes.
- 16.11 The State Administrative Procedure Act.
- 16.12 Regulations and Rulings.
- 16.13 \_\_\_\_ Declaratory Rulings.
- 16.14 \_\_\_\_ Advisory Opinions.
- 16.15 \_\_\_\_ Opinions of Counsel.
- 16.16 \_\_\_\_ Technical Services Bureau Memoranda.
- 16.17 \_\_\_\_ Estoppel.
- 16.18 Tax Return Filing Requirements.
- 16.19 Payment of the Tax.
- 16.20 Records to be Kept by the Taxpayer.
- 16.21 Examination of a Tax Return.
- 16.22 Taxpayers' Bill of Rights.
- 16.23 Confidentiality of Tax Return Information.
- 16.24 Representation of the Taxpayer.
- 16.25 \_\_\_\_ Proceedings in the Division of Tax Appeals.
- 16.26 \_\_\_\_ Conciliation Conferences.
- 16.27 Assessment and Determination of Tax.
- 16.28 \_\_\_\_ Restrictions on Assessment or Collection.
- 16.29 \_\_\_\_ Limitations Periods for Assessments and Determinations.
- 16.30 \_\_\_\_ Effect of Final Federal Determination.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Sec.</b>	
16.31	___ Interest and Penalties.
16.32	___ Assertion of Deficiency after Petition is Filed.
16.33	Permits, Licenses and Registrations.
16.34	Refund Claims.
16.35	___ Time Limits for Claiming Credit or Refund.
16.36	___ Sales and Use Taxes.
16.37	Settlement and Compromise.
16.38	Administrative Review.
16.39	___ Conciliation Conferences.
16.40	___ Proceedings in the Division of Tax Appeals.
16.41	___ Filing the Petition.
16.42	___ Pleadings in the Division of Tax Appeals.
16.43	___ Motions to Dismiss.
16.44	___ Motions for Summary Determination.
16.45	___ Other Motions and Discovery.
16.46	___ Bills of Particulars.
16.47	___ Admissions.
16.48	___ Subpoenas.
16.49	___ Depositions.
16.50	___ Stipulations.
16.51	___ Submission Without Hearing.
16.52	___ Conduct of the Hearing.
16.53	___ Evidence at the Hearing.
16.54	___ Burden of Proof.
16.55	___ The Administrative Law Judge’s Determination.
16.56	___ Expedited Hearings.
16.57	___ Small Claims Hearings.
16.58	___ Review by the Tribunal.
16.59	___ Publication of Decisions.
16.60	Judicial Review—Estate Tax.
16.61	___ Article 78.
16.62	___ Procedure Under Article 78.
16.63	___ Appeal to the Court of Appeals.
16.64	___ Exclusivity of Remedies.
16.65	___ Federal Court.

## APPENDICES

A.	New York State Administrative Procedure Act and Selected Statutes.
B.	Executive Orders.
C.	Selected Administrative Regulations and Forms.
D.	Information About Selected State Agencies.
E.	Rulemaking Forms and Materials.
F.	Model Pleadings and Notices.
G.	Freedom of Information Law Request.
H.	Permitting Materials.

<b>Table of Statutes</b> .....	<b>Page</b> 919
--------------------------------	--------------------

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Table of Cases .....	953
Index .....	989

\*