

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	iii
Table of Cases	xix

Chapter 1 Introduction

1.1 Scope of work	1
1.2 Dicey's idea of equality	1
1.3 History of Crown proceedings.....	4
(a) Origin of petition of right.....	4
(b) Equitable relief.....	5
(c) Contract and tort	6
(d) Royal fiat.....	7
(e) Statutory reform	7
(f) Judicial reform	9
1.4 Meaning of the Crown	11
(a) Executive branch of government.....	11
(b) Crown agency	13
(c) Divisibility	13
(d) Corporate character	16
1.5 Powers of the Crown.....	18
(a) Statutory powers.....	18
(b) Crown prerogative	18
(c) Judicial review of Crown powers	25

Chapter 2 Remedies

2.1 Introduction.....	32
2.2 Damages	34
(a) Definition.....	34
(b) Crown liability	34
(c) Tortious liability	35
(d) Punitive damages	35
(e) Interest on damages	37
2.3 Declaration	39
(a) Definition.....	39
(b) Crown liability	40
(c) Crown proceedings statutes	40
(d) Dyson procedure.....	41
(e) Interlocutory declaration	42
(f) Suspended declaration	44
(g) Constitutional declaration	49

TABLE OF CONTENTS

2.4	Injunction	50
(a)	Definition.....	50
(b)	Crown immunity	51
(c)	Crown servants	52
(d)	Lack of legal authority	53
(e)	Mandatory injunction	54
(f)	Interlocutory injunction.....	54
(g)	Constitutional injunction.....	55
(h)	Personal or official capacity	58
(i)	Justification for Crown immunity.....	59
2.5	Specific performance	61
(a)	Definition.....	61
(b)	Crown immunity	61
2.6	Mandamus	62
(a)	Definition.....	62
(b)	Crown immunity	62
(c)	Persona designata.....	62
(d)	Constitutional mandamus.....	63
(e)	Justification for Crown immunity.....	65
2.7	Prohibition and certiorari	65
(a)	Definition.....	65
(b)	Crown immunity	66
(c)	Constitutional guarantee	67
2.8	Habeas corpus.....	67
(a)	Definition.....	67
(b)	Crown liability	67
2.9	Application for judicial review.....	69
(a)	Definition.....	69
(b)	Crown immunity	69
2.10	Collateral attack.....	69
(a)	Definition of collateral attack.....	69
(b)	Collateral attack in inferior courts.....	71
(c)	Collateral attack in superior courts	71
(d)	Collateral attack in criminal proceedings	71
(e)	Collateral attack in civil proceedings	72
2.11	Set-off.....	76
(a)	Definition.....	76
(b)	Crown immunity	76
(c)	Statutory reform	76
2.12	Proceedings in rem	77
(a)	Definition.....	77
(b)	Crown immunity	77

TABLE OF CONTENTS

2.13 Proceedings by the Crown	79
-------------------------------------	----

Chapter 3 Enforcement of Judgments

3.1 Execution	81
(a) Definition of execution	81
(b) Crown immunity	81
(c) Duty to pay judgment debts	82
(d) Interest on judgment debts	83
(e) Legislative nullification	84
(f) Justification for Crown immunity	84
3.2 Garnishment	85
(a) Definition of garnishment	85
(b) Crown as judgment debtor	86
(c) Crown as garnishee	86
3.3 Contempt	88
(a) Definition of contempt	88
(b) Crown immunity	88
(c) Justification for Crown immunity	89

Chapter 4 Procedure

4.1 General rule	93
4.2 Discovery	95
(a) Definition	95
(b) Crown immunity	96
(c) Statutory reform	96
(d) Designation of Crown representative	97
(e) Residual immunity	98
(f) Crown privilege	99
4.3 Costs	100
(a) Definition	100
(b) Crown immunity	100
(c) Statutory reform	100
(d) Advance costs	101
4.4 Interest	104
(a) Prejudgment interest	104
(b) Postjudgment interest	104
4.5 Limitation of actions	104
(a) Definition	104
(b) Crown immunity	104
(c) Statutory reform of limitation law	105
(d) Limitation periods in the provinces	106
(e) Limitation periods in the federal jurisdiction	107

TABLE OF CONTENTS

(f) Constitutional claims.....	110
4.6 Notice requirements	113
(a) Definition.....	113
(b) Post-accident notice.....	113
(c) Pre-action notice	115
(d) Constitutional notice	116
(e) No action for misfeasance or bad faith without leave	117

Chapter 5 Evidence

5.1 Definition of public interest immunity	121
5.2 Comparison with other privileges	122
5.3 Procedure.....	124
(a) General	124
(b) Form of claim.....	124
(c) Claim made before trial.....	125
(d) Claim made during trial	125
(e) Representation of Crown	127
5.4 Judicial review.....	127
(a) History.....	127
(b) Balancing of interests	129
(c) Balancing in criminal cases.....	131
(d) Inspection	132
(e) Disclosure	133
(f) Disclosure of Crown brief	134
(g) Disclosure under Canada Evidence Act	135
5.5 Class claims	137
(a) General rule	137
(b) Candour in public service.....	137
5.6 Cabinet documents.....	138
(a) Common law	138
(b) Canada Evidence Act, s. 39.....	139
5.7 National security.....	144
5.8 Oral evidence	148
5.9 Real evidence	149
5.10 Informer privilege.....	150
(a) Nature of informer privilege.....	150
(b) Scope of informer privilege.....	153
(c) Other confidential information	156
5.11 Confidentiality laws.....	156
5.12 Freedom of information laws	157

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 6 Tort: General Principles

6.1	History.....	160
(a)	Crown immunity	160
(b)	Early statutory reform.....	160
(c)	United Kingdom reform of 1947	162
(d)	Australia and New Zealand.....	164
(e)	Canada	164
6.2	Vicarious liability	167
(a)	Definition of vicarious liability	167
(b)	Direct liability compared	168
(c)	Crown servant.....	168
(i)	Liability for tort of Crown servant: General rule.....	168
(ii)	Definition of Crown servant.....	169
(iii)	Identification of Crown servant.....	171
(iv)	Independent contractors and non-delegable duties	171
(v)	Crown agent	174
(d)	Commission of tort by servant	175
(i)	Commission of tort by servant: General rule	175
(ii)	Statutory immunity clauses	176
(iii)	Enforcement of criminal law	177
(iv)	Judicial functions	178
(e)	Course of employment	180
(i)	Course of employment: General rule	180
(ii)	De facto authority.....	181
(iii)	Independent discretion	181
(f)	Policy favouring vicarious liability.....	184
6.3	Direct liability	185
(a)	Crown liability	185
(b)	Employers' duties.....	186
(c)	Occupiers' duties	187
(d)	Statutory duties.....	188
(e)	Other duties and reform of direct liability	191
6.4	Lack of legal authority.....	196
(a)	General rule	196
(b)	Compensation under statute.....	196
(c)	Compensation under prerogative	197
(d)	Significance of legal authority	197
(e)	Interpretation of statutory authority.....	198
6.5	Commission of a tort	202
(a)	Recognized heads of liability	202
(b)	Negligence.....	204
(c)	Misfeasance in a public office.....	204
(d)	Constitutional torts	210

TABLE OF CONTENTS

6.6	Reform	216
(a)	Compensation based on invalidity	216
(b)	Compensation based on risk.....	224
(c)	Compensation based on entitlement	228
(d)	A public law of torts.....	229

Chapter 7 Tort: Negligence

7.1	Definition of negligence.....	231
7.2	Duty of care.....	233
(a)	Definition of duty of care.....	233
(b)	The <i>Anns/Kamloops</i> test	234
(i)	Description of the Anns/Kamloops test.....	234
(ii)	The policy-operational distinction	235
(iii)	Criticism of the Anns/Kamloops test.....	238
(c)	The <i>Anns/Cooper</i> test	240
(i)	Description of the Anns/Cooper test	240
(ii)	Proximity	243
(iii)	Residual policy considerations.....	252
7.3	Special categories of negligence	262
(a)	Introduction to special categories of negligence	262
(b)	Pure economic loss.....	262
(i)	Evolution of liability for pure economic loss	262
(ii)	Independent liability of statutory public authorities.....	265
(iii)	Negligent misrepresentation.....	270
(c)	Nonfeasance.....	272
(d)	Peculiarly governmental activity	279
(i)	Evolution of liability for peculiarly governmental activity.....	279
(ii)	Military activity	281
7.4	Invalidity	285
7.5	Reform	290

Chapter 8 Tort: Liability of Servants

8.1	Personal liability in general	293
8.2	State necessity	294
(a)	General rule	294
(b)	Act of state	295
8.3	Legal authority.....	297
8.4	Statutory immunity	299
8.5	Judicial immunity.....	303
(a)	Common law protection.....	303
(b)	Superior court judges	304
(c)	Inferior court judges.....	307

TABLE OF CONTENTS

(d) Quasi-judicial actors	310
(e) Statutory protection	311
8.6 Prosecutorial immunity	316
8.7 Immunity from defamation proceedings	326
(a) Judicial proceedings	326
(b) High executive communications	328
(c) Critique of immunity	330

Chapter 9 Contract

9.1 Introduction	333
9.2 Private law of contract	334
9.3 Intention to create contractual relations	337
(a) Government promises	337
(b) Statutory provisions	338
(c) Election promises	338
(d) Policy promises	339
(e) Tendering contracts	340
9.4 Power of Crown to make contracts	343
(a) Power of a natural person	343
(b) Statutory authority	345
(c) Legislative appropriation	346
(d) Constitutional limits	348
(e) Statutory limits	350
9.5 Power of Crown servants to make contracts	352
(a) General rules of agency	352
(b) Statutory limits	353
9.6 Fettering legislative power	353
(a) Direct fettering of legislative power	353
(b) Indirect fettering of legislative power	354
(c) The <i>Pacific National</i> case	355
(d) Policy reasons for permitting indirect fettering	359
(e) The <i>Resolute FP</i> case	361
(f) Conclusion on fettering legislative power	362
9.7 Liability of Crown servants	362
(a) General rule of immunity	362
(b) Warranty of authority	362
(c) Agent's personal liability	363
9.8 Contracts with Crown servants	364
(a) Application of general law of contract	364
(b) Action for loss of services	369

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 10 Restitution

10.1	Definition of restitution.....	373
10.2	Crown liability for restitution.....	374
10.3	Benefit to Crown.....	375
10.4	Detriment to plaintiff.....	377
10.5	No juristic reason for enrichment	379
10.6	Recovery of unauthorized taxes.....	379
(a)	General right of recovery.....	379
(b)	Uncertainty before the <i>Kingstreet</i> decision.....	380
(c)	The <i>Kingstreet</i> decision.....	384
(d)	Does <i>Kingstreet</i> apply only to the recovery of taxes?	385
(e)	The passing-on defence.....	387
(f)	Limitation periods.....	387

Chapter 11 Taking

11.1	Constitutional power to take property.....	389
11.2	Crown property.....	391
11.3	Compensation for taking.....	392
(a)	No constitutional right to compensation.....	392
(b)	Statutory right to compensation	394
11.4	Regulation of property.....	395
11.5	Constructive taking	396
11.6	Extinguishment of contractual rights	401

Chapter 12 Trust

12.1	Definition of trust	403
12.2	Crown liability as trustee.....	403
12.3	Political trusts	404
12.4	Crown's duties as trustee.....	405
12.5	Crown as fiduciary.....	406
(a)	Definition of fiduciary.....	406
(b)	Crown liability as fiduciary	407
(c)	No ordinary fiduciary	407
(d)	Crown liability as fiduciary generally.....	409
(e)	The Crown's sui generis fiduciary obligation to Indigenous Peoples.....	411
(f)	Legislation modifying fiduciary duty	414

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 13 Estoppel

13.1 Definition of estoppel.....	419
13.2 Crown bound by estoppel	420
13.3 Estoppel and statutory duties	420
13.4 Estoppel and statutory powers	421
13.5 Res judicata	423

Chapter 14 Crown as Creditor

14.1 Legal proceedings by Crown	425
14.2 Prerogative of priority	425
14.3 Competing Crown debts.....	426
14.4 Statutory abolition of Crown priority.....	427
14.5 Statutory reinforcement of Crown priority	429

Chapter 15 Statutes

15.1 Subjection to common law	434
15.2 Subjection to statute law	435
15.3 Presumption of Crown immunity	435
(a) Rule of statutory interpretation.....	435
(b) Rights peculiar to the Crown	438
(c) Public good.....	438
(d) Necessary implication.....	438
(e) Modern version of presumption	439
15.4 Effect of Interpretation Acts.....	448
(a) Codification of presumption.....	448
(b) Reversal of presumption.....	451
15.5 Express words	453
15.6 Necessary implication.....	453
(a) Exception to immunity.....	453
(b) Purpose of statute	453
(c) Other indications in statute	454
(d) Displacement of prerogative.....	458
15.7 Benefit of statutes	460
(a) Requirement of prejudice	460
(b) No effect on Crown	461
(c) Beneficial effect on Crown	462
(d) Burden linked to benefit.....	463
15.8 Implied term of contract	468
15.9 Commercial activity	469

TABLE OF CONTENTS

15.10 Incorporation by reference	472
(a) Crown liability	472
(b) Ambulatory or static	472
(c) Interjurisdictional liability	473
15.11 Provincial Crown as defendant	473
(a) Rights-of-the-parties provision	473
(b) Procedural rights	474
(c) Substantive rights	475
(d) Ambulatory effect	477
(e) “As nearly as possible”	478
15.12 Federal Crown as defendant	479
(a) Absence of rights-of-the-parties provision	479
(b) Proceedings in contract	479
(c) Proceedings in tort	480
15.13 Crown as plaintiff	482
15.14 Criminal liability	484
(a) Strict liability offences	484
(b) Mens rea offences	488
15.15 Crown agents and servants	489
(a) Requirement of prejudice	489
(b) Crown agents	489
(c) Crown servants	490
(d) Crown contractors	492
(e) Crown premises	493
15.16 Federal complications	494
(a) Scope of presumption	494
(b) Meaning of “the Crown”	497
15.17 Reform	500
(a) Criticism of presumption	500
(c) Crown bound by necessary implication	500
(b) Reversal of presumption	505

Chapter 16 Crown agents

16.1 Agent of the Crown	509
16.2 Crown agent at common law	510
(a) Functions test	510
(b) Control test	512
16.3 Crown agent by statute	515
(a) General rule	515
(b) Ultra vires activity	517
16.4 Liability of Crown agent	520
(a) Introduction	520

TABLE OF CONTENTS

(b) Liability to be sued	520
(c) Liability under substantive law	521
(d) Tort	522
(e) Contract.....	525
(f) Crown immunities	527
16.5 Conclusion	528

Chapter 17 Federal Questions

17.1 Federalism	531
17.2 State immunity in international law	531
17.3 Jurisdiction of courts.....	532
(a) Crown immunity	532
(b) Suits against Crown in right of provinces	533
(c) Suits against Crown in right of Canada.....	536
(d) Suits by Crown	543
(e) Suits between governments.....	544
17.4 Choice of law	547
(a) Which law applies?.....	547
(b) Liability of Crown in right of Canada	548
(c) Crown in right of Canada as plaintiff.....	549
17.5 Federal common law	549
(a) Federal common law in the United States	549
(b) Federal common law in Canada	550

Chapter 18 Conclusion

.....	553
Selected Bibliography	559
Index	565

