

# Summary of Contents

- Chapter 1. The Foundation of Judicial Review and the Uniqueness of Constitutional Litigation
- Chapter 2. The Scope of Constitutional Litigation: Government Action
- Chapter 3. Parties
- Chapter 4. Choice of Forum
- Chapter 5. Choice of Procedure
- Chapter 6. Remedies
- Chapter 7. Commencing the Proceeding
- Chapter 8. Evidence in Constitutional Cases
- Chapter 9. Discovery of Governments
- Chapter 10. The Hearing

## **Appendices**

- Appendix A. Appendix—Selected Precedents
- Appendix B. Cases in Which Author Participated as Counsel at Any Level of Court
- Appendix SLL. Selected Legal Literature
- Appendix WP. Words & Phrases

## **Table of Cases**

## **Index**



# Table of Contents

## **CHAPTER 1. THE FOUNDATION OF JUDICIAL REVIEW AND THE UNIQUENESS OF CONSTITUTIONAL LITIGATION**

- § 1:1 Introduction
- § 1:2 The Foundation of Judicial Review
- § 1:3 —The Legitimacy Issue
- § 1:4 —The Enforceability Issue
- § 1:5 —Conclusion
- § 1:6 The Distinctive Nature of Constitutional Litigation

## **CHAPTER 2. THE SCOPE OF CONSTITUTIONAL LITIGATION: GOVERNMENT ACTION**

### **I. INTRODUCTION**

- § 2:1 Generally

### **II. STATE ACTION IN U.S. CONSTITUTIONAL LAW**

- § 2:2 Introduction
- § 2:3 The Actor—The Government Itself
- § 2:4 —The Control Test
- § 2:5 —Entwinement
- § 2:6 The Activity
- § 2:7 —Government Approval
- § 2:8 —Government Encouragement or Coercion
- § 2:9 —Symbiotic Relationship
- § 2:10 —Government Function

### **III. GOVERNMENT ACTION UNDER THE CANADIAN CHARTER OF RIGHTS AND FREEDOMS**

- § 2:11 Introduction
- § 2:12 The Actor
- § 2:13 —Control Test
- § 2:14 —Government Function
- § 2:15 The Activity
- § 2:16 —Statutory Power Plus a Specific Government Program or Policy
- § 2:17 —Government Approval
- § 2:18 —Government Encouragement or Coercion
- § 2:19 —Symbiotic Relationship

## **IV. THE SPECIAL CASE OF THE COURTS**

§ 2:20 Generally

## **V. SUMMARY OF GOVERNMENT ACTION UNDER THE CHARTER**

§ 2:21 Introduction

§ 2:22 Consider the Impugned Actor

§ 2:23 Consider the Impugned Activity

§ 2:24 Summary Chart of Cases by Actor

## **VI. EXTRATERRITORIAL APPLICATION OF THE CHARTER; DIVISION OF POWERS; ABORIGINAL RIGHTS CASES**

§ 2:25 Extraterritorial Application of the Charter

§ 2:26 Division of Powers

§ 2:27 Aboriginal Rights Cases

## **CHAPTER 3. PARTIES**

### **I. INTRODUCTION**

§ 3:1 Generally

### **II. PLAINTIFFS OR APPLICANTS**

#### **A. THE LAW OF STANDING**

##### **1. Introduction**

§ 3:2 Generally

##### **2. Division of Powers**

§ 3:3 Standing as of Right

§ 3:4 Public Standing

§ 3:5 —Special Damage

§ 3:6 —Discretionary Public Interest Standing

##### **3. Standing under the Charter**

§ 3:7 Introduction

§ 3:8 Section 24(1) Standing, or “Private Interest Standing”

§ 3:9 Public Interest Standing

§ 3:10 Standing in Criminal Prosecutions

§ 3:11 Standing to Raise Charter Issues in Existing Litigation

§ 3:12 Procedure on Challenges to Standing

§ 3:13 Lower Court Decisions on Public Interest Standing

§ 3:14 —“Serious issue”

§ 3:15 —“Directly affected” or “genuine interest”

§ 3:16 —Representative Organizations

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 3:17 — —Corporations
- § 3:18 — “Whether the proposed suit is, in all of the circumstances, a reasonable and effective means to bring the challenge”
- § 3:19 — —Representative Organizations
- § 3:20 — —Attorneys General
- § 3:21 — Other Considerations — Illegality

### 4. Standing in Aboriginal Rights Cases

- § 3:22 Generally

## B. MOOTNESS; PLAINTIFFS IN ABORIGINAL RIGHTS CASES

- § 3:23 Mootness
- § 3:24 Plaintiffs in Aboriginal Rights Cases

## III. DEFENDANTS OR RESPONDENTS IN CONSTITUTIONAL CASES

- § 3:25 Introduction
- § 3:26 Declaration of Invalidity of Legislation
- § 3:27 Claims in Damages Against the Crown
- § 3:28 Claims Against the Federal Crown
- § 3:29 Representative Capacity — Provincial Ministers
- § 3:30 Representative Capacity — Federal Ministers
- § 3:31 Judicial Review
- § 3:32 Other Parties

## IV. INTERVENERS

- § 3:33 Introduction
- § 3:34 Academic Commentary on Intervention in Constitutional Cases
- § 3:35 —Assisting the Court
- § 3:36 —Legitimacy Critiques
- § 3:37 Intervention Rules
- § 3:38 —Attorneys General
- § 3:39 —Intervention as Added Party v. “Friend of the Court”
- § 3:40 Interventions at the Court of First Instance
- § 3:41 —Tests Applied to Interventions in Constitutional Cases
- § 3:42 — —Sufficient “Interest” in the Case
- § 3:43 — —Usefulness and Distinctiveness
- § 3:44 — —Prejudice to Parties
- § 3:45 Intervention on Appeals
- § 3:46 Conduct of Interventions

## CHAPTER 4. CHOICE OF FORUM

### I. INTRODUCTION; SUPERIOR COURTS; THE FEDERAL COURT OF CANADA

- § 4:1 Introduction

- § 4:2 Superior Courts
- § 4:3 The Federal Court of Canada

## **II. ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNALS**

- § 4:4 Introduction
- § 4:5 The Impact of the Constitution on the Exercise of an Administrative Tribunal's Discretion
- § 4:6 Jurisdiction Under Section 24 and the Establishment of the Exclusive Jurisdiction Model: *Weber*
- § 4:7 The Choice Among Tribunals
- § 4:8 Section 52 and the Focus on Authority to Decide Questions of Law
- § 4:9 Conclusion on Administrative Tribunals
- § 4:10 Summary Chart of Cases

## **III. OTHER STATUTORY COURTS**

- § 4:11 Statutory Courts in General
- § 4:12 Provincial Offences Court
- § 4:13 Provincial Criminal Trial Court
- § 4:14 Preliminary Inquiry Judges
- § 4:15 Ontario Divisional Court
- § 4:16 Appellate Courts
- § 4:17 Bail Hearing Judges

## **IV. CONCLUSION**

- § 4:18 Concluding Remarks

# **CHAPTER 5. CHOICE OF PROCEDURE**

## **I. INTRODUCTION**

- § 5:1 Generally

## **II. ACTIONS**

- § 5:2 Introduction
- § 5:3 Motions to Strike
- § 5:4 Motions to Determine a Question of Law
- § 5:5 Motions for Summary Judgment
- § 5:6 —Ontario
- § 5:7 —Other Provinces/Territories
- § 5:8 —Federal Court
- § 5:9 —Concluding Comments on Summary Judgment Motions

## **III. APPLICATIONS**

- § 5:10 Introduction
- § 5:11 Ontario

§ 5:12 Other Jurisdictions

**IV. CLASS PROCEEDINGS**

- § 5:13 Introduction
- § 5:14 Constitutional Class Actions in the U.S.
- § 5:15 Canada's Experience to Date
- § 5:16 —“Representative Actions” Before Class Actions Legislation
- § 5:17 —*Guimond v. Quebec (A.G.)*
- § 5:18 —Cases Applying *Guimond* to Deny Certification
- § 5:19 —Cases Distinguishing *Guimond* and Granting Certification
- § 5:20 —Constitutional Class Actions and *Res judicata*
- § 5:21 —Class Actions Combining Constitutional and Other Causes of Action
- § 5:22 —Aboriginal Class Actions
- § 5:23 —Outlook for Class Actions in Constitutional Litigation

**V. TRIBUNAL PROCEEDINGS**

- § 5:24 Generally

**VI. JUDICIAL REVIEW OR STATUTORY APPEALS FROM TRIBUNALS**

- § 5:25 Introduction
- § 5:26 From Evidentiary Hearings
- § 5:27 From Other Government Decisions

**VII. REFERENCES**

- § 5:28 Introduction
- § 5:29 Scope of the Reference Power
- § 5:30 The Court's Discretion to Refuse to Decide

**CHAPTER 6. REMEDIES**

**I. GENERAL PRINCIPLES**

- § 6:1 Introduction
- § 6:2 Availability of Concurrent Remedies Under Sections 52 and 24
- § 6:3 Retroactivity of Charter Remedies

**II. SECTION 52(1) OF THE CONSTITUTION ACT, 1982, DECLARATORY RELIEF, READING IN AND READING OUT (SEVERANCE)**

- § 6:4 Introduction
- § 6:5 Declaratory Relief
- § 6:6 Reading Down
- § 6:7 Severance (Reading Out) and Reading In
- § 6:8 Constitutional Exemptions

### III. SECTION 24(1) OF THE CHARTER

#### A. INTRODUCTION; DAMAGES

§ 6:9 Introduction

§ 6:10 Damages

#### B. INJUNCTIONS

§ 6:11 General Rules

§ 6:12 Structural Injunctions—Introduction

§ 6:13 —American Experience—Origins and Challenges

§ 6:14 — —Modern Developments

§ 6:15 — —Congressional Response

§ 6:16 —Canadian law

### IV. SUSPENSION OF REMEDIES

§ 6:17 Generally

### V. SECTION 24(2) OF THE CHARTER

#### A. INTRODUCTION: *COLLINS*, *STILLMAN* AND THE LAW BEFORE *GRANT*

§ 6:18 Generally

§ 6:19 Trial Fairness

§ 6:20 Seriousness of the Breach

§ 6:21 Effect of the Exclusion on the Administration of Justice

#### B. THE *GRANT* CRITERIA: A REFOCUSING OF THE SECTION 24(2) ANALYSIS

§ 6:22 Introduction

§ 6:23 Seriousness of the Charter-Infringing State Conduct

§ 6:24 Impact on the Charter-Protected Interests of the Accused

§ 6:25 Society's Interest in Adjudication on the Merits

§ 6:26 Application to Different Kinds of Evidence

§ 6:27 Specific Application of the *Grant* Criteria

### VI. INTERIM REMEDIES

#### A. INTRODUCTION; SERIOUS CONSTITUTIONAL ISSUE

§ 6:28 Introduction

§ 6:29 Serious Constitutional Issue

#### B. IRREPARABLE HARM

§ 6:30 Generally

§ 6:31 Elections Cases

§ 6:32 Social Welfare



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 6:33 Language Rights Cases
- § 6:34 Availability of Damages and other Remedies after Trial

### C. BALANCE OF (IN)CONVENIENCE

- § 6:35 Solicitor-Client Privilege Cases
- § 6:36 Elections Cases
- § 6:37 Other Cases

### D. PUBLIC INTEREST; SUSPENSION AND EXEMPTION

- § 6:38 Public Interest
- § 6:39 Suspension and Exemption

## VII. COSTS

- § 6:40 Costs in Civil Constitutional Cases
- § 6:41 Costs in Criminal Constitutional Cases
- § 6:42 Costs for Intervenors
- § 6:43 Advance Interim Costs

## VIII. REMEDIES IN ABORIGINAL RIGHTS CASES

- § 6:44 The Purposes of Aboriginal Rights Remedies — Academic Perspectives
- § 6:45 Cases Ordering Specific Remedies
- § 6:46 —Declarations
- § 6:47 —Constitutional Exemptions
- § 6:48 —Interlocutory Injunctions
- § 6:49 —“Structural” Injunctions
- § 6:50 —Compensatory Remedies—Damages
- § 6:51 —Costs

## CHAPTER 7. COMMENCING THE PROCEEDING

### I. INTRODUCTION

- § 7:1 Generally

### II. SPECIFIC RULES APPLYING TO CROWN OR GOVERNMENT

- § 7:2 Notice of Claim Provisions
- § 7:3 Crown Immunity Provisions
- § 7:4 Short Limitation Periods Applying to Governments

### III. PLEADING A CONSTITUTIONAL CASE

- § 7:5 Introduction
- § 7:6 Drafting of Statement of Claim or Other Originating Document
- § 7:7 A Case Study — *Lavigne v. O.P.S.E.U.*
- § 7:8 Drafting of Defences/Responses

§ 7:9 Amending the Pleadings

## **CHAPTER 8. EVIDENCE IN CONSTITUTIONAL CASES**

### **I. DIVISION OF POWERS AND CHARTER LITIGATION**

#### **A. THE NEED FOR A FACTUAL RECORD**

- § 8:1 Introduction
- § 8:2 Historical Evolution of Admissibility of Extrinsic Evidence
- § 8:3 Inherently Unreliable or Improper Material
- § 8:4 Extrinsic Evidence in Charter Cases
- § 8:5 The Need for a Proper Factual Record
- § 8:6 Current Approach to Extrinsic Evidence in Division of Powers Cases
- § 8:7 Some Factors to Consider on Adequacy of Factual Record
- § 8:8 Nature and Sufficiency of Evidence in Constitutional Cases
- § 8:9 Nature of Evidence Required to Reject Binding Precedent

#### **B. LEGISLATIVE FACTS VERSUS ADJUDICATIVE FACTS**

- § 8:10 Generally

#### **C. EXPERT EVIDENCE**

- § 8:11 Introduction
- § 8:12 A Properly Qualified Expert
- § 8:13 Improper Legal Argument
- § 8:14 Experts Exhibiting Lack of Independence
- § 8:15 Straying Beyond Expertise
- § 8:16 Procedure on Challenges to Affidavits
- § 8:17 Effective Expert Affidavits or Reports
- § 8:18 Cross-examination of Experts
- § 8:19 Weighing of Experts
- § 8:20 Deference to Findings of Legislative Fact

#### **D. BRANDEIS BRIEFS AND JUDICIAL NOTICE**

- § 8:21 Introduction
- § 8:22 Pre-Charter Division of Powers Cases
- § 8:23 Early Charter Cases
- § 8:24 The Current Approach

### **II. UNIQUE ISSUES IN ABORIGINAL RIGHTS LITIGATION**

- § 8:25 The *Sui Generis* Nature of Aboriginal Rights Litigation
- § 8:26 The Need for a Factual Record
- § 8:27 Oral History Evidence

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 8:28	Historical Documents
§ 8:29	Expert Evidence
§ 8:30	Expert Historians
§ 8:31	Emerging Disciplines
§ 8:32	Improper Legal Argument
§ 8:33	Experts Exhibiting Lack of Independence
§ 8:34	Straying Beyond Expertise
§ 8:35	Learned Treatises
§ 8:36	Judicial Notice

## **CHAPTER 9. DISCOVERY OF GOVERNMENTS**

### **I. INTRODUCTION**

§ 9:1	Generally
-------	-----------

### **II. THE STATUTORY SCHEME**

§ 9:2	Provincial Governments
§ 9:3	Federal Government
§ 9:4	—Procedural Rules
§ 9:5	—Privileges or Immunities under the CEA

### **III. SCOPE OF DISCOVERY IN CONSTITUTIONAL CASES**

§ 9:6	Generally
-------	-----------

### **IV. CHOICE OF REPRESENTATIVE TO BE QUESTIONED**

§ 9:7	Generally
§ 9:8	Provincial Governments
§ 9:9	Federal Government

### **V. CABINET CONFIDENCES**

#### **A. INTRODUCTION**

§ 9:10	Generally
--------	-----------

#### **B. PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENTS**

§ 9:11	Introduction
§ 9:12	The Balance of Interests
§ 9:13	—The Public Interest in Openness
§ 9:14	—The Need to Preserve Cabinet Candour
§ 9:15	Factors Applied in Balancing the Interests
§ 9:16	—Age of the Evidence
§ 9:17	—Ongoing Deliberations
§ 9:18	—Alleged Misconduct by the Crown
§ 9:19	—Litigation Necessity

- § 9:20 —Whether the Evidence Relates to Broad Policy or Implementation
- § 9:21 —Form of Proceeding
- § 9:22 Limitations on Orders for Discovery
- § 9:23 Onus on the Parties and Deference
- § 9:24 What Cabinet Documents Should be Protected?

### C. FEDERAL GOVERNMENT

- § 9:25 Introduction
- § 9:26 Constitutionality of s. 39 of CEA
- § 9:27 The Limited Scope of Review under s. 39
- § 9:28 What is a Cabinet Document under s. 39?
- § 9:29 Drawing an Adverse Inference
- § 9:30 Procedure For Claiming Immunity Under s. 39

## VI. INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS, NATIONAL DEFENCE AND NATIONAL SECURITY

- § 9:31 Introduction
- § 9:32 Section 38 of CEA
- § 9:33 —Procedure on Claims Under s. 38 of CEA
- § 9:34 —Factors to be Considered on s. 38 Claims
- § 9:35 —International Relations
- § 9:36 —National Defence and Security
- § 9:37 Security of Information Act

## VII. OTHER CASES OF PUBLIC INTEREST IMMUNITY

- § 9:38 Generally

## VIII. ACCESS TO INFORMATION LEGISLATION; DISCLOSURE IN CRIMINAL CASES; ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL PROCEEDINGS

- § 9:39 Access to Information Legislation
- § 9:40 Disclosure in Criminal Cases
- § 9:41 Administrative Tribunal Proceedings

## IX. UNIQUE DISCOVERY ISSUES IN ABORIGINAL RIGHTS CASES

### A. INTRODUCTION

- § 9:42 Generally

### B. SCOPE OF DISCOVERY

- § 9:43 Obligation to Answer Questions of Historical Fact
- § 9:44 Duty to Make Reasonable Inquiry
- § 9:45 Ongoing Obligation to Produce Documents
- § 9:46 The Crown's Duty to Produce Archival Documents

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 9:47 Questions of Mixed Fact and Law

### C. CROWN PRIVILEGES AND IMMUNITIES

§ 9:48 Public Interest Immunity

§ 9:49 Solicitor-Client Privilege

## CHAPTER 10. THE HEARING

### I. INTRODUCTION

§ 10:1 Generally

### II. NOTICE REQUIREMENTS

§ 10:2 Notice of Constitutional Question—Introduction

§ 10:3 —Statutory Provisions

§ 10:4 —Case Law

§ 10:5 Notice of Application to Exclude Evidence

### III. BIFURCATED HEARINGS

§ 10:6 General Approach

§ 10:7 Bifurcation in Specific Contexts—Criminal Cases

§ 10:8 —Civil Cases

§ 10:9 —Statutory Bifurcation

### IV. APPEALS

§ 10:10 Introduction

§ 10:11 Notice Requirements

§ 10:12 Appeal Route

§ 10:13 Raising New Issues on Appeal

§ 10:14 Supplementing the Record

§ 10:15 Standard of Review

§ 10:16 Remedial Issues on Appeal

## APPENDICES

Appendix A. Appendix—Selected Precedents

Appendix B. Cases in Which Author Participated as Counsel at  
Any Level of Court

Appendix SLL. Selected Legal Literature

Appendix WP. Words & Phrases

**Table of Cases**

**Index**