

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i> .....	iii
<i>Table of Cases</i> .....	TC-1
<b>CHAPTER 1 – THE ROLE OF THE PROSECUTOR</b> .....	<b>1</b>
1. PURPOSE OF THIS CHAPTER.....	1
2. THE CONSTITUTIONAL PRINCIPLE OF INDEPENDENCE .....	4
3. INSTITUTIONAL INDEPENDENCE .....	6
4. INDEPENDENCE AND OBJECTIVITY IN DECISION-MAKING .....	11
a. Independence from the Police and Others .....	11
b. Tunnel Vision .....	13
c. The Exercise of a Challenge Function .....	14
d. Conflict of Interest.....	16
5. PROSECUTORIAL ACCOUNTABILITY .....	18
<b>CHAPTER 2 – THE CHARGING DECISION</b> .....	<b>21</b>
1. PURPOSE OF THIS CHAPTER.....	21
2. REVIEWING THE EXERCISE OF PROSECUTORIAL DISCRETION GENERALLY .....	21
a. What is “Prosecutorial Discretion”? .....	22
b. Reviewability.....	23
c. The Standard of Review.....	25
3. REVIEW OF THE DECISION TO PROSECUTE.....	26
a. The Nature of the Charging Decision .....	26
b. Application of the Standard of Review .....	30
c. Preventing Prosecution .....	32
d. Diversion .....	32
e. Refusing to Consent to Prosecution.....	33
f. Reviewing the Decision <i>not</i> to Prosecute .....	34
g. Procedural Issues in Challenging Charging Decisions .....	39

4.	REVIEWING DECISIONS TO TERMINATE PROCEEDINGS....	43
a.	Staying Private Prosecutions .....	44
b.	Use of the Power to Stay Generally .....	47
c.	The Power to Withdraw Charges.....	48
5.	CHALLENGES TO THE SELECTION OF THE ACCUSED .....	49
a.	Selective Prosecution.....	49
b.	Adherence to Inflexible Prosecution Policies .....	51
c.	Joinder of Accused .....	52
d.	Unequal Treatment of Co-accused .....	54
6.	CHALLENGES TO THE NATURE OF THE CHARGES.....	54
a.	Trivial Cases.....	55
b.	Improper External Influences.....	57
7.	REVIEWING OTHER CHARGE-RELATED DECISIONS .....	58
a.	Direct Indictments .....	58
b.	Electing to Proceed by Indictment Rather than by Summary Conviction .....	61
c.	Elections and Re-elections.....	63
d.	Requirement for Trial by Jury .....	66
e.	Dangerous/Long Term Offender Applications .....	67
f.	Notice to Seek Increased Penalties.....	68
8.	THE CHARGING DECISION AND CONSTITUTIONAL CHALLENGES TO LEGISLATION .....	69
9.	EXTRADITION CASES.....	70
	<b>CHAPTER 3 – DISCLOSURE .....</b>	<b>73</b>
1.	PURPOSE OF THIS CHAPTER.....	73
2.	THE NATURE AND SCOPE OF THE CROWN’S DUTIES .....	74
a.	The General Duty: Promptly Disclose all Information that is not Clearly Irrelevant or Privileged.....	74
b.	The Duty to be Objective .....	77
c.	The Duty to Preserve Evidence.....	77
d.	The Duty to Explain Non-Disclosure .....	81
e.	The Duty to be Transparent.....	83
f.	The Duty to Inquire/Investigate .....	84
g.	The Continuing Nature of the Disclosure Obligation.....	87
h.	Disclosure to Unrepresented Accused.....	90
3.	THIRD PARTY RECORDS .....	90
a.	Introduction .....	90

TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

b.	The Two-Part Test: “Likely Relevance” and “Balancing of Interests” .....	91
c.	Records of Police Witnesses .....	93
d.	Challenging Authorizations to Search and Seize.....	94
e.	Procedural Concerns.....	95
4.	EXCEPTIONS AND LIMITATIONS .....	96
a.	Relevance .....	96
b.	Privilege .....	98
i.	Solicitor-client Privilege.....	98
ii.	Litigation Privilege.....	99
iii.	Informer Privilege .....	101
c.	Statutory Exceptions.....	104
i.	Section 37 of the <i>Canada Evidence Act</i> .....	104
ii.	Section 38 of the <i>Canada Evidence Act</i> .....	104
iii.	Sections 278.1-278.91 of the <i>Criminal Code</i> .....	105
iv.	International Agreements .....	105
d.	Records Under or Beyond the Crown’s Control: <i>Stinchcombe</i> or <i>O’Connor?</i> .....	106
e.	Form of Disclosure .....	107
f.	Attaching Conditions to Disclosure .....	109
g.	The Timing of the Disclosure .....	110
5.	ESTABLISHING A BREACH OF THE RIGHT.....	110
a.	Nature of the Right to Disclosure .....	110
b.	The Persuasive Burden .....	112
c.	The Obligations on the Defence.....	112
d.	Production of the Crown’s Files to the Court .....	114
6.	REMEDIES .....	116
a.	Generally .....	116
b.	Timing .....	117
c.	Adjournments .....	118
d.	Mistrial .....	118
e.	Cross-examination .....	119
f.	Exclusion of Evidence .....	119
g.	Stays of Proceedings .....	120
h.	Costs.....	122
i.	Sentence Reduction .....	122
7.	DISCLOSURE IN OTHER CONTEXTS .....	122
	<b>CHAPTER 4 – ABUSE OF PROCESS .....</b>	<b>125</b>

1. INTRODUCTION.....	125
2. THE EMERGENCE OF THE ABUSE OF PROCESS DOCTRINE.....	126
3. THE APPLICATION OF THE DOCTRINE GENERALLY .....	129
4. THE TEST .....	131
5. ABUSE OF THE CHARGING DISCRETION .....	132
a. Use of the Criminal Process to Collect a Debt .....	133
b. Delay .....	135
c. Re-trials .....	138
d. Use of the Direct Indictment .....	141
e. Improper Relationship with other Branches of Government .....	143
f. Improperly-Motivated Proceedings .....	144
g. Double Jeopardy/Re-Litigation.....	147
h. Lack Of Independence in the Charging Decision .....	150
i. Improper Re-Institution of Proceedings/Use of the Power to Stay Proceedings.....	151
j. Abuse of the Right of Appeal.....	154
2. PREJUDICIAL CHANGES IN THE CROWN’S POSITION .....	157
a. Introduction .....	157
b. Re-electing to Avoid a Limitation Period.....	157
c. Abusive Conduct in Plea Bargaining.....	162
d. Repudiation of Immunity Agreements/Agreements not to Prosecute.....	166
e. Resiling from Positions Taken at Trial on Appeal .....	169
f. Circumvention of Court Rulings .....	171
3. OTHER CATEGORIES OF CROWN MISCONDUCT .....	173
a. Introduction .....	173
b. Prosecutorial Statements Outside Court .....	173
c. Extradition Cases .....	175
d. Jury-related Misconduct .....	177
e. Proceeding Against a Person who is Physically or Mentally Ill...	179
f. Reliance on Perjured Evidence .....	180
g. Failure to Protect the Accused’s Rights .....	180
h. Condoning Police Misconduct.....	181
4. REMEDIAL AND PROCEDURAL ISSUES.....	181
<b>CHAPTER 5 – THE DUTIES OF CROWN COUNSEL AT TRIAL AND ON APPEAL .....</b>	<b>187</b>
1. PURPOSE OF THIS CHAPTER.....	187

TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

2. DUTIES TO THE COURT AND THE ADMINISTRATION OF JUSTICE.....	188
a. The Duty of Civility.....	188
b. The Duty of Candour .....	189
c. The Duty to Assist the Court.....	191
d. The Duty to Preserve Judicial Independence .....	192
3. DUTIES ARISING BEFORE, DURING AND AFTER TRIAL...	192
a. Bail Hearings.....	192
b. The Duty to Investigate .....	192
c. Presentation of the Case at Trial and on Appeal.....	194
4. THE DUTY TO CALL WITNESSES .....	195
a. The Scope of the Duty .....	195
b. The Impact of the Failure to Call Witnesses .....	198
c. The Trial Judge’s Discretion to Call Witnesses .....	201
d. Does The Crown Need to Explain Its Decision not to Call Witnesses? .....	203
5. DUTIES TO DEFENCE COUNSEL AND THE ACCUSED .....	203
a. The Duty to Prevent Wrongful Convictions .....	204
b. The Duty to Assist Unrepresented Accused .....	206
c. The Duty to Minimize Prejudice to the Defence .....	207
d. The Duty to Respect The Solicitor-Client Relationship .....	207
e. The Duty not to Interfere with the Defence .....	208
<b>CHAPTER 6 – IMPROPER CROSS-EXAMINATION .....</b>	<b>211</b>
1. PURPOSE OF THIS CHAPTER.....	211
2. IMPROPER CROSS-EXAMINATION OF THE ACCUSED .....	212
a. Subversion of the Accused’s Charter Rights.....	212
i. Using the Right to Silence as a Trap .....	212
ii. Incrimination by Reference to Prior Testimony .....	215
iii. Using Disclosure as a Trap.....	216
iv. Right to be Present at Trial.....	217
v. Use of a Translator .....	218
b. Lying and the Motive for Lying.....	218
c. Assuming Facts not in Evidence .....	223
d. Bad Character .....	226
e. Criminal Record.....	228
f. Abusive Language .....	230
g. The Defence Strategy .....	232
h. Inflammatory Language .....	232

i. Irrelevant Matters.....	233
j. Splitting the Crown’s Case .....	233
k. Failure to Cross-examine .....	234
l. Manner of Questioning .....	235
3. IMPROPER CROSS-EXAMINATION OF OTHER DEFENCE WITNESSES .....	235
a. Expert Witnesses .....	235
b. Character Witnesses.....	236
c. Other Defence Witnesses.....	237
4. IMPEACHING THE CROWN’S OWN WITNESSES.....	237
5. APPELLATE REVIEW OF IMPROPER CROSS-EXAMINATION .....	240
<b>CHAPTER 7 – IMPROPER JURY ADDRESSES.....</b>	<b>245</b>
1. PURPOSE OF THIS CHAPTER.....	245
2. OPENING ADDRESSES.....	247
a. Introduction .....	247
b. Referring to Inadmissible or Uncalled Evidence .....	247
c. Inflammatory Remarks.....	249
d. Giving Opinions, Commentary or Evidence .....	249
3. CLOSING ADDRESSES .....	251
a. Introduction .....	251
b. Disrespect for an Accused’s Charter Rights.....	251
i. Undermining the Presumption of Innocence.....	251
ii. Infringing the Right to Silence .....	254
iii. Using the Right to Disclosure as a Trap .....	255
c. Disrespect for the Accused or the Defence .....	256
i. The Accused Personally.....	256
ii. Defence Counsel or the Defence Strategy .....	257
d. Expressions of Opinion .....	259
e. Giving Evidence .....	261
f. Appeals to Emotion – the “Inflammatory” Address .....	263
g. Misstating, or Inappropriately Using, the Evidence.....	265
h. Inviting Speculation .....	268
i. Commenting on the Failure to Testify .....	270
j. Commenting on the Law .....	272
k. Inconsistent Presentation of the Case.....	274
l. Compounding the Prejudice Caused by Improper Cross-examination.....	275

TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

4. THE APPELLATE RESPONSE TO IMPROPER JURY ADDRESSES .....	276
a. Standard of Review .....	276
b. Defining a Test .....	278
i. Seriousness of the Impropriety.....	280
A. What was the nature of the comments? .....	280
B. How frequent were the improper comments?.....	280
C. Did it compound other problems in the case? .....	280
D. What were the issues in the case?.....	280
E. What was the order of the jury addresses? .....	281
F. Is there evidence that the jury was not misled? .....	281
ii. The Existence and Effectiveness of Corrective Action .....	281
A. Was the impropriety corrected? .....	281
B. How quickly was the corrective action taken?.....	283
C. Was the correction clear, specific and forceful? .....	283
D. Did Crown counsel take corrective action? .....	284
<b>CHAPTER 8 – COSTS AGAINST THE CROWN .....</b>	<b>285</b>
1. PURPOSE OF THIS CHAPTER.....	285
2. HISTORY .....	286
3. THE JURISDICTION TO AWARD COSTS.....	289
a. The “Functional and Structural” Approach (Charter Jurisdiction).....	289
b. The Inherent Jurisdiction of the Court.....	293
c. Statutory Jurisdiction .....	294
d. Implied Jurisdiction .....	294
e. Civil Jurisdiction vs. Criminal Jurisdiction .....	295
f. Appellate Jurisdiction .....	300
g. Are Criminal Costs Orders Compensatory or Punitive? .....	304
h. The Power to Award Costs to Persons other than the Accused ..	306
4. WHEN SHOULD COSTS BE AWARDED AGAINST THE CROWN? .....	308
a. The “Marked and Unacceptable Departure” Test .....	308
b. Particular Applications .....	310
i. Disclosure Cases .....	310
ii. Abuse of Process .....	313
iii. Unreasonable Search and Seizure .....	314
iv. Unreasonable Delay.....	316
v. Right to an Interpreter .....	317

vi. Language Rights .....	318
vii. Bail Hearings .....	318
viii. Forfeiture Applications .....	319
5. QUANTUM.....	319
<b>CHAPTER 9 – MALICIOUS PROSECUTION AND RELATED TORT CLAIMS .....</b>	<b>323</b>
1. PURPOSE OF THE CHAPTER.....	323
2. SUING PROSECUTORS – THE POLICY RATIONALE.....	324
3. THE <i>NELLES</i> TEST .....	327
a. Introduction .....	327
b. Step 1 – The Initiation of Proceedings.....	327
i. The Role of Prosecutors in the Initiation of Proceedings.....	327
ii. The “Actively Instrumental” Test .....	329
iii. What Kind Of Prosecution?.....	332
c. Step 2 – Termination of the Proceedings in Favour of the Plaintiff .....	333
d. Step 3 – The Absence of Reasonable and Probable Cause.....	335
i. Introduction .....	335
ii. The Subjective Element .....	336
iii. The Objective Element .....	338
e. Step 4 – Malice .....	341
i. Malice Defined .....	341
ii. The Relationship Between Malice and Reasonable and Probable Cause.....	346
f. Damages .....	349
7. OTHER TORTS.....	350
a. Introduction .....	350
b. Abuse of Public Office/Misfeasance in Public Office.....	351
c. Abuse of Process.....	353
d. Negligent Prosecution .....	355
e. Other Forms of Negligence .....	356
f. Conspiracy to Injure .....	356
g. Malicious Non-Prosecution.....	357
8. CHARTER CLAIMS .....	358
9. APPLICATIONS FOR MERCY .....	361
<b>CHAPTER 10 – PROSECUTORIAL STANDARDS .....</b>	<b>363</b>
1. PURPOSE OF THIS CHAPTER.....	363



TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

2. THE STANDARDS SET BY LAW SOCIETIES AND BAR ASSOCIATIONS.....	364
3. CANADIAN PROSECUTION AGENCY STANDARDS .....	365
4. AMERICAN PROSECUTORIAL STANDARDS .....	367
5. UNITED KINGDOM PROSECUTORIAL STANDARDS .....	368
6. INTERNATIONAL PROSECUTORIAL STANDARDS.....	370

