

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	v
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xvii
Chapter 1 The Doctor-Patient Relationship	1
1. Nature of the Relationship	1
(a) Historical Development	1
(b) Fiduciary Nature of the Relationship	5
(c) Creation of the Relationship	8
(d) Duty to Provide Emergency Services	10
(e) Patients Examined at the Request of a Third Party	13
2. Communications Between Doctor and Patient ...	18
(a) Basis for Confidentiality	18
(b) Disclosure Inside a Court of Law	21
(c) Disclosure Outside a Court of Law	29
(i) Permissive and Mandatory Exceptions ..	29
(ii) By Consent of the Patient	29
A. Express	29
B. Implied	31
(iii) By Statute	35
(iv) In the Public Interest	40
(d) Action for Breach of Confidence and Invasion of Privacy	47
Chapter 2 Consent	51
1. Introduction	51
2. The Right to Refuse Treatment	53
3. Forms of Consent	59
(a) Express Consent	59
(b) Implied Consent	60
4. Withdrawing Consent	64
5. Exceptions to the Requirement of Consent	66
(a) Legislation	66
(i) Public Health Legislation	66
(ii) Mental Health Legislation	67
(iii) Codifying Legislation	67

(b)	Emergencies	68
6.	Elements of Consent	74
(a)	Consent Must Be Given Voluntarily.	74
(i)	Coercion and Undue Influence.	74
(ii)	Misrepresentation	78
(b)	Patient Must Have Capacity	81
(i)	Adults with a Disability.	82
A.	Assessing Capacity	82
B.	Substitute Consent at Common Law	88
C.	Substitute Consent Legislation	89
D.	Proxy Appointments and Advance Directives	90
E.	The Standard for Substitute Decision-Making	92
F.	Withdrawal of Life-Sustaining Treatment	94
G.	Artificial Nutrition and Hydration	96
H.	Summary: The Doctor's Responsibility	97
(ii)	Children	100
A.	Assessing Capacity	100
B.	Overriding the Refusal of a Mature Minor	104
C.	Parental Consent	107
D.	Parental Refusal	110
(c)	Consent Must Be Referable to Both the Treatment and the Person Who Is to Administer It.	114
(i)	The Treatment	114
(ii)	The Person Administering the Treatment	119
(d)	Patient Must Be Informed	121
7.	Special Treatment	123
(a)	Research	123
(i)	Definition of "Research".	124
(ii)	Voluntary Consent	126
(iii)	Risk/Benefit Ratio	127
(iv)	Children.	128
(v)	Adults with a Disability	130
(vi)	Fetal Tissue and Embryo Research	131
(b)	Transplantation	133
(i)	<i>Inter Vivos</i>	133
(ii)	<i>Post Mortem</i>	137
(c)	Sterilization.	141

(d)	Medically Assisted Death	146
(e)	Other Medical Procedures	150
8.	The Remedy of Battery	151
Chapter 3 Informed Consent: The Doctor's Duty of Disclosure		153
1.	Introduction	154
(a)	Terminology	154
(b)	Importance of Informed Consent	155
(c)	Source of the Duty of Disclosure	157
2.	Remedy—Battery or Negligence?	158
3.	Standard of Disclosure	161
(a)	The Law Prior to <i>Hopp</i> and <i>Reibl</i>	161
(b)	The Supreme Court Rulings	162
(i)	<i>Hopp v. Lepp</i>	162
(ii)	<i>Reibl v. Hughes</i>	163
(c)	The Meaning of “Material, Special or Unusual Risk”	166
(i)	Examples of Material Risks	167
(ii)	Examples of Non-Material Risks	174
(iii)	Common Risks	178
(iv)	Elective Procedures	179
(v)	Risk of Follow-up Treatment	181
(vi)	Terminology: Material, Special or Unusual	182
(vii)	Appellate Review	183
(d)	The Likelihood and Consequences of the Risk	184
4.	Specific Issues Relating to Disclosure	186
(a)	Other Material Information	186
(i)	Diagnosis and Prognosis	186
(ii)	Alternative Treatment	188
(iii)	Alternative Facilities	193
(iv)	Cost Containment Policies	194
(v)	Conflict of Interest	195
(vi)	Personal Information About the Doctor	197
(b)	Patient's Comprehension	201
(c)	Specific Questions	206
(d)	Risks Not Known to the Doctor	208
(e)	Patient's Special Circumstances	210
(f)	The Duty of Disclosure: Whose Duty?	212

(g)	Therapeutic Privilege	217
(h)	Waiver	219
(i)	Research and Experimentation	219
(j)	Continuing Duty	222
(k)	Duty to Third Parties	226
(l)	Informed Refusal	227
(m)	Proof of Disclosure	229
(n)	Children	232
(o)	Emergencies	232
5.	Causation	232
(a)	The Modified Objective Test	232
(i)	How Subjective?	234
(ii)	The Patient's Own Evidence	238
(b)	Application of the Test	239
(i)	Overall Trends	239
(ii)	Alternative Treatment	240
(iii)	Relevant Factors	242
(c)	Cases Where the Test Does Not Apply	248
(d)	Criticism of the Modified Objective Test	250
(e)	Postponing the Treatment	253
6.	Duty to Disclose Medical Error	256
7.	Conclusion	264
 <i>Chapter 4 Negligence—General Principles</i>		267
1.	Introduction—The Basics of Negligence	268
2.	Duty of Care	269
(a)	Duty to Patients	269
(b)	Duty to the Fetus	274
(c)	Emergency Care	276
(i)	Duty to Provide Care	276
(ii)	Good Samaritan Legislation	276
(d)	Patients Examined at the Request of Third Parties	279
(e)	Duty to Third Parties	279
(i)	Duty to Warn	279
(ii)	Duty to Supervise Dangerous Patient	280
(iii)	Other Situations of Liability	281
(f)	Duty Owed by Government and Regulatory Bodies	284
3.	Standard of Care—General Principles	286
(a)	Introduction	286

(b)	Nature and Character of the Standard of Care	288
(i)	Qualifications of the Doctor	289
A.	General Practitioners and Specialists	289
B.	Residents and Students.	294
C.	Non-Doctors	300
(ii)	Degree of Risk Involved	301
(iii)	The Danger of Hindsight.	305
(iv)	Resources	306
A.	Facilities	307
B.	Innovations in Equipment.	309
C.	Locality Rule	314
D.	Cost Containment Policies	319
(c)	Approved Practice and Error of Judgment	323
(d)	Appellate Review	323
4.	Injury	325
(a)	An Essential	325
(b)	Wrongful Birth	328
(i)	The Factual Context.	328
(ii)	Cost of Raising the Child	330
(iii)	Disabled Children	334
(iv)	Mitigation	335
(v)	Conclusion	336
(c)	Wrongful Life.	336
5.	Causation	339
(a)	The “But For” Test.	339
(b)	Exceptions to the “But For” Test.	342
(c)	<i>Snell v. Farrell</i>	346
(i)	Introduction	346
(ii)	Probability not Certainty, and the “Robust and Pragmatic” Approach.	348
(iii)	The Aftermath of <i>Snell v. Farrell</i>	349
(d)	Deciding Causation Before Standard of Care	353
(e)	Multiple Causes: <i>Athey v. Leonati</i>	356
(f)	Loss of a Chance	359
(g)	Proximate Cause (Remoteness).	362
6.	Conclusion	368
	Chapter 5 Negligence—Specific Duties and Attendant Standards of Care	371
1.	Introduction.	372

2.	The Duty to Attend	372
3.	The Duty to Diagnose	377
	(a) General Principles	377
	(b) Duty to Reconsider the Diagnosis	387
	(c) Specialists	391
4.	The Duty to Refer	393
	(a) When to Refer	394
	(b) Where to Refer	401
	(c) What to Refer	402
	(d) After Referral	405
	(e) Referral (Consultation) as a Defence	405
5.	The Duty to Treat	406
	(a) Quality of Care	406
	(b) Surgery	407
	(i) Wrong Operation	407
	(ii) Inappropriate Surgery	407
	(iii) Injury During Operation	409
	(iv) Objects Left Inside the Body	415
	(v) Post-Operative Care	417
	(c) Anaesthesiology	419
	(d) Obstetrics	422
	(i) Urgency	423
	(ii) Anticipation	426
	(iii) Communication	427
	(e) Drugs and Injections	428
	(i) Adverse Reactions	428
	(ii) Inappropriate Drug	431
	(iii) Errors in Administration	434
	(iv) Injections	435
	(f) Casts	436
	(g) Futile or Inappropriate Treatment	439
	(h) Communication Among Members of the Treatment Team	441
6.	The Duty to Instruct the Patient	442
7.	Conclusion	447
	Chapter 6 Defences to an Action in Negligence	449
	1. Introduction	449
	2. Approved Practice	451
	(a) The <i>Korn</i> Decision	451
	(b) Effect of <i>Korn</i>	453

(c)	Meaning of “Approved Practice”	457
(i)	Relevant Date	457
(ii)	Proof	459
(iii)	“Respectable Minority” Principle	460
(d)	Departure from Approved Practice	462
3.	Error of Judgment	463
4.	Contributory Negligence of the Patient	467
(a)	Effect of Contributory Negligence	467
(b)	Examples of Contributory Negligence	468
(c)	Duty to Mitigate Loss	476
(d)	Joint and Several Liability	476
5.	Expiry of the Limitation Period	477
(a)	Rationale for the Defence	477
(b)	Length of the Limitation Period	478
(c)	Termination of Professional Services	479
(d)	Discoverability Rule	483
(e)	Sexual Assault	486
(f)	Fraudulent Concealment	487
6.	Waiver of Liability	489
Chapter 7 Proof of Negligence		493
1.	Introduction	493
2.	Evidence	494
(a)	Witnesses	494
(i)	The Role of the Expert Witness	494
(ii)	The Necessity of Expert Evidence	502
(b)	Documents	507
(c)	Admissions	509
(d)	Conclusion	509
3.	Difficulties of Proof	510
(a)	Direct and Circumstantial Evidence	510
(b)	<i>Res Ipsa Loquitur</i>	512
(c)	Obtaining Expert Witnesses	517
(i)	A “Conspiracy of Silence”?	517
(ii)	Preparing the Expert Witness	521
(d)	The Jury	522
Chapter 8 The Doctor in Court		527
1.	Introduction	527
2.	As Witness	529
(a)	Interviews	529

(b)	Qualifications	530
(c)	Giving Evidence	530
(i)	Nature of the Evidence	530
(ii)	Examination-in-chief	531
(iii)	Cross-examination	532
(d)	The Medical-Legal Report	533
3.	As Defendant	536
(a)	Advice and Co-operation	536
(b)	Giving Evidence	538
(c)	Costs	538
Chapter 9 Other Civil and Criminal Liability		543
1.	Introduction	543
2.	False Imprisonment	543
3.	Contract	546
(a)	Elements of a Contract Action	546
(b)	Guarantee of Outcome	548
(c)	Advantages of a Contract Action	550
(d)	Medical Products	552
4.	Defamation	554
5.	Criminal Liability	559
Chapter 10 The Doctor's Liability for the Acts of Others		563
1.	General Principles of Vicarious Liability	563
2.	Relationships with Others and Vicarious Liability	566
(a)	Office Staff	567
(b)	Nurses	567
(c)	Other Health Care Professionals	569
(d)	Other Doctors	570
3.	Partnerships	573
4.	Direct Liability	574
Chapter 11 The Hospital		575
1.	Liability in General	575
2.	Direct Liability—General Principles	576
(a)	Breach of Contract	576
(b)	Negligence	578
(c)	Expert Evidence	579
3.	Direct Liability—Specific Duties	579

(a)	Personnel	579
(i)	Selection	579
(ii)	Instruction and Supervision	581
(b)	Organization	582
(i)	The Emergency Department	583
(ii)	The Recovery Room	585
(iii)	Handling of Drugs	586
(iv)	Communication of Infection	587
(v)	Patient Surveillance and Protection	587
A.	Self-Harm	587
B.	Harm to Others	591
C.	Harm by Others	592
(vi)	Co-ordination and Communication of Test Results	592
(c)	Facilities and Equipment	593
(d)	Statutory Standards	595
4.	Vicarious Liability	596
(a)	Introduction	596
(b)	Doctors	599
(c)	Nurses	610
(i)	Extent of the Hospital's Vicarious Liability	610
(ii)	General Principles of Nurses' Liability	612
(iii)	Specific Examples	617
A.	Obstetrics	617
B.	Post-Operative and Emergency Room Care	620
C.	Administration of Medication and Other Procedures	622
(d)	Other Employees	622
(e)	Volunteers	623
5.	Conclusion	623
	Chapter 12 Medical Records	625
1.	Importance	625
(a)	As an Adjunct to Medical Care	625
(b)	As Legal Documents	627
2.	Contents	632
(a)	Hospital Records	632
(b)	Office Records	633
(c)	Electronic Health Records	634
3.	Patient's Right of Access	635

(a)	The Right	635
(b)	The Remedy	638
4.	Use in Legal Proceedings	639
(a)	Admissibility	639
(b)	Obligation to Produce	640
(c)	Privilege	642
(i)	Litigation Privilege	642
(ii)	The Wigmore Criteria	643
(iii)	Incident Reports	645
(iv)	Disciplinary Proceedings	648
(v)	Statutory Privilege	649
5.	Conclusion	652
<i>Chapter 13 The Future</i>		653
1.	A Malpractice “Crisis” in Canada?	653
(a)	Importance of a Canadian Perspective	653
(b)	Current Statistics	655
(i)	Claim Frequency	655
(ii)	Claim Severity	658
(iii)	CMPA Membership Fees	659
(iv)	Conclusion	661
(c)	Impact on Medical Practice	661
(d)	Uncompensated Patients	662
2.	Is There a Better System?	666
(a)	Introduction	666
(b)	Is It Time to Re-Examine No-Fault Compensation?	667
<i>Index</i>		671