

# Contents

<i>Preface</i> .....	v
<i>Table of Cases</i> .....	xvii
<b>Chapter 1 The Doctor-Patient Relationship</b> .....	1
1. Nature of the Relationship .....	1
(a) Historical Development .....	1
(b) Fiduciary Nature of the Relationship .....	5
(c) Creation of the Relationship .....	8
(d) Duty to Provide Emergency Services .....	10
(e) Patients Examined at the Request of a Third Party .....	13
2. Communications Between Doctor and Patient ...	18
(a) Basis for Confidentiality .....	18
(b) Disclosure Inside a Court of Law .....	21
(c) Disclosure Outside a Court of Law .....	29
(i) Permissive and Mandatory Exceptions ..	29
(ii) By Consent of the Patient .....	29
A. Express .....	29
B. Implied .....	31
(iii) By Statute .....	35
(iv) In the Public Interest .....	40
(d) Action for Breach of Confidence and Invasion of Privacy .....	47
<b>Chapter 2 Consent</b> .....	51
1. Introduction .....	51
2. The Right to Refuse Treatment .....	53
3. Forms of Consent .....	59
(a) Express Consent .....	59
(b) Implied Consent .....	60
4. Withdrawing Consent .....	64
5. Exceptions to the Requirement of Consent .....	66
(a) Legislation .....	66
(i) Public Health Legislation .....	66
(ii) Mental Health Legislation .....	67
(iii) Codifying Legislation .....	67

(b)	Emergencies . . . . .	68
6.	Elements of Consent . . . . .	74
(a)	Consent Must Be Given Voluntarily. . . . .	74
(i)	Coercion and Undue Influence. . . . .	74
(ii)	Misrepresentation . . . . .	78
(b)	Patient Must Have Capacity . . . . .	81
(i)	Adults with a Disability. . . . .	82
A.	Assessing Capacity . . . . .	82
B.	Substitute Consent at Common Law . . . . .	88
C.	Substitute Consent Legislation . . . . .	89
D.	Proxy Appointments and Advance Directives . . . . .	90
E.	The Standard for Substitute Decision-Making . . . . .	92
F.	Withdrawal of Life-Sustaining Treatment . . . . .	94
G.	Artificial Nutrition and Hydration . . . . .	96
H.	Summary: The Doctor's Responsibility . . . . .	97
(ii)	Children . . . . .	100
A.	Assessing Capacity . . . . .	100
B.	Overriding the Refusal of a Mature Minor . . . . .	104
C.	Parental Consent . . . . .	107
D.	Parental Refusal . . . . .	110
(c)	Consent Must Be Referable to Both the Treatment and the Person Who Is to Administer It. . . . .	114
(i)	The Treatment . . . . .	114
(ii)	The Person Administering the Treatment . . . . .	119
(d)	Patient Must Be Informed . . . . .	121
7.	Special Treatment . . . . .	123
(a)	Research . . . . .	123
(i)	Definition of "Research". . . . .	124
(ii)	Voluntary Consent . . . . .	126
(iii)	Risk/Benefit Ratio . . . . .	127
(iv)	Children. . . . .	128
(v)	Adults with a Disability . . . . .	130
(vi)	Fetal Tissue and Embryo Research . . . . .	131
(b)	Transplantation . . . . .	133
(i)	<i>Inter Vivos</i> . . . . .	133
(ii)	<i>Post Mortem</i> . . . . .	137
(c)	Sterilization. . . . .	141

(d)	Medically Assisted Death . . . . .	146
(e)	Other Medical Procedures . . . . .	150
8.	The Remedy of Battery . . . . .	151
<i>Chapter 3</i>	<b>Informed Consent: The Doctor's Duty of Disclosure</b>	153
1.	Introduction . . . . .	154
(a)	Terminology . . . . .	154
(b)	Importance of Informed Consent . . . . .	155
(c)	Source of the Duty of Disclosure . . . . .	157
2.	Remedy—Battery or Negligence? . . . . .	158
3.	Standard of Disclosure . . . . .	161
(a)	The Law Prior to <i>Hopp</i> and <i>Reibl</i> . . . . .	161
(b)	The Supreme Court Rulings . . . . .	162
(i)	<i>Hopp v. Lepp</i> . . . . .	162
(ii)	<i>Reibl v. Hughes</i> . . . . .	163
(c)	The Meaning of “Material, Special or Unusual Risk” . . . . .	166
(i)	Examples of Material Risks . . . . .	167
(ii)	Examples of Non-Material Risks . . . . .	174
(iii)	Common Risks . . . . .	178
(iv)	Elective Procedures . . . . .	179
(v)	Risk of Follow-up Treatment . . . . .	181
(vi)	Terminology: Material, Special or Unusual . . . . .	182
(vii)	Appellate Review . . . . .	183
(d)	The Likelihood and Consequences of the Risk . . . . .	184
4.	Specific Issues Relating to Disclosure . . . . .	186
(a)	Other Material Information . . . . .	186
(i)	Diagnosis and Prognosis . . . . .	186
(ii)	Alternative Treatment . . . . .	188
(iii)	Alternative Facilities . . . . .	193
(iv)	Cost Containment Policies . . . . .	194
(v)	Conflict of Interest . . . . .	195
(vi)	Personal Information About the Doctor . . . . .	197
(b)	Patient's Comprehension . . . . .	201
(c)	Specific Questions . . . . .	206
(d)	Risks Not Known to the Doctor . . . . .	208
(e)	Patient's Special Circumstances . . . . .	210
(f)	The Duty of Disclosure: Whose Duty? . . . . .	212

(g)	Therapeutic Privilege . . . . .	217
(h)	Waiver . . . . .	219
(i)	Research and Experimentation . . . . .	219
(j)	Continuing Duty . . . . .	222
(k)	Duty to Third Parties . . . . .	226
(l)	Informed Refusal . . . . .	227
(m)	Proof of Disclosure . . . . .	229
(n)	Children . . . . .	232
(o)	Emergencies . . . . .	232
5.	Causation . . . . .	232
(a)	The Modified Objective Test . . . . .	232
(i)	How Subjective? . . . . .	234
(ii)	The Patient's Own Evidence . . . . .	238
(b)	Application of the Test . . . . .	239
(i)	Overall Trends . . . . .	239
(ii)	Alternative Treatment . . . . .	240
(iii)	Relevant Factors . . . . .	242
(c)	Cases Where the Test Does Not Apply . . . . .	248
(d)	Criticism of the Modified Objective Test . . . . .	250
(e)	Postponing the Treatment . . . . .	253
6.	Duty to Disclose Medical Error . . . . .	256
7.	Conclusion . . . . .	264
 <i>Chapter 4 Negligence—General Principles</i> . . . . .		267
1.	Introduction—The Basics of Negligence . . . . .	268
2.	Duty of Care . . . . .	269
(a)	Duty to Patients . . . . .	269
(b)	Duty to the Fetus . . . . .	274
(c)	Emergency Care . . . . .	276
(i)	Duty to Provide Care . . . . .	276
(ii)	Good Samaritan Legislation . . . . .	276
(d)	Patients Examined at the Request of Third Parties . . . . .	279
(e)	Duty to Third Parties . . . . .	279
(i)	Duty to Warn . . . . .	279
(ii)	Duty to Supervise Dangerous Patient . . . . .	280
(iii)	Other Situations of Liability . . . . .	281
(f)	Duty Owed by Government and Regulatory Bodies . . . . .	284
3.	Standard of Care—General Principles . . . . .	286
(a)	Introduction . . . . .	286

(b)	Nature and Character of the Standard of Care . . . . .	288
(i)	Qualifications of the Doctor . . . . .	289
A.	General Practitioners and Specialists . . . . .	289
B.	Residents and Students. . . . .	294
C.	Non-Doctors . . . . .	300
(ii)	Degree of Risk Involved . . . . .	301
(iii)	The Danger of Hindsight. . . . .	305
(iv)	Resources . . . . .	306
A.	Facilities . . . . .	307
B.	Innovations in Equipment. . . . .	309
C.	Locality Rule . . . . .	314
D.	Cost Containment Policies . . . . .	319
(c)	Approved Practice and Error of Judgment . . . . .	323
(d)	Appellate Review . . . . .	323
4.	Injury . . . . .	325
(a)	An Essential . . . . .	325
(b)	Wrongful Birth . . . . .	328
(i)	The Factual Context. . . . .	328
(ii)	Cost of Raising the Child . . . . .	330
(iii)	Disabled Children . . . . .	334
(iv)	Mitigation . . . . .	335
(v)	Conclusion . . . . .	336
(c)	Wrongful Life. . . . .	336
5.	Causation . . . . .	339
(a)	The “But For” Test. . . . .	339
(b)	Exceptions to the “But For” Test. . . . .	342
(c)	<i>Snell v. Farrell</i> . . . . .	346
(i)	Introduction . . . . .	346
(ii)	Probability not Certainty, and the “Robust and Pragmatic” Approach. . . . .	348
(iii)	The Aftermath of <i>Snell v. Farrell</i> . . . . .	349
(d)	Deciding Causation Before Standard of Care . . . . .	353
(e)	Multiple Causes: <i>Athey v. Leonati</i> . . . . .	356
(f)	Loss of a Chance . . . . .	359
(g)	Proximate Cause (Remoteness). . . . .	362
6.	Conclusion . . . . .	368
	<b>Chapter 5 Negligence—Specific Duties and Attendant Standards of Care . . . . .</b>	<b>371</b>
1.	Introduction. . . . .	372

2.	The Duty to Attend . . . . .	372
3.	The Duty to Diagnose . . . . .	377
	(a) General Principles . . . . .	377
	(b) Duty to Reconsider the Diagnosis . . . . .	387
	(c) Specialists . . . . .	391
4.	The Duty to Refer . . . . .	393
	(a) When to Refer . . . . .	394
	(b) Where to Refer . . . . .	401
	(c) What to Refer . . . . .	402
	(d) After Referral . . . . .	405
	(e) Referral (Consultation) as a Defence . . . . .	405
5.	The Duty to Treat . . . . .	406
	(a) Quality of Care . . . . .	406
	(b) Surgery . . . . .	407
	(i) Wrong Operation . . . . .	407
	(ii) Inappropriate Surgery . . . . .	407
	(iii) Injury During Operation . . . . .	409
	(iv) Objects Left Inside the Body . . . . .	415
	(v) Post-Operative Care . . . . .	417
	(c) Anaesthesiology . . . . .	419
	(d) Obstetrics . . . . .	422
	(i) Urgency . . . . .	423
	(ii) Anticipation . . . . .	426
	(iii) Communication . . . . .	427
	(e) Drugs and Injections . . . . .	428
	(i) Adverse Reactions . . . . .	428
	(ii) Inappropriate Drug . . . . .	431
	(iii) Errors in Administration . . . . .	434
	(iv) Injections . . . . .	435
	(f) Casts . . . . .	436
	(g) Futile or Inappropriate Treatment . . . . .	439
	(h) Communication Among Members of the Treatment Team . . . . .	441
6.	The Duty to Instruct the Patient . . . . .	442
7.	Conclusion . . . . .	447
	<b>Chapter 6 Defences to an Action in Negligence . . . . .</b>	<b>449</b>
	1. Introduction . . . . .	449
	2. Approved Practice . . . . .	451
	(a) The <i>Korn</i> Decision . . . . .	451
	(b) Effect of <i>Korn</i> . . . . .	453

(c)	Meaning of “Approved Practice” . . . . .	457
(i)	Relevant Date . . . . .	457
(ii)	Proof . . . . .	459
(iii)	“Respectable Minority” Principle . . . . .	460
(d)	Departure from Approved Practice . . . . .	462
3.	Error of Judgment . . . . .	463
4.	Contributory Negligence of the Patient . . . . .	467
(a)	Effect of Contributory Negligence . . . . .	467
(b)	Examples of Contributory Negligence . . . . .	468
(c)	Duty to Mitigate Loss . . . . .	476
(d)	Joint and Several Liability . . . . .	476
5.	Expiry of the Limitation Period . . . . .	477
(a)	Rationale for the Defence . . . . .	477
(b)	Length of the Limitation Period . . . . .	478
(c)	Termination of Professional Services . . . . .	479
(d)	Discoverability Rule . . . . .	483
(e)	Sexual Assault . . . . .	486
(f)	Fraudulent Concealment . . . . .	487
6.	Waiver of Liability . . . . .	489
<b>Chapter 7 Proof of Negligence . . . . .</b>		<b>493</b>
1.	Introduction . . . . .	493
2.	Evidence . . . . .	494
(a)	Witnesses . . . . .	494
(i)	The Role of the Expert Witness . . . . .	494
(ii)	The Necessity of Expert Evidence . . . . .	502
(b)	Documents . . . . .	507
(c)	Admissions . . . . .	509
(d)	Conclusion . . . . .	509
3.	Difficulties of Proof . . . . .	510
(a)	Direct and Circumstantial Evidence . . . . .	510
(b)	<i>Res Ipsa Loquitur</i> . . . . .	512
(c)	Obtaining Expert Witnesses . . . . .	517
(i)	A “Conspiracy of Silence”? . . . . .	517
(ii)	Preparing the Expert Witness . . . . .	521
(d)	The Jury . . . . .	522
<b>Chapter 8 The Doctor in Court . . . . .</b>		<b>527</b>
1.	Introduction . . . . .	527
2.	As Witness . . . . .	529
(a)	Interviews . . . . .	529

(b)	Qualifications . . . . .	530
(c)	Giving Evidence . . . . .	530
(i)	Nature of the Evidence . . . . .	530
(ii)	Examination-in-chief . . . . .	531
(iii)	Cross-examination . . . . .	532
(d)	The Medical-Legal Report . . . . .	533
3.	As Defendant . . . . .	536
(a)	Advice and Co-operation . . . . .	536
(b)	Giving Evidence . . . . .	538
(c)	Costs . . . . .	538
<b>Chapter 9 Other Civil and Criminal Liability . . . . .</b>		<b>543</b>
1.	Introduction . . . . .	543
2.	False Imprisonment . . . . .	543
3.	Contract . . . . .	546
(a)	Elements of a Contract Action . . . . .	546
(b)	Guarantee of Outcome . . . . .	548
(c)	Advantages of a Contract Action . . . . .	550
(d)	Medical Products . . . . .	552
4.	Defamation . . . . .	554
5.	Criminal Liability . . . . .	559
<b>Chapter 10 The Doctor's Liability for the Acts of Others . . . . .</b>		<b>563</b>
1.	General Principles of Vicarious Liability . . . . .	563
2.	Relationships with Others and Vicarious Liability . . . . .	566
(a)	Office Staff . . . . .	567
(b)	Nurses . . . . .	567
(c)	Other Health Care Professionals . . . . .	569
(d)	Other Doctors . . . . .	570
3.	Partnerships . . . . .	573
4.	Direct Liability . . . . .	574
<b>Chapter 11 The Hospital . . . . .</b>		<b>575</b>
1.	Liability in General . . . . .	575
2.	Direct Liability—General Principles . . . . .	576
(a)	Breach of Contract . . . . .	576
(b)	Negligence . . . . .	578
(c)	Expert Evidence . . . . .	579
3.	Direct Liability—Specific Duties . . . . .	579



(a)	Personnel . . . . .	579
(i)	Selection . . . . .	579
(ii)	Instruction and Supervision . . . . .	581
(b)	Organization . . . . .	582
(i)	The Emergency Department . . . . .	583
(ii)	The Recovery Room . . . . .	585
(iii)	Handling of Drugs . . . . .	586
(iv)	Communication of Infection . . . . .	587
(v)	Patient Surveillance and Protection . . . . .	587
A.	Self-Harm . . . . .	587
B.	Harm to Others . . . . .	591
C.	Harm by Others . . . . .	592
(vi)	Co-ordination and Communication of Test Results . . . . .	592
(c)	Facilities and Equipment . . . . .	593
(d)	Statutory Standards . . . . .	595
4.	Vicarious Liability . . . . .	596
(a)	Introduction . . . . .	596
(b)	Doctors . . . . .	599
(c)	Nurses . . . . .	610
(i)	Extent of the Hospital's Vicarious Liability . . . . .	610
(ii)	General Principles of Nurses' Liability . . . . .	612
(iii)	Specific Examples . . . . .	617
A.	Obstetrics . . . . .	617
B.	Post-Operative and Emergency Room Care . . . . .	620
C.	Administration of Medication and Other Procedures . . . . .	622
(d)	Other Employees . . . . .	622
(e)	Volunteers . . . . .	623
5.	Conclusion . . . . .	623
	<b>Chapter 12 Medical Records . . . . .</b>	<b>625</b>
1.	Importance . . . . .	625
(a)	As an Adjunct to Medical Care . . . . .	625
(b)	As Legal Documents . . . . .	627
2.	Contents . . . . .	632
(a)	Hospital Records . . . . .	632
(b)	Office Records . . . . .	633
(c)	Electronic Health Records . . . . .	634
3.	Patient's Right of Access . . . . .	635

(a)	The Right . . . . .	635
(b)	The Remedy . . . . .	638
4.	Use in Legal Proceedings . . . . .	639
(a)	Admissibility . . . . .	639
(b)	Obligation to Produce . . . . .	640
(c)	Privilege . . . . .	642
(i)	Litigation Privilege . . . . .	642
(ii)	The Wigmore Criteria . . . . .	643
(iii)	Incident Reports . . . . .	645
(iv)	Disciplinary Proceedings . . . . .	648
(v)	Statutory Privilege . . . . .	649
5.	Conclusion . . . . .	652
<i>Chapter 13 The Future</i> . . . . .		653
1.	A Malpractice “Crisis” in Canada? . . . . .	653
(a)	Importance of a Canadian Perspective . . . . .	653
(b)	Current Statistics . . . . .	655
(i)	Claim Frequency . . . . .	655
(ii)	Claim Severity . . . . .	658
(iii)	CMPA Membership Fees . . . . .	659
(iv)	Conclusion . . . . .	661
(c)	Impact on Medical Practice . . . . .	661
(d)	Uncompensated Patients . . . . .	662
2.	Is There a Better System? . . . . .	666
(a)	Introduction . . . . .	666
(b)	Is It Time to Re-Examine No-Fault Compensation? . . . . .	667
<i>Index</i> . . . . .		671