

Contents

Introduction	1
Paul Daly: Why is Standard of Review so Addictive?	1
Postscript	4
The Hon. Justice David Stratas: A Decade of <i>Dunsmuir</i> : Please No More	7
Introduction	7
<i>Dunsmuir</i> and the law of substantive review	8
The nature of administrative law as the cause for confusion?.....	8
The real cause of the confusion	8
Doctrine and principle: why they matter.....	9
In the law of substantive review, is doctrinal decision-making possible? ...	10
What <i>Dunsmuir</i> has wrought	10
Other post- <i>Dunsmuir</i> cases	12
Conclusion concerning the post- <i>Dunsmuir</i> cases.....	16
What of <i>Dunsmuir</i> ?	16
The Background to <i>Dunsmuir</i>/Le contexte de <i>Dunsmuir</i>	19
Martine Valois: Si l'histoire de la norme m'était contée: évolution et circonvolutions du principe de déférence au Canada	19
I. Compétence et légalité.....	20
II. Caractère raisonnable et retenue judiciaire.....	24
III. Norme de contrôle et limites du contrôle judiciaire.....	27
Clarence Bennett: David <i>Dunsmuir</i> — An Unlikely Administrative Law Celebrity	31
Standard of Review.....	32
Standard of Review as an Avenue to Appeal.....	32
Conclusion	34
<i>Dunsmuir</i> and Public Employment/<i>Dunsmuir</i> et la fonction publique	35
Matthew Lewans: On the Privilege of Public Employment.....	35
Nicolas Lambert: <i>Dunsmuir v. New Brunswick</i> — the Savviness of Standards of Review	39
The Philosophy of <i>Dunsmuir</i>/La philosophie de <i>Dunsmuir</i>	43
Mark D. Walters: Theorizing Administrative Law — Does <i>Dunsmuir</i> have a Philosophy?	43
Mary Liston: Deference as respect: Lost in translation?	47
The road to hell is paved with . . . pre- <i>Southam</i> formalism	48
What deference as respect meant in its original context	49
[Lack of] attention to the [non-]reasons that were [not] offered.....	50
Democratic deference as respect	52
Deference is dead, long live deference!.....	53
Andrew Green: The Search for a Simpler Test: <i>Dunsmuir</i> and Categories....	55

Léonid Sirota: The Paradox of Simplicity in Canadian Administrative Law	59
Evan Fox-Decent & Alexander Pless: <i>Dunsmuir</i> and Jurisdiction	65
Sheila Wildeman: The road to <i>Dunsmuir</i> or, on re-reading administrative law's bumpy kinky chain novel in the fading light of "a culture of justification"	69
The Background to <i>Dunsmuir</i> II	71
Fast Forward	75
Toward a Counter-Hegemonic Culture of Justification	77
Conclusion: Foregrounding the Background	81
Correctness Review/La norme de la décision correcte	83
Mark Mancini: The Dark Art of Deference: Dubious Assumptions of Expertise On Home Statute Interpretation	83
Lauren Wihak: The Withering of Correctness Review	89
Shaun Fluker: The Return of Correctness in Judicial Review	95
Martin Olszynski: <i>Dunsmuir</i> is Dead — Long Live <i>Dunsmuir</i>!	
An Argument for a Presumption of Correctness	99
What has <i>Dunsmuir</i> Wrought?	99
<i>Garneau</i> : "The day has [still] not yet come"	101
Re-building <i>Dunsmuir</i>	102
Reasonableness Review/La norme de la décision raisonnable	107
David Mullan: The True Legacy of <i>Dunsmuir</i> — Disguised Correctness Review?	107
The Hon. Joseph T. Robertson, Q.C.: "<i>Dunsmuir's</i> Demise & The Rise of Disguised Correctness Review"	111
Eddie Clark: <i>Dunsmuir</i> and the hows and whys of judicial review	119
<i>Dunsmuir</i> and Fairness/<i>Dunsmuir</i> et l'équité procédurale	123
Laverne Jacobs: Transparency and Institutional Bias in Canadian Administrative Law: Why the <i>Dunsmuirian</i> Approach is Not Enough	123
(a) The value of transparency within modern government accountability	123
(b) <i>Dunsmuir</i> and procedural fairness generally	124
(c) Institutional Bias as an Issue of Procedural Fairness	125
(d) Transparency: Tempering <i>Dunsmuir's</i> Effect	126
<i>Dunsmuir</i> and the Constitution/<i>Dunsmuir</i> et la constitution	129
Audrey Macklin: Charter Rights and Charter-Lite	129
Introduction	129
(a) What is a <i>Charter</i> Value?	133
(b) Normative Primacy and Priority	134
(c) Democratic Legitimacy vs. Independence	137
Conclusion	138

Kate Glover: <i>Dunsmuir</i> & the Constitutional Status of the Administrative State	141
Indigenous Peoples and Dunsmuir/Les peuples autochtones et Dunsmuir.....	147
Janna Promislow: Deference with a Difference: <i>Dunsmuir</i> and Aboriginal Rights	147
Naiomi Metallic: Deference and Legal Frameworks Not Designed By, For or With Us	153
Teaching Dunsmuir/Enseigner Dunsmuir	159
Craig Forcese: Through a glass, darkly — Teaching Canada’s administrative law standard of review	159
Narelle Bedford: Transcending Jurisdictions — Teaching <i>Dunsmuir</i> in Australia	163
<i>Dunsmuir</i> — the Australian context.....	163
Observation One — Identify the universals.....	164
Observation Two — Embrace technology.....	165
Conclusion	166
Judicial Perspectives/Regards de la magistrature	167
The Hon. Joseph T. Robertson, Q.C.: “The Merits of <i>Dunsmuir</i> : Rightly or Wrongly Decided (Then & Today)?”	167
Hon. John M. Evans: Reflections on <i>Dunsmuir</i> of a Recovering Judge.....	175
Introduction	175
<i>Dunsmuir</i> as judicial law reform	175
A single reasonableness standard.....	176
Reasonableness review: reasons and outcome	178
Selecting the standard of review: correctness or reasonableness?	181
Non-adjudicative decision makers	184
Comparative Perspectives/Regards comparatifs.....	187
Janina Boughey: <i>Dunsmuir</i> ’s Influence in Australia.....	187
Dean R. Knight: Locating <i>Dunsmuir</i> ’s Meta-structure Within Anglo-Commonwealth Traditions	191
Jeff Pojanowski: <i>Dunsmuir</i> : A View from South of the Border.....	197
The Application of Dunsmuir/L’application de Dunsmuir	201
Robert Danay: Did <i>Dunsmuir</i> simplify the Standard of Review? An Empirical Assessment	201
Methodology.....	202
Results: No Apparent Reduction in Legal Argument on Standard of Review	202
Conclusion: Vindication for Madam Justice Abella?.....	204
William Lahey and Diana Ginn: How the Lower Courts are “doing <i>Dunsmuir</i> ”	205

Gerald Heckman: The Supreme Court and questions of law in immigration and refugee law decision-making.....	209
Rebutting the <i>Dunsmuir</i> presumption of reasonableness review:	
general questions of law of central importance to the legal system	
and outside the adjudicator’s expertise	211
The role of the certified question in the choice of standard of review ...	215
Does the choice of standard of review make any difference?.....	215
Alice Woolley: Stranger Things — A defence of <i>Dunsmuir</i>	217
Moving on from <i>Dunsmuir</i>/Faut-il passer à autre chose?	225
Lorne Sossin: <i>Dunsmuir</i> — Plus ça change Redux	225
Peter Gall: <i>Dunsmuir</i> : Reasonableness and the Rule of Law.....	229
The Hon. Justice David Stratas: Looking Past <i>Dunsmuir</i> :	
Beginning Afresh	235
Introduction	235
Identification of settled doctrine and well-accepted principles	235
Some doctrine and well-accepted principles	235
Deducing operational rules from the doctrine and principles:	
an introduction.....	237
Judicial policies	239
Some possible deductions	240
A few words about a longstanding, uniquely Canadian predilection	242
Some suggested operational rules	243
Personal comments.....	247
Summary/Résumé.....	249
Michel Bastarache, QC, CC: <i>Dunsmuir</i> 10 Years Later	249
Institutional Constraints.....	249
Our Objective in <i>Dunsmuir</i>	251
Post- <i>Dunsmuir</i>	253
Louis LeBel: L’ordre et le rêve — Le contrôle judiciaire après <i>Dunsmuir</i> ...	257