

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Dedication</i>	iii
<i>About the Authors</i>	v
<i>Foreword</i>	vii
<i>Foreword to the First Edition</i>	ix
<i>Preface</i>	xiii
1	WHAT IS A WORKPLACE INVESTIGATION AND WHY CONDUCT ONE?
	1
	What is an Investigation?.....
	2
	Why are Investigations Useful and Important?.....
	4
	When Should an Investigation be Done?.....
	14
	Evaluating the Threshold Question
	17
	1. Misconduct and Just Cause — Key Concepts.....
	17
	2. Human Rights — Key Concepts
	19
	(a) Discrimination
	20
	(b) Harassment
	23
	(c) Sexual Harassment
	26
	3. Non-Human-Rights-Related Misconduct — Key Concepts
	29
	4. Workplace Violence
	41
	5. Poisoned Work Environment.....
	43
	What is the Workplace?
	44
	“Hot Potatoes”
	45
	The Foundation of a Solid Investigation — The “Four Pillars”
	47
	1. Fairness.....
	48
	2. Thoroughness
	48
	3. Timeliness
	49
	4. Confidentiality.....
	49
	The Role of the Investigator.....
	50
	The Investigation Standard.....
	51
2	CHOOSING YOUR PROCESS
	55
	The Traditional Workplace Investigation Model.....
	56

HUMAN RESOURCES GUIDE TO WORKPLACE INVESTIGATIONS

1. Establish the Mandate.....	56
2. Select the Investigator.....	57
3. Advise the Parties about the Process	57
4. Interview the Complainant.....	58
5. Share the Allegations with the Respondent.....	59
6. Interview the Respondent.....	60
7. Interview the Witnesses, if Any	61
8. Review with the Parties any Contradictory Evidence Collected.....	61
9. Analyze the Evidence, Make Decisions and Prepare a Report.....	61
10. Share Findings with the Parties	62
Ways in Which an Investigation Can Deviate from the Traditional Model.....	63
1. The Anonymous Complaint (i.e., when the identity of one or both of the parties is unknown).....	63
2. The Counter-Complaint	65
3. Multi-Party Complaints.....	67
(a) Multiple Respondents	68
(b) Multiple Complainants	69
4. Parties and Witnesses Outside of the Organization	71
(a) Parties Outside of the Organization.....	71
(b) Witnesses Outside of the Organization.....	74
Processes to Consider when a Traditional Workplace Investigation Might Not be Appropriate.....	74
1. Informal Processes	74
(a) Complainant's Personality	78
(b) Respondent's Personality.....	78
(c) Basic Agreement on the Facts.....	78
(d) One or Two Incidents.....	79
(e) Mitigating Circumstances	80
(f) Positive Pre-existing Relationship between the Parties	80
(g) Only Two Parties.....	80
2. Where an Informal Approach May Not be Appropriate	81
(a) Serious Allegations.....	81
(b) Allegations Involving Abuse of Power	81
(c) The Inarticulate Complainant	82
(d) Individuals with "High Process Needs"	82
(e) A Nonchalant Respondent.....	82
(f) Problematic Dynamic between the Parties.....	83
(g) A Recurring Problem.....	84

TABLE OF CONTENTS

(h) Allegations Against Very Senior Members of the Organization or Individuals with High Public Profiles	84
3. A Strong Caution on the Use of an Informal Process	85
4. Mediation	88
5. Assessments / Reviews.....	89
3 INVESTIGATION “TRIAGE”	95
Choosing the Investigator: Internal vs. External.....	96
1. Making the Decision.....	98
(a) Serious Allegations.....	98
(b) Obvious Complexities to the Process.....	98
(c) The “Eeww” Factor	99
(d) High Profile Person.....	100
(e) Too Close for Comfort.....	100
(f) Inexperienced and Untrained Investigators.....	100
(g) High Likelihood of Legal Challenge	102
(h) Other Demands on the Internal Investigator’s Time.....	102
2. Hiring an External Investigator — Questions to be Asked	103
(a) How many and what types of cases have you worked on in the past?	104
(b) How do you charge for your work on an investigation?	105
(c) Can you describe your process for me?.....	106
(d) Do you have any specialized training and if so what is it?.....	107
(e) How do you make decisions when you have two competing sides of the story?.....	107
(f) Have you ever been unable to make a decision in an investigation?.....	108
(g) Can you provide a sample report so we can have a sense of what the deliverable will be at the end of the process?.....	108
(h) Can you provide references?.....	109
Interim Measures	110
Timing Issues.....	113
Communication Issues.....	116
1. Communication with People who “Need to Know”..	116
2. Communication with the Parties	118
3. Specific Communication with the Respondent.....	123

HUMAN RESOURCES GUIDE TO WORKPLACE INVESTIGATIONS

Public Relations / Media Strategy.....128
Specialized Support.....128
Health and Safety130
How Much Will the Investigation Cost?.....132
Employee Support.....133
Checklist136

4 SETTING UP THE PROCESS.....145
W5-H145
“Why” are We Proceeding?.....146
“What” is the Investigator Going to be Doing?
(Determination of Mandate).....146
1. Findings of Fact.....150
2. Findings of Fact plus Drawing Conclusions
About the Facts151
(a) Determination of Breach of a Policy151
(b) Determination of Breach of a Statute152
(c) Other Legal Problems or Issues153
3. Recommendations.....154
4. Legal Opinion.....156
“Who” Will be Involved in the Investigation?156
1. Who Will Conduct the Investigation?158
(a) Fees.....159
(b) Mandate159
(c) Privilege.....160
(d) Logistics163
(e) Form of Reporting.....163
2. Who Will the Investigator Interview?164
(a) The Complainant is No Longer Employed167
(b) The Respondent is No Longer Employed.....169
(c) The Respondent has been Charged with a
Crime.....171
(d) A Witness is No Longer Employed or is
Not an Employee172
3. Who Will be Present at the Interviews?174
(a) Legal Counsel175
(b) Union Representative.....179
(c) Friend, Family Member or Other Support
Person.....181
4. Who Will Inform the Respondent of the
Allegations?183
“When” Should the Investigation be Conducted?.....185
1. Finding a Suitable External Investigator186

TABLE OF CONTENTS

2.	A Party Wishes to Retain Counsel.....	187
3.	The Complainant is on a Leave of Absence.....	188
	“Where” Should the Investigation be Conducted?.....	189
	“How” Will the Interviews be Conducted?.....	191
1.	Methods of Collecting Evidence from Individuals in an Investigation	191
	(a) In-Person Interview	192
	(b) Video Interviews (such as “Skype” or “Facetime”)	192
	(c) Telephone Interviews	192
	(d) Written Questions or E-mail Interviews	193
2.	Setting Up In-Person Interviews.....	193
3.	Method of Collection of Verbal Evidence from an Interviewee	195
	(a) Taking Notes, Either Handwritten or on a Computer/Laptop/Tablet or Similar Device.....	196
	(b) Recording Device	199
	(c) Transcription	201
4.	Use of Signed Statements.....	202
	Checklist	206
5	COLLECTION OF EVIDENCE	221
	Party Interviews	222
	1. Tone of the Interviews — “Warmly Neutral”	224
	2. Structure of the Interview	227
	(a) Preamble	228
	(i) Explanation of Role of the Investigator	228
	(ii) Explanation of Mandate	228
	(iii) Confidentiality Caution	229
	(iv) Discussion of Reprisal Protection	234
	(v) Discussion of Support	235
	(vi) Attendance of a Representative	236
	(vii) Preamble	237
	(b) Fact-Gathering	239
	(i) The Open-Ended Question Opener	239
	(ii) The Drill-Down.....	242
	(iii) Other Information to be Gathered	244
	(A) Relevant Witness Information	244
	(B) Other Physical or Documentary Evidence.....	246
	(C) Reason for Bringing the Complaint	247
	(c) Conclusion/Wrap-up	248

HUMAN RESOURCES GUIDE TO WORKPLACE INVESTIGATIONS

- 3. Key Differences with Respondent Interviews249
 - (a) Ensuring the Respondent has Received Notice of all of the Allegations249
 - (b) Ensuring the Respondent has Provided a Response to Each of the Allegations.....250
 - (c) When the Respondent Admits the Allegations251
 - (d) Other Information Offered Up by the Respondent252
- 4. Avoiding Use of Leading Questions.....254
- Witness Interviews256
 - 1. Structure of the Interviews259
 - (a) Preamble259
 - (i) Explanation of Role of the Investigator259
 - (ii) Confidentiality Caution260
 - (iii) Discussion of Reprisal Protection261
 - (iv) Attendance of a Representative262
 - (v) Reporting.....262
 - (b) Fact-Gathering262
 - (i) Standard Opener263
 - (ii) Bull’s-Eye Questioning.....264
 - (c) Conclusion/Wrap-Up270
- Follow-Up Interviews273
 - 1. Follow-Up with the Parties.....273
 - 2. Follow-Up with a Witness276
- Other Evidence277
- Checklist279
- 6 FACT-FINDING AND ANALYSIS297**
 - Fact-Finding298
 - 1. The Hierarchy of Evidence298
 - (a) Admissions.....298
 - (b) Partial Admissions and Quasi-Admissions.....299
 - (c) Corroborative Evidence300
 - (i) Evidence of “Eye-Witnesses” and “Ear-Witnesses”300
 - (ii) Documentary Evidence.....302
 - (iii) Physical Evidence.....303
 - (iv) Other Witnesses.....304
 - (v) Can you make a finding of fact absent corroboration?.....307
 - (d) Denials — Making Credibility Assessments308

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- (i) Consider Each Party’s Story as a Whole.....313
- (ii) Pay Particular Attention to How Each Party Answered (or Did not) the Questions Asked317
- (iii) Body Language and Demeanour319
- (iv) Unconscious Bias321
- (e) Other Types of Evidence322
 - (i) Hearsay322
 - (ii) Similar-Fact Evidence.....323
- 2. Standard of Proof in Workplace Investigations326
- 3. What if the Investigator Cannot Figure It Out?327
 - (a) Are You Just Uncomfortable Making the Decision?327
 - (b) Can More Information be Obtained?.....328
 - (c) Should a Second Opinion be Obtained?.....328
 - (d) Do You Need Some More Time?329
 - (e) If You Still Cannot Decide330
- Getting Organized.....331
- Analysis.....332
- Checklist337
- 7 REPORTING, AND WHAT HAPPENS AFTER THE INVESTIGATION349**
 - Before You get Started — Planning your Report.....349
 - 1. Will the Report be Verbal or Written?350
 - 2. Is There to be One Final Report or is an Interim One Needed?.....352
 - 3. When Should the Report be Written?.....353
 - 4. To Whom is the Report being Written?354
 - 5. Is the Report Intended to be Privileged?354
 - 6. Do the Parties get a Copy of the Report?356
 - 7. How Will the Report be Disseminated?.....356
 - Anatomy of a Report358
 - 1. Introduction or Background358
 - 2. Mandate.....359
 - 3. The Parties.....359
 - 4. The Process.....361
 - 5. Applicable Policy / Policies / Legal Provisions364
 - 6. The Evidence and Findings of Fact365
 - 7. Policy / Legal Analysis369
 - 8. Recommendations.....372
 - 9. “Other”373

HUMAN RESOURCES GUIDE TO WORKPLACE INVESTIGATIONS

10. Appendices	374
11. Do I Have to Write it This Way?.....	374
Top 10 Tips for Report-Writing.....	375
1. Always Assume that the Report is Being Written for a Third Party.....	375
2. Organize the Report for the Benefit of the Reader.....	376
3. Remember that Information about the Process is as Important as the Facts, the Findings and the Analysis.....	377
4. Double-Check that the Correct Process was Followed	378
5. Think Symmetrically.....	379
6. Clearly Tie the Finding of Fact to the Evidence.....	380
7. Use of Definitive Language	380
8. Use the Language of the Policy or the Law.....	380
9. Proofread, Proofread, and Proofread Again — and Then Ask a Colleague to Proofread	381
10. Give Yourself Sufficient Time and Space to Write the Report.....	382
The Report is Written — Now What?.....	383
1. The “Heart-to-Heart”	383
2. Coaching or Training	384
3. Apology	384
4. Workplace Conference.....	385
5. Mediation	385
6. Change of Position	386
7. Disciplinary Responses	387
(a) Warnings	387
(b) Suspensions.....	388
(c) Termination of Employment	389
(i) <i>Re Toronto Transit Commission and ATU, Local 113 (M. (E.))</i>	390
(ii) <i>Canada Post Corp. v. C.U.P.W.</i>	391
(iii) <i>Doucet v. Oromocto Auto Sales Ltd.</i>	391
Taking Steps as a Result of Unsubstantiated Complaints	391
Checklist	393
8 OVERCOMING COGNITIVE BIASES.....	401
Confirmation Bias.....	401
Primacy Effect.....	403
Defensive Attribution Bias.....	403
Courtesy Bias	405

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Affinity / Likeability Bias.....	406
	Empathy Gap.....	407
	The Illusory Truth Effect.....	408
	Information Bias.....	408
	Minimizing the Impact of Biases.....	410
9	15 WORKPLACE INVESTIGATION CASES YOU NEED TO KNOW ABOUT	411
	Appropriate Response.....	412
	1. <i>Boucher v. Wal-Mart Canada Corp.</i>	413
	2. <i>Re Calgary (City) and CUPE, Local 38 (P. (M.))</i>	414
	3. <i>Re Hinton Pulp & Hinton Wood Products and Unifor, Local 855 (Thompson)</i>	416
	4. <i>Pierro v. Hospital for Sick Children</i>	418
	Neutrality.....	420
	5. <i>Pate v. Galway-Cavendish & Harvey (Township)</i>	421
	6. <i>Greater Toronto Airports Authority v. P.S.A.C., Local 0004</i>	423
	7. <i>Disotell v. Kraft Canada Inc.</i>	425
	8. <i>Elgert v. Home Hardware Stores Ltd.</i>	427
	9. <i>Shoan v. Canada (Attorney General)</i>	428
	Fairness — Notice to the Respondent of the Allegations Against Him or Her.....	430
	10. <i>Marchand v. Regional Occupational Centre Society</i>	431
	11. <i>Stone v. SDS Kerr Beavers Dental</i>	433
	12. <i>Re Brampton (City) and Brampton Professional Firefighters Assn. (IAFF, Local 1068) (Hamilton)</i>	434
	Standard of Review.....	435
	13. <i>Chualo v. Toronto Police Services Board</i>	436
	14. <i>Morgan v. University of Waterloo</i>	438
	Uncovering Issues in Workplace Culture.....	440
	15. The External Review into Sexual Misconduct and Sexual Harassment in the Canadian Armed Forces.....	441
10	SELF-CARE FOR WORKPLACE INVESTIGATORS	445
	Work in a Team.....	446
	Talk it Through — Work it Out.....	447
	Sleep on It.....	447
	Increase Your Skill Set.....	448
	Other Diversions.....	448
	Do Not Work on the Weekends.....	449

HUMAN RESOURCES GUIDE TO WORKPLACE INVESTIGATIONS

Take Breaks in Between Investigations.....	449
Say No When You are at Your Limit	449
11 CONCLUDING THOUGHTS.....	451
Abusive Workplaces Lead to Suffering.....	452
Most Bad Behaviour Goes Underground.....	453
Not Everyone Knows How, or is Willing, to Behave Properly in the Workplace	457
Respectful and Civil Workplaces Do Not Just Happen.....	459
Accountability	461
Looking Back and Moving Forward	463
APPENDICES	
Appendix A — Workplace Investigation: Traditional Model.....	467
Appendix B — Determining When an Informal Process May be Appropriate	471
Appendix C — Complainant Investigation Letter	473
Appendix D — Respondent Investigation Letter.....	477
Appendix E — Witness Investigation Letter	481
Appendix F — Confidentiality Agreement.....	483
Appendix G — Complainant Reporting Letter Where Allegations are Substantiated.....	485
Appendix H — Complainant Reporting Letter Where Allegations are not Substantiated.....	487
Appendix I — Respondent Reporting Letter Where Allegations are Substantiated.....	489
Appendix J — Respondent Reporting Letter Where Allegations are not Substantiated.....	491
<i>Index</i>	493