

INDEX

ABUSIVE WORKPLACES, 452

ACCOUNTABILITY, 461

BEHAVIOUR. *See* GENERAL THOUGHTS

BIASES

affinity/likeability bias, 406

confirmation bias, 401

courtesy bias, 405

defensive attribution bias, 403

empathy gap, 407

generally, 401

illusory truth effect, 408

information bias, 408

minimizing impact of, 410

primacy effect, 403

BULL'S-EYE QUESTIONING, 264-270

CASE LAW

employer response, adequacy of, 412-420

Boucher v. Wal-Mart Canada Corp., 413

generally, 412

Pierro v. Hospital for Sick Children, 418-420

Re Calgary (City) and CUPE, Local 38 (P. (M.)), 414-416

HUMAN RESOURCES GUIDE TO WORKPLACE INVESTIGATIONS

CASE LAW — *Continued*

employer response — *Continued*

Re Hinton Pulp & Hinton Wood Products and Unifor, Local 855 (Thompson), 416-418

fairness, notice to respondent re allegations, 430-435

generally, 430

Marchand v. Regional Occupational Centre Society, 431

Re Brampton (City) and Brampton Professional Firefighters Assn. (IAFF, Local 1068 (Hamilton)), 434

Stone v. SDS Kerr Beavers Dental, 433

generally, 411

neutrality of investigator, 420-430

Disotell v. Kraft Canada Inc., 425-427

Elgert v. Home Hardware Stores Ltd., 427

generally, 420

Greater Toronto Airports Authority v. P.S.A.C., Local 0004, 423-425

Pate v. Galway-Cavendish & Harvey (Township), 421-423

Shoan v. Canada (Attorney-General), 428-430

standard of review, 435-440

Chovalo v. Toronto Police Services Board, 436-438

generally, 435

Morgan v. University of Waterloo, 438-440

workplace culture, uncovering issues in, 440-443

External Review into Sexual Misconduct and Sexual Harassment in the Canadian Armed Forces, 441-443

generally, 440

COGNITIVE BIASES. *See* BIASES

COMMUNICATION. *See* PRE-INVESTIGATION
PROCEDURE

INDEX

COMPLAINANT

ex-employee, where, 167-168
inarticulate, 82
interview of, 58
multiple, 69-71
on leave of absence, where, 188
personality, 78

COMPLAINANT INVESTIGATION LETTER, SAMPLE, 473-475

COMPLAINT

allegation vs. complaint, 16
anonymous complaint, 63-65
counter-complaint, 65-67
generally, 2-13
reason for, 247
unsubstantiated complaints, 391

CONFIDENTIALITY, 49, 120, 229-234, 258, 260

CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT, SAMPLE, 483

CORROBORATIVE EVIDENCE. *See* FACT-FINDING, hierarchy of evidence

CREDIBILITY. *See* FACT-FINDING, hierarchy of evidence

DECISION, 107, 327-331, 372

DISCIPLINE. *See* REMEDIATION OPTIONS

DISCRIMINATION, 20-22

EMPLOYER RESPONSE. *See* CASE LAW

HUMAN RESOURCES GUIDE TO WORKPLACE INVESTIGATIONS

EVIDENCE, COLLECTION OF

- checklist, 279-296
- fact-finding. *See* FACT-FINDING
- generally, 221
- handwritten notes/calendar entries, 278
- interviews. *See* INTERVIEWS
- miscellaneous sources, 277, 295

EVIDENCE, HIERARCHY OF. *See* FACT-FINDING

EVIDENCE, TYPES OF. *See* FACT-FINDING

FACT-FINDING, *see also* INTERVIEWS

- analysis, 332-336, 346
 - checklist, 346
 - description choices, 335
 - determination whether policy breached, 334
 - examples, 333-334
- checklist, 337-347
- conclusions from. *See* analysis
- generally, 297
- hierarchy of evidence, 298-325, 337-344
 - admissions, 298
 - checklist, 337-344
 - corroborative evidence, 300-307
 - computers and smart phones, 303
 - documentary evidence, 302
 - eye/ear witnesses, 300-302
 - lack of, 307
 - other witnesses, 304-306
 - physical evidence, 304
 - recordings, 302

INDEX

FACT-FINDING — *Continued*

hierarchy of evidence — *Continued*

- credibility assessments, 308-322
 - answers to questions, attention to, 317-19
 - body language and demeanour, 319-321
 - generally, 308-313
 - party's story considered as whole, 313-317
 - unconscious bias, 321
- denials. *See* credibility assessments
- hearsay, 322
- partial/quasi-admissions, 299
- similar-fact evidence, 323-325

inability to decide, 327-331

- checklist, 345
- discomfort factor, 327, 345
- more information, obtaining, 328
- procedure where, 330
- second opinion, advisability of, 328
- time, additional, 329

organization of evidence, 331, 346

standard of proof, 326, 344

FAIRNESS, 6, 8, 48, 430-435

FOUR PILLARS, 47-50

GENERAL THOUGHTS

- abusive workplaces, consequences of, 452
- accountability, 461
- assumptions re good behaviour, 457
- bad behaviour, burial tendency, 453-457
- generally, 1, 451

HUMAN RESOURCES GUIDE TO WORKPLACE INVESTIGATIONS

GENERAL THOUGHTS — *Continued*

positive responses, examples of, 463-465

respectful and civil workplaces, creation requirement, 459

HARASSMENT. *See* HUMAN RIGHTS INVESTIGATIONS; NON-HUMAN-RIGHTS HARASSMENT

HUMAN RIGHTS INVESTIGATIONS

discrimination, 20-22

generally, 20

harassment, 23-26

sexual harassment, 26-29

INTERVIEWS, *see also* FACT-FINDING; INVESTIGATION PROCESS PLANNING

complainant, of, 58

order of interviews, checklist, 279

party interviews, 222-249, 273-276, 279-288

checklist, 279-288

complainant, 58

fact gathering, 239-248, 283-285

checklist, 283-285

drill-down, 242-244, 283

generally, 239

open-ended questions, use of, 239-242

physical/documentary evidence, 246

reason for complaint, 247

relevant witness information, 244-246

follow-up interviews, 273-276, 294

generally, 222-224

leading questions, avoidance of, 254-256

preamble, 228-238, 279-282

INDEX

INTERVIEWS — *Continued*

party interviews — *Continued*

preamble — *Continued*

- attendance of representative, 236
- checklist, 279-282
- confidentiality caution, 229-234
- mandate, explanation of, 228
- reporting procedures, 237
- reprisal protection, discussion of, 234
- role of investigator, explanation of, 228
- support, discussion of, 235

respondent interviews, 60, 249-254

- checklist, 286-288
- denial vs. admission to allegations, 251
- information offered by respondent, 252-254
- key differences re, 249
- notice of all allegations, 249
- response to each allegation, 250

structure, 227-249

tone of, neutrality, 224-227

wrap-up, 248, 285

potential, 164-166

preparation for, checklist, 279

witness interviews, 61, 256-273, 276, 288-294

checklist, 288-294

common mistakes, 271-273

fact-gathering, 262-270

bull's-eye questioning, 264-270

checklist, 291-294

generally, 262

standard opener, 263

HUMAN RESOURCES GUIDE TO WORKPLACE INVESTIGATIONS

INTERVIEWS — *Continued*

witness interviews — *Continued*

- follow-up interviews, 275, 294
- generally, 256-258
- preamble, 259-262
 - attendance of representative, 262
 - checklist, 289-291
 - confidentiality caution, 258, 260
 - reporting procedures, 262
 - reprisal protection, discussion of, 261
 - role of investigator, explanation of, 259-261
- structure of, 259-273
- wrap-up, 270-273

INVESTIGATION PROCESS, MODELS RE

- anonymous complaint, 63-65
- assessments/review, 89-93
- counter-complaint, 65-67
- generally, 55
- informal processes
 - caution re using, 85-87
 - generally, 74-78
 - where appropriate, 78-80, 471
 - basic agreement re facts, 78
 - complainant's personality, 78
 - mitigating circumstances, 80
 - one/two incidents, 79
 - only two parties, 80
 - positive pre-existing relationship, 80
 - respondent's personality, 78
 - where inappropriate, 81-85

INDEX

INVESTIGATION PROCESS, MODELS RE — *Continued*

informal processes — *Continued*

where inappropriate — *Continued*

abuse of power allegations, 81

“high process needs” individuals, 82

high rank respondents, 84

inarticulate complainant, 82

nonchalant respondent, 82

problematic dynamics, 83

recurring problem, 84

serious allegations, 81

mediation, 88

multiple complainants, 69-71

multiple respondents, 68

parties outside organization, 71-74

traditional model, 56-63, 467-469

complainant, interview of, 58

contradictory evidence, review with parties, 61

evidence analysis and report preparation, 61

finding, sharing with parties, 62

investigator, selection of, 57

mandate, establishment of, 56

parties, advising re process, 57

respondent, advising re allegation, 123-128, 140, 183-185

respondent, interview of, 60

witnesses, interview of, 61

witnesses outside organization, 74

INVESTIGATION PROCESS PLANNING

checklist, 206-219

generally, 145

HUMAN RESOURCES GUIDE TO WORKPLACE INVESTIGATIONS

INVESTIGATION PROCESS PLANNING — *Continued*

- individuals involved in investigation, 158-185, 208-213
 - checklist, 208-213
 - complainant no longer employee, where, 167-168
 - conduct of investigation. *See* investigator
 - interviewees, potential, 164-166
 - interviews. *See* interviews, persons present
 - respondent, informing of allegations, 183-185
 - respondent no longer employee, where, 169-171
 - respondent subject to criminal investigation, 171
 - witness no longer employee, where, 172
- interviews, modes of conduct, 191-205, 215-219
 - checklist, 215-219
 - email interviews, 193
 - generally, 191
 - in-person interview, 192, 193
 - note-taking, 196-198
 - recording device, use of, 199-201
 - signed statements, use of, 202-205
 - telephone interviews, 192
 - transcription, 201
 - verbal evidence, modes of collection, 195-205
 - video interviews, 192
 - written questions, 193
- interviews, persons present, 174-183
 - friend/support person, 181-183
 - investigation team, presence of, 174
 - legal counsel, 175-179
 - potential witnesses, exclusion of, 183
 - union representative, 179-181

INDEX

INVESTIGATION PROCESS PLANNING — *Continued*

- investigation location, 189-191, 214
- investigator, 158-164, 208
 - checklist, 208
 - fees, 159
 - generally, 158
 - litigation privilege, 162
 - logistics, 163
 - mandate, 159
 - privilege, 160-163
 - reporting, form of, 163
 - solicitor-client privilege, 160-162
- mandate, determination of, 146-158, 206-208
 - breach of policy determination, 151
 - breach of statute determination, 152
 - checklist, 208
 - conclusions re facts, 151-154
 - fact findings, 150
 - generally, 146-150
 - legal opinion, 156-158
 - legal problems/issues, 153
 - recommendations, 154-156
- questions
 - how question, 191-205, 215-219
 - what question, 146-158, 206-208
 - when question, 185-189, 213
 - where question, 189-191, 214
 - who question, 158-185, 208-213
 - who, what, why, where, when, how system, 145
 - why question, 146, 206

HUMAN RESOURCES GUIDE TO WORKPLACE INVESTIGATIONS

INVESTIGATION PROCESS PLANNING — *Continued*

timing of investigation, 185-189, 213

 checklist, 213

 complainant on leave of absence, where, 188

 external investigator, sourcing issues, 186

 generally, 185

 party wishing to retain counsel, where, 187

INVESTIGATORS, *see also* INVESTIGATION PROCESS PLANNING

advice for. *See* INVESTIGATORS, ADVICE FOR

external vs. internal. *See* PRE-INVESTIGATION PROCEDURE

introduction of, 119

neutrality of. *See* CASE LAW

role of investigator, explanation of, 228, 259-261

selection of, 57

INVESTIGATORS, ADVICE FOR

breaks between investigations, 449

diversions, pursuit of, 448

generally, 445

refusing work, 449

skill set development, 448

talk therapy, 447

team, use of, 446

time, taking, 448

weekends off, 449

MANDATE

establishment of, 56

explanation of, 228

generally. *See* INVESTIGATION PROCESS PLANNING

INDEX

MANDATE — *Continued*

outline of, 120

reporting, 359

MEDIATION, 88, 385

NON-HUMAN-RIGHTS HARASSMENT

behavioural norms and, 32

bullying, 37

employer responsibility, 31

gossip, rumours and cyberbullying, 35

isolation and shunning, 35

non-harassment, examples of, 39

personal harassment policies, 29

physical contact, 38

practical jokes, 34

profanity/abusive language, 34

psychological harassment, 30

shouting, 33

trend re, 32

unjustified performance management, 36

unreasonable demands and lack of support, 36

violence, displays of, 39

warning signs re, 40

workplace harassment, legal consequences, 31

OCCUPATIONAL HEALTH AND SAFETY ACT, 14, 42

PRE-INVESTIGATION PROCEDURE, *see also*
INVESTIGATION PROCESS PLANNING

checklist re investigation “triage”, 136

communication issues, 116-128, 138-141

HUMAN RESOURCES GUIDE TO WORKPLACE INVESTIGATIONS

PRE-INVESTIGATION PROCEDURE — *Continued*

communication issues — *Continued*

- checklist, 138-140

- confidentiality expectations, 120

- investigator, introduction of, 119

- mandate, outline of, 120

- need to know basis, 116-118

- notice of allegations to respondent, 123-128, 140

- particular concerns, discussion re, 122

- parties, communication with, 118-123

- policies, provision of, 120

- process, outlining, 119

- representation rights, 121

- respondent, specific communications with, 123-128, 140

cost of investigation, 132, 143

employee support programs, 133, 143

external investigator, questions for, 103-110, 136

- checklist, 136

- decision-making process, 107

- experience of, 104

- fees, 105

- generally, 103

- methodology, 106

- references, 109

- sample report, 108

- specialized training, 107

generally, 95

health and safety issues, 130-132, 142

interim/temporary steps, 110-113, 137

investigator choice, internal vs. external, 96-103, 136

INDEX

PRE-INVESTIGATION PROCEDURE — *Continued*

investigator choice — *Continued*

- abhorrence factor, 99
- checklist, 136
- complexities, 98
- demands on internal investigator's time, 102
- experience of investigators, 100-102
- generally, 96-98
- high-ranking respondent, 100
- legal challenge possibilities, 102
- objectivity necessity, 100
- seriousness of allegations, 98

public relations/media strategy, 128, 141

specialized support, 128-130, 142

timing/delay considerations, 113-116, 137

“triage” analysis, 95

RECOMMENDATIONS, 154-156, 372

REMEDIATION OPTIONS

apology, 384

change of position, 386

checklist, 400

coaching/training, 384

discipline, 387-391

- suspensions, 388

- termination, 389-391

- warnings, 387

generally, 383

heart-to-heart, 383

mediation, 385

HUMAN RESOURCES GUIDE TO WORKPLACE INVESTIGATIONS

REMEDIATION OPTIONS — *Continued*

unsubstantiated complaints, 391
workplace conference, 385

REPORTING

audience of report, 354
checklist, 393-399
dissemination of report, modes of, 356-358, 395
generally, 349
interim vs. final, 352, 393
parties, receipt of copy by, 356, 394
planning, 349-358
privilege, considerations re, 354-356, 394
reporting letter, samples
 non-substantiated allegations, where, 487
 respondent, to (non-substantiated allegations), 491
 respondent, to (substantiated allegations), 489
 substantiated allegations, where, 485
structure, 358-375, 396-398
 appendices, 374
 checklist, 396-398
 evidence and fact-finding, 365-369
 generally, 358
 introduction/background, 358
 investigation process, account re, 361-364
 mandate, 359
 miscellaneous matters, 373
 parties, 359-361
 policy/legal analysis, 369-371
 policy/policies/legal provisions contexts, 364
 recommendations, 372

INDEX

REPORTING — *Continued*

structure — *Continued*

style, 374

timing, 353, 393

tips re, 375-382, 398-400

audience, 375

checklist, 398-400

definitive language, use of, 380

evidence and fact-finding, 380

generally, 375

investigation process, importance of, 377-379

organization, 376

policy and legal language, use of, 380

proofreading, 381

symmetrical thinking, 379

time and space, 382

written vs. verbal format, 350-352, 393

RESPONDENT

considerations re, 8

fairness to. *See* CASE LAW

high rank respondents, 84, 100

informing of allegations, 123-128, 140, 183-185

interviews with, 60, 249-254

multiple respondents, 68

no longer employee, where, 169-171

nonchalant respondent, 82

personality, 78

reporting letters to, 489, 491

specific communications with, 123-128, 140

subject to criminal investigation, 171

HUMAN RESOURCES GUIDE TO WORKPLACE INVESTIGATIONS

RESPONDENT INVESTIGATION LETTER, SAMPLE, 477-479

RT CIRCLE, 9-13

SEXUAL HARASSMENT, 26-29

STANDARD OF PROOF, 326, 344

STANDARD OF REVIEW. *See* CASE LAW

THRESHOLD QUESTION, 15-17, *see also* WORKPLACE INVESTIGATION

TIME, 49, 102, 329, 382, 448

UNSUBSTANTIATED COMPLAINTS, 391

WITNESS

corroborative evidence from, 300-302, 304-306

interviews. *See* INTERVIEWS

no longer employee, where, 172

outside organization, 74

potential witnesses, exclusion of, 183

relevant witness information, 244-246

WITNESS INVESTIGATION LETTER, SAMPLE, 481

WORKPLACE CULTURE. *See* GENERAL THOUGHTS

WORKPLACE, DEFINITION OF, 44

WORKPLACE HARASSMENT. *See* NON-HUMAN-RIGHTS HARASSMENT

WORKPLACE INVESTIGATION

allegation vs. complaint, 16

INDEX

WORKPLACE INVESTIGATION — *Continued*

complainant. *See* **COMPLAINANT**

complainant investigation letter, sample, 473-475

complaints, 2-13

confidentiality agreement, sample, 483

described, 2

fairness in, 6, 8, 48

four pillars of, 47-50

- confidentiality, 49
- fairness, 48
- thoroughness, 48
- timeliness, 49

generally. *See* **GENERAL THOUGHTS**

harassment investigations. *See* **HUMAN RIGHTS INVESTIGATIONS; NON-HUMAN-RIGHTS HARASSMENT**

human rights context, 7

human rights investigations. *See* **HUMAN RIGHTS INVESTIGATIONS**

importance to employees, 7-9

importance to employer, 4-7

information requiring preliminary investigation, 45-47

investigation standard, reasonableness as, 51-53

investigator. *See* **INVESTIGATION PROCESS PLANNING; INVESTIGATORS, ADVICE FOR; PRE-INVESTIGATION PROCEDURE**

just cause termination, 17-19

misconduct investigations, 17-19

non-human rights harassment. *See* **NON-HUMAN-RIGHTS HARASSMENT**

OHSA “workplace harassment”, 14

poisoned work environment, 43

HUMAN RESOURCES GUIDE TO WORKPLACE INVESTIGATIONS

WORKPLACE INVESTIGATION — *Continued*

pre-investigation. *See* PRE-INVESTIGATION PROCEDURE
procedures. *See* INVESTIGATION PROCESS, MODELS RE
remediation. *See* REMEDIATION OPTIONS
reporting. *See* REPORTING
respondent. *See* RESPONDENT
respondent investigation letter, sample, 477-479
RT Circle, 9-13
steps in, 2-4
threshold question
 answers to, 16
 benefits of using, 16
 described, 15
 evaluation of, 17
timing of, 14-17
usefulness of, 4-13
witness investigation letter, sample, 481
workplace violence. *See* WORKPLACE VIOLENCE

WORKPLACE VIOLENCE

generally, 41
legal definition, 42
OHSa definition, 42