

Economic Substance and Tax Avoidance: An International Perspective

Robert McMechan, LL.B., LL.M., Ph.D.

ISBN: 978-0-7798-5332-8
No. of Pages: Approx. 250
Binding: Softcover
Publication 2013-03-29

Table of Contents

www.carswell.com

Introduction

I – Tax minimization versus abusive tax avoidance

What is tax avoidance?

Central role of economic consequences

II – Effects of unchecked abusive tax avoidance

Detrimental effects on taxpayer compliance

Inequitable allocation of tax liabilities

Wasting of resources on uneconomic activity

Interference with government social and economic policies

Distortion of competition

Conclusion

III – A case for standards in responding to abusive tax avoidance

IV – Limits of judicial doctrines in Canada

Legal ineffectiveness

Substance versus form

Sham

Business purpose

V – SCC's treatment of economic substance

Legal form trumps economic substance in tax cases

Mara Properties Ltd. v. The Queen

Duha Printers (Western) Ltd. v. The Queen

Shell Canada Ltd. v. The Queen

SCC's rationale

Prohibition against "judicial re-drafting"

Certainty and predictability

Right to minimize taxes

SCC's different approach in non-tax cases

VI – U.S. economic substance doctrine

Leading U.S. court cases

Gregory v. Helvering

Knetsch v. United States

Goldstein v. Commissioner

Frank Lyon v. United States

An ordinary business exception?

Legislatively intended benefits

Import of bona fide legal relationships

- U.S. tax shelter cases
 - Sale and leaseback ("SILO") shelters
 - Contingent instalment sale ("CINS") shelters
 - Corporate owned-life insurance ("COLI") shelters
 - High-basis, low-value shelters
 - Bond and option sales strategy ("BOSS") and son-of-BOSS shelters
 - Distressed asset debt ("DAD") shelters
- U.S. economic substance doctrine codified
 - For and against codification
 - Budget proposal for fiscal year 2000
 - Abusive Tax Shelter Shutdown Act of 1999*
 - Joint Committee Study / White Paper on Corporate Tax Shelters
 - Budget Proposal for the Fiscal Year 2001
 - Abusive Tax Shelter Shutdown Act of 2001*
 - Jumpstart Our Business Strength (JOBS) Act 2004*
 - Tax Reduction and Reform Act of 2007*
 - Budget Proposal for Fiscal Year 2010
 - Codification at last

VII – Economic Substance under GAAR in other jurisdictions

- South Africa
 - Historical GAAR
 - 2005 Discussion Paper on Tax Avoidance
 - 2006 GAAR amendments
 - Eleven factors: the draft legislation
 - Application to scheme as a whole or any part thereof
 - Application in the alternative
 - Remedies under GAAR
 - Notice requirement
 - What has been accomplished
 - Conclusion
- Australia
 - Historical GAAR in Australia
 - Part IVA
 - Reconstruction provision
 - Notice provision
 - Provision of last resort
 - What has been accomplished
 - Conclusion
- New Zealand
 - Historical GAAR
 - Section BG 1

	Reconstruction provision
	Relationship of section BG 1 to other provisions
	What has been accomplished
	Conclusion
Other countries	
U.K. draft GAAR	
	Historical anti-avoidance efforts
	HMRC's administrative position
	1997 Tax Law Review Committee Report
	1998 Inland Revenue Consultation Document
	2009 Tax Law Review Committee Discussion Paper
	2011 Advisory Committee GAAR Study Group Report
	European Community concept of abusive practice or abuse of law
	Observations
	Conclusion
VIII – Reporting requirements and penalties	
Canada	
	Reporting requirements
	Promoter penalties
	Proposed additional reporting requirements
	Proposed additional penalty
	Observations
Québec	
	Mandatory disclosure regime / Understatement penalties
	Observations
United States	
	Reporting requirements
	Promoter penalty
	Penalties for failure to file returns and failure to maintain investor lists
	Penalties for false statements and gross valuation overstatements
	Penalties for failure to disclose
	Penalties for understatement
	Strict liability understatement penalty
	Website advisories, standards of practice and settlement initiatives
	Enjoined conduct
	Observations
Australia	
	No reporting requirement
	Shortfall penalties
	Promoter penalties
	Tax alerts

Economic Substance and Tax Avoidance: An International Perspective

Robert McMechan, LL.B., LL.M., Ph.D.

ISBN: 978-0-7798-5332-8
No. of Pages: Approx. 250
Binding: Softcover
Publication 2013-03-29

Table of Contents

www.carswell.com

Observations
New Zealand
No reporting requirement
Shortfall penalties
Promoter penalties
Revenue alerts
Observations
South Africa
Reporting requirements
Reporting penalties
No shortfall penalties
Observations
U.K.
Reporting requirements
Promoter penalties
Investor penalties
Observations
Conclusion

IX – Case studies

Canada Trustco Mortgage Co. v. The Queen
OSFC Holdings Ltd. v. The Queen
Donohue v. The Queen
Faraggi v. The Queen
4145356 Canada Ltd. v. The Queen

X – Conclusion

XI – Select Bibliography

APPENDIX A – ECONOMIC AND COMMERCIAL REALITIES IN TAX CASES

Reliance on economic realities in tax cases
Computation of Profit
Employees versus Independent Contractors
Whether Business Exists
Fair Market Value Determinations
Miscellaneous Instances
Reliance on commercial realities in tax cases

APPENDIX B – TAX COURT GAAR CASES